INTERNATIONAL TOURISM CONGRESS
“CITY TOURISM”

Congress Website: https://itc2019.anadolu.edu.tr/

16-19 OCTOBER 2019
ESKİŞEHİR
Sponsors

Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism

Governorship of Eskişehir

VakıfBank

The Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey

Turkish Airlines

Association of Turkish Travel Agencies

Anemon Hotels

Eskişehir Union of Chamber Merchants and Craftsmen

Chamber of Commerce

Eskişehir Chamber of Industry

Detay Publishing
A Short History

We are pleased to announce that the 4th International Tourism Congress will be held in Eskisehir, Turkey between October 16 - 19, 2019 and is hosted by Anadolu University.

The theme of the congress will be CITY TOURISM. Urban dimension of tourism has been scrutinized from different angles notably since the 1990s. Even though ‘tourist cities’ may not be distinctly demarcated from the other types since cities are multifunctional, tourism is a salient feature of most cities that penetrates the daily life. Thus, tourism activities induce a wide range of opportunities and predicaments in cities. Examination of these relations involves management, planning and marketing practices, and inspection of their socio-cultural reflections. Therefore, the goal of the congress is to thoroughly examine contemporary city tourism issues, stimulate dialogue, and develop new perspectives in the field of tourism within the globalized environment. The congress invites conceptual, empirical, and methodological research papers, and destination context case studies on different city tourism themes. Papers and presentations are expected to address both the theoretical, methodological, and practical aspects of city tourism. As such, the 4th International Tourism Congress will provide a unique forum for attendees from academia, industry, government, and other organizations to actively exchange, share, and challenge state-of-the-art research and cases on city tourism.
4th International Tourism Congress Honorary Board

Mehmet Nuri ERSOY  
Republic of Turkey Minister of Culture and Tourism

Özdemir ÇAKACAK  
Governor of Eskisehir

Prof. Dr. Şafak Ertan ÇOMAKLI  
Rector of Anadolu University

Advisory Board *

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title, Name and Surname</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Ahmet AKTAŞ</td>
<td>Akdeniz University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Orhan BATMAN</td>
<td>Sakarya University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. A. Celil ÇAKICI</td>
<td>Mersin University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Füsun İSTANBULLU DİNÇER</td>
<td>İstanbul University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Necdet HACIOĞLU</td>
<td>Balıkesir University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Azize TUNÇ HASSAN</td>
<td>Hacı Bayram Veli University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Orhan İÇÖZ</td>
<td>Yaşar University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Nüzhet KAHRAMAN</td>
<td>İstanbul Ticaret University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Kurtuluş KARAMUSTAFA</td>
<td>Erciyes University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Salih KUŞLUVAN (Term Chair)</td>
<td>İstanbul Medeniyet University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Bahattin RIZAOĞLU</td>
<td>Adnan Menderes University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Alp TİMUR</td>
<td>Dokuz Eylül University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Dr. Muharrem TUNA</td>
<td>Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University (Tourism Academics Association)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(*) Ordered by surname alphabetically.
4th International Tourism Congress Scientific Board

Prof. Dr. Abdul Celil ÇAKICI, Mersin University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Abdullah KARAMAN, Selçuk University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Abdullah TANRISEVDİ, Adnan Menderes University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Adina NEGRUŞA, Babeş-Bolyai University, Romania
Prof. Dr. Adnan TÜRKOŞ, Ege University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Agustín Santana TALAVERA, Universidad de La Laguna, Spain
Prof. Dr. Ahmet Akın AKSU, Akdeniz University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Ahmet AKTAŞ, Akdeniz University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Ahmet TAYFUN, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Ali YAYLI, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Alp TİMUR, Dokuz Eylül University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Arzu KILIÇLAR, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Asım SALDAMLı, Artuklu University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Aslı AFŞAR, Adnan Menderes University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Atila YÜKSEL, Anadolu University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Azilah KASIM, Universiti Utara, Malaysia
Prof. Dr. Azize HASSAN, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Bahar TANER, Mersin University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Bahattin ÖZDEMİR, Akdeniz University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Bahattin RIZAOĞLU, Adnan Menderes University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Beykan ÇİZEL, Akdeniz University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Bilgehan GÜLCAN, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Brendan T. CHEN, National Chin-Y University Of Technology, Taiwan
Prof. Dr. Burcu Selin YILMAZ, Dokuz Eylül University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Cafer TOPALOĞLU, Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Cengiz DEMİR, İzmir Kâtip Çelebi University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Cevdet AVCİKURT, Balıkesir University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Christina G-Q. CHI, Washington State University, USA
Prof. Dr. Cihan ÇOBANOĞLU, University of South Florida Sarasota-Manatee(USFSM), USA
Prof. Dr. Çağatay ÜNÜSAN, KTO Karatay University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Derman KÜÇÜKALTAN, İstanbul Arel University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Dimitrios BUHALIS, Bournemouth University, UK
Prof. Dr. Doğan GÜRSOY, Washington State University, USA
Prof. Dr. Doğan Yaşar AYHAN, Başkent University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Doğan TUNCER, Başkent University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Düriye BOZOK, Balıkesir University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Ebru GÜNLER KÜÇÜKALTAN, Dokuz Eylül University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Ferah ÖZKÖK, Çanakkale 18 Mart University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Fevzi OKUMUŞ, University of Central Florida, USA
Prof. Dr. Fisun YÜKSEL, Adnan Menderes University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Fügenc DURLU ÖZKAYA, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Füsun İSTANBULLU DİNÇER, İstanbul University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Gazi UÇKUN, Kocaeli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Gökalp Nuri SELÇUK, Atatürk University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Haktan Erdoğan EKİZ, King AbdulAziz University, Saudi Arabia
Prof. Dr. Hasan KILIÇ, Doğu Akdeniz University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. İbrahim BİRKAŞ, The Turkish Tourism Investors Association
Prof. Dr. İge PIRNAR, Yaşar University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. İrfan ARIKAN, Krems University, Austria
Prof. Dr. İrfan YAZICIÖGLU, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. İsa SAGBAŞ, Afyon Kocatepe University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. İsmail KIZILIRMAMAK, İstanbul University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. John T. BOWEN, University of Houston, USA
Prof. Dr. Kemal BİRDİR, Mersin University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Kurban ÜNLÜÖNEN, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Kurtuluş KARAMUSTAFA, Erciyes University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Kutay OKTAY, Kastamonu University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Levent ALTINAY, Oxford Brookes University, UK
Prof. Dr. Mahmut DEMİR, Isparta University of Applied Sciences, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Manuel António Brites SALGADO, Instituto Politécnico da Guarda, Portugal
Prof. Dr. Maria DOLORES ALVAREZ, Boğaziçi University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Medet YOLAL, Anadolu University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Mehmet Cihan YAVUZ, Çukurova University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Mehmet SARIIŞIK, Sakarya University of Applied Sciences, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Mehmet YEŞİLTAŞ, Cyprus International University, North Cyprus
Prof. Dr. Meryem AKOĞLAN KOZAK, Anadolu University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Metin KOZAK, Dökuz Eylül University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Mithat Zeki DİNÇER, İstanbul University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Muharrem TUNA, Hacı Bayram Veli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Muhsin HALİS, Kocaeli University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Murat DOĞDUBAY, Balıkesir University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Murat GÜMÜŞ, Batman University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Mustafa TEPECİ, Celal Bayar University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Muzaffer UYSAL, University of Massachusetts, USA
Prof. Dr. Nazmi KOZAK, Anadolu University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Necdet HACIOĞLU, Balıkesir University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Nilüfer TETİK, Akdeniz University, Turkey
Prof. Dr. Nurten ÇEKAL, Pamukkale University, Turkey
*Ordered by name alphabetically.

**All submitted papers will follow a rigorous double-blind review process.
## Executive Committee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name, Surname and Title*</th>
<th>Assignment</th>
<th>E-mail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oktay EMİR, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Chair</td>
<td><a href="mailto:oktayemir@anadolu.edu.tr">oktayemir@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Sadık BAHÇE, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:asbahce@anadolu.edu.tr">asbahce@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alev DÜNDAR ARIKAN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:adundar@anadolu.edu.tr">adundar@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arzu TOKER, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:arzu_turan@anadolu.edu.tr">arzu_turan@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aysel YILMAZ</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:aysely@anadolu.edu.tr">aysely@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barış ÇİÇEK, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:bariscivak@anadolu.edu.tr">bariscivak@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burak DÜZ</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:bduz@anadolu.edu.tr">bduz@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burcu KAYA SAYARI</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:burcukaya142@anadolu.edu.tr">burcukaya142@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cem IŞIK, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:cemisik@anadolu.edu.tr">cemisik@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Çağıl Hale ÖZEL, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Vice Chair</td>
<td><a href="mailto:chkayar@anadolu.edu.tr">chkayar@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deniz KARAGÖZ, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dkaragoz@anadolu.edu.tr">dkaragoz@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dilek ACAR, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dacar1@anadolu.edu.tr">dacar1@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duygu YETGİN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dyetgin@anadolu.edu.tr">dyetgin@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dönüş ÇİÇEK, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dcicek@anadolu.edu.tr">dcicek@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ebru ZENCİR ÇİFTÇİ, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ezencir@anadolu.edu.tr">ezencir@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ece DOĞANTAN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:edogantan@anadolu.edu.tr">edogantan@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emrah YILDIRZ</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:emrahyildirz34@anadolu.edu.tr">emrahyildirz34@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emre Ozan AKSÖZ, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Vice Chair</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ozana@anadolu.edu.tr">ozana@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engin BAYRAKTAROĞLU, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:enginbayraktaroglu@anadolu.edu.tr">enginbayraktaroglu@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erkan SEZGİN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:esezgin@anadolu.edu.tr">esezgin@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuat ÇİFTÇİ</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:fuatciftci@anadolu.edu.tr">fuatciftci@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gökçe YÜKSEK, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gozer@anadolu.edu.tr">gozer@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gözde TÜRK TARHAN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gturktarhan@anadolu.edu.tr">gturktarhan@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gül Nur DEMİRAL</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gulnurdemiral@anadolu.edu.tr">gulnurdemiral@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hakan SEZEREL, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hakansezergizel@anadolu.edu.tr">hakansezergizel@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hakan YILMAZ, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hyilmaz5@anadolu.edu.tr">hyilmaz5@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hilmi Rafet YÜNCÜ, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hryuncu@anadolu.edu.tr">hryuncu@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hüseyin ÖNEY, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:honey@anadolu.edu.tr">honey@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İbrahim Taner AKKOÇ</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ibrahimtanerakkoc@anadolu.edu.tr">ibrahimtanerakkoc@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İnci Oya COŞKUN, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ioyazicilar@anadolu.edu.tr">ioyazicilar@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medet YOLAL, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:myolal@anadolu.edu.tr">myolal@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mehtap YÜCEL GÜNGÖR, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mehtapyg@anadolu.edu.tr">mehtapyg@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merve KALYONCU</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:merverkalyoncu@anadolu.edu.tr">merverkalyoncu@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merve ÖZGÜR GÖDE</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:merveozgurgode@anadolu.edu.tr">merveozgurgode@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muhammed KAVAK</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:muhammedkavak@anadolu.edu.tr">muhammedkavak@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mune MOĞOL SEVER, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mmogol@anadolu.edu.tr">mmogol@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Email</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nazmi KOZAK, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:nkozak@anadolu.edu.tr">nkozak@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orçun ATİLLA</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:orcumatilla@anadolu.edu.tr">orcumatilla@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Osman GÜLDEMİR, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:osmanguldemir@anadolu.edu.tr">osmanguldemir@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Önder YAYLA</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:onderyayla@anadolu.edu.tr">onderyayla@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pembe Gül ÇAKIR, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pcakir@anadolu.edu.tr">pcakir@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pınar ŞENEL</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pinargoksu@anadolu.edu.tr">pinargoksu@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rıdvan KOZAK, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:rkozak@anadolu.edu.tr">rkozak@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seda SÖKMEN</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sedabuldu@anadolu.edu.tr">sedabuldu@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seher GÜLENÇ</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sehergeyik@anadolu.edu.tr">sehergeyik@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selin KAMA</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:selinkama@anadolu.edu.tr">selinkama@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sema EKİNCİEK</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:semaekincek@anadolu.edu.tr">semaekincek@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semra GÜNAY AKTAŞ, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:semragunay@anadolu.edu.tr">semragunay@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serhat AYDIN</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:serhataydin@anadolu.edu.tr">serhataydin@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serkan OLGAÇ</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:solgac@anadolu.edu.tr">solgac@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sezi AYDIN</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:seziaydin@anadolu.edu.tr">seziaydin@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Şeyda YAYLA</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:seydayayla@anadolu.edu.tr">seydayayla@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sibel ÖNÇEL, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sguler@anadolu.edu.tr">sguler@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sibel ŞAHİN</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sibelsahin@anadolu.edu.tr">sibelsahin@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ufuk ÇEVİK</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ufukcevik@anadolu.edu.tr">ufukcevik@anadolu.edu.tr</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Ordered by name alphabetically*
Foreword

Hosted by Anadolu University Faculty of Tourism this year, the 20th National Tourism Congress is a well-established and very important organization that brings together all the tourism stakeholders of Turkey, ranging from academics to decision-makers, in order to address issues in both theoretical and sector-related perspectives.

It is also of great importance that this year’s National Tourism Congress coincides with the period in which the 2023 Tourism Strategy has been announced. In particular, as a result of the implementation of the tourism strategy in which the sustainable and income-driven growth model comes to the fore, Turkey is projected to host 75 million tourists in 2023 and to obtain a receipt of 65 billion dollars. In addition, the Turkish Tourism Promotion and Development Agency, similar to the agency models that have been operating in the countries with the highest tourism receipts across the world for years, has also launched its operations. By this means, the promotion of the brand of Turkey will exert a drastic change and improvement from budget to mentality, media to content.

I do believe that the main theme and sub-themes of this Congress, aligned with the strategies, goals and operations of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, and the scientific studies prepared in this framework will prove to have invaluable contributions to the achievement of the objectives of Turkey.

I would like to thank the whole administrative staff of Anadolu University hosting the 20th National Tourism Congress, in particular to Prof. Dr. Şafak Ertan ÇOMAKLI, the president of the university. Besides, I would like to express my gratitude to all the academics and scientists, who have contributed to the organization of the Congress and have taken part in the stages of scientific assessment. I congratulate Prof. Dr. Oktay EMİR, the chairman of the Executive Committee of the Congress who has put great labours in the successful realization of such a comprehensive organization, and all the academic and administrative staff in charge.

Mehmet Nuri ERSOY
The Republic of Turkey
The Minister of Culture and Tourism
Foreword

The history of Eskişehir dates back to the Old and Middle Ages. The ancient sources refer to our city as a Phrygian city enriched by trade and famous for its hot springs at the crossroad of important roads.

Eskişehir, which came under the rule of the Seljuks since the 12th century, had also been in an important position for the Ottoman Empire. Karacahisar Castle, the first fortress conquered by the Ottoman Empire, and Karacaşehir, where the first khutbah was read in the name of Osman Gazi, the founder of the Ottoman Empire, are within the borders of Eskişehir.

Our City is worth seeing with its three important points; the most important witness of the city’s rich past with its thousands of years of history, Yazılıkaya Phrygian Valley, Sivrihisar Ulu Mosque and Odunpazarı Historical City Centre, and with other artifacts in UNESCO Temporary World Heritage List. Numerous destinations such as Kurşunlu Mosque and Complex, Eskişehir Modern Museum, Eskişehir Eti Archaeology Museum, Republic History Museum, Kurtuluş Museum, Esminiatürk, Atlıhan Handicrafts Bazaar, Pessinus Ancient City, Han Underground City, Seyyid Battal Gazi Complex, Tülomsaş Museum are waiting for visitors both from Turkey and abroad.

Eskişehir, which has broken new grounds throughout the history such as; the reading of the first khutbah in the Ottoman Empire (Osman Bey Period), the opening of the first court of appeal (1923), the establishment of the first agricultural research institute (1925), the opening of the first village institute (1940), the production of the first Turkish car, called Revolution, (1961), the production of the first Turkish locomotive, Karakurt, (1961), the first Open Education Faculty (1982), the city where the first High Speed Train service was made (2009), the first Capital of Turkish World Culture (2013), the first Intangible Cultural Heritage Capital (2013) ) and the first National Jet Engine Production (2019), is among the most visited cities in terms of domestic tourism.

The 20th National Tourism Congress (UTK20) and the 4th International Tourism Congress (ITC2019) were held together for the first time on 16-19 October 2019 in Eskişehir hosted by Anadolu University Tourism Faculty. The main theme of the congress was determined as “City Tourism”. Believing that The 20th National Tourism Congress (UTK20) and the 4th International Tourism Congress (ITC2019), where sector representatives, leading nongovernmental organizations and tourism academics came together and evaluated the issues related to city tourism, will have important outcomes on behalf of our city and our country’s city tourism, I would like to thank everyone who contributed to hosting such important congresses with the participation of scientists, sector representatives and all other stakeholders in the tourism sector.

Özdemir ÇAKACAK
The Governor of Eskişehir
Foreword

As a sub-sector of tourism, which is one of the leading sectors of our country and the world, city tourism is of great importance both with its attractiveness and with its strong contribution to the city economy. Therefore, organizing the 20th National Tourism Congress and the 4th International Tourism Congress with the theme of “city tourism” in the province of Eskişehir, which has recently attracted considerable attention with its city tourism, has not only been a great privilege for Eskişehir but also brought remarkable opportunities for the sector stakeholders and tourism academics.

Anadolu University has always supported the studies and research on city tourism. As such, our university cooperated closely with the actors of the tourism sector in the city and developed projects on this subject. Thus, Anadolu University is honored to be the host of the 20th National Tourism Congress and the 4th International Tourism Congress, which a large number of national and international tourism academics have attended. These Congresses are expected to make significant contributions to developing city tourism in Eskişehir, bringing solutions to problems, bringing the academia and sector stakeholders together, and shedding light on the subject through new research. I would like to take this opportunity to thank all the scientists who have participated in both congresses either as a presenter or audience. I would also like to thank all the academic and administrative staff of the congress’s advisory, scientific and executive committees.

I wish that the 20th National Tourism Congress and the 4th International Tourism Congress will be beneficial for the scientific world, Eskişehir, and our country and I hope that the positive results of these congresses will be seen as soon as possible.

Prof. Dr. Şafak Ertan ÇOMAKLI
Anadolu Üniversitesi Rektörü
Preface

Distinguished Members of the 20th National and 4th International Tourism Congresses

Family,

We have now completed the 20th of the National Tourism Congress which has played a privileged role in the development of the Turkish tourism science field. It is our great pleasure and honor to have the researchers who are wholeheartedly devoted to the field come together and share information.

The Congress has shed light on the intellectual journey of many scientists over the past 20 years and continues its mission to contribute to the training of young academics. To give brief information about both congresses, in addition to the presentation of more than 250 oral presentations in national and international congresses, a colloquium was organized in which panels of seven national and international speakers and seven doctoral dissertations were presented. These figures show that the scientific quality and level of participation have been very high in the 20th UTK and 4th ITC congresses. As such, as Anadolu University Tourism Faculty, we are honored to have undertaken the hosting of the 20th National and the 4th International Tourism Congress held in Eskişehir in 2019.

I would like to express my sincere thanks to our Culture and Tourism Minister Mr. Mehmet Nuri ERSOY, our Provincial Governor Mr. Özdemir ÇAKACAK, to the Rector of Anadolu University Prof. Dr. Şafak Ertan ÇOMAKLI, to the mayor of Sivrihisar Mr. Hamid Yüzügüllü for their important financial and moral contributions to the congress. Our Provincial Culture and Tourism Director Şennur AZADE, with whom we are always pleased to work in harmony, has provided significant material and moral support by participating in the congress process and communicating on behalf of the Ministry. I would like to thank TÜBİTAK for providing support for the congress events through their 2223-B program. I would like to thank to Turkish Airlines and the its manager in Eskişehir Mr. Süleyman ARSLAN that both supplied the participants with the means of transportation. I would like to thank to the chairman of Eskişehir Chamber of Industry Mr. Celalettin KESIKBAŞ and to the chairman of Eskişehir Chamber of Commerce Mr. Metin GÜLER, to the chairman of Eskişehir Union of Merchants and Craftsmen Mr. Ekrem BİRSEN, to the manager of the branch bank of Vakıfbank in Anadolu University Mrs. Meltem AYTEN, to the owner of Detay Publishing Mr. Hüseyin YILDIRIM, to ANEMON Hotels Executive Board and their manager of Eskişehir ANEMON Mr. Ozan BAYER, to the accommodation enterprises and other tourism stakeholders and civil society organizations as well as the the media representatives for all their support for the congress. I want to give thanks to all the sponsors that have contributed to the congress.
I would like to thank the field coordinators and the reviewers for their dedication in the preparation, evaluation and presentation of the papers presented to both congresses. I would also like to thank Prof. Dr. Salih KUŞLUVAN, who has been in constant communication with our faculty on behalf of the advisory board, and has ensured excellent cooperation to make our congresses as best as one can.

Last but not least, I would like to thank our faculty members and administrative staff who contributed to the organization of the congress for their dedication. We do hope that the 20th National and 4th International Tourism Congress will make an important contribution to our field,

Best regards,

Prof. Dr. Oktay EMİR
Chairman of the Executive Committee,
Dean, Faculty of Tourism, Anadolu University
## CONTENTS

**Determining the Effective Factors on the Tourism Income and Tourism Expenditure of Turkey Via Classification Regression Trees Approach**  
Ece ÖZGÖREN, Sinan SARAÇLI, Cengiz GAZELOĞLU ............................................................................... 1

**Forecasting Tourism Income and Tourism Expenditure of Turkey Via Artificial Neural Networks**  
Berkalp TUNCA, Sinan SARAÇLI ...................................................................................................................... 8

**Bibliometric Analysis of Studies Related to Perspectives of the Managers Working in Accommodation Enterprises on Accessible Tourism: 2006-2019 Period**  
Zeki AKINCI, Dilara Bahtiyar SARI, Murad Alpaslan KASALAK ..................................................................... 17

**The Impact of Private Sector Theme Parks on City Hotels: The Case of Antalya Province**  
Serkan YORULMAZER, Murad Alpaslan KASALAK, Zeki AKINCI .................................................................... 25

**The Role of Unique Attractions in the Formation of City Image: The Case of Eskişehir Sazova Science Culture and Art Park**  
Samet ÇEVİK, Semih SARIİPEK ........................................................................................................................ 33

**Managing Consumer Complaints: Tripadvisor Case in Çanakkale**  
Çiğdem ÖZKAN, Mustafa BOZ .......................................................................................................................... 42

**Comparative Analysis of the Views of the Stakeholders Regarding the Needs of Tourism Faculty Undergraduates for the Development of Their English Communication Skills**  
Davut UYSAL, Cihan SEÇİLMİŞ ........................................................................................................................ 48

**Is the Availability of Mobile Augmented Reality Applications in Tourism Education Possible? Thoughts of Tourism Academicians: The Case of Eskişehir**  
Duran CANKÜL, Batuhan SÖNMEZ ................................................................................................................. 58

**The Effect of Urban Renewal Projects on Urban Identity in Turkey: Case of Istanbul and Antalya**  
Sibel MANSUROGLU, Veysel DAG, Feyzanur DEMIR .................................................................................. 66

**Qualitative Research on Individual Transformation Based on Travel Experiences**  
Özer Mesut ÖZÇELİK, Ece ÖMÜRİŞ, Duygu AYDIN ....................................................................................... 74

**Analysis of Factors Affecting City Brand Loyalty: A Structural Equality Model Proposal**  
Erkan ARI, Yasin Emre OĞUZ, Veysel YILMAZ .............................................................................................. 79

**Gastronomy as a Tourism Resource: The Case of Gaziantep**  
Zeynep KARSAVURAN, Onur DİRLİK ............................................................................................................ 86

**An Econometric Analysis on Determining the Relationship Between Employment and Tourism: The Case of Turkey**  
Yaşar SARI, Yasin Emre OĞUZ, Cansev ÖZDEMİR ......................................................................................... 95

**The Role of Local Entrepreneurs in Urban Tourism: A Study on Hotels in Edirne City Centre**  
Bilge ÇAVUŞGIL KÖSE, Serol KARALAR ......................................................................................................... 102
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Determining The Contributions of Archeological Sites in Turkey's Cultural Tourism Competitiveness</td>
<td>Eda HAZARHUN, Ceren İŞÇİ, Mustafa TEPECİ</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship Between Service Orientation Status and Demographic Characteristics of The Front-Line Employees in Hotel Enterprises</td>
<td>Begüm İLBAY, Meryem AKOĞLAN KOZAK</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Comparison of Perceptions of Local People Regarding Tourism and Tourism Support According to Their Socio-Economic Status and Educational Level</td>
<td>Ayşe Nevin SERT, Sila KARACAOĞLU</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concept Restaurants</td>
<td>Pınar ŞENEL, Hakan YILMAZ</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing and Validating a Gastronomy Experience Scale</td>
<td>Ahmet YARIŞ</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social Responsibility Activities in Food and Beverage Enterprises: The Case of Eskişehir</td>
<td>Duran CANKÜL, Selçuk YÜCESOY</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Market Research of Antalya City Against Competitors in The Scope Of Destination Competitiveness</td>
<td>Mehmet BAHAR, Nedim YÜZBAŞIOĞLU</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happiness Among Tourism Students: A Study on The Effect of Demographic Variables on Happiness</td>
<td>Boran TOKER, Mehmet Bahadir KALIPÇİ</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is It Only “Urban” That Counts: An Extra-Urban Approach in Tourist Guiding Training</td>
<td>TOLGA GÜL, Yalçın ARSLANTÜRK</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Tourism In Sustainable Cities</td>
<td>Tuğba USTA, Adem Usta, Aslı TENDERİ</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smart Cities in The Scope of Industry 4.0: Analysis Of Official Applications</td>
<td>Ebru GÖZEN</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Web-Based Travel Intermediaries Loyalty: The Influences of Trust and Satisfaction</td>
<td>Şükrü Fırat ÇİFTÇİ, Beykan ÇİZEL</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dehumanizing Tourism and the Despair</td>
<td>Atilla YÜKSEL</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Model Recommended in ECSI Scope for Measurement of Quality Service</td>
<td>Erkan ARI, Yasin Emre OĞUZ, Veysel YILMAZ</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Evaluation of Business Travelers Profiles and Preferences from The Perspectives of Hotel Executives in Manisa</td>
<td>Mustafa TEPECİ, Eda HAZARHUN, Ceren İŞÇİ</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Evaluation of Ecomuseum Concept in Terms of Sustainability
Halil KORKMAZ, Ilayda Zeynep NIYET

A Theoretical Proposal For Modelling Tourist Types and Behaviours
Engin BAYRAKTAROĞLU

The Effect Of Customers’ Satisfaction Of Tourism Transportation On Their Intention To Revisit: A Case Of Yht
Cihan SEÇİLMİŞ, Davut UYSAL, Ebru Tespire AYDIN

Disabled Tourists’ Access At Kyrenia Sea Front, North Cyprus
Gizem GÜVENBAŞ, Mukaddes POLAY

The Impact of Cultural Tourism Activities on the Sustainable Preservation of Heritage Places: Birgi
Özge YİĞİT, Hümeysa BIROL

Olgica GRCHEVA

An Assessment on Tourism Precariat: Examples From Eskişehir
Barış ÇIVAK, Engin BAYRAKTAROĞLU

A Research on Walkability Perception of Tourists Visiting Old Town Mardin
Kadir ÇAKAR, Serhat HARMAN, Şehmus AYKOL

A Study on the Perceptions of Congress and Fair Organizers on MICE Tourism
M. Murat KIZANLIKLI, Havva ÇIVGIN

A Bibliometric Analysis on Articles About Tourism and Virtual Reality In Turkey
Altan ÇETİN, Mustafa ÇOŞKUNER, Nesrin SAVAŞ, Gökçe YÜKSEK

Determination of Resident Opinions on Global Warming and Climate Change in Tourism Cities: Case of Antalya City
Sibel MANSUROĞLU, Veysel DAĞ, Gülcan CÖMERT

The Idea of Divine Mercy and Its Religious Cult in Krakow as Impulse on Urban Tourism
Paweł PLICHTA

Turkey’s Metropolitans in Terms of City Tourism: A Review of Tourism Brochures
Burçin KIRLAR CAN, Mehmet ERTAŞ, Sonay KAYGALAK ÇELEBİ

The Need For A Tour Guide While The Cities Get Smarter
Grant Altay TAŞKIN

Tracing Industrial Heritage: The Case Of Berlin Bicycle Route
Evinç DOĞAN

Analysis of Tourist Attraction of Brand Cities: The Cases of Antalya and St. Petersburg
Güneş SÜTÇÜ, Oktay EMİR
Does The Destination Decision Of Inbound Tourists From Different Counters Affect Each Other? The Case Of Turkey
Selim YILDIRIM, Burak EROĞLU ................................................................. 315

Not Every Small Hotel is a Boutique Hotel
Eda AVCI ........................................................................................................ 316

Consumer Personality Traits and Their Influence on Brand Experience and Satisfaction
Ridhwan Olatunji OLAOKE, Steven William BAYIGHOMOG .............................. 317

Prediction of Number of Foreigners Visiting Turkey with LSTM and Feed-Forward Neural Networks
Baki ÜNAL, Çağdaş Hakan ALADAĞ ................................................................. 319

Modelling Inbound Tourism Demand for Istanbul
Deniz GÖKTAŞ, Dilara ORUÇ ........................................................................... 320

Readiness the Small Town of Pangandaran – West Java, Indonesia, As a World-Class Tourist Destination
Heru Purboyo Hidayat PUTRO ............................................................................ 321

Urban Tourism Development Through Creative Economy and Green Tourism: The Case of Jakarta
Rusdi ABBAS, Dzikri Abdul AZIS, Heri KURNIAWAN, Rahmadha Akbar SYAH
Arinda SHABRINA, Dianissa SCHEHERAZADE, Zaki Khudzaifi MAHMUD ................... 322

Revisiting the Old Issue: Workplace Incivility and Employee Emotional Exhaustion
Uju Violet ALOLA, Andrew Adewale ALOLA ................................................... 323

Social Production of Street Food Markets in London
Fatos Ozkan ERCIYAS ..................................................................................... 324

Horizontal Individualism, Authenticity and International Tourist Behaviors
Hakan SEZEREL, Deniz KARAGÖZ ................................................................. 325

The Core Principles for an Effective City Tour Design
Orhan YABANCI ............................................................................................. 326

Which European Union Countries Turkey is similar in Hosting Foreign Tourists
Selim YILDIRIM, Burak EROĞLU ................................................................. 327

Winter and Urban Tourism Duality Under Climate Change: Case of Erzurum, Turkey
Neslihan KULÖZÜ UZUNBOY, Osman Cenk DEMİROĞLU ................................. 328

Destination Perceptions and the Relation Between Satisfaction and Repurchase Behaviour
İbrahim ÇETİN ............................................................................................... 329

The Contribution of Opet Respect to History Project, An Unique Social Responsibility Project, to Historical, Social and Cultural Change in Gallipoli Peninsula and Its Effect on Domestic Tourism
Burhan SAYILIR, Ferdi BOZKURT ..................................................................... 330
The Relationship Between Economic Policies and Tourism Policies in Turkey
Inci Oya COŞKUN, Fırat ÇİFTÇİ ...................................................................................................................... 331

A Trip to Bursa: A Multi-Sensory Experience
Ebru GÖKDAĞ, Özge BOZDOĞAN ................................................................. 332

Agri-Tourism Potential of Gazipaşa as an Alternative to Urban Tourism
Gözdegül BAŞER ...................................................................................................................... 333

Tourism and Media: False, Additives, Outputs
Sedat CERECİ ...................................................................................................................... 334

An Oasis in a Complex World: Slow Cities
Fülden Nuray KÜÇÜKergin, Cemal Ersin SILIK ...................................................................................... 335

Pastry (Borek) Culture in Uzbek Tatars: Böğrüdelik Village Sample
Nisa Nur KAYA, Osman GÜLDEMİR, Nermin IŞIK .................................................................................... 336

The Impact of Architectural Heritage on the Tourism: The Case of Walled City of Famagusta, Cyprus
Nazife ÖZAY, Maryam GHASEMI .................................................................................................................. 337

The Effect of Website Features on the Visiting Levels of the Destination Website at Destination Selection
Sami ÖZCAN ....................................................................................................................................................... 347

How Sustainable is Tourist-Guiding Education in Turkey? : Perspectives from the “Urban Side”
Yalçın ARSLANTÜRK, Özlem ALTUNÖZ ................................................................................................. 356

Urban Tourism in Scope and Its Repercussions on Turkish Tourism Academia
Özlem ALTUNÖZ, Yalçın ARSLANTÜRK ................................................................................................. 361

Environmental Problems and Sustainable Tourism at the Golden Horn, Istanbul
Özgür ZEYDAN ................................................................................................................................................... 369

The Impact of Instagram Influencers on Tourists Hotel Perceptions: A Study on A Five Star Hotel In Istanbul
Zehra YARDI, E. Ozan AKSOZ ........................................................................................................................................ 374

Bibliometric Analysis of Tourism Economics Field Studies
Sezi AYDIN, Cem IŞIK ................................................................................................................................... 381

A Study on Exploring the Tourism Potential of Altinköy as a Rural Tourism and Recreational Activity Area
Ayşe ATAR, Seda ÖZDEMİR AKGÜL, Muharrem TUNA ........................................................................... 388

Analysis of the Concepts of Tourism and Tourist by Metaphors
Günay EROL, Ebru DÜŞMEZKALENDER ................................................................................................. 399

Natural Disaster Threat on World Heritage Sites in Turkey and the Effect on Cultural Tourism
Doğa Dinemis Aman ................................................................................................................................... 408
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to determine the effects of most important components on the Tourism income and expenditure of Turkey by the help of Classification Regression Trees (CR&T). With this purpose, quarterly tourism income and expenditure and type of income and expenditure data (Thousand $) among the years 2003 and 2018 is obtained from the web site of Turkish Statistical Institute. Effects of income and Expenditure types (Food and beverage, Accommodation, Health, Transport (In abroad), Sports education and culture, Tour services, International transport by foreign Company, GSM roaming, Other goods and services, Clothes and shoes, Souvenirs, Carpet, rug etc.) on tourism income and expenditure is examined via Classification and regression trees which are becoming increasingly popular for partitioning data and identifying local structure in small and large datasets. Classification trees include those models in which the dependent variable (the predicted variable) is categorical. Regression trees include those in which it is continuous.

The results of the analysis indicate that, while accommodation is the most effective factor on tourism income, individual expenditures are the most effective factor on tourism expenditure of Turkey. On the tourism income other effective factors are determined as Food and beverage, Clothes and shoes, other goods and services and Transport. Accommodation and package tour expenses are also found significant on the tourism expenses of Turkey. Detailed results are given in the related tables and figures.

Key Words: Tourism Income, Tourism Expenditure, Classification Regression Tree.

INTRODUCTION

The contribution of the tourism industry (in terms of income generation, employment, etc.) can be very significant for the economy of a country (Armstrong and Read, 2000). Hence, the development of tourism has usually been considered as a positive contribution to economic growth (Khan et al, 1995; Lee and Kwon, 1995). Furthermore, Dritsakis (2004) proposes the view that the contribution of tourism to a country's economy is multifaceted, affecting its exchange rate, as well as different sectors of the economy such as the employment sector (by reducing the propensity to emigrate), the business sector (as it has to develop in order to meet the increasing tourist market), the income sector (in its contribution to aggregate income and the importance of the multiplier effect), the cultural sector (by improving the living standards of the people) and the fiscal sector (as tourism activities yield income to the public sector). Numerous studies have shown that tourism income can lead to economic growth via increased employment, income and tax revenues (Croes and Vanegas, 2006; Vanegas and Croes, 2003; Sugiyarto et al, 2002; Page, 1999; Uysal and Gitelson, 1994; West, 1993; Khan et al, 1990). These findings tend to support the tourism-led economic growth (TLEG) hypothesis (Eeckels et al, 2012).
LITERATURE REVIEW

Tourist expenditure behavior is defined as a system with complex interactions (Abbruzzo, Brida, & Scuderi, 2014), which involves a complex process of individual decision-making (Olya & Al-ansi, 2018). Specifically, complexity arises from the fact that travel decision-making involves multiple decisions around the various elements of the vacation, which are highly influenced by situational factors, such as personality, attitude, brand preference, perception, cognition, and market segmentation (Belk, 1974; Cohen, Prayag, & Moital, 2014). Furthermore, expenditures cover the purchase of both tangible/visible items (e.g. transportation costs) and intangible items (e.g. emotional), products and services which may be interrelated (Brida & Scuderi, 2013; Laesser & Crouch, 2006; Mehran and Olya, 2018).

The link between expenditure on the tourism industry and its economic growth has attracted considerable interest from economic researchers, at both theoretical and empirical levels. The overall view is that the tourism industry may require major investments in basic infrastructure such as transport, accommodation, water supply and health care. Sinclair (1998) points out that countries potentially benefit from increasing expenditures on tourism. The Keynesian approach supports the thesis that public and private expenditure on the tourism industry is an important policy tool to ensure a reasonable level of economic activity, correct short-term cyclical fluctuations in aggregate expenditure (Singh and Sahni, 1984) and secure an increase in productive investment, thus providing socially optimal direction for growth and development (Ram, 1986), especially by a simultaneous increase in short- and long-term revenues. It is argued that delay in developing the tourism industry will adversely affect the country’s economic growth and employment levels (Dallas, 2001). Looking now at the econometric modeling, the long-run relationship between public expenditure and real output (as in the case of transportation and communication expenses) – that is, the ability of public expenditure to influence national income – is examined on two levels: the nature of the causality pattern and the output implications of expenditure (Louca, 2006).

The aim of this study is to determine the effects of most important components on the Tourism income and expenditure of Turkey by the help of CR&T analysis.

MATERIAL AND METHOD

To analyze the important factors on tourism income and expenditure of Turkey, the data set (in Thousand $) among the years 2003 and 2018 is obtained from the web site of Turkish Statistical Institute. The data set for the Tourism income is compiled from “Tourism Income by Type of Expenditure” from the Departing Visitors Statistics and for the Tourism expenditure is compiled from “Tourism Expenses by Type of Expenditure” from the Arriving Citizens Statistics. The data is quarterly for all income, expenditure and the other types of expenditures.

The data come from questionnaires which are applied to residing abroad citizens, foreigners with face to face interview, four times every year. Sample size of survey is calculated by using quota sampling method. The survey is done with face to face interview. Statistical analyses are performed via SPSS software.

CRT is a recursive partitioning method to be used both for regression and classification. CRT is constructed by splitting subsets of the data set using all predictor variables to create two child nodes repeatedly, beginning with the entire data set. The best predictor is chosen using a variety of impurity or diversity measures (Gini, towing, ordered towing and least-squared deviation). The goal is to produce subsets of the data which are as homogeneous as possible with respect to the target variable (Lewis, 2000; Alkhasawneh et al, 2014)

Classification and regression trees are becoming increasingly popular for partitioning data and identifying local structure in small and large datasets. Classification trees include those models in which the dependent variable (the predicted variable) is categorical. Regression trees include those in which it is continuous (Wilkinson, 1992)

Unlike classical regression techniques for which the relationship between the response and predictors is pre-specified (for example, straight line, quadratic) and the test is performed to prove or disprove the relationship, RTA assumes no such relationship. It is primarily a method of constructing a set of decision rules on the predictor variables (Breiman al. 1984; Verbyla 1987; Clark and Pregibon 1992). The rules are constructed by recursively partitioning the data into successively smaller groups with binary splits based on a single predictor variable. Splits for all of the predictors are examined by an exhaustive search procedure and the best split is chosen. For regression trees, the selected split is the one that maximizes the
homogeneity of the two resulting groups with respect to the response variable (the split that maximizes the between-groups sum of squares, as in analysis of variance, although other options may be available. The output is a tree diagram with the branches determined by the splitting rules and a series of terminal nodes that contain the mean response (Prasad et al, 2006).

Definitions of the variables used in the analysis are also given in below. All these definitions are obtained from the meta data explanations of Turkish statistical institute.

Tourism Income: Tourism income is defined as the total individual and package tour expenditures made in Turkey by foreigner and citizen visitors resident in abroad (excluding real estate expenditures, repair-maintenance expenses for residences, durables, transfers etc.). Tourism income includes the expenditure on food and beverages, accommodation, health, transportation in Turkey, sports, education, culture, international transportation with Turkish firms, mobile phone roaming expenditures, marina service expenditures, souvenirs etc.

Tourism Expenditure: Tourism expenditures are defined as the total individual and package tour expenditures (food and beverages, accommodation, health, transportation, sports, education, culture, international transportation by foreign firms, mobile phone roaming expenditures, souvenirs etc.) made in abroad by a citizen visitors resident in Turkey (excluding real estate expenditures, repair-maintenance expenses for residences, durables etc.)

Individual expenditures for Tourism income is defined as; the total consumption expenditure made by a visitor or on behalf of a visitor for and during his/her trip except package tour expenditures, commercial and investment expenditure and the cash given to relatives.

Individual expenditures for Tourism expenditure is defined as; all expenditure in the place visited by visitor or on behalf of visitor during trip except package tour expenditures, commercial and investment expenditure and the cash given to relatives.

Type of Expenditure for Tourism income is defined as the expenditures of visitors made in Turkey for food and beverage, accommodation, health, transport (inside Turkey), sports, education, culture, tour services, international transportation by Turkish company, mobile phone roaming, marina service, clothes and shoes, souvenirs, carpet, rug, other expenditures (like individual care, gold, silver).

Type of Expenditure for Tourism expenditure is also defined as that citizens make expenditures in abroad as food and beverage, accommodation, health, transport (in abroad), sports, education, culture, tour services, international transportation by foreign company, mobile phone roaming, clothes and shoes, souvenirs, carpet, rug, other expenditures.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Results of the CR&T analysis for the tourism income of Turkey is given in Figure 1. Figure 1 indicates that accommodation has the greatest effect on the tourism income of Turkey than the other factors (types of expenditure).
According to CRT analysis, accommodation expenses are divided into two subgroups. For the first group, while the accommodation expense is equal or less than 772113 $, food and beverage expenses have found the effective variable (factor) for the food and beverage expenses which are more than 943876 $, other goods and services has a significant effect. Within this group equal or less than 1279639 $, expenses for transport found the effective factor on the tourism income of Turkey. For this group tourism income mean of Turkey is 4471639 $ for the less or equal transport expenses of 344295 $.

Additionally, for the food and beverage expenses which are less or equal than 943876 $, clothes and shoes has significant effect. In this group, tourism income mean of Turkey is 2265318 $ for the less or equal than clothes and shoes expenses of 353261 $, while clothes and shoes expenses more than 353261 $, tourism income mean of Turkey is 3725173 $. For the second group, while accommodation expense is more than 772113 $, food and beverage expense has found the effective factor. For the food and beverage expenses which are less or equal than 1982267 $, clothes and shoes has an important effect on the tourism income. For this group, while expenses of shoes and clothes less or equal than 841579 $, tourism income mean of Turkey is 7123493 $ and while it more than 841579 $, tourism income mean of Turkey is 8584431 $.
Results of the CR&T analysis for the tourism expenditure of Turkey is given in Figure 2. Figure 2 shows that individual expenditures have the significant effect on the tourism expenditure of Turkey than the other factors.

According to CRT analysis, individual expenses are divided into two groups. While individual expenditures expenses are equal or less than 902740$, individual expenditures has found an important variable. In this group, tourism expenditure mean of Turkey is 749408$ for the less or equal individual expenditures expenses of 812869$. In addition to this, while tourism expenditures expenses more than 812869$, tourism expenditure mean of Turkey is 999813$. While individual expenditures are more than 902740$, accommodation expenses has found efficient variable. For the accommodation expenses which are less or equal than 253020$, package of tour expenditure expenses has an important effect on the tourism expenditure of Turkey. For this group, while package of tour expenditure expenses are less or equal than 147712$, tourism expenditure mean of Turkey is 1125598$. Moreover, for the accommodation expenses is more than 253020$, tourism expenditure mean of turkey is 1301863$. 
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

According to the results of many studies, it can be expected that (tourism) services have an income elasticity of demand greater than 1, so that, as real income increases, real tourism services will grow at a faster rate than the proportional growth in income (Deaton and Muellbauer, 1980; Fuchs, 1968; Inman, 1985). Thus (tourism) services consume an increasing share of national income and (all else being equal) national employment as well. Explanations can be based on structural change: After being saturated in terms of basic needs and durable goods, a growing economy has more money left over for travel and leisure goods (consumed in the usual environment) as well as for other luxury goods (Gunter and Smeral, 2016).

In earlier studies researchers especially consider the tourist arrivals/departures and expenditures/receipts or tourism demand as the dependent variable. Even much of the variables are same with the earlier studies, they examined the effects of independent variables on the dependent variable such as regression analyses, panel data analyses and etc. In this study, one of the multivariable and visual statistical analyze CRT is used the determine the effects of similar independent variables on tourism income and expenditure. The results of the analysis indicate that, while accommodation is the most effective factor on tourism income, individual expenditures are the most effective factor on tourism expenditure of Turkey. On the tourism income other effective factors are determined as Food and beverage, Clothes and shoes, other goods and services and Transport. Accommodation and package tour expenses are also found significant on the tourism expenses of Turkey.

Considering these effective variables on tourism income and expenditures and foreseeing the future values of these variables should be much helpful to the country’s economy and it may also help to prepare the future tourism politics of the country.

REFERENCES


Forecasting Tourism Income and Tourism Expenditure of Turkey Via Artificial Neural Networks

Berkalp TUNCA
Afyon Kocatepe University
berkalp0606@gmail.com

Sinan SARAÇLI
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Afyon Kocatepe University
ssaracli@aku.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Turkey's economy in terms of increased tourism revenues or tourism income/expenditure has a quite significant impact. When the country is stuck in terms of foreign exchange, tourism sector plays a major role in the economy in eliminating foreign exchange inflow, unemployment and import/export deficits. Also, as well as tourism income, tourism expenditures are also very important in our country. Forecasting the tourism income and expenditures of a country may lead the administrators to take some precautions for any unexpected situations in the country's economy and future tourism investments.

Artificial neural networks (ANN), which have been very popular within the researchers in recent years, are simply an information processing technique based on the biological nerve cells (neurons). Just like in the human brain, there are links between nerve cells. When these bonds are connected to each other, an artificial neural network is formed. ANN is used in many areas such as statistics, medicine, quality control and etc. in recent years. One of the most important reasons that attracted the attention of researchers is the ability to learn, generalize and solve a problem such as a human being.

The aim of this study is to forecasting the tourism income and expenditures of Turkey via artificial neural network approach. With this purpose the quarterly data set for the tourism income and expenditures of Turkey between the years 2003-2018 is obtained from the web page of Turkish statistical institute. The forecasted value of the first quarter of 2019 is compared with the real value. The performances of the predicted values were calculated according to MAPE criteria. The results of the study indicates that forecasts are closer to the real values. Detailed results are also given in related tables and figures.

Keywords: Tourism Income, Tourism Expenditure, Artificial Neural Network.

INTRODUCTION

In recent years, the academic community has shown considerable interest in the relationship between tourism and economic growth. These studies strive to empirically investigate the significance of the socalled tourism-led growth hypothesis (TLGH) supporting a direct effect from tourism activity to growth and suggesting in general that tourism increases foreign exchange income, creates employment opportunities, and therefore triggers overall economic growth. This hypothesis derives directly from the export-led growth hypothesis (ELGH) which states that the economic growth of countries can be generated not only by increasing the amount of labour and capital within the economy, but also by expanding exports (Georgantopoulos 2012).

Measures of international tourism volume and international tourism expenditures are both important for a destination. Forecasts of tourist volume in the form of arrivals are important for private suppliers of tourism services to plan their operations, and for destinations to foresee infrastructure and superstructure development needs (Sheldon 1993).

Understanding tourist expenditure is critically important because “tourism is an expenditure-driven economic activity” and “the consumption of tourism is at the centre of the economic measurement of tourism and the foundation of the economic impacts of tourism” (Mihalic 2002, Wang and Davidson 2010).
Tourism today carries not only sociocultural and political significance but also provides considerable economic benefits. In the 20th century, tourism has emerged as one of the largest and the fastest growing industries in the global economy (Eadington and Redman 1991). For many countries, tourism expenditure has become an important source of business activity, income, employment and foreign exchange (Lee et al, 1996). Today tourism has become a much more important opportunity for any government. Authorities orientate their economies to gain more tourism income (Aydın 2016).

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

Previous literature between tourism (and its components; accommodation, package travel, food and drinks, transport, sporting activities, shopping) and economic growth, although various measures of tourism activity have been employed (e.g. total tourism expenditure, tourism arrivals, international visitor consumption, domestic tourism expenditure), suggests that tourism is a key factor for economic growth especially for the cases of low income and/or small countries (Georgantopoulos 2012).

The literature review of research into tourism forecasting shows that researchers have used a variety of methods in forecasting tourism demand. These methods include simple time series extrapolative methods such as exponential smoothing, ARIMA models, complex econometric models, combined models, and artificial intelligence methods. Of note throughout the literature review is that researchers state that no single model outperforms others in all cases (Benjamin et al, 2018).

Tourists’ incomes are used in different forms such as gross national product (GNP) (Garín-Muñoz and Amaral 2000; Qui and Zhang 1995; Ongan et al. 2017), gross domestic product (GDP) (Kulendran and Wilson 2000; Lathiras and Siriopoulos 1998; Ongan et al. 2017), GDP per capita (Dritsakis 2004; Hor 2015; Piv’cevi´c et al. 2016; Ongan et al. 2017), and the industrial production index (IPI) (Espinoza et al. 2012; González and Moral 1995; Seo et al. 2009; Chang et al. 2017; Ongan et al. 2017).

The income variable has been most commonly included in demand models as a major determinant of tourism demand (Uysal and Crompton 1984). Demand theory implies that as per capita incomes rise, more people are likely to travel, and tourist expenditures are a positive function of income. Both hypotheses have been supported by a host of empirical studies (Artus 1972; Barry and O’Hagan 1972; Gray 1966; Jud and Joseph 1974; Kwack 1972; Laber 1969; Loeb 1982; Stronge and Redman 1982). These studies also found that the income variable is generally highly elastic, indicating that tourism expenditures rise at a more rapid percentage rate than income (Lee et al, 1996).

Time series is a general problem of great practical interest in many disciplines. Because it allows you to discover, with some margin of error, the future values of a series from its past values. In the relevant literature there have been numerous successful applications in different fields, such as the economy, finance and hydrology (Tealab 2018).

Box and Jenkins (Chen and Chang 2009), in the late 70s, made an important work in studying applications composed of mathematical linear models. These models represent Autoregressive (AR) and Moving Averages (MA) processes. While in the AR processes it is assumed that the current value of the time series is a linear combination of its past values. Processes in the MA are supposed that the current value is a function of random interference passes or perturbations that have affected the series. Many practical experiments have demonstrated that this approach makes it possible to represent the dynamics of many real time series. That class models is popularized in both the academic and professional fields (Tealab 2018).

However, it has also been found that many real time series seem to follow non-linear behavior and the approach of Box and Jenkins is insufficient to represent their dynamics (Clements et al. 2004, Granger and Tersvirta 1993). Thus in the most relevant literature have been presented a wide range of models that suggest different mathematical representations of the non-linearity present in the data (Granger and Tersvirta 1993, Tersvirta 1994), such as the models based on schemes (Granger and Tersvirta 1993) and different types of ANN (Anders and Korn 1999, Zhang et al. 1998). Some other literature reviews focused on one type of forecasting, one-step or multistep ahead forecasting, and comparing the proposed strategies in theoretical and practical terms (Taieb et al. 2012, Tealab 2018).

In conventional time series analysis two main approaches, which are separate but not necessarily mutually exclusive, have been used. One of them performs the analysis in the frequency domain, sometimes termed spectral analysis because of its theoretical justification based on the spectral representation (Cramer 1942; Cramer and Leadbetter 1967) of a stationary process. In time series, in fact, repetitive cycle, that is, the frequency with which the series varies, is of special interest. The estimation of the power spectral density, or simply the power spectrum that gives the power corresponding to the rate of oscillation expressed in...
cycles per unit time, provides a frequency-domain description of second-order statistics of the process. The other performs the analysis on the time domain by which we mean that one postulates some parametric model, and the data are fitted to this model by estimating the parameters. Among many models, general linear models such as an autoregressive process model are preferred because of its simplicity in estimating the parameters and forecasting the future. The parametric modeling of stationary time series can be accomplished by well-established parameter estimation techniques, such as least squares and maximum likelihood. The use of the maximum likelihood estimator for parameter estimation can be justified (Box and Jenkins 1970) for large data records on the basis of its asymptotic unbiased and minimum variance properties (Lee and Jung 2019).

MATERIAL AND METHODS

To analyze the important factors on tourism income and expenditure of Turkey, the data set (in Thousand $) among the years 2003 and 2018 is obtained from the web site of Turkish Statistical Institute. The data set for the Tourism income is compiled from “Tourism Income by Type of Expenditure” from the Departing Visitors Statistics and for the Tourism expenditure is compiled from “Tourism Expenses by Type of Expenditure” from the Arriving Citizens Statistics. The data is quarterly for all income, expenditure and the other types of expenditures.

The data, come from questionnaires which are applied to residing abroad citizens, foreigners with face to face interview, four times every year. Sample size of survey is calculated by using quota sampling method. The survey is done with face to face interview. Statistical analyses are performed via MATLAB software.

While constructing an artificial neural network model, as in other time series analyzes, there is no need to go into any stationary way. Because of the structure of ANN, stationary process takes place automatically in the learning stage. Also, since the data set shows a seasonal distribution, it would be correct to select the delay value between 1 and 4, and 1 delay was used for the study.

When the creation of ANN was initiated, the data was firstly divided to measure the performance of the network. Accordingly, the data; 70% training, 15% validation and 15% testing.

There are various types of artificial neural networks. Feed forward neural networks are one of these types. The structure of multilayer feed forward artificial neural networks is basically given in Figure 1. The architecture as illustrated in the figure consists of three parts such as input, hidden, and output layers. Each layer consists of neurons. The architecture structure is determined based on deciding the number of neuron in each layer. These neurons are linked each other by weights. There is no link among the neurons in the same layer (Egrioglu et al. 2013).

![Figure 1. Multilayer feed forward artificial neural networks with one output neuron](image)

When determining the architecture of the network, 4 different architectures were tried. Experiments were also made between 1 and 10 to determine the number of hidden layers. As a result, the architecture with the lowest error was chosen as the architecture in Figure 2. multilayer and feedforward networks were used for the architectural structure.
There are many learning algorithms for ANN training. These networks have different properties according to each other. Levenberg-Marquardt algorithm was used for this study. Because this algorithm requires a second order derivative, it works faster than other first order derivative algorithms. The LM algorithm update derived from steepest descent and Newton algorithms is given in (1) (Çavuşlu et al. 2012):

$$\Delta w = (J^T J + \mu I)^{-1} J^T e$$  

(1)

$w$ is the weight vector, $I$ unit matrix, $\mu$ combination coefficient. $J$ (P×M) xN size Jacobian matrix, $e$ (P×M) x1 shows the error vector. $P$ shows the number of training samples, $M$ shows the number of outputs and $N$ shows the number of weights. $\mu$ is an adjustable parameter. If this parameter is too large, the method behaves like the Newtonian method if it is too small as the vertical descent method. An adaptive structure for this parameter is given in (2) (Çavuşlu et al. 2012):

$$\mu(n) = \begin{cases} 
\mu(n-1) k, & E(n) > E(n-1) \\
\frac{\mu(n-1)}{k}, & E(n) \leq E(n-1)
\end{cases}$$

(2)

In equation (2), $k$ is a fixed number. $E$ indicates the suitability value.

The parameters used in the formation of the network, such as the combining function and the transfer function, were found by means of the trial and error path. Weighted total formula is used for the combining function. There is no study on transfer function in the literature about which function is better. Sigmoid Function, Purelin Function and Tansig Function were tested. Sigmoid Function was chosen as the transfer function because the most suitable result for the data structure was given by Sigmoid Function. The estimation values obtained through the generated network are given in the other section.

Definitions of the variables used in the analysis are also given in below. All these definitions are obtained from the meta data explanations of Turkish statistical institute.

**Tourism Income:** Tourism income is defined as the total individual and package tour expenditures made in Turkey by foreigner and citizen visitors resident in abroad (excluding real estate expenditures, repair-maintenance expenses for residences, durables, transfers etc.). Tourism income includes the expenditure on food and beverages, accommodation, health, transportation in Turkey, sports, education, culture, international transportation with Turkish firms, mobile phone roaming expenditures, marina service expenditures, souvenirs etc.

**Tourism Expenditure:** Tourism expenditures are defined as the total individual and package tour expenditures (food and beverages, accommodation, health, transportation, sports, education, culture, international transportation by foreign firms, mobile phone roaming expenditures, souvenirs etc.) made in abroad by a citizen visitors resident in Turkey (excluding real estate expenditures, repair-maintenance expenses for residences, durables etc.)

“Individual expenditures” for Tourism income is defined as the total consumption expenditure made by a visitor or on behalf of a visitor for and during his/her trip except package tour expenditures, commercial and investment expenditure and the cash given to relatives.

“Individual expenditures” for Tourism expenditure is defined as: all expenditure in the place visited by visitor or on behalf of visitor during trip except package tour expenditures, commercial and investment expenditure and the cash given to relatives.

“Type of Expenditure” for Tourism income is defined as the expenditures of visitors made in Turkey for food and beverage, accommodation, health, transport (inside Turkey), sports, education, culture, tour services, international transportation by Turkish company, mobile phone roaming, marina service, clothes and shoes, souvenirs, carpet, rug, other expenditures (like individual care, gold, silver).
“Type of Expenditure” for Tourism expenditure is also defined that citizens make expenditures in abroad as food and beverage, accommodation, health, transport (in abroad), sports, education, culture, tour services, international transportation by foreign company, mobile phone roaming, clothes and shoes, souvenirs, carpet, rug, other expenditures.

The performance of the model created by ANN was measured according to Root Mean Square Error (RMSE) criteria. The RMSE is calculated as in (3):

\[
RMSE = \sqrt{\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} (P_i - O_i)^2}
\]

(3)

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

As a result of statistical analysis, ANN estimated values and actual tourism income values are given in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Annual Quarter</th>
<th>Tourism Income</th>
<th>ANN Estimated</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Annual Quarter</th>
<th>Tourism Income</th>
<th>ANN Estimated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1261787,54</td>
<td>3309547,2</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>3736768,51</td>
<td>5614283,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>2365088,83</td>
<td>3828433,1</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>6599970,83</td>
<td>4545011,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>7367019,81</td>
<td>7755003</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>11314074,42</td>
<td>6711634,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>2860972,16</td>
<td>4285707,7</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>6464878,88</td>
<td>3309547,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1829174,36</td>
<td>3510849,3</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>3524242,46</td>
<td>4406883,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>3511572,75</td>
<td>5203922</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>7066015,44</td>
<td>5226071,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>8204202,56</td>
<td>5547109,1</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>11055086,49</td>
<td>7584678,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>3531659,49</td>
<td>5238614,8</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>7361478,00</td>
<td>6708921,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>2195035,90</td>
<td>3710686,2</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>4648816,26</td>
<td>7752633,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>4218076,76</td>
<td>6631076,1</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>8315788,69</td>
<td>7641488,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>9811404,53</td>
<td>4056714,4</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>11579006,20</td>
<td>5570501,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>4097593,32</td>
<td>6361449,4</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>7765380,04</td>
<td>6713723,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>2191985,09</td>
<td>3708730,9</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>4807836,16</td>
<td>5425917,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>4099847,60</td>
<td>6366415,3</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>8975975,93</td>
<td>8019347,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>8838918,06</td>
<td>5651202</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>12854372,91</td>
<td>5666269,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>3463198,77</td>
<td>5121940,6</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>7667178,84</td>
<td>6718109,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>2425257,58</td>
<td>3874444</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>4868889,89</td>
<td>5408342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>4262510,03</td>
<td>6732481,7</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>7733676,66</td>
<td>8163255,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>9844808,55</td>
<td>4311944,2</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>12294188,53</td>
<td>5415858,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>4409923,53</td>
<td>7074910,1</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>6568022,36</td>
<td>6717075,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>3161505,88</td>
<td>4660942,2</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>4066383,56</td>
<td>4513662,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>5519757,74</td>
<td>9579852,6</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>4981317,99</td>
<td>6293032,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>11506482,82</td>
<td>6713209,4</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>8277009,42</td>
<td>8425223,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>5227320,72</td>
<td>8977691,6</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>4782728,72</td>
<td>5562664,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>2850711,36</td>
<td>4274298,8</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>3369752,92</td>
<td>7959918,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>5076277,23</td>
<td>8642390,7</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>5413048,32</td>
<td>4969883,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>11103382,70</td>
<td>6709490</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>11391668,14</td>
<td>9368700,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>6034109,77</td>
<td>3872734,5</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>6109186,56</td>
<td>6712309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>2865050,04</td>
<td>4290266,6</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>4425236,70</td>
<td>3969842,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>5498768,09</td>
<td>9539415,4</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>7044590,71</td>
<td>7110910,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>10173986,09</td>
<td>6473038,9</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>11502664,53</td>
<td>7569999,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>6393191,59</td>
<td>4327488,8</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>6540434,30</td>
<td>6713181,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>4629679,12</td>
<td>4485943,86</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
When Table 1 is examined, it can be seen that the ANN model is under the effect of seasonal fluctuations. In addition, the results indicate that, estimations of tourism income are closer to the real values. (Actual value = 4629679.12, while the ANN estimate = 4485943.86). The graph of real and estimated tourism income values are also given in Figure 3.

As a result of statistical analysis, ANN estimated values and actual tourism expenditure values are given in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Annual Quarter</th>
<th>Tourism Expenditure</th>
<th>ANN Estimated Expenditure</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Annual Quarter</th>
<th>Tourism Expenditure</th>
<th>ANN Estimated Expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>658012.03</td>
<td>715329.27</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1401450.74</td>
<td>1266584</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>479027.35</td>
<td>728323.95</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1540463.63</td>
<td>1366560.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>777261.00</td>
<td>764476.67</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1225842.18</td>
<td>1195243.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>510526.60</td>
<td>714082.63</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1363729.05</td>
<td>715329.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>784075.73</td>
<td>767187.17</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>870185.87</td>
<td>1253002.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>679526.30</td>
<td>725428.75</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1286535.18</td>
<td>1115133.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>823292.81</td>
<td>819522.71</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1060833.53</td>
<td>1209954.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>667565.71</td>
<td>719882.42</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1375834.77</td>
<td>1183690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>973995.04</td>
<td>1175108.5</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1205354.73</td>
<td>1258100.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>745259.78</td>
<td>753273.43</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1286831.00</td>
<td>1193270.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>859450.90</td>
<td>1064765.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1224441.00</td>
<td>1210082.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>815895.87</td>
<td>798304.04</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1536938.08</td>
<td>1195083.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>861971.99</td>
<td>1079308.5</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1365769.58</td>
<td>1361057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>821773.04</td>
<td>814298.01</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1402782.96</td>
<td>1253925</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>936933.28</td>
<td>1170106.9</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1178169.79</td>
<td>1266973.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>650269.27</td>
<td>711557.07</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1523758.80</td>
<td>1191365.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>765000.19</td>
<td>760134.57</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1282504.30</td>
<td>1342007.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1013811.56</td>
<td>1179479.7</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1542831.69</td>
<td>1208284.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>924511.90</td>
<td>1167978.6</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1344630.36</td>
<td>1370337.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1339959.74</td>
<td>1240375.4</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1528456.60</td>
<td>1243106.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>913908.84</td>
<td>1165584.5</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1537627.05</td>
<td>1348500.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1143814.93</td>
<td>1189314.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1509692.59</td>
<td>1362120.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>909792.38</td>
<td>1164361</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1131773.28</td>
<td>1324695.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1298680.72</td>
<td>1215727.7</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>870700.09</td>
<td>1188594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1024785.76</td>
<td>1180546.5</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>855785.70</td>
<td>1116842.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1059157.85</td>
<td>1183555.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1386361.80</td>
<td>1040621.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1288080.59</td>
<td>1210628.1</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1560756.30</td>
<td>1261884.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1718416.18</td>
<td>1131710.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1334339.55</td>
<td>1400169.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1135885.56</td>
<td>1188841.9</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1079007.76</td>
<td>1236975.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1345250.14</td>
<td>1243460.7</td>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>1650275.89</td>
<td>1185087.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1563345.21</td>
<td>1404494.9</td>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>1209379.14</td>
<td>1304719.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>1830039.06</td>
<td>1403781.8</td>
<td></td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>957647.35</td>
<td>1193606.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>1066706.49</td>
<td>1173049.08</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 also indicates that, estimations of tourism expenditure for the first quarter of 2019 are closer to the real values. (Actual value = 1066706.49, while the ANN estimation= 1173049.08). The graph of real and estimated tourism expenditure values are also given in Figure 4.
Figure 3. Output values of the ANN model and figure of actual values for tourism income

Figure 4. Output values of the ANN model and figure of actual values for tourism expenditure

RMSE values of the ANN models are given in Table 3. The RMSE of the model obtained from tourism income is 2625378,999 and the RMSE of the model obtained from tourism expenditure is 230673,1382.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RMSE</th>
<th>Tourism Income</th>
<th>Tourism Expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Income</td>
<td>2625378,999</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Expenditure</td>
<td>230673,1382</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

As it is mentioned in earlier sections of this study, tourism income and expenditures are important indicators of economy for any country. Any information of these indicators for the future may also help the government to make provisions against any unexpected situation. At that point as obtaining errorless
data, using the correct variables and choosing the correct statistical analysis is also much important. In this it was not possible to interfere the data set and the variables, however estimations of the related time series are done by ANN which is one of the most effective time series analyzing method.

Because of the efficiency on estimating the time series of ANN, this method became much popular in recent years. Even there are many time series analyzing methods, this technique power of this technique is also related with using the pre information of related data set. At that point it can be recommended to the researchers to obtain the forecasts of any time series about tourism via ANN.

REFERENCES


With win-win policy in the context of accessible Tourism it is possible, on the one hand, to spread tourism to 12 months, to increase employment, to increase occupancy-income rates and to make tourism activities sustainable, and on the other hand, to enable people with disabilities to integrate with the society by eliminating the legal, socio-cultural, environmental and economic barriers for them. The aim of this study is to determine the readiness of accommodation enterprises for accessible tourism by profiling the academic studies in related to “the point of view of accommodation enterprises towards disabled tourism”. For this purpose, scientific studies which are related to the perspective of the accommodation enterprises to accessible tourism from 2006 to the present; articles in the database of Ulakbim, proceedings which are published in congress books in the Google Scholarly Database and graduate theses which are registered at the National Thesis Center on the website of the Council of Higher Education, have been evaluated within the framework of the parameters such as publication year, research subject, domestic resource. In the light of the findings, it was observed that the managers of the accommodation enterprises were interested in the subject of accessible tourism, but they did not have sufficient knowledge and awareness, and legal, structural and organizational arrangements are not possessed in the accommodation enterprises adequately.

Keywords: Disability, Accessibility, Accessible Tourism, Accommodation Enterprises

INTRODUCTION

The World Health Organization Report (WHO 2011) estimates that more than one billion people in the world population of 2010, in other words, approximately 15 percent of the world’s population, suffer from any kind of disability. This number and ratio is increasing day by day. Legal, structural and administrative arrangements are being made in order to ensure that the increasing population of people with disabilities is able to live like other people in society. Together with these regulations, especially in developed countries, social and economic supports provided for the purpose of integrating the disabled people to the society instead of assimilating them have started to provide touristic travel and accommodation activities like the other healthy people of the society.

It has made significant improvements in the social and economic opportunities for the disabled in Turkey. Hospitality industry is one of the major subsystems of the tourism industry of Turkey. According to the data of 2019 (KTB 2019), the number of rooms with accommodation (investment and operation certificate) within the Ministry of Culture and Tourism has reached 569,886 and the number of beds has reached 1,200,122 units. However, there are various legal, structural and managerial barriers and deficiencies about accessibility in tourism in hospitality enterprises. According to the Turkey Disability Studies conducted by Turkey Statistical Institute (TSI) in 2002 was reported to be 12.29% rate of disability in Turkey. As of 2018, the population of Turkey is considered to exceed 82 million, it is understood that the number of disabled people exceeded 10 million, according to this rate. Accordingly, given that 10 million
people with disabilities only 5700 rooms designed in accommodation enterprises in Turkey, it is seen that 1754 disabled people have one disabled room.

In the context of accessible tourism, as well as determining the needs, problems, expectations and ways of solution of the disabled that represent the demand side, it is also important to determine the point of view of the accommodation enterprises that provide hospitality services to disabled people and are among the units represent the supply side. This study, which reveals the perspectives of accommodation enterprises managers on accessible tourism, is thought to make significant contributions to literature of accessible tourism and the related public institutions, particularly the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, in the decision-making processes related to accessible tourism.

LITERATUR REVIEW

According to the World Health Organization, disability is a part of human condition. Everyone will be temporarily or permanently weakened at a certain point in their lives, and for many years people will face increasing difficulties in performing their functions. Disability is complex and interventions that overcome the disadvantages associated with disability are multiple and systemic and vary in context (WHO 2011). Disability is a multidimensional structure, each dimension has its own access requirement and they differ significantly from one another. In this context, multi-dimensional structures; mobility, hearing, vision, cognitive / mental health, hidden sensitivities and long-term health conditions are accepted by disability statistics (Buhalis and Darcy 2011).

Accessibility is closely related to universal design, the process of creating products that can be used by people with the widest range of capabilities, operating in the widest possible range of areas. Darcy (1998) divides accessibility into three dimensions as physical, sensory and communicative access. In this context, it can be said that accessibility in tourism and travel depends on three factors. These are the capacity of people with disabilities to transport and travel, the capacity to communicate, and the availability of opportunities and activities.

Accessible tourism, whose main component is people with disabilities, is defined as a form of tourism involving cooperation processes among the stakeholders that enable people with access needs, including mobility, vision, hearing and cognitive dimensions, to operate independently, equally and respectfully through the provision and delivery of universally designed tourism products and services (Buhalis and Darcy 2011). The accessible tourism approach requires cooperation between the stakeholders in supply and demand. The availability of infrastructure and accessible tourism enterprises is important for destination choices of disabled tourists wishing to participate in tourism activities. Although the preferred destination is accessible, disabled tourists can change destination preferences or cancel their travel if they cannot find suitable accommodation facilities, particularly suitable accommodation facilities, for indoor and outdoor accessibility. As can be seen, accommodation enterprises are located in the center of accessible tourism activities. In a tourism destination where accommodation services are not accessible, it is not possible to implement a sustainable accessible tourism in universal design.

In this theoretical study, it is aimed to reveal bibliometric profile of the studies within the framework of various parameters in the years between 2006-2019 in the tourism literature in Turkey to reveal and evaluate the perspective of accommodation enterprises towards disabled tourists and accessible tourism. For this purpose, postgraduate theses, papers presented in scientific congresses and articles in local tourism journals, which are registered in the internet address of the Higher Education Council, were examined in terms of some bibliometric parameters (year of publication, subject of study, national research).

METHOD

Zencir and Kozak (2012) stated that bibliometric analysis is a method used to reveal the scientific performance of academic institutions, and for this purpose, the profile of articles on tourism in the journals published by Social Science Institutes. Similarly, in this study, it covers domestic studies on the perspectives of hospitality enterprises towards disabled tourism. For this purpose, the studies published in the period of 2006-2019 revealing the perspectives of accommodation enterprises towards tourism are searched. As a result of the researches, graduate theses, papers and articles were obtained with the keywords, “disabled tourism”, “accessible tourism” and “accommodation enterprises”, with 4 theses master, 5 papers and 6 articles were included in the research. The year of publication, the subject of study, the publication language and the Turkish language of the study are the determined parameters. The contents of the parameters can be explained as follows.

Year of publication: This parameter defines the academic studies published between 2006-2019.
The subject of study: In this parameter, it refers to the academic studies conducted on the perspectives of accommodation processes towards disabled tourism.

Work area: Research subjects of national studies conducted to determine whether they are ready for the disabled tourist accommodation enterprises in Turkey were examined.

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

The academic studies examined were analyzed with research methods, working groups (sample) and data collection techniques and their findings are presented below. When the studies of the last thirteen years are examined in Table 1, it is seen that the quantitative method is predominant and the qualitative method is in the minority between 2006-2019. Between 2006-2019, there were a total of 15 academic studies, including 5 presented papers, 4 graduate theses and 6 articles, which were included in the study in accordance with the criteria. Twelve of the studies were carried out quantitatively, 2 were qualitative and 2 were mixed methods. Survey, semi-structured interview and interview studies are among the general data collection methods.

The results of the systematic analysis of the academic studies on accessible tourism, disabled tourism and accommodation enterprises are presented in Table 2. In general academic studies (papers, articles, graduate thesis), it is revealed that accessible tourism is given wide coverage by the manager, the operator or by the enterprise. Another finding that emerges as a result of systematic analysis is the fact that studies on people with disabilities in demand for disabled tourism are in the minority.

In the academic studies conducted between 2006-2019 (papers, articles, graduate thesis), the information obtained in accordance with the opinions of business executives about accessible tourism are as follows:

- **Hospitality managers have a positive perspective on accessible tourism, but they do not have sufficient knowledge and experience.**

According to the inferences obtained from the studies on the regulations of accessible (disabled) tourism, the point of view of the accommodation business owner / managers towards accessible tourism or the studies on disabled market awareness, it is understood that cities and accommodation enterprises are not fully ready for disabled tourism. It is seen that many business owners or managers do not have sufficient information on this subject and although the disabled tourism market is seen as an important market, they are not fully aware of this market. In addition, while it is understood that managers’ attitudes towards people with disabilities are positive, they do not have enough information and awareness about accessible tourism.

- **Accommodation establishments are not ready for accessible tourism for legal, structural and administrative reasons.**

Made in a systematic review results, accessible accommodation establishments in Turkey (disabled) tourism, legal, structural and managerial aspects have emerged are not ready yet. Although accommodation establishments comply with legal regulations, according to the legal regulations of developed countries, they are inadequate to provide quality services to people with disabilities. In addition to legal regulations, accommodation establishments are structurally far from meeting the needs of people with disabilities in terms of both indoor and outdoor arrangements. In addition, they do not have sufficient managerial information on how to provide services to people with disabilities because they do not have training and certification systems on accessible tourism.

- **Most hospitality managers do not have sufficient awareness of the importance of the accessible tourism market.**

The number of people with disabilities who have a disability for any reason is increasing rapidly as the life span of people increases. There is a tremendous capacity for people with disabilities to participate in tourism activities all over the world. In this context, it is seen that the managers of accommodation establishments do not have sufficient knowledge and awareness about the place and importance of accessible tourism in sustainable tourism.

- **The services provided to people with disabilities in accommodation establishments are not sufficient.**

The service provided to disabled people in accommodation establishments is perceived only for the use of rooms and therefore most of the arrangements are directed to the disabled room. While disabled people should be able to benefit from independent and equal accommodation activities without being dependent on anyone, it is seen that all spaces, both indoors and outdoors, are designed without considering disabled people. It is stated that there are no regulations in accordance with the universal design for the comfortable use of people with disabilities in restaurants, pools, gardens and beaches.
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

In the definition of the United Nations, there are many physical, social, cultural and economic barriers to the participation of people with disabilities to the tourism activities, which are defined as the largest and special minority of the world. In the line with the studies investigating the perspectives of the accommodation enterprises to the accessible tourism, the things that should be done for the accommodation enterprises to be ready for accessible tourism can be summarized as follows:

- **Accessible legal and structural arrangements with universal design should be made.**

Existing accommodation establishments should be made in compliance with new regulations and accessibility standards and new facilities should be designed according to these standards (Uslu, 2019: 98). In line with the legal regulations on the rights of people with disabilities, regulations and improvements should be made in the legal legislation taking into consideration universal designs. The accommodation enterprises in Turkey should go to an arrangement for increasing the number of rooms designed for disabled guests and increase the number of available handicapped rooms should be provided (Bulgan, 2014: 172; John, 2018: 148; Attack, 2008: 71).

While determining the arrangements to be made, not only people with physical disabilities, but also people with disabilities with visual, hearing, speech and other types of disabilities should be taken into consideration (Burak, 2018: 148). According to the managers of accommodation establishments, the biggest expectation of the disabled from the accommodation establishments is the arrangements for the disabled (Kırlar, 2013: 191). First of all, improvements should be made in the legal legislation in our country in the light of the legal regulations of the modern world regarding the rights of people with disabilities. However, the regulations required for disabled people in accommodation enterprises should be reviewed and expanded in accordance with international standards (Eryilmaz, 2010: 118).

- **Accommodation establishments that meet accessible tourism criteria should be given a Disabled Friendly Accommodation Certificate.**

In order to encourage tourism enterprises, the Ministry of Culture and Tourism may issue a “Disabled Friendly Accommodation Facility” certificate to enterprises that have structural designs according to universal standards for the disabled. Enterprises can increase their share in the disabled tourism market and thus our country by introducing themselves in both domestic and foreign markets with this certificate (Eryilmaz, 2010: 119). The certificate application can be used to indicate the difference between accommodation enterprises and other accommodation enterprises that provide services to disabled guests according to universal standards. Accommodation companies that make investments for people with disabilities who are sensitive to universal values and comply with universal rules and who are deemed eligible for certification should also benefit from privileges such as tax relief and incentives (Uslu, 2019: 98; Eryilmaz, 2010: 119). In addition, accommodation establishments should be sensitive about providing quality services for disabled people and should provide accurate and complete information about the services they offer (Burak, 2018: 148).

- **Certified and applied in-service and out-of-service trainings should be provided to staff on accessible tourism.**

Psychologically and physiologically, people with disabilities are more sensitive than healthy people. The wrong attitude and behavior towards them will not only make these people unhappy, but will also negatively affect their level of satisfaction with the enterprise. In this context, informative trainings should be given about accessible tourism in order to raise the awareness of accommodation enterprises managers about disabled tourism (Uslu, 2019: 98). Persons with accessible tourism education certificate should be employed. For these reasons, theoretical and practical training on how to treat disabled guests should be added to in-service and out-of-service training programs. However, as stated above, business employees should be composed of trained personnel who are familiar with sign language, who have knowledge of how to treat a disabled individual. Employees should be informed more about providing services to disabled people (Atak, 2008: 71). If necessary, the Ministry of Tourism should prepare hotel programs and trainings about how to treat disabled people by educating their staff about this issue (Burak, 2018: 148).

- **Instead of assimilating disabled people in accommodation establishments should be integrated with other people.**

Hospitality managers should not exclude people with disabilities from other healthy people; Using the same pool, restaurant and beach with other people with disabilities will make them both psychologically and physiologically satisfied. Studies have shown that people with disabilities do not want to take a holiday together with people with disabilities like themselves and that they want to spend time with healthy individuals (Yenişehrlioğlu, 2013: 78).
In addition, arrangements for disabled people in accommodation establishments should be designed not only for a specific type of disability, but to cover all disability groups (types) (Burak, 2018: 148).

- Accommodation establishments should provide accurate and adequate information to people with disabilities taking into account their disability.

Accommodation establishments must provide timely information to enable people with disabilities to act safely, comfortably and freely within the accommodation enterprise, taking into account the types of disability. The use of elevators should be informed according to the disability types (hearing, vision and physical disability). In this context, accommodation facilities, elevators, stairs, pools, beaches and roads should be designed to suit all types of barriers at a universal level, affective surfaces, audible warnings and wheelchair users should have a large interior space. There should be clear, comprehensible, general warning, signs showing the characteristics of general and accessible areas within the accommodation establishment, they should be sensitive about providing quality services for the disabled, and should provide accurate and complete information about the services they offer (Burak, 2018: 147). At the same time, hotel managers should be made aware of accessible tourism by the Ministry of Tourism (Atak, 2008: 71).

As a result, in the tourism sector, where there is intense global competition in line with the win-win policy, the managers of public sector and the managers of accommodation enterprises should have the necessary knowledge, awareness and awareness about accessible tourism in the context of sustainable tourism.

Further studies can be extended to databases, topics and / or year breaks. In this way, this study which is prepared in systematic review method can be enriched. This study focuses on the perspectives of accessible tourism accommodation businesses in Turkey. In the future studies, the activities of accommodation companies operating in other countries on accessible tourism and their managers' perspectives on accessible tourism can be evaluated. Thus, in Turkey and accommodation businesses in foreign countries it can be analyzed in comparison to the systematic review methods.

REFERENCES


### Tables

#### Table 1. Studies Included in Systematic Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Researcher(s)</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Data Collection Tools</th>
<th>Sampling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Toker and Kaçmaz</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>81 senior managers of accommodation enterprises in Alanya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Yılmaz, Şahin and Avcıkurt</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>52 managers working in 5 star accommodation enterprises in Belek</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Emiroğlu and Demirkol</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>50 accommodation enterprises managers at 4 and 5 star accommodation enterprises in Istanbul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Ayyıldız, Atay and Yazıcı</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>27 accommodation enterprises managers at 4 and 5 star accommodation enterprises in Kusadasi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>Şenol, Oktay and Ozmen</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>21 accommodation enterprises manager in Antalya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Bulgan and Çanıkçı</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>326 managers at accommodation enterprises in Antalya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Büyükşalvarcı, Şapçılar and Tuncel</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>15 accommodation enterprises managers in 4 and 5 star accommodation enterprises in Konya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Aydoğdu, Pamukçu and Yaşarsoy</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>Accommodation enterprises Managers in 6 Accommodations Enterprises in Kastamonu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Yaylı and Öztürk</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>252 accommodation enterprises managers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>Güçlü Nergiz and Akbıyık Ünsal</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Semi-structured interview method</td>
<td>11 managers in different sized accommodation enterprises operating in Kocaeli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Yenişehirlioğlu and Türkay</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Semi-structured interview method</td>
<td>Managers in 7 five stars accommodation enterprises and 5 four stars accommodation enterprises in Antalya / Managers in 10 five stars accommodation enterprises and 14 four stars accommodation enterprises in Istanbul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Eryılmaz</td>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td>Interview and Survey</td>
<td>40 managers in 4 and 5 star accommodations enterprises in Bodrum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Kırlar</td>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td>Interview and Survey</td>
<td>Managers in 17 accommodation enterprises in Izmir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Atak</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>Managers in 57 accommodation enterprises in Marmaris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>Uslu</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>318 managers at 4 and 5 star accommodation enterprises in Alanya</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Table 2. Results of Systematic Analysis of Research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Researcher(s)</th>
<th>Type of study</th>
<th>Findings, Highlighted Results and Theoretical Inferences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Toker and Kaçmaz</td>
<td>Presented Paper</td>
<td>It was determined that the managers' viewpoints of the tourism market, which are accessible to managers of accommodation enterprises, are grouped under eight sub-factors: business, legal regulations, travel agency, information and awareness, destinations, government and cooperation, value and gain and competence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yılmaz, Şahin and Avcıkurt</td>
<td>Presented Paper</td>
<td>As a result of the research, it was determined that managers are aware of the disabled market. Another important finding that emerged as a result of the research is that managers see disabled tourism as an important market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emiroğlu and Demirkol</td>
<td>Presented Paper</td>
<td>In the research, it was determined that most of the services provided to people with disabilities in accommodation enterprises have inadequacies, in general it is thought negatively about the disabled tourism market structure in Istanbul and most managers participate in what needs to be done to improve it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aydoğdu, Pamukçu and Yaşarsoy</td>
<td>Presented Paper</td>
<td>As a result of the research, it has been determined that both the physical structures and other structures and formations of the accommodation enterprises certified by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism in Kastamonu city center are not sufficient to meet the needs of disabled people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayyıldız, Atay and Yazıcı</td>
<td>Presented Paper</td>
<td>In the light of the findings, it is revealed that some enterprises do not reserve special rooms for disabled people. The majority of the participants believe that accommodation enterprises managers are not aware of the accessible tourism market. It is noteworthy that the majority of the accommodation enterprises managers participate in the inadequacy of the markings for the disabled and to focus more on legal and structural regulations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Şenol, Oktay and Özmen</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>It has been determined that the number of disabled rooms in the construction process of accommodation enterprises is taken into consideration in the legal regulations in the country and that there is no need to create more disabled rooms. It has been determined that there are deficiencies and inadequacies in the arrangements made for disabled guests within the accommodation business and some applications are made in accordance with the legal requirements. It was found that having a wheelchair in the facility and placing a disabled toilet stone in the bathroom was seen as a room designed for disabled people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Büyükşalvarcı, Sapçılar and Tuncel</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>According to the findings of the study, it was determined that touristic accommodation enterprises operating in Konya Province do not give sufficient importance to accessible tourism. It is observed that they behave more sensitively in areas such as rooms, corridors, general usage areas and bathrooms for people with physical disabilities, but visual signs for hearing impaired people and sound systems for visually impaired people are not sufficient. It has been determined that accommodation companies attach more importance to situations that require legal obligation, but they show less tendency and sensitivity to other areas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yaylı and Öztürk</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>It can be said that the viewpoints of accommodation enterprises managers towards accessible tourism and market are positive. In addition, it can be stated that as the number of stars given to the enterprises in line with the services owned and offered by the ministry increases the viewpoints of the accessible tourism market positively increases.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Güçlü Nergiz and Akbıyık Ünsal</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>According to the data obtained, it was determined that physical and structural arrangements for disabled people in accommodation enterprises were made in order to meet legal requirements and however, the existing regulations were only for the physically disabled and the requirements of the visually and hearing impaired were not taken into consideration. In this context, it has been tried to develop solutions for the sector.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yenişehirlioğlu and Türkay</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>As a result of the research findings, it has been determined that accommodation enterprises partially conform to the needs of disabled people in terms of design and architecture, but this suitability is not in a position and level where disabled people can move freely. As a result of the findings obtained from people with disabilities, it has been determined that accommodation workers or tourists do not have any negative perception of people with disabilities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgan and Çarıkçı</td>
<td>Article</td>
<td>It has been determined that the managers of accommodation enterprises consider themselves sufficient and competent in terms of service quality in terms of structural and hardware and service personnel in terms of providing service to accessible tourism market. Another important finding from this study have been identified that disabled guests come mostly in the less warm spring and autumn months.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eryılmaz</td>
<td>Thesis</td>
<td>As a result of the study, it was determined that the managers of accommodation enterprises were not aware of the importance of accessible (disabled) tourism market. In addition, it is revealed that touristic accommodation enterprises generally comply with the legal regulations which are obliged to fulfill for disabled people, but the related legislation is insufficient in comparison with developed countries in the context of universal design.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kırlar</td>
<td>Thesis</td>
<td>The findings show that there are some physical deficiencies and arrangements that need to be fulfilled within the scope of accessibility. In addition, it has been concluded that the opinions of the accommodation enterprises managers about accessible (disabled) tourism are positive but it is not yet suitable for accessible (disabled) tourism of İzmir province.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atak</td>
<td>Thesis</td>
<td>It was found that the managers of the accommodation enterprises were not very knowledgeable about the relevant market and that they were quite new and unprepared for this target market formed by people with disabilities and however, they were very willing to move towards the accessible tourism market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uslu</td>
<td>Thesis</td>
<td>According to the results of the study, it is concluded that the managers of accommodation enterprises in Alanya destination are not aware of the importance of the market for physically disabled tourism and they have similar opinions about accessible tourism, however they want to get enough share from accessible tourism.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Impact of Private Sector Theme Parks on City Hotels: The Case of Antalya Province

Serkan YORULMAZER
Akdeniz University
serkanyorulmazer@gmail.com

Murad Alpaslan KASALAK
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Akdeniz University
muradkasalak@akdeniz.edu.tr

Zeki AKINCI
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Akdeniz University
zakinci@akdeniz.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The increase in tourism facilities and recreation areas has led people to seek different places. Especially in today’s world, people want to spend their spare time as colorful and high quality as possible in their remaining time from the time they meet their work and vital needs, and to use their limited spare time in the best and unforgettable way. This is where the theme parks come into play. The theme parks are filled with different themes, cartoons and comic book heroes, science and technology elements, science fiction and fairy tales.

Theme parks do not only benefit people. They also cause serious changes in the location where they are established. Themed parks stimulate the economy in their area and provide local people with financial benefits. In this way, the local people who earn money, the theme park is protected and protected. One of the elements that experience the economic impact of the theme park is the city hotels. Particularly during certain periods (holidays, semester breaks), the theme parks can reach almost 100% occupancy rate as a result of the influx of visitors. Therefore, the aim of this study was to determine the effect of the theme parks operated by the private sector operating in the city of Antalya. Situation analysis, which is one of the qualitative research methods, was used as the research method. A semi-structured interview with theme park managers was conducted. According to results, the managers stated that the theme parks had a positive effect on the development of tourism in Antalya and the spread of tourism to 12 months. Also theme parks are thought to have made a great contribution to tourism. For example, the extension of the tourism season, the hotel occupancy rates, guests’ stay time, room prices and visitor profiles can be given as an example to affect positively

Keywords: Theme Parks, City Hotels, Antalya, Private Sector

INTRODUCTION

People enjoy the variety of things they like, such as movies, serials, music, legends, historical elements. This is also an important element that brings society together and causes it to socialize. For example, it would be a great pleasure if a well-liked film’s hero welcomes or accompanies people during their holidays, thus greatly increasing customer satisfaction and loyalty. In this context, theme parks and hotels have emerged, aimed to make people feel unfamiliar by bringing together elements that people already know and love, quickly adapting to the maximum enjoyment of their vacation and have enable customers to choose again. In this sense theme parks have been beneficial to the surrounding city hotels. Visitors who come to spend time in theme parks have preferred the city hotels for accommodation. In fact, theme parks have affected many factors such as the length of the season they come, room prices, length of stay, occupancy rates, visitor profile and services provided.
LITERATURE REVIEW

Theme Parks

In recent years, theme parks and attractions have become the most popular types of mass entertainment venues. Theme parks have become a relatively new entertainment concept that try to create the fantasy atmosphere of another place or time, while the recreational parks are gaining popularity at the turn of the century. Theme parks are generally designed to address the family as a visiting unit and are considered a leisure activity, as they provide an opportunity for entertainment in an individual's free time (Milman, 2001, s. 139). At the same time, the atmosphere and activity in the theme park contribute to the enjoyment of active participation by visitors in general. Visitors usually spend a day in the theme park (Bigne, Andreu, & Gnoth, 2005, s. 837). Theme parks, which are of great importance in the tourism sector, contribute greatly to the promotion activities and economic development of the countries and also support the tourism sector seriously. Theme parks, which create huge attraction centers in order to reveal the wishes and dreams of the people, are able to attract the attention of their visitors thanks to the innovations within them (Küçük & İnce, 2018, s. 19).

When the studies on theme parks were examined, Deniz (2002) examined the design principles of themed parks and gardens in his master thesis. Topaloğlu (2007) studied Ankara wonderland city park within the scope of the theme park concept. Gök and Bingöl (2017) examined the history of theme parks and the history and culture themed parks in their article titled “History and Cultural Themed Parks”. In her article Yıldız Altın (2017) wrote about the use of folklore in theme parks in her article on the unification of culture in the context of entertainment industry. In her master thesis, Yücesoy (2017) conducted a research to determine the theme parks and suitable themes for Bursa. In his book chapter, Özcan (2017) made an evaluation on the economic analysis of theme parks and the possible effects of Ankapark. In their articles, Aylan and Şalvarcı (2018) examined the importance of recreation areas in terms of urban tourism within the framework of Konya-themed parks. Küçük and İnce (2018) examined the concept of thematic park in Kayseri Anatolian Wonderland case. In his article, Tuna (2018) made an examination under the title of themed parks and child friendly tourism. Eyüpoğlu (2018) has written a master thesis on Theme park as a socio-cultural and architectural program: A critical review of Ankapark, Ankara. In his master's thesis, Gülhan (2019) evaluated the economic effects of theme parks in terms of tourism within the scope of Sazova Park.

A theme park can be defined as an entertainment product that combines tangible goods and intangible services. ‘Theme park product’ consists of three product layers (Birenboim, Anton-Clave, Russo, & Shoval, 2013, s. 605).

- **Basic product**: it is what the customer buys primarily: the excitement and / or atmosphere created by the visitors.
- **Material product**: the creative capacities of designers and planners are transferred to the content of the park (safety, driving, attractions and shows, brand name, quality of services, sharing the park with other people).
- **Increased product**: catering and retail, parking, services for visitors with special needs, complaints handling procedures, opening hours and weather.

The oldest theme parks in the United States came into activity in the last half of the 19th century. The first American amusement park was the World Columbian Exposition, held in Chicago in 1893. In 1897, Steeplechase Park, the first of three major parks, was opened on Coney Island in Brooklyn, New York. Introduced as a safe, clean, aesthetically appealing, creative entertainment facility in California in the mid-1950s, Disneyland has a unique design for both children and adults. Theme parks, especially regional parks, were endemic in the US in the 1960s and 1970s. Since then, in the 1980s and 1990s, most parks have been developed as destination parks (Heo & Lee, 2009, s. 447). The tourism industry is an important pillar of the world economy and in some economies theme parks make a major contribution. The US amusement park provides jobs for approximately 500,000 seasonal employees and generated $ 12 billion in 2007 (Dong & Man Siu, 2013, s. 541).

Theme Parks can be categorized as theme parks with adventure and entertainment theme, science fiction theme, nature theme and history theme according to the usage patterns of consumers. In terms of their size, these parks are scaled according to the number of visitors annually and classified as follows (Özcan, 2017).

- **Large Theme Parks**: Theme parks with more than 1 million visitors.
- **Middle Theme Parks**: Theme parks that reach between 250 thousand and 1 million visitors.
- **Small Theme Parks**: Theme parks with 250 thousand or less visits.
• **Large Amusement Parks**: Parks with more than 500,000 visits and an instant payment system.

• **Small Amusement Parks**: Amusement parks with an instant payment system with fewer than 500,000 visits.

Recently, modern theme parks and other theme accommodation facilities have adopted pre-existing elements as a key element in the development of the theme concept. These include folklore, mythology, legends, movies, places to see or popular TV shows. It is important to note that audiences are familiar with the story, but it is not so important to the guest's experience. Contemporary theme parks are the idea that the focus of creating new value for popular customers of the twentieth century shifts from commodity consumption to services and ultimately to experience. While today’s theme parks compete for providing entertainment products that are appropriate to the atmosphere and service, they have changed the meaning of mechanical driving or attractions to a post-modern interactive experience with storytelling involving five senses. In this modern theme park environment, employees have become actors in which their responsibilities to create a thematic environment are extended beyond their operational operational tasks (Milman, 2010, s. 231).

The impact of theme park operations brings both benefits and challenges to the local community and cultural order. A theme park in an area provides contact between residents and visitors. This may be problematic in areas where the inhabitants' traditional cultural order is quite different from that of park visitors. Also, when there is a significant socioeconomic difference between visitors and residents of the area, this can cause a problem. For example, problems may include misunderstandings and disagreements between residents and visitors due to the overcrowding of facilities and transportation, over-commercialization of trade, differences between languages, traditions and value systems, and violation of local dress code. Theme parks have a particularly high participation rate and therefore the density of visitors in space and time is a major problem. On the other hand tourism in an area can improve people's living standards and help to pay for improvements in community facilities and services if the economic benefits of tourism are well-distributed (Raluca & Gina, 2008, p. 637). In Table 1 below includes the 25 most visited Theme Parks, their number of visits in 2017-2018 and the percentage of change between them (Themed Entertainment Association, 2019).

### Table 1. 25 Theme Park 2017-2018 Visitor Numbers and Percentage Change in Numbers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ranking</th>
<th>Theme Park</th>
<th>% Change</th>
<th>Participation 2018</th>
<th>Participation 2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MAGIC KINGDOM THEME PARK AT WALT DISNEY WORLD RESORT, LAKE BUENA VISTA, FL, U.S.</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>20,859,000</td>
<td>20,450,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>DISNEYLAND PARK AT DISNEYLAND RESORT, ANAHEIM, CA, U.S.</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>18,666,000</td>
<td>18,300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>TOKYO DISNEYLAND AT TOKYO DISNEY RESORT, TOKYO, JAPAN</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>17,907,000</td>
<td>16,600,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>TOKYO DISNEYSEA AT TOKYO DISNEY RESORT, TOKYO, JAPAN</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
<td>14,651,000</td>
<td>13,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>UNIVERSAL STUDIOS JAPAN, OSAKA, JAPAN</td>
<td>-4.3%</td>
<td>14,300,000</td>
<td>14,935,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>DISNEY’S ANIMAL KINGDOM THEME PARK AT WALT DISNEY WORLD RESORT, LAKE BUENA VISTA, FL, U.S.</td>
<td>10.0%</td>
<td>13,750,000</td>
<td>12,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>EPCOT THEME PARK AT WALT DISNEY WORLD RESORT, LAKE BUENA VISTA, FL, U.S.</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>12,444,000</td>
<td>12,200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>HANGHAI DISNEYLAND, SHANGHAI, CHINA</td>
<td>7.3%</td>
<td>11,800,000</td>
<td>11,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>DISNEY’S HOLLYWOOD STUDIOS AT WALT DISNEY WORLD RESORT, LAKE BUENA VISTA, FL, U.S.</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>11,258,000</td>
<td>10,722,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>CHIMELONG OCEAN KINGDOM, HENGQIN, CHINA</td>
<td>10.6%</td>
<td>10,830,000</td>
<td>9,788,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>UNIVERSAL STUDIOS FLORIDA THEME PARK AT UNIVERSAL ORLANDO RESORT, FL, U.S.</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>10,708,000</td>
<td>10,198,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>DISNEY CALIFORNIA ADVENTURE PARK AT DISNEYLAND RESORT, ANAHEIM, CA, U.S.</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>9,861,000</td>
<td>9,574,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
City Hotels and Features

City hotels are the structures around the commercial centers. They have been created as complex facilities to meet the needs of cultural changes, sports activities, bed and eating and drinking. The rapid increase in tourist demand led to the revival of the hotel market and increased the diversity. As a result, there is a change from small hotels to modern urban hotels. This development in the hospitality sector has been at the forefront not only with individual and innovative hotel owners, but also with international hotel chains and their hotel designs (Fischer, 2008, p. 7).

City hotels are located in the city center and are mostly short-term or long-term businesses for businessmen to do their jobs. These hotels host business meetings, conferences, meetings and entertainment activities. Especially in European countries, accommodation and breakfast service is offered in this type of establishments. City hotels are built by converting private homes into accommodation and are usually built in populated centers or in places where tourists often prefer. Such facilities have been accepted and developed in terms of preventing the economic difficulties in traditional hotel management workforce and hotel restaurant applications (Aktaş, 2002, p. 24-29).

When determining the location where the city hotels will be built, the functioning of the city, the function that the region will load on the hotel and the architectural structure of the region are taken into consideration. The location of the hotel is located in a city center or cottage where construction is intense, and directly affects the general location of the hotel and its connection with the environment (Yakartepe, 2011, p. 83). For example, the choice of location of a city hotel built for business purposes, transportation vehicles, proximity to terminals, close to working areas and entertainment centers, having an appropriate architectural understanding with the environment is a reason for choice for business travelers (Yolcu, 2006). In addition, city hotels are improving the surrounding structures due to their structural function. The shopping centers, parks, restaurants, exhibition areas and commercial centers in the vicinity of the hotel develop according to the requirements of the urban environment in connection with the functions of the hotels (Mcneill, 2008, p. 384).
When the impact of theme parks on city hotels is examined, studies reveal that theme parks affect the occupancy rate of hotels. It is seen that the occupancy rates of the hotels located closer to the theme park are higher than those of the faraway hotels. For example, as shown in figure 1, Resort World Sentosa Hotels achieve higher occupancy rates than Singapore Luxury Hotels. Theme parks also allow guests to stay around the theme park, significantly extending their stay and increasing the tendency to revisit that destination. While being close to theme parks generally increases hotel occupancy, the distance to the city center should not be neglected. The fact that the hotels are close to the city center means that they are easily accessible. As seen in Disneyland Hong Kong and Sentosa Singapore, the proximity of the theme parks to the city center or the easy access to the city center leads to a high level of attendance for daily visitors (Sona & Lund, 2014).

![Figure 1. The Relationship of Theme Parks and Hotel Occupancy Rate](source: Sona, F., Lund, C., (2014), DNA of Theme Park Hotels, Colliers International, S. 4)

**METHOD**

Particularly in recent years, participation in tourism in line with the wishes of tourists has become focused on experience by leaving only sea, sand and sun coverage. Tourists prefer different experiences that add excitement to themselves, improve their personal skills and allow them to experience the excitement they have never experienced before. It offers experience to tourists with activities in themed parks. Therefore, the aim of this study was to determine the effect of the theme parks operated by the private sector operating in the city of Antalya. Within the scope of this aim, Themed Parks, which have become prominent in the popularity of attracting tourists in Antalya in recent years, have been selected and a research universe has been formed. The analysis units that make up the research universe; The Lands Of Legends Theme Park, a subsidiary of Rixos Hotel Group, Dinazor Park, a Tetra Group subsidiary, and Park Funtastic, a subsidiary of Dayoğlu Transportation. The analysis units that make up the research universe; The Lands Of Legends Theme Park, a subsidiary of Rixos Hotel Group, Dinazor Park, a subsidiary of Tetra Group, and Dayoğlu Transportation Tur Ltd. Şti. is owned by Park Funtastic.

Situation analysis, which is one of the qualitative research methods, was used as the research method. The case study, which is considered as a research method, has different names in the literature such as case study or case study. Qualitative research is an approach that focuses on understanding social phenomena in a realistic and holistic way within their environment (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2011: 39). In this context, he argues that social phenomena can be understood by separating the unique dimensions of a situation based on the relativity of the social world. The reasons for preferring the case study method in the research include the fact that the research subject wants to be examined in its own environment, to provide in-depth information about the subject, the research center to have its own characteristics and not to conduct studies on this subject before. In addition, this method is preferred because it allows the development of new theories by allowing to gather detailed information about a subject, event, business or region (Kılıç & Kurnaz, 2010: 46). As data collection tools in this method, Yin (1984) mentions 6 sources in the data collection process: 1) documents, 2) archive records, 3) interviews, 4) direct observation, 5) participatory observation, 6) physical structures
In the thought of establishing a Theme Park, Antalya was firstly favorable in terms of weather conditions, the idea of spreading tourism to 12 months and the investment costs were appropriate. The most important priority of the Theme Park is to ensure the complete safety and security requirements. The Land of Legends Theme Park, which aims to ensure that families spend quality and comfortable time with their children, sells memories to families. Tema Park has a surfing course, balloon up to 150 meters, adventure park, various character shows and dolphin shows.

When the guest profile of the park is examined, it is seen that 70% Russian, 20% European and 10% Turkish guests constitute the visitor profile. Before the construction of Tema Park, the tourism season, which was 4 months, increased to 10 months with its construction. However, the fact that Tema Park was free of charge allowed the price to be reflected in the room and significantly affected the income of the hotel.

In 2017, 600,000 people visited the Theme Park, which increased to 700,000 in 2018. The target is to reach 900,000 people in 2019.

**Findings of Park Funtastic**

Located in the Kepez district of Antalya, Park Funtastic is a thematic park full of sporting activities and entertainment for all ages and tastes.

Park Funtastic, the largest mountain sled in the Mediterranean region, also organizes various concerts. Park Funtastic’s peak season is spring and autumn, which includes activities such as sledding, ATV, Zipline, Amusement Park, Survivor, Paintball, Thematic Park, Go Kart, Pool Boat, Horse Track, Scoop Park and Bicycle Park.

60% of the visitor profile is composed of local adult visitors, 30% is student visitors and 10% is foreign visitors. The location of the park close to Konyaalti district, famous for its beach, has enabled tourists coming to this region to visit the park. The theme park has had a positive impact on the city hotels in the region. Although it has been 6 months since the completion of the opening and renovation of the park, approximately 200,000 people have visited.
alive with their looks and breaths. Dinosaurs known from films and documentaries can be visited within walking distance. The park, which has a Dinopark Excursion Track, includes various activities such as Planetarium, 7D Cinema, Fossil Pool, Climbing Wall, Dino-Vivor, Bumper Boats, Pool Games, Children’s Workshop, Mini Zoo, Trampoline and Pony.

Dinopark provides benefit for tourists staying in Göynük region to go out of the hotel and spend. In 2018, Dinopark visited 210,000 local and foreign visitors.

**CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION**

While tourism continues to spread throughout the world, the trend of sea-sand-sun trio is gradually losing. People have begun to demand not only to rest in their holidays but also to have fun by acting within certain themes. As a result of all these, Theme Parks have been established and started to be developed to meet these needs. Theme Parks have attracted certain audiences thanks to their various themes and continued to carry out their activities by increasing the number of visitors. With the various themes they have, they have managed to make people feel themselves sometimes in a film or a story. Theme parks, which are increasing their popularity all over the world, have become important contributors to the development of tourism. The increase in the number of people visiting Theme Parks every year supports this idea. The managers of the theme parks examined within the scope of the research stated that the theme parks had a positive effect on the development of tourism in Antalya and the spread of tourism to 12 months. New hotels have started to be built around The Lands of Legends which has become an important theme park not only in Antalya province but also in our country especially in terms of guest visits. In addition, activities such as the sale of souvenirs or local dishes in theme parks such as Park Funtastic and Dinopark provide economic benefits to local people in terms of tourism revenues. Braun (2001, s. 81) stressed the importance of theme parks in terms of tourism in his book on Economic Impacts of Theme Parks on the Regions and stated that Disneyland branded hotels are the most preferred hotels in the Anaheim region. At the same time, the activities taking place in these parks increase the satisfaction level of tourists by having different experiences. In this way, Antalya becomes a tourism city which has the characteristics of being a destination that attracts tourists only within the sea, sand and sun triangle. In addition, the increase of themed parks will lead to the formation of healthy generations who care about recreational activities.

In short, as a result of the research, Theme Parks are thought to have made a great contribution to tourism. For example, the extension of the tourism season, the hotel occupancy rates, guests’ stay time, room prices and visitor profiles can be given as an example to affect positively. Theme Parks in our country to reach the number of visitors close to the examples in the world; will make a major contribution to tourism and will positively affect the development of our tourism destinations.

**REFERENCES**


The Role of Unique Attractions in the Formation of City Image: The Case of Eskişehir Sazova Science Culture and Art Park1

Samet ÇEVİK
Assist.Prof.Dr., Bandırma Onyedi Eylül University
scevik@bandirma.edu.tr

Semih SARIİPEK
Lecturer, Bandırma Onyedi Eylül University
ssariipek@bandirma.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The image which is defined as the sum of beliefs, ideas, and impressions that a person has a destination, is also a valuable concept in the tourism development of cities. Factors affecting city image consists of functional characteristics, concerning the more tangible aspects of the city, such as infrastructure, environment, commercial activities, touristic services, recreation facilities, cultural activities and psychological characteristics, concerning the more intangible aspects, such as quality of life, hospitality of local resident and atmosphere of the city. In addition, another important element in the formation of the city image is unique attractions that belong to the city and integrate as the symbol of the city. This study focuses on the role of unique attractions in the formation of the city image. In this research, Sazova Science Culture and Art Park, which is one of the unique attractions of Eskişehir, was chosen as the case through the typical case sampling method by using the case study design. The aim of the research is to determine the image of the Sazova Science Culture and Art Park in the views of the visitors and to evaluate the contribution of this attraction to the city image of Eskişehir. For this purpose, TripAdvisor was selected for data collection and 265 comments between 01.08.2018-31.07.2019 were analyzed by content analysis technique. The findings show that Sazova Science Culture and Art Park has a strong positive image and this attractiveness also has a feature that shapes Eskişehir city image.

Keywords: City Image, Unique Attractions, Eskişehir, Sazova Science Culture and Art Park

INTRODUCTION

The success of cities in city tourism requires a strong image. Due to the complex nature of cities and the combination of many services, the formation of a strong image is not easy. The presence of strong image positions cities in a different place in the eyes of visitors and plays an important role in increasing the number of tourists in cities.

The dimensions that determine the image of a destination in the context of city tourism are: natural resources; general infrastructure; touristic infrastructure; tourist leisure and recreation; culture, history and art; political and economic factors; natural environment; social environment; atmosphere of the place (Beerli and Martin, 2004: 659). Some of these dimensions contain functional or more tangible characteristics of destination, while others are psychological or more abstract characteristics. Some images of destinations could be based upon observable or measurable characteristics such as scenery, attractions, accommodation facilities, price levels while others could be based on more intangible characteristics like friendliness, safety, atmosphere (Echtner and Richie, 2003).

Echtner and Richie (2003) asserted that there is one additional dimension of the destination image. According to Echtner and Ritchie, images of destinations can range from those based common functional and psychological traits to those based on more unique features, events, feelings or auras. From this point of view, the role of unique attractions in the formation of city image was investigated in this study. Sazova Science Culture and Art Park, one of the unique attractions in Eskişehir, which has rapidly increased in city tourism in recent years was selected as a research area in the study and the image of the park was tried to be determined in the light of the online comments shared by visitors.

1 “This work was supported by Scientific Research Projects Coordination Unit of Bandırma Onyedi Eylül University. Project Number: BAP-19-1009-097”
Sazova Science Culture and Art Park is the largest park in Eskişehir with an area of approximately 400 thousand square meters. The park consists of several parts. These parts are; Dream Castle which is a first of its kind in Turkey, Science Experiment Center where Turkey's largest planetarium in, Japanese Garden which was made in cooperation with the Metropolitan Municipality of Eskişehir and Japan Embassy of Turkey within the framework of 2010 Japanese Year events, museum ship, zoo, Esminiaturk which consists of the models of historical Turkic buildings, Turkish World Science Culture and Art Center, Aquarium, an open-air concert area for 1200 people, amphitheater and restaurants. Besides, within the park area, there is a large pond with various water sports, playgroups consisting of heroes, children's various activities they can do playground for water, playground for children with disabilities. Private sightseeing trains are available within the parking area (Eskişehir Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism, 2019).

Within the scope of the study, first of all, a literature review on the concept of image öncelikle was presented and then the results of the research which analyzed the comments between 01.08.2018 and 31.07.2019 about Sazova Science Culture and Art Park on TripAdvisor were explained and various suggestions were offered.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Following the early works of Boulding (1956) and Martineau (1958) who proposed that human behaviour is dependent upon image rather than objective reality, academic interest in several fields and discipline regarding the concept of image has been increased. The image concept has generally been considered as an attitudinal construct consisting of an individual's mental representation of knowledge (beliefs), feelings, and global impression about an object or destination (Baloglu and McCleary, 1999: 870). However, Dichter (1985: 75) viewed image as total impression which is formed as a result of the individual attributes. According to Dichter, image describes not individual traits or qualities, but the total impression an entity makes on the minds of others. It is the most powerful influence in the way people perceive things and should be a crucial concept in shaping marketing, advertising, and communication efforts.

The image of a destination consists of the subjective interpretation of reality made by the tourist (Bigné et al., 2001). Hunt (1975:1) described the destination image as “the perceptions held by potential visitors about an area”. According to Crompton (1979: 18), destination image is “the sum of beliefs, ideas, and impressions that a person has a destination”. In the context of destination marketing, image is a valuable concept. What the potential customers think about the natural attractions, climate, people or cultural life of a destination may shape images which detract from or contribute to successful development. Although a destination may have high quality of touristic attractions, a negative image may detract from realizing potential use or optimum touristic and economic development (Hunt, 1975). Destination image influences a tourist’s travel decision-making, cognition and behaviour at a destination as well as satisfaction and recollection of the experience (Jenkins, 1999).

In their study, Chen and Tsai (2007) revealed that destination image not only influences the decision-making process but also conditions after-decision-making behaviours of tourists. Destination image appears to have the most important effect on behavioural intentions, in other words intention to revisit and willingness to recommend.

The formation of the image has been described by Reynolds (1965) as the development of a mental construct based upon a few impressions chosen from a flood of information. In the case of destination image, this “flood of information” has many sources including promotional literature (travel brochures, posters), the opinions of others (family/friends, travel agents), the general media (newspapers, magazines, television, books, movies) (Echtner and Ritchie, 2003), and today especially internet and social media. Image is mainly caused or formed by two major forces: personal factors and stimulus factors. Personal factors are the sociodemographic characteristics, prior knowledge, needs, values, motivations, preferences and personality of the visitor. Personal factors, affect one’s cognitive organization of perceptions, thus also influencing the perceptions of the environment and the resulting image. The formation of image is closely related to sociodemographic variables. Sociodemographic variables such as age, gender, occupation, education level can cause differences in image perception. Motivations are one of the important determinants of the destination image as the reasons for individuals to participate in tourism activities vary. These motivations determine the image of the destination before and after the visit, and the image begins to shape through these motivations either consciously or unconsciously during the destination selection process. (Baloglu and McCleary, 1999; Beerli and Martin, 2004).

Stimulus factors consist of information sources, previous experience and distribution (Baloglu and McCleary, 1999). Information sources refer
to the amount and diverse nature of information sources to which individuals are exposed, including destination information acquired as a result of having visited the place (Beerli and Martin, 2004: 661). Fakeye and Crompton (1991) emphasized the role of information sources in image formation process in their model. Although individuals have never visited a destination before and have not been in the process of getting any information, they have an image about that destination. Gunn (1988) called this image as organic image. According to Gunn, many images are the result of readers’ assimilation of material from books, newspapers, etc. For example, children's geography or history books are probably the most influential in the early formation of images. The second level of tourist images, as called induced images, derives from a conscious effort to develop, promote, and advertise (Gunn, 1988). According to the model of Fakeye and Crompton (1991), at first tourists develop organic images for alternative destinations. With their motivation to travel, they enter into the process of active information search and develop induced images for alternative destinations. The extent of this search will vary from zero search, in which case the organic images are likely to be decisive, to extensive search, which may result in induced images that are substantially different from the organic images. Upon visiting the selected destinations, a tourist will develop a more complex image resulting from actual contact with the area. Complex images constitute the final phase of the process and incorporate experiences at the destination (Fakeye and Crompton, 1991). Experience may also influence the post-visit perceived image of the destination. When there is past experience, the criteria for decisions are strengthened, while the need to receive information becomes weaker (Beerli and Martin, 2004). Crompton (1979) revealed that people form their image on the basis of what they or their acquaintances have actually experienced at the destination. It implies that a destination cannot do very much to create an image of itself which is different from what it really is.

The complex image developed by individuals for a destination has both perceptual/cognitive and affective evaluations. Perceptive/cognitive evaluations referring to the individual’s own knowledge and beliefs about the object, and affective appraisals relating to an individual’s feelings towards the object. Cognitive image is related to destinations’ attributes, which can be functional/tangible and psychological/abstract. Affective image is related to the emotions that a tourist destination is able to evoke and is developed depending on the tourist’s psychological motivations. Finally, perceptual/cognitive and affective image together form the overall image of a destination (Baloglu and McCleary, 1999; Beerli and Martin, 2004; Martin and del Bosque, 2008; Stern and Krakover, 1993).

Echtner and Ritchie (2003: 46) asserted that each of the destination image components contains functional, or more tangible, and psychological, or more abstract, characteristics. Furthermore, images of destinations can also range from those based on common functional and psychological traits to those based on more distinctive or even unique features, attractions, events or auras. To the extent that Gartner and Hunt (1987:15) remarked that images should be built around comparative advantages. An area with unique natural resources or recreation areas should undertake an assessment of its comparative advantages and disadvantages and market accordingly. However, concurrent with assessing comparative advantages and disadvantages, perceptions or images held by prospective travellers should be ascertained.

**METHODOLOGY**

The aim of the study is to determine the image of the Sazova Science, Culture and Art Park, one of the unique attractions of Eskişehir, in the eyes of the visitors and to evaluate the contribution of this attraction to the image of Eskişehir. In the context of this aim, the study basically sought answers to the following 4 questions:

- What is the attribution of the visitors’ comments about Sazova Science, Culture and Art Park?
- What are the significant elements in the positive comments made by visitors about the Sazova Science, Culture and Art Park?
- What are the significant elements in the negative comments made by visitors about the Sazova Science, Culture and Art Park?
- What is the contribution of Sazova Science, Culture and Art Park image to Eskişehir city image?

TripAdvisor was selected for data collection and 265 comments on Sazova Science Culture and Art Park between 01.08.2018 - 31.07.2019 were included in the study. The data were analyzed by content analysis technique. Content analysis is not a mere description and depiction tool or technique as a selective, classifying and quantitative method. On the contrary, it is a method that investigates certain aspects of social reality through inference. (Gökçe, 2006: 19). The main purpose in the content analysis; to reach the concepts and relationships that can explain the data obtained from the research. The
process to achieve this purpose is to bring together similar data within the framework of certain concepts and themes and to interpret them in a way that the reader can understand (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2011: 227). In the research, the themes that were formed by coding the data were tabulated according to the frequency level and expressions that were evaluated as positive or negative were determined.

FINDINGS

Demographic Characteristics of the Visitors

The demographic data of 265 visitors who visited the Eskişehir Sazova Science Culture and Art Park were analyzed. When the data related to the gender variable is examined, while it is understood that 188 (70.94%) of 265 visitors did not specify their gender when they became members of TripAdvisor; 17 visitors (6.42%) are women and 60 visitors (22.64%) are men.

Data on the age variable indicate that 217 (81.89%) of the 265 visitors did not specify the age range. 18 visitors (6.79%) are in the 25-34 age range; 22 visitors (8.50%) are between the ages of 35-49; 7 visitors (2.64%) are in the 50-64 age range and 1 visitor (0.38%) is over 65 years of age.

The analysis in terms of the regions where the visitors of Eskişehir Sazova Science Culture and Art Park reside revealed that 95 visitors (35.85%) came from the Marmara Region, followed by Central Anatolia with 55 visitors (20.75%) and the Aegean Region with 29 visitors (10.94%). While 5 visitors (1.89%) from the Mediterranean Region, 5 visitors from the Black Sea Region (1.89%), 2 visitors from the Eastern Anatolia Region (0.75%), 1 visitor from the Southeastern Anatolia Region (0.38%) and 1 visitor from abroad (0.38%) visited Sazova Science Culture and Art Park. According to the data, Sazova Science Culture and Art Park attracted the most visitors from Istanbul (65 visitors, 24.53%). 11.32% (30 visitors) of the visitors were Eskişehir local people. 72 visitors (27.17%) did not specify their city of residence when they became members of TripAdvisor.

Visitors Ratings

TripAdvisor allows visitors to rate from 1 to 5 points the destinations they visited. In this evaluation, 5 points are expressed as “excellent”, 4 points as “very good”, 3 points as “average”, 2 points as “poor” and 1 point as “terrible”. The evaluation scores of the visitors who visit Eskişehir Science Culture and Art Park are shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Visitors Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Visitor Rating</th>
<th>Number of visitors</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>73.21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>19.62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean 4.64

According to Table 1, while 194 (73.21%) of 265 visitors stated Sazova Science Culture and Art Park as an “excellent” attraction, 52 visitors (19.62%) stated it as “very good”. While 15 visitors (5.67%) stated their experience was “average”, 2 visitors (0.75%) stated that their experience was “bad” and the other 2 visitors (0.75%) stated that it was “terrible”. The average score given by the visitors was calculated as 4.64.

This score is very high and Sazova Science Culture and Art Park has received “Certificate of Excellence” from TripAdvisor. Certificate of excellence is a certificate issued by TripAdvisor to destinations, tourism and catering businesses that consistently score well from visitors, and has a significant impact on the preferences of potential tourists in decision-making.

Visitor Experience Dates

Table 2 presents data on the experience dates of 265 visitors who visited Sazova Science Culture and Art Park. According to this, 45 visitors (16.99%) visited the park in August. This is followed by 38 visitors (14.34%) in July and 37 visitors (13.96%) in June.

Table 2. Visitor Experience Dates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of Experience (2017-2018-2019)</th>
<th>Number of Visitors</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>January</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3.77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>8.68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>13.96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>14.34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>16.99%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>9.81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>9.43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Characteristics of Visitors’ Comments

When 265 visitors’ comments who visited Sazova Science Culture and Art Park between 01.08.2018 and 31.07.2019 were evaluated it was revealed that the majority of comments are positive.

The findings of the visitors’ comments are shown in Table 3. Accordingly, while 201 comments (75.85%) contain only positive statements, in 57 comments (21.51%) it was seen that positive and negative statements about the park were used together. Only 7 comments (2.64%) were completely negative.

Table 3. The Characteristics of Visitors’ Comments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Comments</th>
<th>Number of Comments</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Only Positive Comments</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>75.85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only Negative Comments</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both Positive and Negative Comments</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>21.51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Positive Comments

In this research, the positive comments of the visitors of Eskişehir Sazova Science Culture and Art Park about their experiences are grouped under certain themes. These data are shown in Table 4.

As can be seen from Table 4, 188 out of 265 visitors (70.94%) who visited Sazova Science Culture and Art Park used positive expressions to describe the park in general in their comments. Visitors described the park as “wonderful”, “magnificent”, “perfect”, “very big”, “very beautiful”, “symbol of Eskişehir”, “the pearl of Eskişehir”, “one of the first places in Eskişehir”, “compete with parks in Europe”, “to be appreciated”, “to be proud”, “peaceful”, “one of the rare parks”, “pleasing”, “very successful”, “incredible”, “heartwarming”, “spacious”, “garden of paradise”, “modern”, “fascinating”.

Table 4. The Distribution of Visitors’ Positive Comments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Number of Comments</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General expressions used to describe the park</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>70.94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideal for children and families with children</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>39.62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>38.49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dream Castle</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>33.58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having natural elements</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>31.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rest and enjoyment</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>27.92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity of activities</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>22.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pirate ship</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>22.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Zoo</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>21.89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clean, well- kept and organized</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>21.13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>20.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eti Underwater World</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>18.11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food and beverage facilities</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>18.11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sightseeing train</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>10.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science Experiment Center</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>9.81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parking facilities</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>9.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Esminiaturk</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair prices</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6.79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Favourable for photo shooting</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>6.42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For all ages</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>6.04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hiking and sports facilities</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5.66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sabanci Planetarium</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkish World Science Culture and Art Center</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.02%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Exemplary Park</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gift market</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close to the centrum and easy Access</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amphitheatre</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese Garden</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous innovation</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The fact that the Sazova Science Culture and Art Park is an ideal park for children and families with children had a positive impact on the experience of many visitors. 105 visitors (39.62%) accept that places and activities with lots of entertaining and educational opportunities for children as an important element of their experience. The rate of visitors who are satisfied with the park experience and recommend this experience to potential visitors in their comments is quite high. 102 visitors (38.49%) recommended their park experiences to potential visitors with the words "must visit," "worth a visit" and "it’s worth to be seen". The fact that the Sazova Science Culture and Art Park contains many natural elements is another important factor that keeps visitors satisfied with their experiences.

The findings show that 84 visitors (31.70%) argued that the natural attractions of the park as an important part of their experiences. The pond, swans, trees, green spaces and fresh air are the most popular natural attractions in the park. The number of visitors who think that Sazova Science Culture and Art Park is a suitable place for resting, having fun and having a pleasant time and sharing this element in their comments is 74. The fact that lies behind is that the park has many activities. This is an important factor that leads to a positive shaping of the experiences of many visitors. 60 visitors (22.64%) stated that they were pleased with the experience as the park had a wide range of activities. In addition to the variety of activities, the fact that the park is very clean, well-maintained and organized in general has affected many visitors positively. The fact that the park is completely clean, has an aesthetic appearance, the landscape and the cleanliness of the toilets are found to be in the comments of 56 visitors (21.13%). In addition, parking facilities are sufficient (9.06%), prices are affordable (6.79%), an ideal place for photographing (6.42%), appealing to all ages (6.04%), hiking and sports facilities (5.66%), a park to be taken as an example by other cities (2.64%), being close to the center and easy to access (1.51%) and continuous innovations in the park (0.75%) give positive direction to the visitors’ experiences.

The places inside Sazova Science Culture and Art Park and a variety of park-specific activities were also taken part in visitors’ comments. Dream Castle is the first among these. 89 visitors (33.58%) saw Dream Castle as an important element of the park experience, while the Pirate Ship (22.26%), Zoo (21.89%), Eti Underwater World (18.11%), food and beverage places (18.11%), sightseeing train (10.57%), Science Experiment Center (9.81%), Esminaturk (8.30%), Sabancı Planetarium (4.91%), Turkish World Science Culture and Art Center (3.02%), gift market (1.51%), Amphitheatre (1.13%) and Japanese Garden (1.13%).

### Negative Comments

In this research, the negative comments of the visitors of Eskişehir Sazova Science Culture and Art Park about their experiences are grouped under certain themes. These data are shown in Table 5.

#### Table 5. The Distribution of Visitors’ Negative Comments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Number of Comments</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paying for each place</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>6.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The disappointment of Dream Castle</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overcrowding</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to visit the park in hot weather due to lack of shade areas</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited food and beverage facilities</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some places are closed on Mondays</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The necessity of not raising expectations too much</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of a multi-featured park</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The need for improvement</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The disappointment of the Pirate Ship</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Far from the centre and difficult to Access</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not enjoyable to visit the park in cold weather</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No bicycles allowed in the park, continuous pedestrian</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The lack of service of the sightseeing train when the park is empty.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The disappointment of the Zoo</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of orientation signs</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requiring reservation of some places</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Airless of Turkic World Science Culture and Art Center</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-distance between places</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Could not visiting Sabancı Planetarium at all times</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disappointment of Science Experiment Center</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic at the exit of the park</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficient number of toilets</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficient number of staff</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Although it is forbidden to picnic, not following this rule</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No information at stops for the sightseeing train</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As can be seen from Table 5, the number of negative comments about Sazova Science Culture and Art Park experience of the visitors is far less than the positive comments. The negative comments of the visitors are divided into two as negative comments about the overall park and negative comments made on the basis of places or activities. One of the most important negative statements about the experience of the visitors regarding the overall park is to charge for entrance to every place in the park. 17 visitors (6.42%) stated that they were not satisfied with this and indicated a negative park experience. The fact that the park is overcrowded especially on weekends, holidays and in summer and queues at the entrance to the places is one of the factors that negatively shape the visitors’ experiences. 9 visitors (3.40%) suggested that the park should not be visited during the holidays due to the negative experience of this situation. The fact that the trees in the park have not yet grown enough to shade is one of the factors that some visitors mentioned negatively in their park experience. Because of this, 9 visitors (3.40%) stated that it is difficult to visit the park in hot weather. 7 visitors (2.64%) remarked that the food and beverage facilities within the park are limited. These visitors asserted that they had a negative park experience due to the crowded food and beverage places and the lack of different types of food and beverage. The fact that some of the places in Sazova Science Culture and Art Park do not serve on Mondays has a negative impact on the experience of visitors who do not this issue. 6 visitors (2.26%) suggested to potential visitors not to visit the park on Mondays by pointing this situation. 4 visitors (1.51%) expressed that the park is not a very special park in general and described the park as an ordinary, artificial and a medium quality park. Similarly, 4 visitors (1.51%) remarked that the expectations should not be raised very high, otherwise they might be disappointed while other 3 visitors (1.13%) stated that the park needs further development. Other negative evaluations of the overall park include that the park is far from the city centre and difficult to Access (0.75%); not enjoyable to visit in cold weather (0.75%); cycling is not allowed in the park and there is constant pedestrian (0.75%); insufficiency of orientation signs (0.38%); some places require reservation (0.38%); long-distance between places (0.38%); vehicle traffic at the exit of the park (0.38%); insufficient toilets (0.38%); the insufficient number of staff (0.38%) and the people who did not obey the picnic rule (0.38%).

The Dream Castle is one of the negative evaluations made on a spatial basis. In their comments, 10 visitors (3.77%) remarked that the Dream Castle looks beautiful from the outside but it is disappointed in the interior. The visitors mentioned this disappointment in their comments and suggested that it is unnecessary to enter the castle unless there is a child and participation in the activities is not considered. According to 2 visitors (0.75%) the Pirate Ship; according to other 2 visitors (0.75%) the Zoo and according to 1 visitor (0.38%) Science Experiment Center was disappointing. Other spatial elements adversely affected the experiences of visitors are the interior of the Turkic World Science Culture and Art Center is stuffy (0.38%); Sabancı Planetarium could not be visited every time (0.38%); the sightseeing train does not serve when the park is not crowded (0.75%) and no information at the stops for the sightseeing train (0.38%).

**Visitors’ Reviews of Eskişehir**

Visitors of Sazova Science Culture and Art Park also made the evaluations and definitions about Eskişehir in their comments. The findings regarding the evaluations of the visitors about Eskişehir are shown in Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Number of Comments</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yılmaz Büyükerşen and sense of municipality</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>20.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General expressions about Eskişehir</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>9.43%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As can be seen from Table 6, Yılmaz Büyükerşen, the Metropolitan Municipality Mayor of Eskişehir, and the sense of municipality are the leading evaluations of visitors about Eskişehir. 55 of 265 visitors (20.75%) commented that Yılmaz Büyükerşen is a successful and visionary mayor and that Eskişehir is a good example of municipalism and is managed with a social municipality understanding. In addition, visitors give congratulations to Yılmaz Büyükerşen and everyone who contributed the park.

On the other hand, 25 visitors (9.43%) used expressions evaluating Eskişehir in general in their comments. Visitors remarked that Eskişehir is in the mood of a European city and it is a very advanced city in terms of urbanism; as a capital of culture it is convenient regarding cultural tourism and is very rich in terms of places to visit; the residents of Eskişehir are both very lucky and host tourists very well.
CONCLUSION

In this study, which investigated the role of unique attractions in the formation of the city image, it was concluded that Sazova Science Culture and Art Park has a strong positive image in the eyes of visitors. Of the 265 reviews analyzed, the elements such as the positive comments about the park are much higher than the negative ones; the adjectives were chosen by visitors to describe the park; the fact that the park is an ideal area for children and families; harboring natural attractions; away from the stress of the city and including opportunities for relaxation, rest and fun; offering many activities together show that the park has become one of the first places that come to mind about Eskişehir in the views of the visitors.

In addition, it is understood from the results of the study that the existence of many different places with unique features including Dream Castle, Pirate Ship, Science Experiment Center, Zoo, Eti Underwater World, Japanese Garden and Sabancı Planetarium enhances the overall image of the park. Especially Dream Castle, Pirate Ship, Zoo, Eti Underwater World are the places where the visitors’ comments are much more and these places form the experiences of the visitors positively. Negative evaluations of the overall park are far less in number and are generally composed of fees, crowds and hot weather.

As a city which has gained acceleration in city tourism in recent years, the number of tourists has been continuously increasing. Eskişehir has become one of the most requested destinations for organized tours. In the study of Evren and Kozak (2012), it was concluded that the purposes of the visitors of Eskişehir are to sightseeing-entertainment, and to visit historical and cultural richness of the city. In the same study, according to visitors Sazova Science Culture and Art Park was one of the most attractive factors of Eskişehir. In support of this result, this study revealed that visitors identified the park as the symbol of Eskişehir and has a strong image as a unique attraction.

Another result of the current study is that the positive image of Sazova Science Culture and Art Park as a unique attraction also has an effect on the formation of the city image of Eskişehir. In their comments, the visitors made positive evaluations for Yılmaz Büyükerşen who has been the Mayor of Eskişehir Metropolitan Municipality since 1999. This situation is in parallel with the results of Evren and Kozak (2012). They concluded that the image of Yılmaz Büyükerşen is one of the most important factors of Eskişehir which visitors put in the forefront. In this study, visitors also mentioned that Yılmaz Büyükerşen is a successful and visionary Mayor. Besides, the positive comments of visitors about Eskişehir also show that Sazova Science Culture and Art Park reinforces the city image of Eskişehir.

In order to make this advantage sustained by Eskişehir with its unique attraction, the deficiencies mentioned by the visitors about the park should be eliminated. Efforts that will increase the awareness of the park in national and international media should be intensified. It is essential to have an active website and social media pages which include all the places and activities of the park together and constantly updates on developments and events. With the emphasis on marketing, promotion and public relations related to the park, the sustainability of this strong image provided by the park in terms of city tourism will be ensured.
REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

Today’s competitive business environment, complaint management should be considered as an important issue in solving marketing problems and for customer satisfaction. Companies must listen to their customers and give feedback. Customers must feel that their complaints and opinions are cared and problems are solved. Today's Internet technologies make it easier for firms and customers to interact with each other. The second generation of web based services is characterized by having complaint management which allow people to share information and opinions (Miguens, Baggio ve Costa, 2008). Online social travel networks are changing the way travellers plan their trips. These websites allow tourists to provide reviews of visitors who stayed in hotels before. One of these social networks is TripAdvisor which is well known around the world.

The aim of this study is to investigate online complaint management practices appeared in TripAdvisor. One five stars, one four stars, two hotels were chosen as samples which operate in Canakkale city center. For this purpose, the first fifty reviews about both hotels were examined which were written by Turkish and foreign customers. Hotels' answers were analyzed and evaluations were made regarding attitudes and complaint management of the hotels. Totally hundred costumer reviews were analyzed. Qualitative data analysis methods were used in the study. Customer comments were transferred to Excel program and reviews were analyzed by content analysis, which is one of the qualitative research methods. The research is based on the first fifty reviews of the two hotels made in TripAdvisor between July 15 and July 15 2019.

It is seen that there is no any response from both hotes to the reviews of Turkish guests. On the other hand, some foreign guests' reviews were responded. When the research findings were examined, it is seen that both hotels do not pay necessary attention and they do not care about customer complaints. In the study, it was concluded that customer complaints are generally related to the features of the rooms, personnel behavior and service quality. It is concluded that the customer satisfaction is related to the location of the hotel, the kitchen, the services offered (such as tennis court, spa) and staff characteristics.

Key Words: TripAdvisor, Complain Management, Çanakkale Hotels.

INTRODUCTION

Complaints management have been studied from a number of disciplinary perspectives. Complaints management is about resolving individual complaints and identifying opportunities to make systemic improvements. Every organisation that deals with the public or every business that market goods and services will receive complaints. People expect companies and organisations to be customer-focused and responsive to complaints. Companies and organisations are required to have complaints management systems (CMS) in place and be accountable for their decisions and actions (Queensland Ombudsman, 2019). In certain circumstances, customers become almost inevitably unhappy due to various problems or difficulties that are not always under the direct control of the company. Encouraging clients to express their discontent is the first step recommended to managers in their effort to systematically learn about customers' negative experiences, restore satisfaction and strengthen business relationships (Fornell, 1992).
Complaints should be considered an indicator of organizational performance assessment, signalling some problems or failures in internal processes that need quick recovery in order to avoid migration of profitable customers. Furthermore, organizations must learn that the consequences of losing clients are both profit decrease and negative word of mouth.

Consumers trust the comments shared on TripAdvisor (Taştan and Kızılcık, 2017). Users’ online comments are a tool that provides communication and information about tourism businesses for past and future customers (Sparks and Bradley, 2014). The aim of this study is to investigate online complaint management practices for two hotels in Canakkale throughout reviews published in TripAdvisor.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Complaint management is the process of dissemination of information aimed at identifying and correcting various causes of customer dissatisfaction (Fornell & Westbrook, 1984). It defines strategies used by companies to solve and learn from the previous mistakes in order to restore customer confidence in organizational reliability (Hart et al., 1990).

TripAdvisor is the world’s largest travel platform and helps 490 million travelers each month to make their trips easier. Travelers across the globe use the TripAdvisor site and app to browse more than 760 million reviews and opinions of 8.3 million accommodations, restaurants, experiences, airlines and cruises. Whether planning or on a trip, travelers turn to TripAdvisor to compare low prices on hotels, flights and cruises, book popular tours and attractions, as well as reserve tables at great restaurants. TripAdvisor, the ultimate travel companion, is available in 49 markets and 28 languages (Tripadvisor, 2019). As an evidence of the growing importance of online search and influence on travel behaviors, a survey of the hotel and restaurant industry in Europe in 2007 concluded that 80% of UK consumers are researching online before booking a hotel and half of them maintained to have refrained from booking a specific hotel as a consequence of a negative review on TripAdvisor-like websites (Pew Research Center, 2005).

In their study, Erdem and Yay (2017) found that restaurant customers complained about staff, then food and beverage, service, price, service environment and menu, respectively.

According to Alrawadieh and Demirkol (2015), the issues in which the customers make negative comments in accommodation establishments are determined as poor service quality, the quality and cleanliness of the facilities (rooms, bathrooms etc.), personnel attitude and performance, high prices, physical characteristics of the enterprise environment, food and beverage quality, not meeting the special requests of the guests, misleading promotion and information.

Sparks and Browning (2010) found that the negative reviews shared on TripAdvisor were related to the internal (external features of the rooms) and external (location of the hotel) factors of hotel businesses. In the study of Sparks and Bradley (2014), the typology of 150 negative comments received from TripAdvisor was analyzed and developed. The most criticized issues regarding negative comments are room features and staff. Then comes the ambiance and cleanliness.

In the study of Olcay and Sürme (2014), customer complaints in a four-star hotel operating in Gaziantep include general hotel services, food and beverage services, room comfort and cleanliness, respectively.

Gürkan and Polat (2014) examined 815 complaints made by domestic customers belonging to 34 accommodation establishments operating in 14 different regions in the Aegean and Mediterranean Regions. Service quality, facilities, staff, pool-bound and managerial. In particular, customers complained of inadequate and poor quality of food & beverage services, inadequate cleaning and hygiene, and inadequate and defective materials used in rooms.

In this study Filip (2013) found that customer complaining behaviour and subsequently on the development and implementation of the service recovery strategy.

METHOD

With the growing importance of social networking and online complaint management, the aim of this study is to investigate online complaint management practices for two hotels in Canakkale throughout reviews published in TripAdvisor.

For this purpose, the first 50 reviews of Turkish and foreign customers of both hotels were examined. Hotels’ answers to these reviews were analyzed and evaluations were made regarding hotel attitudes regarding complaint management. Total 100 customer reviews were analyzed.

TripAdvisor evaluates customers’ opinions based on five criteria: location, cleanliness, service, room and sleep quality. In addition, there is a section in the customer comments section where original evaluations of customers can be made. In this study, customer review of the hotel is analyzed according
to these 4 criteria. Customer reviews are classified in two ways as satisfaction and dissatisfaction. The customers were divided into two as Turkish and foreign and the reviews of Turkish and foreign customers were compared.

Qualitative data analysis methods were used in the study. Customer reviews were transferred to Excel program. Data were analyzed with Spss 22 analysis program. Customer comments were analyzed by content analysis, which is one of the qualitative research methods. The research is based on the first 50 reviews made between July 15 and July 25, 2019.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

When the first hundred reviews of two of the top ten hotels operating in Çanakkale center were examined, it was concluded that the accommodation was excellent between 40-50% in terms of room, service, cleanliness, location and sleep quality, and between 8-16 % bad and lousy. It can be stated that they are generally satisfied with the hotels located in the center of Çanakkale. Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent %</th>
<th>Perfect</th>
<th></th>
<th>Good</th>
<th></th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Awful</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>f</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95,0</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50,0</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23,0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14,0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaning</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95,0</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40,0</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26,0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14,0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>96,0</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>42,0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27,0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11,0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Room</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95,0</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>41,0</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26,0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12,0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep quality</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>96,0</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>43,0</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26,0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10,0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Customer reviews were examined in the research are grouped under 4 categories. Categories based on TripAdvisor customer reviews questions. These are:

1. Satisfaction from the rooms, the general cleanliness of the hotel, the care, the food and service, the attention of the staff, the restaurant.
2. Dissatisfaction with the general cleanliness, maintenance, food and service, the attention of the staff and the restaurant from the rooms.
3. Satisfaction or dissatisfaction with the general cleanliness of the hotel from the rooms, maintenance, food and service, the attention of the staff, some of the restaurants
4. Other complaints and satisfaction.

When customer reviews are evaluated according to category 1:

It is seen that most of the customers (70%) express their satisfaction clearly. For example, the phrase “hotel is very clean, staff is concerned and friendly”. Only eight of the satisfaction comments were returned by guest relation department.

Costumer Reviews 1: “Goog everything.”

Hotel Reviews: “Dear Guest XXX, Thank you for choosing XXX Hotel for your stay in Çanakkale and thank you taking the time to write a review on Tripadvisor.”

Costumer Reviews 2: “This it the location where you feel yourself at home with their great and friendly staff. We are very glad to hear that you liked our customer service and XXX Hotel’s Location.”

Hotel Reviews: “Dear Mr XXX, Thank you so much for your short feedback and we are truly delighted that you did enjoy your stay with us. We are very glad to hear that you liked our customer service and XXX Hotel’s Location. Looking forward to welcoming you back in the future. Best Regards, Guest Relations Department”

Costumer Reviews 3: “Amazing hotel with amazing facilities. Decoration is super/ wonderful kitchen.”

Hotel Reviews: “Thank you so much for taking the time to give us feedback. We are delighted to hear that you had a great service from our team.”
Costumer Reviews 4: “I was surprised to see such a large and modern hotel in Canakkale after the ferry ride into the older part of town. There was a supermarket across the street, a nice bar, a big game room and an inviting pool looking out to the Dardanelles.”

Hotel Reviews: “We really appreciate you taking the time to give us feedback for your stay at XXX Hotel.”

Costumer Reviews 5: “Modern with view of sea. Got beautiful pix of sunset. Buffet dinner included: Beef tips fish and vegetables were notable. Breakfast buffet OK. Room with shower, pergo floors, modern and clean. Thank you for choosing us for your stay in Canakkale and thank you very much for your excellent comment about us. We are happy to hear that you enjoyed your stay with us. We would love to welcome you again in XXX Hotel in the future.”

Hotel Reviews: “Dear Our Guest XXX, Thank you for choosing us for your stay in Canakkale and thank you very much for your excellent comment about us. We are happy to hear that you had enjoyed your stay with us. We would love to welcome you again in XXX Hotel in the future.”

Costumer Reviews 6: “Dardanelles, with a beautiful view of the strait from our two room suite. Dinner was very good. In addition, there is an indoor lap pool (note swimmers need to have a bathing cap), and the hotel offers spa services. There is nicely maintained fitness center, outdoor soccer field, and tennis courts. Wi-fi is available with strong signal.”

Hotel Reviews: “We would like to thank you for your nice comments. We are all very happy to hear that you had enjoyed your stay with us. We would love to welcome you again in XXX Hotel in the future.”

Costumer Reviews 7: “Room is very small and dirty, staffs are rude.”

Hotel Reviews: “We are very sorry to read that overall your stay was not satisfying. We do apologize that your room experience was not up to your expectation.”

When customer reviews are evaluated according to category 2:

It is seen that very few (14%) of the customers express their dissatisfaction clearly. For example, “the room is dirty, cleanliness is very crappy, the rooms are old, the staff are uninterested, the food is bad”. Only three of the negative comments were returned by guest relation department.

Spark and Brownin (2010), in their study, shared negative comments via TripAdvisor, the hotel operations of the interior (room features and customer services) and external (hotel location) determined that the factors are related. Similarly, Sparks and Bradley (2014) found that negative comments were mostly about room features and personnel behavior.

Costumer Reviews 1: “My wife and I agree that the room was not clean” (Costumer 74). Hotel Reviews: We really appreciate you taking the time to give us feedback for your stay at xx hotel. We do apologize that your room experience was not up to your expectation.

Costumer Reviews 2: “Stayed here for 2 nights as it looked like the smartest hotel in the area. Unfortunately, I would never stay here again in my life. Two major issues: 1. Most of the staff were rude and unhelpful (which was counter to all the other hotels we stayed at in Turkey), 2. The rooms were unbearably hot - a/c was not switched on and hot air was pumped into the bathroom. Made sleeping very difficult even with windows open. Definitely not what you expect from a 5* hotel. Best avoided at all costs.”

Hotel Reviews: “We are very sorry to read that overall your stay was not satisfying. As for the We would like to inform you that our goal is total customer satisfaction. XXX Hotel has several good reviews and recommended by several guide books customer service, it is very upsetting to read that it was beneath your expectations.”

Costumer Reviews 3: “Room is very small and dirty, staffs are rude.”

Hotel Reviews: “We are very sorry to read that overall your stay was not satisfying. We do apologize that your room experience was not up to your expectation.”

When the customer reviews are evaluated according to the category 3:

It is seen that 15 comments contain both positive and negative evaluations. Only two of these comments were returned by the customer relations department. For example:
Costumer Review 1: “Stayed here for 2 nights as it looked like the smartest hotel in the area. Nice looking hotel, wonderful location (by the sea, just out of town), great breakfast ... unfortunately I would never stay here again in my life because room is not clean. (Costumer 88).”

Hotel Reviews 1: “We really appreciate you taking the time to give us feedback for your stay at XXX Hotel. We do apologize that your room experience was not up to your expectation. Once again we would like to apologize for your dissatisfaction and would be happy to welcome you again in order to prove XXX Hotel quality.”

Costumer Reviews 2: “Though not loud, they were not silent. The hotel has a huge dining room with a generous buffet. The quality was pretty good. As you have experienced we have central heating for winter and self controlled A/C for summer in all rooms, the level of heat and weather can be adjusted from each room. We have checked the adjust switches of the heating system in all rooms whether it is working properly.”

Hotel Reviews 2: “Dear Guest XXX, Thank you so much for taking the time to give us feedback. We are delighted to hear that you had a great service from our team. As you have experienced we have central heating for winter and self controlled A/C for summer in all rooms, the level of heat and weather can be adjusted from each room. We have checked the adjust switches of the heating system in all rooms whether it is working properly. We would be happy to see you again in the XXX Hotel.”

When the customer evaluations are evaluated according to the category 4:

It is seen that one (%1) comments contain both positive and negative reviews.

Costumer Reviews 1: “The quality was pretty good. But my wife is not relax in the room so room is very hot.”

Hotel Reviews 1: “Dear Guest XXX, Thank you so much for taking the time to give us feedback. We are delighted to hear that you had a great service from our team. As you have experienced we have central heating for winter and self controlled A/C for summer in all rooms, the level of heat and weather can be adjusted from each room. We have checked the adjust switches of the heating system in all rooms whether it is working properly. We would be happy to see you again in the XXX Hotel.”

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Customer reviews do not consist solely of complaints. Positive or negative assessments are seen by potential customers. Customers consider customer ratings before booking a stay. As well as the extent to which the hospitality company cares about customer reviews is understood by looking at the response rate. Returning to customer evaluations is important for customer satisfaction. It is also considered as an attitude that will enable future customers to think positively.

According to the results of the research; When a total of 100 customer reviews are reviewed, it is seen that 70 of them are positive, 14 of them are completely negative and 16 of them are both positive and negative.

It was found that only 14 out of 100 comments were answered by the customer relations department. Of the 14 comments, 8 were positive, 3 were negative, 2 negative and positive and 1 were other subjects.

It is seen that there is no response to the reviews of Turkish guests. Hotels answer reviews of foreign customers. When the research findings were examined, it is seen that both hotels do not pay necessary attention to customer reviews and they do not care about customer complaints. In the study, it was concluded that customer complaints are generally related to the features of rooms, personnel behavior and service quality. The study concluded that the customer satisfaction is related to the location of the hotel, the kitchen, the services offered (such as tennis court, spa) and staff characteristics.
REFERENCES


Comparative Analysis of the Views of the Stakeholders Regarding the Needs of Tourism Faculty Undergraduates for the Development of Their English Communication Skills

Davut UYSAL
Lect.Dr., Anadolu Üniversitesi
davutu@anadolu.edu.tr

Cihan SEÇİLMİŞ
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi
csecilmis@ogu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to identify the needs of tourism faculty undergraduates to develop their English communication skills with a comprehensive needs analysis and to investigate if the stakeholders’ views about the students’ needs differ from one another. The study is considered to be important because it included all the stakeholders of tourism faculties in Turkey to provide a basis for a well-tailored vocational English curriculum and to increase the qualifications of tourism faculty graduates. In this study, graduates and undergraduates of tourism faculties, tourism lecturers and English language instructors at tourism faculties and executive representatives of the tourism sector were taken as the stakeholders. The population of the study covered all tourism faculties in Turkey. Sampling was taken from six different tourism faculties using the simple random sampling method with a questionnaire. The sampling of the graduates and executive sector representatives was taken from an Antalya-based association using the simple random sampling method again. Analysis of the research data helped identify which stakeholders differed from one another in the needs of tourism undergraduates for the development of tourism undergraduates’ English communication skills, and relevant suggestions are offered to manage the differences and thus to increase the effectiveness of the English courses currently given at tourism faculties.

Key Words: Needs Analysis, Tourism Faculties, English, Communication Skill

INTRODUCTION

The tourism sector is an industry that has increased its importance day by day and turned into a global industry especially in the last quarter-century (Veijola, 2010: 84). In parallel with this, effective and sustainable management of this rapidly growing industry gains importance and more qualified labour force is needed in the sector (İçöz, 1991: 15; Jafari and Sola, 1996: 229; Kusluvan and Kusluvan, 2000: 251; Haven-Tang and Jones, 2008: 353). Tourism faculties are the institutions responsible for raising this qualified laborforce in Turkey. The graduates of tourism faculties can’t reflect their tourism-related skills on the sector without having sufficient English language skills due to the international nature of the tourism sector (Kuppan, 2008; Hsu, 2010; Chen et al. 2011) because tourism is a sector where communication among individuals from different countries is intense (Davras and Bulgan, 2012: 231).

In the literature, there are many studies conducted on the students learning English for special purposes (Laborda, 2002; Blue and Harun, 2003; Lin et al. 2013; Lo, 2011). However, despite all the findings and suggestions of these studies, tourism faculty graduates continue to fail to use their foreign language skills as a means of communication following their graduation. In order to overcome such problems, it is necessary to determine tourism undergraduates’ language needs and expectations from language teaching processes correctly to be able to plan the objectives of vocational English courses and to create course contents in line with their needs (Allwright and Allwright, 1977; Mackay and Mountford, 1978; Widdowson, 1981; Hutchinson and Waters 1987; Waite, 1989).

Considering that English communication skills are very important for the tourism faculty graduates and that the failure of the tourism faculty graduates in using English for communication purpose is common, a detailed needs analysis needs to be conducted. Only in this way, it will be possible to design
English instruction effectively with the participation of all the stakeholders of tourism faculties. It is also important to find out whether there is a difference between the views of the stakeholders who have to jointly work to raise qualified graduates from tourism faculties. This study aims to fill in this gap in the relevant literature.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Since the services delivered in the tourism sector are generally abstract, the quality of the personnel employed in the sector increases the perceived quality of the delivered services and reflects positively on the customer satisfaction receiving the delivered services (Kelley, 1992; MacVigar and Rodger, 1996; Leslie and Richardson, 2000; Conlin and Baum, 2003; Haven-Tang and Jones, 2008). The opposite of this occurs when employees in the sector lack adequate foreign language skills, and thus the value of the tourist attractions offered to consumers and their satisfaction levels decrease (Leslie and Russell, 2006; Ghany and Latif, 2012; Akgöz and Gürsoy, 2014). For these reasons, appropriate English teaching and course design should be implemented to make tourism graduates effective foreign language users following their graduation (Leslie and Russell, 2006).

In the present circumstances in Turkey, the language practitioners and faculty directors' views are taken into account in the design of English courses but the vocational needs of tourism undergraduates for English communication skills are generally ignored (İgrek, 2013). However, Hutchinson and Waters (1991) emphasize the need to identify undergraduates' needs and to keep students at the centre of language teaching and course design.

METHOD

Quantitative data collection method was used in the data collection stage in the study. The reason for this is that it is more convenient to work with large samples (Carr, 1994). The questionnaire developed by Boran (1994) was used in the study. Three different versions of the questionnaire were adapted and no change was made in the content items except the demographic questions and rhetoric language. One version was adapted for the undergraduates, one version was adapted for tourism lecturers and English instructors at tourism faculties. The third version was adapted for the representatives of the sector and the graduates of tourism faculties. Each version was piloted on a group of participants with similar characteristics to the research population.

According to the reliability analysis of the pilot study, the Cronbach’s alpha (α) coefficient was found to be 0.89. This value indicates that the scale is a highly (α> 0.70) reliable one (Hair et al., 2010). The questionnaire was administered between July and September 2018.

Population and Sampling

The research population consisted of all the tourism faculties in Turkey. Therefore, the research population consisted of tourism undergraduates, tourism lecturers, graduates of tourism faculties, English language instructors and executive representatives of the sector. Due to the cost and time-related limitations, the simple sampling method was used in the sampling stage and sampling was taken from 6 different tourism faculties. In order to sample from tourism faculty graduates and sector representatives, the questionnaire was administered in an Antalya-based association whose members consist of hotel managers, by using a simple sampling method. The sample size of the participants was calculated by using the sample size table suggested by Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000) and it was aimed to administer the questionnaire on at least 384 participants.

A total of 448 questionnaires were administered to tourism faculty undergraduates by the researcher to six faculties. The questionnaire was replied by 90 tourism lecturers. A total of 32 questionnaires were delivered to the English language instructors at six tourism faculties and 22 questionnaires were returned. 130 members from the chosen regional association with around 1200 members filled out the related questionnaire. 60 of them were found to have a degree from a tourism faculty and the remaining was found to be sector representatives.

Purpose and Significance of the Study

This study aims to determine whether there is any difference between stakeholders’ views on the English communication needs of tourism undergraduates and to identify which stakeholders’ views differ from one another. Language learners, who are the primary resources in needs analysis may not be aware of their English communication needs. Therefore, it is the responsibility of the needs analyst or course designers to determine the needs of the students by ensuring the participation of all stakeholders in the needs analysis. The findings of such a needs analysis and designing courses in line
with the findings will lead to positive consequences for all stakeholders. To achieve success in practice, it is important to identify the differences in the views of all stakeholders regarding the needs of tourism undergraduates. Only with this way, it will be possible to design and successfully implement the courses that fully meet the communication needs of tourism undergraduates at maximum level, including the setting of effective course objectives, course materials, assessment tools and learning outcomes. In the study, the following hypotheses have been developed in order to determine the differences between the views of the stakeholders regarding the relevant needs of tourism undergraduates;

H1. Stakeholders’ views on the needs of tourism faculty undergraduates to improve their English reading skills significantly differ from one another.

H2. Stakeholders’ views on the needs of tourism faculty undergraduates to improve their English writing skills significantly differ from one another.

H3. Stakeholders’ views on the needs of tourism faculty undergraduates to improve their English speaking skills significantly differ from one another.

H4. Stakeholders’ views on the needs of tourism faculty undergraduates to improve their English listening skills significantly differ from one another.

H5. Stakeholders’ views regarding the effectiveness of the English courses offered in tourism faculties significantly differ from one another.

H6. Stakeholders’ views regarding the participation of the stakeholders in the design of English courses at tourism faculties significantly differ from one another.

H7. Stakeholders’ attitudes towards English significantly differ from one another.

This study is a significant one as it conducted a comprehensive needs analysis based on all stakeholders’ participation to find out the needs of tourism faculty undergraduates to improve their English communication skills and also focused on the possible difference between the views of the stakeholders regarding the needs for developing tourism faculty students’ English communication skills. It is not possible to design appropriate course content, to adapt appropriate teaching methods and techniques and to achieve already set course objectives in the cases where the language needs of the target students are ignored or are not determined appropriately.

Data Analysis

The data obtained from the study was submitted for relevant statistical analysis to determine whether there is a statistical difference between the stakeholders’ views regarding the needs of tourism faculty undergraduates for the development of their English communication skills and if there is, which stakeholders differ from one another. For this purpose, percentages and frequencies were calculated with SPSS. One-way ANOVA test was used for between-group comparison because the data for the related items were found to have a normal distribution (between +2.0 and -2.0) (George, 2011). When a significant difference was found, Gabriel Post Hoc test was used to determine which groups differed.

FINDINGS

Demographic Findings Regarding the Participants

As seen in Table 1, 41.9% (n = 259) of the participants were female and 58.1% (n = 359) of them were male. The number of participant students from the tourism faculties was 62.5% (n=386). The percentage of tourism lecturers was 14.6% (n=90). Then, the sector representatives and graduates followed with 9.7% (n=60). The lowest participation rate was found to be English instructors with 3.6% (n=22).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>41.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>359</td>
<td>58.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Instructors</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Lecturers</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>62.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between 17-21</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>39.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between 22-26</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>31.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between 27-31</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between 32-36</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37 and above</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>12.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>618</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 2, 39.2% (n = 242) of the participants were in the 17-21 age range. 31.2% of them (n = 193) were in the range of 22-26 years and the percentage of the participants aged 37 years and above was 12.6% (n = 78). The percentage of participants aged between 32 and 36 was the lowest with 7% (n = 43).
Table 2. Findings Regarding the Suggested Exit Levels for Tourism Faculties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Suggested Exit Level</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Yüzde</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beginner</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-intermediate</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>8,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>56,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper-Intermediate</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>29,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>618</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

56.3% of the participants (n = 348) suggested Intermediate level as the exit level for tourism faculties while 29.1% (n = 180) of them suggested upper intermediate level as the exit level. The rate of those stating that elementary level should be the exit level at tourism faculties was 2.6% (n = 16), while the rate of those stating that pre-intermediate level should be the exit level with 8,4 (n=52). The rate of those stating that beginner level should be the exit level was found to be 0,8% (n=5) while the rate of those stating that advanced level should be the exit level with 2,8% (n=17).

Findings of Between Group Comparisons

Findings Regarding English Reading Skills

One Way ANOVA test indicated that there is a significant difference between the stakeholders’ views regarding tourism undergraduates’ needs for developing their English reading skills (p = .001). Therefore, Gabriel Post Hoc test was conducted. As seen in Table 3, the views of tourism lecturers significantly differed from the sector representatives (p = .001), graduates (p = .005) and undergraduates (p = .008).

Table 3. Gabriel Post Hoc Test Results for English Reading Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I)</th>
<th>(J)</th>
<th>MD(I-J)</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>Tourism Lecturer</td>
<td>-1.2514</td>
<td>1.4905</td>
<td>.991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>2.8906</td>
<td>1.5620</td>
<td>.444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>2.4091</td>
<td>1.5620</td>
<td>.696</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>1.0847</td>
<td>1.1373</td>
<td>.987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-1.2514</td>
<td>1.4905</td>
<td>.991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>4.1420*</td>
<td>1.0445</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>3.6605*</td>
<td>1.0445</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>2.3361*</td>
<td>0.7336</td>
<td>.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-2.8906</td>
<td>1.5620</td>
<td>.444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism Lecturer</td>
<td>-1.41420</td>
<td>1.0445</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>0.4815</td>
<td>1.1442</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>1.8059</td>
<td>0.8697</td>
<td>.214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-2.4091</td>
<td>1.5620</td>
<td>.696</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism lect.</td>
<td>-3.6605*</td>
<td>1.0445</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>0.4815</td>
<td>1.1442</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>1.3244</td>
<td>0.8697</td>
<td>.639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-1.0847</td>
<td>1.3737</td>
<td>.987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism lect.</td>
<td>2.3361*</td>
<td>0.7336</td>
<td>.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>1.8059</td>
<td>0.8697</td>
<td>.214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>1.3244</td>
<td>0.8697</td>
<td>.639</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant at 0.05 level
Findings Regarding English Writing Skills

One Way ANOVA test revealed that there is a significant difference between the stakeholders’ views regarding the needs for English writing skills ($p = .001$). Therefore, Gabriel Post Hoc test was conducted. As seen in Table 4, the views of tourism lecturers significantly differed from the sector representatives ($p = .037$), graduates ($p = .001$) and undergraduates ($p = .001$). Similarly, it was found that the views of the English instructors significantly differed from the views of the graduates ($p = .032$).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I)</th>
<th>(J)</th>
<th>MD(I-J)</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>-0.07489</td>
<td>0.15866</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>0.24654</td>
<td>0.16627</td>
<td>0.742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>0.47749*</td>
<td>0.16627</td>
<td>0.032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>0.33268</td>
<td>0.14623</td>
<td>0.075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>0.07489</td>
<td>0.15866</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>0.32143*</td>
<td>0.11119</td>
<td>0.037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>0.55238*</td>
<td>0.11119</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>0.40757*</td>
<td>0.07809</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-0.24654</td>
<td>0.16627</td>
<td>0.742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>-0.32143*</td>
<td>0.11119</td>
<td>0.037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-0.23095</td>
<td>0.12180</td>
<td>0.451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-0.08615</td>
<td>0.09258</td>
<td>0.975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-0.47749*</td>
<td>0.16627</td>
<td>0.032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>-0.55238*</td>
<td>0.11119</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-0.23095</td>
<td>0.12180</td>
<td>0.451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-0.14481</td>
<td>0.09258</td>
<td>0.603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-0.33268</td>
<td>0.14623</td>
<td>0.075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>-0.40757*</td>
<td>0.07809</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-0.08615</td>
<td>0.09258</td>
<td>0.975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>0.14481</td>
<td>0.09258</td>
<td>0.603</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant at 0.05 level

Findings Regarding English Speaking Skills

One Way ANOVA test revealed that there is a significant difference between the stakeholders’ views regarding the needs for English speaking skills ($p = .001$). Therefore, Gabriel Post Hoc test was conducted. As seen in Table 5, the views of the tourism lecturers significantly differed from the sector representatives ($p = .003$), graduates ($p = .001$) and undergraduates ($p = .001$).
Table 5. Gabriel Post Hoc Test for English Speaking Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I)</th>
<th>(J)</th>
<th>MD(I-J)</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>-1.13973</td>
<td>1.4663</td>
<td>.977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-2.3064</td>
<td>1.5366</td>
<td>.728</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-2.6212</td>
<td>1.5366</td>
<td>.562</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-1.4707</td>
<td>1.3514</td>
<td>.894</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-1.13973</td>
<td>1.4663</td>
<td>.977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-3.7037*</td>
<td>1.0275</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-4.0185*</td>
<td>1.0275</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-2.8680*</td>
<td>.07217</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-3.7037*</td>
<td>1.0275</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>.03148</td>
<td>1.1256</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-1.3973</td>
<td>1.4663</td>
<td>.977</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-2.3064</td>
<td>1.5366</td>
<td>.728</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-2.6212</td>
<td>1.5366</td>
<td>.562</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-1.4707</td>
<td>1.3514</td>
<td>.894</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-2.8680*</td>
<td>.07217</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>.03148</td>
<td>1.1256</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant at 0.05 level

Findings Regarding English Listening Skills

One Way ANOVA test indicates that there is a significant difference between the stakeholders' views regarding the needs for English listening skills (p = .006). Therefore, Gabriel Post Hoc test was conducted. As seen in Table 6, the views of the tourism lecturers significantly differed from those of the undergraduates (p = .001).

Table 6. Gabriel Post Hoc Test for English Listening Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I)</th>
<th>(J)</th>
<th>MD(I-J)</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>-2.4444</td>
<td>1.5787</td>
<td>.660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-0.01944</td>
<td>1.6544</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-0.05278</td>
<td>1.6544</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-0.05009</td>
<td>1.4549</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-2.4444</td>
<td>1.5787</td>
<td>.660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-2.6389</td>
<td>1.1063</td>
<td>.156</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-1.9167</td>
<td>1.1063</td>
<td>.574</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-2.9453*</td>
<td>.07770</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-0.01944</td>
<td>1.6544</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-0.05278</td>
<td>1.1063</td>
<td>.156</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-0.05009</td>
<td>1.4549</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-2.9453*</td>
<td>.07770</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-1.9167</td>
<td>1.1063</td>
<td>.574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>-0.07222</td>
<td>1.2119</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-1.0286</td>
<td>0.9211</td>
<td>.920</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-0.05009</td>
<td>1.4549</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-2.9453*</td>
<td>.07770</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-0.03064</td>
<td>0.9211</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>-1.0286</td>
<td>0.9211</td>
<td>.920</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant at 0.05 level
Findings Regarding the Evaluation of the English Courses at Tourism Faculties

One Way ANOVA test was conducted to see whether there is a significant difference between the stakeholders' views towards the evaluation of the English courses given at tourism faculties, and it was found that there is a significant difference (p = .001). Then, Gabriel Post Hoc test was conducted. As seen in Table 7, the views of the English instructors differ significantly from the views of the undergraduates (p = .022). Likewise, the views of the tourism lecturers differ significantly from the views of the undergraduates (p = .001). It was also found that the views of the undergraduates differ significantly from the views of the graduates (p = .001).

Table 7. Gabriel Post Hoc Test for the Evaluation of the Current English Courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I)</th>
<th>(J)</th>
<th>MD(I-J)</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>-.04836</td>
<td>.25407</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>.29280</td>
<td>.26626</td>
<td>.949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>.21553</td>
<td>.26626</td>
<td>.994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-.61202*</td>
<td>.23416</td>
<td>.022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>.04836</td>
<td>.25407</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>.24444</td>
<td>.17805</td>
<td>.840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>.26389</td>
<td>.17805</td>
<td>.769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>.56366*</td>
<td>.12505</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-.21553</td>
<td>.26626</td>
<td>.994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>.24444</td>
<td>.17805</td>
<td>.840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>.50833</td>
<td>.19504</td>
<td>.090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-.31921</td>
<td>.14825</td>
<td>.176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>-.21553</td>
<td>.26626</td>
<td>.994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>.26389</td>
<td>.17805</td>
<td>.769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>.50833</td>
<td>.19504</td>
<td>.090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>-.82755*</td>
<td>.14825</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>English Inst.</td>
<td>.61202*</td>
<td>.23416</td>
<td>.022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism Lect.</td>
<td>.56366*</td>
<td>.12505</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>.31921</td>
<td>.14825</td>
<td>.176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>.82755*</td>
<td>.14825</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*. Significant at 0.05 level

Findings Regarding the Participation of the Stakeholders in English Course Design

One Way Anova test was conducted to find out if there is any significant difference between the stakeholders' views regarding the participation of the stakeholders in English course design at tourism faculties revealed that there is not any significant difference (p=.059).

Findings Regarding General Attitude Towards English

One Way Anova test was conducted to find out if there is any significant difference between the stakeholders' views regarding their attitudes towards English in general revealed that there is not any significant difference (p=.179).
The status of the tested hypotheses is as follows;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1. Stakeholders’ views on the needs of tourism faculty students to improve their English reading skills significantly differ from one another.</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2. Stakeholders’ views on the needs of tourism faculty students to improve their English writing skills significantly differ from one another.</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3. Stakeholders’ views on the needs of tourism faculty students to improve their English speaking skills significantly differ from one another.</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4. Stakeholders’ views on the needs of tourism faculty students to improve their English listening skills significantly differ from one another.</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H5. Stakeholders’ views regarding the effectiveness of the English courses offered in tourism faculties significantly differ from one another.</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H6. Stakeholders’ views regarding the participation of the stakeholders in the design of English courses in tourism faculties significantly differ from one another.</td>
<td>0.059</td>
<td>Refused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H7. Stakeholders’ attitudes towards English significantly differ from one another.</td>
<td>0.179</td>
<td>Refused</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

In light of the findings of the study, it could be concluded that tourism lecturers have the highest needs expectations for English reading skills. However, it is also significant that their perceptions of the needs for this skill are similar to those of English instructors at tourism faculties. At this point, it is seen that there is a need for further studies examining the reasons why their perceptions are high.

The findings obtained from the between-groups analyses regarding English writing skills indicated that the views of the tourism lecturers differed from those of the sector representatives, graduates and tourism undergraduates. Again, as stated for English reading skills, the views of tourism lecturers were found to have the highest perception of needs.

The findings obtained from the between-group comparisons conducted for English writing skills also indicated that English instructors significantly differed from the tourism graduates. Graduates have lower perceptions of need than the English instructors despite their sector experience. This finding can also be attributed to the claims that knowledge of the English instructors regarding the sector is insufficient.

The findings obtained from between comparisons regarding needs for English speaking skills revealed that tourism lecturers differed from the sector representatives, graduates and undergraduates. Tourism lecturers have the highest perception of the need for English speaking skills among all stakeholders except English instructors as in reading and writing skills.

According to the findings of between-group comparisons regarding English listening skills, tourism lecturers differ from tourism undergraduates. However, they have a similar perception of needs for English listening skills to the other stakeholders.

The findings regarding the evaluation of the current English courses given at tourism faculties revealed that tourism lecturers differed from tourism undergraduates. In other words, the perceptions of the tourism lecturers regarding the achievements in gaining English listening skills in English courses are much higher than the tourism undergraduates. Similarly, English instructors and tourism undergraduates differ in their perception of achieving English listening skills at tourism faculties. Tourism undergraduates’ perception of achieving English listening skills in English courses was found to be higher than English instructors. It is noteworthy that undergraduates have higher perceptions of achievement in gaining English listening skills than the English instructor.

Similarly, it is also noteworthy that the perceptions of tourism undergraduates about gaining English listening skills in English courses differ from the graduates. This finding can be interpreted as follows. The students who believe that they have gained adequate English listening skills in their undergraduate courses understand that they have failed to acquire the relevant skills in their faculties when they attempt to use their skills in the sector, but they do not have the chance to make up for their loss. Therefore, the awareness of undergraduates regarding their English language skills needs following their graduation is weak and needs to be improved during their undergraduate education. It was also seen that all stakeholders should be included in curriculum and course design, and all stakeholders have similar positive attitudes towards English and the need for English teaching at tourism faculties.
Another finding that can be concluded from these findings is that the tourism lecturers generally differ from other stakeholders, and further studies are needed to improve their perceptions towards the communication needs of their students. It could be said that their expectations are far from realistic.

Another point to be emphasized is the establishment of effective coordination between the English instructors and the tourism lecturers and this will increase the effectiveness of the English courses (Dudley-Evans and St John, 1998: 45). It could be claimed that the teaching hours at faculties are limited, and implementing such a team-teaching approach will be time-consuming. In this case, one or two extra hours per week could be created in faculties for such activities. An advantage of this kind of team teaching activities is the creation of a positive perception of undergraduates that the tourism lecturers give importance to English course and English teaching (Jordan, 1997; 121).

Besides, it will be possible to eliminate the possible missing information of the English instructors regarding tourism and to correct any misunderstanding. This coordination can also be realized with the other stakeholders so that all stakeholders can meet at a reasonable and realistic point in terms of the needs of tourism undergraduates to improve their English communication skills as they are supposed to collaborate in raising qualified graduates. As a result of this, the effectiveness of the English courses in tourism faculties could be increased and the desired goals regarding undergraduates’ qualification could be achieved. In the same way, it will be possible to bring the high perception levels of tourism lecturers regarding the tourism undergraduates’ needs for improving their English communication skills to a normal and realizable level.

REFERENCES


Is the Availability of Mobile Augmented Reality Applications in Tourism Education Possible? Thoughts of Tourism Academicians: The Case of Eskişehir

Duran CANKÜL
Assist.Prof.Dr., Eskişehir Osmangazi University
dcankul@ogu.edu.tr

Batuhan SÖNMEZ
Anadolu University
bthnsnmz26@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The state of the Republic of Turkey has invested a large amount to educate qualified human resources for into the tourism sector. What will make these investments meaningful is to increase their qualifications. The role of academics is particularly important in increasing the qualifications of students and education. In line with this, the aim of this research is to reach the views of the tourism academicians who work in tourism faculties regarding the use of mobile augmented reality technology (MAG) in tourism education. For this purpose, the research was carried out by qualitative method.

In the method part of the research, one-to-one interviews were conducted with 15 academics working in the tourism faculties of Anadolu University and Eskişehir Osmangazi University using a semi-structured interview form. The answers obtained were deciphered by the researcher and interpreted under four themes: strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats by applying content and frequency analysis.

Key Words: Tourism, Tourism Education, Multimedia, Augmented Reality

INTRODUCTION

The main source of any tourism-related organization, regardless of its national borders, is the de facto employees of the organization. The quality of the staff reflects the quality of the organization. Finding the right staff undoubtedly presents one of the biggest challenges to organizations (Leslie and Richardson, 2000: 489). According to Haven-Tang and Jones (2008: 353), tourism is a labor-intensive sector and customer-employee communication is an important determinant of quality. Running the right staff in the right place at the right time, is critical to quality. According to Hawkins (1998: 82), as a result of the increasing use of technology in the tourism sector, it is necessary and important to employ skilled, trained and qualified personnel in the sector in the use of technological devices and software.

The integration of technology into education has become an important topic of study in the current era. According to Pierson (2001: 427), technology integration in education is defined as facilitating the student's learning process by combining the teacher's knowledge of technology with the pedagogical knowledge he possessed. For Robinson (2008: 2130), the integration of technology into education is an integral part of a comprehensive education reform. Technology integration covers many different topics. Technology alone cannot help the student achieve learning goals, but it is a factor that offers great opportunities in facilitating the path to learning goals.

Augmented reality (AR) is a technology in real time, based on real-world perception, where virtual information is added as an extra layer. Augmented reality can technically be used to enhance all five senses, but its most common use is visual. The added virtual layer is sometimes consist of sound, 3D objects, 3D scenes or sometimes composed only of textual information (Loijens, 2017: 14). Azuma (1997: 356) defines augmented reality as any system with the following three properties; To be able to combine reality and virtual, to be able to work in real time and interactively, to be able to work in 3D. It is thought that the mobile use of augmented reality technology, which has found a wide range of uses in different sectors and achieved positive outcomes, has great potential in tourism education as well.
LITERATURE REVIEW

Tourism Education

Strengthening the understanding that human resources are crucial to shaping the future of a society leads to increased efforts to improve the quality of education and training (Ural and Pelit, 2002: 219). Education is critical in developing the country's economy. Labor within factors of production can only be strengthened by a well-trained human resource (Kızılırmak, 2000: 192). The service industry in which tourism is involved is distinguished from other industries by obvious differences. For example, the product comes across as an abstract concept in the service industry unlike other industries. Such differences like these, make the quality of human resources even more important in service industries. The nature of the products offered increases the importance of human resources education (Lee-Ross and Pryce, 2010: 6).

When the local and foreign literature is examined, when tourism education is mentioned the main subject to be explain is vocational education. Vocational education is a process that aims to give people the knowledge, skills and abilities they will use in their future professional lives (Hacıoğlu, 1992: 91). The main objective of vocational tourism education is to develop and train a student who will can able to be a manager in the sector after the graduate from the tourism program (Pauzé, 1993: 61). Tourism education focuses on the process that aims to gain the necessary skills to understand and analyze, interpret and evaluate the principles of tourism. Tourism education enhances the student's abilities, enabling them to learn conceptual issues to contribute to their professional and intellectual development (Cooper and Shepherd, 1997: 35).

It is defended that human resources are of great importance in the production and delivery of services within tourism enterprises and that human resources within the tourism sector play a key role in the successful and being a long life of the enterprises (Lohmann and Jafari, 1995: 491; Baum and Szivas, 2007: 1). The concept of quality improvement in an increasingly competitive environment has become an important issue for the tourism sector. There is an accurate proportional relationship between the success of the sector and the quality of the services offered (Augustyn and Ho, 1998: 75). Human resources is one of the most important parts of tourism enterprises and is the basis thing of developing the tourism sector. Increasing the quality of human resources training can gain competitiveness (Mayaka and King, 2002: 112).

Jenkins (1997: 216) states that businesses in the tourism sector in any country in the world need qualified managers and employees, i.e. trained human resources, to survive in an increasingly competitive environment.

Solnet (2007: 130-131) states that service businesses are characterized by the intense communication that takes place between employees and customers. Interactions with employees within the service sector are experiences that customers remembered best. Employees who are uncomfortable dealing with customers or lack the training and expertise to meet customer expectations, cause to customers remember service experience as a bad experience.

Cognitive Load Theory

Cognitive load theory assumes that human cognitive architecture consists of two different types of memory; limited-capacity working memory and large-capacity long-term memory. Cognitive load theory argues that traditional education and training techniques overload students’ working memory, thus ignoring the structure of human cognitive architecture. This theory seeks to adapt educational instructional designs to human cognitive architecture (Schnotz and Kürschner, 2007: 472-475). The main subject of cognitive load theory is cognitive load. Every load that occurs on the cognitive system while performing the learning activity is defined as cognitive load (Sweller, Merrienboer, and Paas, 1998: 258). The theory has three different cognitive loads as a topic of discussion; extraneous, intrinsic and germane cognitive loads (Sweller, 2005: 26-27).

- Extraneous cognitive load is due to inappropriate instructional designs that ignore the limits of working memory and fail to focus on the structure of working memory.
- Intrinsic cognitive load is the cognitive load that occurs due to the inherent complexity of information that needs to be processed. The element is determined by interaction levels.
- Germane cognitive load is the cognitive load that shows the effort expended to perform learning activities. It is the cognitive burden caused by effortless learning, but because this effortless learning can help build the cognitive scheme, it counts as effective cognitive burden.
Multimedia

Multimedia learning is defined as learning through words and pictures. Multimedia is the simultaneous use of audio and visual data to achieve higher quality learning (Mayer, 2009: 5). According to Brooks, Nolan and Gallagher (2002: 13) multimedia is a single medium containing video, audio, text and images. Multimedia is the use of elements such as Sound, Pictures, Animation, graphics and tables in a computer environment for a higher quality educational experience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Three Assumptions of the Cognitive Theory of Multimedia Learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dual Channel</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People have separate channels for processing audio and visual information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Limited Capacity</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The amount of information that people can process simultaneously on each channel is limited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Active Processing</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People participate in active learning by organizing selected information into compatible mental representations and integrating mental representations with other information.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Mayer (2009: 63), multi-media learning is based on 3 basic assumptions; these are dual channel, limited capacity, and active processing assumptions. The three assumptions of the cognitive theory of multimedia learning are given in Table 1 above.

Augmented Reality

Augmented reality (AR) is a technology for displaying virtual objects created via computers on the real physical environment in real time. As well as virtual reality (VR) technology where the user is in a fully virtual world, AR enables the user to perceive virtual objects and the real environment as a whole (Zhou, Duh and Billinghurst, 2008: 193). The concepts of virtual and augmented reality are two different technologies that are often confused. In order not to confuse these concepts, Milgram and Kishino (1994: 1322) had been aimed to reveal the differences of these two concepts under the name of “reality-virtuality continuum”.

Augmented reality is associated with virtual reality but not exactly the same. While virtual reality creates an entirely artificial environment, augmented reality enriches the real environment with virtual objects (Höllerer and Feiner, 2004: 221). Augmented reality is have being used by many different sectors for various purposes.

Juan and Perez (2011: 449) have been used augmented reality technology as a supporting application in the treatment of fears of acrophobia patients. They point out that augmented reality technology could also be used in psychological treatments.

Peddie (2017: 89) notes that augmented reality technology, which uses 3-D modeling, offers enormous opportunities for professional groups such as architecture and engineering.

Kourouthanassis et al., (2015: 80), in their work, they used augmented reality technology as a virtual guide for tourists in the promotion of the island of “Corfu”, located in Greece. At the end of the study, they received positive feedback from tourists about augmented reality technology.

The use of augmented reality in education also produces positive results. As an example of these results; Developing the ability to think in 3D (Ibili and Şahin, 2013: 7), increasing interest in the lesson and focusing on the subject (Yusoff and Dahlan, 2013: 256), Increasing sensory motor development (Fleck and Simon, 2013: 20) and can be said to reduce cognitive load (Küçük, Yılmaz, Göktaş, 2014: 401). There are augmented reality applications that can also be used within higher education. It helps students understand concepts better (Peddie, 2017: 96).
Augmented reality technology used by many different sectors has the potential to improve the quality of tourism education. Research is important in this sense. As it is thought that augmented reality can increase the quality of Human Resource Education which is of great importance for the tourism sector, this research aims to reach the views of Tourism academics towards mobile augmented reality technology.

METHOD

In the method part of the research, one-to-one interviews were conducted with 15 academicians working in the tourism faculties of Anadolu University and Eskişehir Osmangazi University using a semi-structured interview form. The interview form was taken from the study of Küçük, Yılmaz, and Göktaş (2014) and made suitable for the field of tourism education by the researcher. According to Türnüklü (2000), the semi-structured interview technique is one of the data collection techniques suitable for use in educational sciences. This technique can also provide the researcher with advantages such as asking side questions and getting more in-depth answers from the participants, depending on the flow of the interview. The case study pattern from qualitative research methods was used in the study. According to Yıldırım ve Şimşek (2011), in case studies, a new case is explored in its entirety. The details of the interview are given in Table 2 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>University</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P1</td>
<td>Anadolu University</td>
<td>Assoc. Prof.</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>07:25</td>
<td>31.07.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P2</td>
<td>Anadolu University</td>
<td>Prelector</td>
<td>Tourism Guidance</td>
<td>07:32</td>
<td>1.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P3</td>
<td>Anadolu University</td>
<td>Assistant</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>06:42</td>
<td>1.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P4</td>
<td>Osmangazi University</td>
<td>Assoc. Prof.</td>
<td>Tourism Guidance</td>
<td>07:01</td>
<td>1.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P5</td>
<td>Osmangazi University</td>
<td>Assoc. Prof.</td>
<td>Gastronomy-Culinary Arts</td>
<td>11:33</td>
<td>6.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P6</td>
<td>Osmangazi University</td>
<td>Assistant</td>
<td>Tourism Guidance</td>
<td>08:24</td>
<td>6.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P7</td>
<td>Anadolu University</td>
<td>Assts. Prof.</td>
<td>Tourism Guidance</td>
<td>09:53</td>
<td>6.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P8</td>
<td>Anadolu University</td>
<td>Prelector</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>08:32</td>
<td>6.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P9</td>
<td>Anadolu University</td>
<td>Assoc. Prof.</td>
<td>Tourism Guidance</td>
<td>07:32</td>
<td>6.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P10</td>
<td>Osmangazi University</td>
<td>Prof.</td>
<td>Gastronomy-Culinary Arts</td>
<td>12:27</td>
<td>6.08.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P11</td>
<td>Anadolu University</td>
<td>Assoc. Prof.</td>
<td>Gastronomy-Culinary Arts</td>
<td>07:27</td>
<td>2.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P12</td>
<td>Anadolu University</td>
<td>Assoc. Prof.</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>08:06</td>
<td>2.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P13</td>
<td>Osmangazi University</td>
<td>Assoc. Prof.</td>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>09:43</td>
<td>2.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P14</td>
<td>Osmangazi University</td>
<td>Prelector</td>
<td>Gastronomy-Culinary Arts</td>
<td>08:35</td>
<td>2.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P15</td>
<td>Osmangazi University</td>
<td>Assts. Prof.</td>
<td>Gastronomy-Culinary Arts</td>
<td>06:58</td>
<td>2.09.2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tourism academicians interviewed in the scope of the research were asked 8 questions. All interviews were conducted in the academicians rooms. The interviews were recorded on the researcher’s smartphone with the permission of the academics and then deciphered by the researcher. The findings were interpreted by the researcher as strengths, weaknesses, threats and opportunities under 4 themes.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In this part of the study, the answers of 15 Tourism academics to 8 interview questions about the use of mobile augmented reality applications (MAG) in tourism education were gathered under the themes of Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats. Table 3 shows the strengths. The views of some academicians are as follows.

P6 “I believe in the importance of making it concrete. Therefore, I think undergraduate and graduate students can learn abstract concepts very easily with this technology.”

P3 “It will simplify the students learning process. In other words, it will enable them to understand a topic more simply , which makes it easier to understand visually. When animations are into the work, I think it will makes it easier to learn the subject.”
P14 “It will facilitate the student’s learning effort and shorten the learning time. An application that can be used anywhere at any time, can learn more efficiently in a shorter time. Student will work with pleasure. Unfortunately, students don’t even read the books we give, they just memorize powerpoint presentations, but this technology will help them learn instead of memorizing.”

P2 “I would be happy to use it in class. I think it would make the lesson much more interactive. Who are we giving the course for, students, in a very general sense that is our customers, this will increase student satisfaction. Generation z in particular is far ahead of us in technological terms, so augmented reality will meet their expectations and needs at a higher level. Their satisfaction will make me happy also. Beyond satisfaction, it will increase the students’ level of achievement, and this will also give me satisfaction, so it would be good to use this technology.”

P8 “Definitely I think. Tourism sector is an applied sector, there is no point in given education being in a very conceptual way. Since the past, we have been trying to design tourism education as much as possible to appeal to more sense organs, so we have internships and so we have practical courses. Tourism geography, tour planning will be very useful in courses such as.”

P10 “It would be positive effect because we will be integrating the students into the lesson. For example, with augmented reality, student will be able to learn as if he were there. This, of course, Tourism 4.0 or Industry 4.0 also mentioned in smart tourism can enter into the topic. I think it may be useful in the introduction of destinations as the subject of the course.”

P4 “I’d be happy to use this technology. I think it would be more accurate to tell the lessons in the newest way and to tell them according to Generation z. Giving information through the right sources and the right channels is very important for the recipient, so I think augmented reality should be used in the lessons.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Embodying the subject of the course</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthening the understanding of the subject</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A real educational experience</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improving student satisfaction</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addressing more sense organs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Include students more in the course</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transmission of information through correct sources and channels</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3. Strengths

The following table 4 contains the findings on the weaknesses of mobile augmented reality technology, obtained from interviews with academics.

P11 “Perhaps not for the Department of Tourism Management, but I think it should be used extensively in the Departments of guidance and gastronomy. Because tourism management is a little more theoretical than other departments. But it will be useful in practical areas should definitely be used.”

P15 “I consider myself sufficient in terms of using technology, but this is a new technology. I need to get an education about technology in order to be able to master the level that I can use in my lectures. On the other hand, the classrooms and the amps in the faculties need to be made suitable, for the use of this technology in my lectures.”

P13 “It may not be technology, but there may be a risk of sudden deterioration of the technical equipment used to use this technology. This situation can be a problem for academics and students at an unexpected moment.”

P7 “As a disadvantage, will it be sustainable? This technology can be very smart, but could it be something that would break down quickly? The system may not always work. When technology comes into play, there’s always risk.”
Table 4. Weaknesses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weaknesses</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shortages of use in tourism management department</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educators’ lack of education for technology</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure and hardware deficiencies</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk of rapid deterioration</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 lists the opportunities that academics have indicated for the use of mobile augmented reality applications in tourism education. Some opinions are as follows.

P3 “The potential to increase academic achievement is high. As a result, countries in the world develop their education with such technologies, such technologies should be used in tourism education in order not to be left behind.”

P13 “Of course, if you can use the applications correctly, if the other party is also satisfied with it, the knowledge in long-term memory will gain a quality and more permanent place, so students’ success will increase.”

P4 “First of all, it will provide day-long learning as it will not compress the learning process into a specific place or time. The student will be able to study at whatever time the learning hour is most appropriate for him/her. It will make the learning process continuous. The way they learn will change with technological approaches.”

P1 “Lessons in all areas, should to be somewhat interactive. Although tourism is service-oriented and based on Human Relations, the use of technological applications is also necessary within tourism. On the one hand, another characteristic of tourism is that instead of product flow in tourism, the flow of information is intense. Information flow is provided by information systems. So this means that tourism students should make more use of information technologies. But on the one hand, that means that also schools and their teachers have to keep up with it.”

P15 “As with any education, tourism education should be supported with this and such technologies. The changing world affects every area, tourism cannot stay out of it. As such technologies become physical evidence, the tourism sector is affected to this situation, therefore the education area of tourism also should be affected. If this kind of technological applications will not be used in tourism education, the technology should not be used also in the tourism sector. But these technologies are in the industry as physical evidence.”

Table 5. Opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opportunities</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Catching world standards in education</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More permanent and higher quality information storage in long-term memory</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day-long training opportunity</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makes lessons interactive</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simultaneous advancement of industry and education</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 shows the threats mentioned by tourism academics. Some are as follows.

P3 “I think there are pros and cons of this work in terms of the effort spent for a learning. Learning can increase when the student strives for certain things, this technology can always offer students the simple way. There’s a Russian writer saying, “if you’re trying to understand something by writing, you’re reading it 3 times.” You reading with your eyes firstly, secondly you reading with your brain for understand and finally you are reading while you are writing. Visual training is very useful, but some subjects can’t be worked out just by watching.”

P10 “I think it should be supported, I think it would be positive, but there is a limit to that. Because tourism is about travelling and seeing, providing experience. Tourism is an abstract concept because it’s in the service sector, but this and applications like this embody it a little bit. For example, if someone who has never seen Cappadocia experiences it with augmented reality and it only affects their awareness of the destination, it is very good. Contrary to the concept of tourism, if it completely assimilates the destination, augmented reality is not good, making tourism completely digital is not a good thing.”
4th International Tourism Congress

P12 “It can reduce reading but it increases the acquisition of audio and visual information. But this is where the instructor has to step in. A bridge between reading and visual and auditory knowledge can be established by taking exams with the classical method.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Threats</th>
<th>frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Encouraging the student to choose the easy path</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fully digitising tourism</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reducing reading habits</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In order to increase the quality of tourism education, it is an undeniable fact that tourism education needs to be kept up to date and supported by the technologies of the age. In this context, in order to increase the efficiency of tourism education, education needs to be supported by new technological applications such as mobile augmented reality (MAR).

Tourism academics have stated that they are satisfied with mobile augmented reality (MAR) applications, that this technology has great opportunities to improve tourism education, and that the use of mobile augmented reality in Generation z education will produce positive results. It should not be forgotten, that the success rate achieved as a result of a new application or the use of a new technology in education is directly proportional to the educators’ perspective on the new application or technology and their intention to use it.

It is thought that tourism education needs to be supported by mobile augmented reality (MAR) technologies in order to increase its effectiveness. It is important to studies on the subject for keep the subject up to date, to raise awareness and to start using mobile augmented reality (MAR) applications in tourism education.

REFERENCES


The Effect of Urban Renewal Projects on Urban Identity in Turkey: Case of Istanbul and Antalya

Sibel MANSUROGLU
Prof.Dr., Akdeniz University
smansur@akdeniz.edu.tr

Veysel DAG
Res.Assist., Pamukkale University
veyseldag@pau.edu.tr

Feyzanur DEMIR
feyzanudemr@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

In the process of historical development, many influences such as the location of the cities, environmental conditions, cultural and social structure have brought different identities to the cities. However, the urban textures that are worn out over time, and their natural and cultural landscape characteristics are ignored and reconsidered within the framework of urban renewal causes this identity to disappear. When we look at the urban renewal projects implemented in our country, the uniformization that emerges with the implementation of similar projects in different cities, de-identifies our cities, breaks the ties with nature, leads to many problems from the neighborhood culture to the weakening of the social texture. In urban renewal projects, it should be taken into consideration that the natural, cultural and social characteristics of each city and even different areas in the same city are different from each other.

In this study, the effects of urban renewal projects implemented in different cities (Istanbul and Antalya) on the city were evaluated through plans, projects and other visuals. It has been found that urban renewal studies have negative effects on urban identity and memory in the investigated areas. Among the evaluated urban renewal studies, it was found that social and cultural characteristics of Sulukule (Istanbul) and natural structure characteristics of Kepez and Santral Districts (Antalya) weren't taken into consideration. Therefore, it is important to determine the prominent features of each project area and to carry out the renewal studies accordingly in terms of preserving the urban identity and memory. Therefore, urban renewal studies should be carried out by a multidisciplinary team (landscape architect, architect, civil engineer, urban planner, ecologist, geologist, sociologist, economist) and this process should be supported by legal arrangements.

With this study, it is aimed to reveal the negative effects of urban renewal studies on urban identity and memory, which is aimed at transforming the poor quality building stock in our country into places where people can live safely and without taking into consideration the existing natural and cultural landscape features of the cities. For this purpose, some suggestions are presented inline with the results of the study and the principles and aims of urban renewal.

Key Words: Urban Renewal, Urban Identity, Sulukule, Santral District, Istanbul, Antalya

INTRODUCTION

Many influences such as the position of the cities in the historical development process, environmental conditions, cultural and social structure have brought different identities to the cities. However, the urban textures that are worn out over time, and their natural and cultural landscape characteristics are ignored and reconsidered within the framework of urban renewal causes this identity to disappear.

Today, there are many definitions of urban renewal that differ according to their vision, purpose, strategy and method. According to Lichfield, urban renewal is defined as a compromise over the results of the renewal that will arise from the need to better understand the processes of urban degradation. According to Donnison, they are new ways and methods for coordinating the problems concentrating on urban
collapse. Urban renewal, as a comprehensive and integrated vision and action, is to ensure the continuous improvement of the economic, physical, social and environmental conditions of an area. In other words, it is the re-development and revitalization of a lost economic activity, the functioning of a non-functioning social function, the provision of social integration in areas with social exclusion, the restoration of this balance in areas where environmental quality or ecological balance is lost (Roberts 2000, Akkar 2006).

According to Lynch, the characteristics that differentiate cities constitute the identity of the city. It's the relationship and interactions between the natural, social and built environment that make up the identity of the city and differentiate it from the others. The identity of the city, together with the cultural structure based on natural environmental conditions and the social environment, and the built environment form together (Suher et al. 2004, Ünlü 2017). Today, when discussing the identity problem in cities, it is important to address the natural, cultural and social environment together. Turkey has hosted different civilizations throughout history and in countries with a rich cultural heritage, preservation of history has an important role in the formation of urban identity tissue, especially on a subject that should be given importance (Zorlu et al. 2010).

The distinctive features and identities of the cities are decisive. While some cities stand out with their spatial characteristics, some cities come to the forefront with their socio-cultural characteristics. However, it is important to establish the relations between them. In other words, according to their natural characteristics, cities should be formed by artificial elements which are in harmony with the natural features of the city and they should be adopted and adopted by the people living there. In this case, the identity of the city, hence the citizen can be mentioned (Can 1999).

Today, population growth and migration cause unplanned growth of cities. New buildings constructed to meet the increasing housing need are applied without determining the existing natural and cultural values, are uniformized with the effect of globalization and concrete silhouettes are formed in the city with increasing floor heights.

Cities that have a certain identity with their unique cultural assets reveal the identity of the streets and squares. Cities have the characteristics of streets, squares, open spaces and areas where people will come together, interact and produce urban culture (Güler et al. 2016). While changes and renewals in urban space are sometimes in the direction of increasing the quality of space and life, they sometimes appear as economic, social, environmental and physical collapse and degradation of the space (Akkar 2006).

Urban regeneration practices first emerged as a result of the urban growth movements in Europe in the 19th century, as a result of the demolition and reconstruction of some regions (Sisman and Kibaroglu 2009).

While urban renewal in Turkey's history dates back to the Ottoman Empire, after the fast urbanization process of change and renewal that began in 1950, it has been shaped by changes observed in European and American cities (Polat and Dostoglu 2007). Urban regeneration practices started in Ankara in 1990 and after, and then came to the agenda of Istanbul with the Marmara Earthquake. In recent years, the area of interest in the renewal has shifted to the slum areas close to the city centers with the enacted laws. Issued in 2012 6306 No. Disaster Risk Areas Under the Law on the Renewal of Turkey has entered into a new renewal process. In this process, it is aimed to transform the slum areas and areas at risk of disasters and to increase the living standards of the citizens. However, over time the concentration of the renewal has been directed towards areas that are planned, but the building stock is worn out, easy to access to the city center, high rent value, and more profitable and faster profits (Senturk 2014).

Urban regeneration practices started in Ankara in 1990 and after, and then came to the agenda of Istanbul with the Marmara Earthquake. In recent years, the area of interest in the renewal has shifted to the slum areas close to the city centers with the enacted laws. Issued in 2012 6306 No. Disaster Risk Areas Under the Law on the Renewal of Turkey has entered into a new renewal process. In this process, it is aimed to transform the slum areas and areas at risk of disasters and to increase the living standards of the citizens. However, over time the concentration of the renewal has been directed towards areas that are planned, but the building stock is worn out, easy to access to the city center, high rent value, and more profitable and faster profits (Senturk 2014).

With this study, it is aimed to reveal the negative effects of urban renewal studies on urban identity and memory, which is aimed at transforming the poor quality building stock in our country into places where people can live safely and without taking into consideration the existing natural and cultural landscape features of the cities. For this purpose, some suggestions are presented in line with the results of the study and the principles and aims of urban renewal.
MATERIAL AND METOD

Material
The main material of the study is Istanbul Sulukule Urban Renewal Project and Kepez and Santral Neighborhoods Urban Renewal Project. The selected provinces are among the most important cities which are prominent with their tourism identity and are visited by local and foreign tourists in terms of their natural and historical beauties. According to the surveys, the number of tourists coming to Istanbul by air in 2018 was 12 million 355 thousand 122 and Antalya by 13 million 57 thousand (Anonymous 1 2018, Anonymous 2 2019). Istanbul, the most populous city of our country, is the fifth most populous city with a population of 15 million 67 thousand 724 people and Antalya with a population of 2 million 426 thousand 356 (TUİK 2019). In this case, Istanbul almost as much as the population, Antalya is about 6 times as much as the population of tourists.

Metod
The study was carried out in three directions: land and office. In the first stage, literature surveys about urban Renewal and urban identity were made and concepts and determinations in this direction were put forward. In the second stage, the impacts of Sulukule Urban Renewal Project and Antalya Power Plant Urban Renewal Projects on the city were evaluated through plans, projects and other visuals, and then these assessments were controlled on-site by observations and investigations in the field. In the last stage of the study, the negative effects of urban Renewal studies on urban identity and memory were determined within the scope of tourism and some suggestions were developed in terms of the discipline of landscape architecture in order to reduce or eliminate these effects.

Urban Renewal Applications in Turkey
Urban renewal has become one of the most talked about and debated issues of urbanization, which became more visible with the destruction in 1999 Marmara and Düzce Earthquakes (Genç 2008). Urban renewal works under the name of urban regeneration project have accelerated for various purposes, especially in the reduction of disaster risks and renewal of slum areas. These studies are being implemented in many urban areas with the cooperation of local administrations, especially the Housing Development Administration (TOKİ). In addition to the new local government laws that give the legal basis to the local authorities for urban regeneration, these practices have been created with the Urban Renewal Law, which aims to eliminate the unhealthy construction areas of cities, especially natural disaster risks. In addition, urban renewal practices 2981 numbered Development Amnesty (1984), 3194 numbered Development (1985), 5104 numbered North Ankara Entrance Urban Renewal Project (2004), No. 5366 Renovated Historical and Cultural Immovable Assets by Renewing and Using (2005), 5393 It is based on Municipality (2005) and 6306 Disaster Risk Renewal (2012) Laws. In addition to this, the Special Provincial Administration no. 302, Abolition of the General Directorate of Land Office with the Amendment of the Law on Land Office No: 5273 and Collective Housing Law, the General Assembly and the Procedure of the Law No. 5162 on the General Staff and Procedures Laws on the Protection of Cultural and Natural Assets and Changes in Various Laws numbered 5226, Laws on the Conservation and Use of the Immovable Historical and Cultural Immovable Property by the Law No. 5366 are other legal regulations related to urban renewal. In addition, urban renewal practices 2981 numbered Development Amnesty (1984), 3194 numbered Development (1985), 5104 numbered North Ankara Entrance Urban Renewal Project (2004), No. 5366 Renovated Historical and Cultural Immovable Assets by Renewing and Using (2005), 5393 It is based on Municipality (2005) and 6306 Disaster Risk Renewal (2012) Laws. In addition to this, the Special Provincial Administration no. 302, Abolition of the General Directorate of Land Office with the Amendment of the Law on Land Office No: 5273 and Collective Housing Law, the General Assembly and the Procedure of the Law No. 5162 on the General Staff and Procedures Laws on the Protection of Cultural and Natural Assets and Changes in Various Laws numbered 5226, Laws on the Conservation and Use of the Immovable Historical and Cultural Immovable Property by the Law No. 5366 are other legal regulations related to urban renewal.
Istanbul Sulukule Urban Renewal Project

Istanbul has been included in the World Heritage List by UNESCO on 06.12.1985 with its 356 list number. One of the main reasons for Istanbul being included in this list is the Land Walls. Hatice Sultan and Neslişah Sultan Districts are also located next to the Land Walls (Erturk 2009). Hatice Sultan and Neslişah Sultan Districts, which are known as Sulukule, but which include an official and more comprehensive region (In recent years, these two districts are merged and referred to as Karagumruk District) (Aktas and Alp 2018), has been the living space of our citizens of Roman origin for centuries. Roma living in homes of their parents / grandparents state that they came here with Fatih’s armies (Somersan et al. 2011).

Located within the scope of urban renewal, Sulukule is located in the northwest of Fatih District. Zeytinburnu is located to the west of the district, Eyup districts are located to the northwest, and the shores of the Golden Horn to the north and the Marmara Sea to the east (Figure 1).

Sulukule Urban Renewal project area is located in an easily accessible area in terms of highway. The most important transportation axes in the immediate vicinity of the project area are Fevzi Pasa Street, Vatan Street and Beylerbeyi Street and are easily accessible from all three streets. The area can be accessed from the Ankara-Edirne direction D-100 Highway, which is a ring road in the northwest direction, in connection with the Topcular-Vatan Street Multiple Junction (Erturk 2009).

The Historical Peninsula, which has a history of thousands of years, has served as the capital of the great civilizations such as Eastern Roman, Byzantine and Ottoman Empire and has reached today with the changing spatial formations under the influence of these civilizations. However, due to various reasons, many ancient artifacts have been lost, large green areas have been destroyed and there have been great changes in the social texture.

Sulukule, which is a well-known place both in the city and in the country, was remembered with the Roma who have been living here for decades and in the past with the entertainment houses that they run and which have a certain place in the city’s entertainment life. Roma lived mainly within the borders of the Neslişah district in the south of the area, while traditional Turkish families lived in Hatice Sultan district in the north. According to Islam (2009), with the closure of entertainment houses, which are the main source of income in the region in the 1990s, it is understood that the region has entered into a ratification process. According to Islam (2009), with the closure of entertainment houses, which are the main source of income in the region in the 1990s, it is understood that the region has entered into a ratification process. Sulukule was a very stigmatized region in the eyes of large sections. Until recently, the region served as property and rent values that were well below the market averages and cheap housing stock for low income (Islam 2009).

Sulukule’s place in the city during the Ottoman period: It is known that Roma have a great place in Ottoman entertainment culture. Although the novels weren’t officially present in the Ottoman Palace entertainments, in some cases they took part in sultan entertainments and circumcision feasts. Even though the tradition of Entertainment Arms during the Ottoman period experienced its most magnificent periods, it is possible to say that Sulukule contributed to the city in many ways besides dance and music. After the conquest of Istanbul, the Romans, who were Muslims, established the palace mehter team. It is known that the best, richest mules and baskets of Istanbul also emerged from Sulukule (Meric et al. 2006).

Sulukule’s place in the city during the Republican period: In the periods after the proclamation of the Republic, the tradition of Entertainment Arms continued. Beler (1946) Sulukule Entertainment Houses, furnished with a simple decor and clean room, singing and dancing (Meric et al. 2006).

While Vatan Street was being built, part of the city walls in Edirnekapi and 29 houses in Sulukule were destroyed. A large part of their houses have been demolished and the people of Sulukule have fused with the Hatice Sultan and Neslişah Sultan districts, which have settled along the walls, sliding towards the top and walls. In order to keep in touch with each other, the residents of the destroyed old Sulukule houses established the Sulukule Tourism Survival and Protection Association in 1969 with the support of the Ministry of Tourism. During this period, the Association organized a one-month International Gigan Festival with the participation of novels from the Balkans and European countries. Sulukule, the establishment of a new Roma neighborhood and reunion efforts were unsuccessful when the association was dissolved. In 1985, Sulukules applied to the Ministry of Tourism with the “Show Houses Project”. However, despite the Ministry’s positive approach to the project, this initiative wasn’t successful when it wasn’t accepted by the local government. Although the Show Houses Project wasn’t implemented, the “Entertainment Houses”, known as three, reached thirty-four during this period. These enterprises were
Entertainment Houses, which symbolize the water and Roman culture, were completely closed in 1990s for various reasons and entertainment activities were stopped. Therefore, the differentiation of Sulukule region within the entertainment sector in the 1960s started to differentiate once the entertainment places were closed. However, the population structure in the neighborhood has not changed, but due to the closure of entertainment venues, the region has been dragged into a big and rapid collapse (Ertürk 2009).

Within the scope of the urban renewal project carried out by the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality, Fatih Municipality and TOKİ, which was adopted in 2005, covering Neslisah and Hatice Sultan Districts, more than 300 buildings were demolished and 640 houses were built in place (Figure 2) (Isikcevahir 2017).

When the old and new zoning plans of Sulukule, which is declared as a renewal area by the Council of Ministers based on the law numbered 5366, are compared, the old zoning plan includes 7 parks, 2 educational institutions, 1 tourism facility, 3 religious facilities and building islands. In the new zoning plan, there are 4 parks, 1 educational institution, 2 tourism facilities, 2 trade areas, 3 religious facilities and building islands (Figure 3). According to the changes made in the zoning plans, the increase in the building areas and the decrease in the number of parks and areas are noteworthy. In addition, it is thought that the addressing of the parks to certain regions within the building islands rather than the common use leads to significant changes on the identity of the region. The decrease in the number of educational institutions, the increase in tourism facilities and commercial areas indicate that the characteristics of the region have changed.

**Antalya Kepez Santral District Urban Renewal Project**

Depending on the movement of urbanization in the world and in Turkey, Antalya city’s social, cultural, physical, altered quickly economically advanced and differentiated. It is observed that the process of urbanization in Antalya shape depending on the political and spatial decisions in Turkey. The urbanization process in Antalya city is in parallel with our other cities, rapid population growth, environmental pollution, transportation, visual pollution, housing need, urban identity, inadequate green areas, destruction of environmental resources and values to be protected, slum housing, city center problems are seen as common problems and solution proposals is being developed (Manavoglu 2009).

Within the scope of Law No. 6306 on Disposal Renewal of Areas under Disaster Risk, which is 132.7 hectares, owned by Antalya Metropolitan Municipality and determined within the boundaries of Kepez Santral District, in accordance with the decision of Council of Ministers dated 24.12.2014 and numbered 2014/7041, Pursuant to the decision of the Council of Ministers, it was published in the Official Gazette dated 25.12.2014 and numbered 29216 and declared as ‘Risky Area. Following the decision of the Council of Ministers, planning and project studies were initiated by the Municipality.

The information about the Urban Renewal Project of Antalya Kepez Santral District is summarized below in line with the Explanation and Justification Report for the Area in Accordance with the Law No. 6306 on the Renewal of Areas at Disaster Risk obtained from the Directorate of Urban Renewal Branch (Antalya Buyuksehir Belediyesi 2014).

The development of slum in the city of Antalya dates back to the late 1950s. The first mass and dense slums, especially in the northwest of the city which has developed in every way, has developed simultaneously with the establishment of factories. Ferrochrome Factory in 1957, in 1961 with the establishment of the Weaving Factory and Kepez Hydroelectric Power Plant and manufacturing industry with the development of Kepez, Ahatlı, Erenköy slum districts were formed to meet the need for housing. Kepez Santral District is among the old slums of Antalya.

The Project Area is the area of Antalya Burdur Highway in the east, Ferrochrome Factory in the south, Prison and Ünsal District, Forest Area and Zoo in the north, Forest and Kepez Hydroelectric Power Plant in the west (Figure 4). The area where the site is located and the 1st degree natural site, the Vakıf Zeytinligi land is the urban renewal impact area. Kepez Santral District is located in the old slums of Antalya province.

Kepez Santral District although it is one of the first areas that have an impact on the identity of the city in terms of its location, it is known as a settlement area with low quality of construction and inadequate in terms of infrastructure and infrastructure due to its slum settlement area (Mansuroglu et al. 2018). For these reasons, it was decided to implement urban renewal (Figure 5 and Figure 6).
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Especially after 1980, large scale national and international capital housing projects are in the forefront of profit motive, against unnecessary expansion of cities, destruction of cultural, historical and natural riches, against the principle of economic, social and environmental sustainability, inefficient use of public resources, as well as waste has led to the proliferation of urban spaces that increase social inequality, exclusion and polarization. The urban spaces formed due to these reasons need renewal and renewal. In almost every province in our country, there are areas where crime rates that don't comply with regular urban development, lack of technical infrastructure and other equipment, are economically weak and socially collapsed. These areas really need urban renewal.

When we look at the urban renewal projects implemented in our country, the uniformization that emerges with the implementation of similar projects in different cities, de-identifies our cities, breaks the ties with nature, leads to many problems from the neighborhood culture to the weakening of the social texture. The effects of urban renewal examples in Istanbul and Antalya are presented in (Table 1).

Istanbul Sulukule Urban Renewal Project Antalya Kepez Santral District

Urban Renewal Project

- The existing urban fabric and population structure of Sulukule were ignored and the area was redesigned as an empty land. In this way, the traditional street texture and the layout of the building island were disrupted, the parcels from the history to the present day were eliminated, and the courtyard, facade, street, square structure, building scale and the characteristic usage of the region were changed.

- The Sulukule Renewal Project was implemented without considering the general socio-demographic characteristics of the Roma people living in the area, the public could not keep up with the changing living conditions and gentrification became inevitable with the increase of land and property values,

- When the project is considered in terms of its effects on the physical structure, it is a closed site without walls around the tissue brought to the region and can be defined as a physical environment for the housing expectations of the upper class. This change in the physical structure of Sulukule means the destruction of the urban and architectural heritage of the neighborhood, which has had its own unique texture for centuries. In addition to the elimination of the examples of civil architecture, an important construction activity was carried out in the vicinity of the Land Walls, which is one of the World Heritage List areas of Istanbul and including the wall protection band. With the uniformization of the new structures, the existing identity in the field has been damaged.

- The project area constitutes an important urban renewal potential in terms of location and size. Since it is located at the entry point to the city (north), it makes people's first impressions of Antalya. However, as the project does not reflect the identity of the city, concrete blocks with increasing floor heights will put pressure on the natural and cultural structure of the area.

- As the area is open to investors, the land and real estate market will rise.

- When the general socio-demographic characteristics of the people living in the area are taken into consideration, it is inevitable that the gentrification which will emerge on the basis of changing living conditions will be inevitable with the coexistence with the people in the upper income group.

- The coexistence of the current population and the people in the upper income group may bring about social and cultural conflicts in the future,
• By building high-rise buildings instead of (low-rise buildings / low-density buildings), people will be cut off from the soil, natural and cultural values will be damaged and the culture of the neighborhood will be weakened over time.

• It has been determined that the natural building features are not taken into consideration in the construction of the project. The forested area to the north of the area is at risk with increasing housing demand. Failure to consider existing plants in the area during the application process is a factor in the loss of existing tissue.

It is seen that the urban renewal studies implemented in Istanbul Sulukule and Antalya Kepez Santral District isn't compatible with the urban renewal purposes.

While these projects are expected to establish a relationship between the physical conditions of the city and its social problems, it is seen that an effort has been made for gentrification. It is thought that this situation will cause social problems such as unemployment and inability to adapt to the people leaving the region. Consequently, adversities will be experienced in terms of increasing urban welfare and quality of life.

Urban renewal projects aiming to require a physical change process in the urban fabric lead to the change of urban texture and silhouette with intensive construction in Antalya Kepez Santral District.

In terms of contributing to the maintenance of urban identity in Sulukule and Antalya Kepez and Santral Neighborhoods;
- Implementations that will reveal the impact of the Land Walls around Sulukule and ensure that the walls aren't damaged,
- Keeping the culture of entertainment houses alive, maintaining the novel culture and making use of alternative tourism opportunities,
- Appropriate landscaping in order to break the impact of high-rise buildings in Antalya Kepez and Santral Neighborhoods and reduce the impact of urban heat island,
- To take necessary measures to prevent the olive groves and forested areas located near the Antalya Kepez and Santral Neighborhoods project area to be affected by new projects,
- Painting the previous silhouettes of the neighborhoods on the walls of various buildings (transformers, mukhtar buildings, etc.) to be constructed in both project areas,
- Including museum-like works in the districts exhibiting traditional life,
- Identifying and using previously grown plants in the region, especially in landscape applications,
- It is important to include original designs that reflect the previous characteristics of the neighborhoods in urban reinforcement elements (bench, trash bin, lighting element, flooring materials, manhole covers, stops, etc.).

As a result, in urban renewal projects, taking into consideration that the natural, cultural and social characteristics of each city and even different areas in the same city are different from each other, it is important to make different projects for each urban renewal area in order to preserve the identity gained by the cities and transfer them to future generations.
REFERENCES


Qualitative Research on Individual Transformation Based on Travel Experiences

Özer Mesut ÖZÇELİK
Akdeniz University
ozer_ozcelik@hotmail.com

Ece ÖMÜRİŞ
Assist.Prof.Dr., Akdeniz University
eceomuris@akdeniz.edu.tr

Duygu AYDIN
Akdeniz University
daydin93@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Transformational learning is emerging as a fundamental topic in travel and tourism research. Individual's views of the world are changed by travelling as a result of transformative learning. According to the transformational learning theory, what triggers transformation is to encounter new and unexpected phenomena, and consequently, for the individual to create a dilemma. This is because transformational travel differs from ordinary travels that offer a temporary getaway from the routine. The purpose of this study is to understand what individuals are learnt by travelling and how their views of world changed. Semi-structured in-depth interviews with twenty-two travellers were carried out. According to interviews, travel experiences seem to increase skills development by encouraging individuals to struggle harder in their own lives. Furthermore, individuals have been found to have more awareness and developing self-confidence about their lives.

Keywords: Transformative Learning, Transformational Travel, Transformational Tourism

INTRODUCTION

In tourism literature, it has been known that there is a positive and strong bond among traveling, learning, development and individual transformation. Relationship between traveling and learning, which began in the 17th and 18th centuries when European aristocracy commenced to participate in the Grand Tour for education (Towner, 1985), was started to appear among the subcultures that emerged between the working class and the middle class in the second half of the 20th century. Cohen's (1973) “vagabonds” drifters, who emphasized traveling as a way to gain experience about life, and Vogt (1976) had hippie travelers called globetrotters “wanderers” had many different motivations such as escape, novelty, relaxing which allows them to leave their residences to hit the roads and travel for a long time. One of these motivations is learning motivation. In the 80s, the vagabond discourse associated with hippiness was left to the backpacker (Cohen, 2004). Though they generally lose their value in relation to the hippie movement, travel has been regarded as an important means of gaining vital experience and remains as the core values of rejection of mass tourism.

Towards the end of the 20th Century, especially in the late 20th Century, as people have more free time, and the increase in their income and the opportunity to travel enable more people to travel and offer them opportunity to develop intellectual sense (Bodger, 1998). According to Falk et al. (2012) today, mass tourism and associated tourism activities still remain updated, but also leave room for changing travel and leisure time patterns. From this point of view, it is possible to say that tourism and travel have become an important means by which people can learn, develop ideas and create new perspectives.

In the daily discourse, this phenomenon is not as interesting as other areas in the tourism literature (Falk et al., 2012), although it is thought to be an enlightening experience for travellers to travel (Martín-Cabello and García-Manso, 2015). But recently, the scientific literature has begun to investigate the qualifications gained through travel. According to Jang and Cai (2002), the relationship between people's motivations and
their choice of destination is crucial in predicting their future travels. The issues that tourists possess (such as culture, demography, experience, personality, social capital, etc.) and the issues of destinations (activities, services, management, environment, infrastructure etc.) provide us to understand the sense of tourist's travel decisions and what kind of tourism they will experience in destinations. Tourists are getting some output from the social, cultural and environmental interactions in their destinations. These are satisfaction, pleasure, complaint, health, skill development and learning etc. (Pearce, 2005). Learning motivation (Niggel and Benson, 2008), which is one of the many motivations that nowadays attract travellers from their homes, is also a result of travel experiences. Studies have shown that travellers also have different learning outcomes that enhance their general skills beyond cultural and environmental learning (Pearce and Foster, 2007; Martín-Cabello and García-Manso, 2015). Furthermore, Pearce's fourteen factors, which represent the basic motivations of tourists in the travel career path theory developed by Maslow's Basic Needs Hierarchy model, relate to these outputs. For example; the motivations of self-development, self-enhancement and self-actualization in Pearce's model overlap with learning output (Falk et al., 2012). Richards and Wilson (2004) in a study they conducted with from travelers with backpacks received responses about their travel motivations such as “discovering other cultures” and “interacting with people from other countries”, “raising the level of knowledge” and “developing general skills”.

Pearce (2005) finds travellers whose cognitive status is mindfulness, obtain more learning, higher satisfaction, and a more developed understanding of their travels, by taking the concept of mindfulness (conscious awareness) in psychology. Likewise, Moscardo (1996) describes the concept of mindfulness as “being open to learning, relating to the surrounding area and creating and developing new routines”. When we examine both the historical process and the motivational and cognitive situations of travellers, it is possible to state that the relationship between travel and learning is more concerned with more individual and independent travellers, especially in the last period.

According to Wilson (1993), learning involves both what is happening in the individual and what is connected with the person's surroundings and life experiences. Therefore, if learning represents an important result of the individual's life experiences and therefore the tourist experience, it is necessary for tourism providers and researchers to understand the basis of human learning. (Falk et al., 2012).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Tourism is an effective instrument that transforms thoughts and behaviors of people during and after travel (Lean, 2009, 2012; Lean, Staiff and Waterton, 2014). Describing transformational tourism as an outcome of the tourism experience, Christie and Mason (2003) have defined transformational tourism as a “tourism activity that leads to a positive change on the attitudes and values of individuals who gain the touristic experience.” Similarly, the concept of transformational travel is also used to describe travels carried out with a motivation for self-improvement such as to do self-exploration, to develop a sensitivity for visited places, and to search for deeper meanings on a journey (Tomljenovic and Ateljevic, 2015). Ross (2010) has defined travel as “a comprehensive, individually-tailored, private and fun way, when carried out consciously, to give the individual self-awareness and spiritual experience and to increase his awareness.” Within the transformational learning framework, Ross (2010) has defined transformational travel as “a sustainable journey initiated by the traveler in order to create conditions suitable for transforming one or more main characteristic of the individual (emotional, cognitive, physical, and spiritual).” The theory of transformative learning, first introduced by Mezirow in 1978, is for individuals to learn how to question their own ideologies, beliefs, and perspectives for personal development in line with their own will and goals. Individuals are expected to transform their experiences into new meaningful perspectives by the end of the transformative process (Akpınar, 2010). In order for this process to be initiated, certain travel conditions triggering the process are necessary. The first step of this process is called “disorienting dilemmas” (Mezirow, 1978). For example, if a person encounters a different culture, a physical environment, or social habits, this leads to a cognitive dissonance in which he or she cannot adapt to the current reference framework or worldview. Thus, a dilemma is formed that will lead to the reshaping of reference frames — in other words, semantic structures (Reisinger, 2013a). According to Mezirow (1991), the self-confidence and competency development of the individual constitutes the final stage of this process. According Tomljenovic and Ateljevic (2015), in order for the transformation to begin, it must be independent and it must take place through motivations such as transformation, learning, integration with local culture, and participation in activities that push the individual to think.
Ross (2010) has stated that experiences such as the following can be transformative: when traveling, to stay in holy places; to participate in rituals and ceremonies; to be in nature and to connect with it; to participate in sustainable practices; to learn esoteric stories; to participate in group activities such as yoga, meditation, art and so forth to discover oneself; to learn from local teachers; to perform physically challenging activities; and to provide voluntary community services.

In conclusion, new circles allow the individual to gain new perspectives by offering new stimuli that can somehow force him or her. According to the transformational learning theory, what triggers transformation is to encounter new and unexpected phenomena, and consequently, for the individual to create a dilemma. This is because transformational travel differs from ordinary travels that offer a temporary getaway from the routine. It offers an understanding that allows the traveler to transform. In order to understand transformation related to travel experience, it is necessary for travelers to understand these dilemmas they have experienced, how these dilemmas are solved and what the consequences are. Travelers, as a result of important travel events, experience deep personal and perceptual changes. Transformative learning takes place through experience, crisis and reflection, all of which are often linked to travel. In this respect, the transformational learning theory will be able to establish a suitable framework for investigating the transformative power of tourism.

**METHODOLOGY**

The purpose of the study is to try to understand how the travels lead to a change in the individuals. From this point, the research question is developed as what kind of changes occur in the individual travelers as a result of their travels? In this study, phenomenological design was used as qualitative research methods. The phenomenological approach emphasizes the experience itself and how experience transforms into consciousness (Merriam, 2009). Therefore, in order to search for answers to the question of the study, a phenomenological pattern was used in order to understand in depth what is the change in themselves after traveling based on people's travel experiences. In the study, purposive sampling was used which was formed by 22 people who have experienced frequent individual travels before. No constraints were sought other than the travel experiences of the participants and no demographic limitation was introduced.

**Data Collection**

Data were collected using an interview method to reach participants’ experiences with their travel experiences and their experiences with subsequent changes (Creswell, 2014). Although negotiations were conducted within semi-structured questions, participants were given the flexibility to describe their experience with the journey and its subsequent changes. All interviews were recorded with voice recorder and transcribed by researchers in writing. The interviewees were asked two questions:

- “Considering your previous travel experiences. do you think travelling is instructive? What do you think your travels have taught you?”
- “How has learning through travel changed you?”

**FINDINGS**

In the interviews, rich data were obtained by the individual travellers about the changes that occurred as a result of their travel experiences were subjected by the thematic analysis and the changes after the travel. The themes were defined by the researchers as categorical aggregation and grouping of data. Individual transformation based on a post-travel learning was analysed in three themes: Awareness, self-confidence and skills development.

**Awareness:** The travelers had a common opinion that the act of traveling had an instructive nature. Traveling led individuals to learn by offering new experiences. The most dominant instructive characteristic of traveling was the discovery of cultural differences and the outside world. With travel as a tool, individuals began to realize the outside world by moving away from their lantern of life. The meanings of such phenomena, such as different forms of life, cultural and geographical structure, and political and social life, were experienced by confronting what was real, unlike what people learned in lectures and in books. Therefore, experiencing different lives and witnessing the outside world paved the way for the travelers to create an awareness. The participants achieved a personal transformation by developing an awareness of both their own selves and the outside world.

- “That was the first time opened up my World. I didn't even realize that I wanted to be open but I suppose I was always a bit of an introspective kind of person…”
- “For example, after wandering the Kaçkar Mountains, I realized that I was a person of nature. For example, some people go to hotels.
They go to the Aegean region or so. But, I realized I'm more of a person who prefers the nature. I think it's more exhilarating — exploring, walking, and seeing different places. And, I also realized that I was more of an environmentalist. Every garbage I saw in nature offended my eyes. I wanted to clean them all..."

- “I also might have realized that I am not a big city type of person. I guess, also realised that even later when I travelled again but at that time I felt yet that I needed some time out from big cities as they put me under stress with their noises, people and traffic and also heat and bad air...”

- “Some people they haven’t been travelling and they believe their whole life is in one place and they’re very happy just they live their life, simple life, not see anything. Like the man today that never seen the longest waterfall of turkey but lives here. But they happy to live their lives without going very far. But for us in Australia or in the West we have very lucky we can see the World, we can go travelling but the problem is that is makes you feel like you can do anything but makes you not very happy with the simple life. So you feel like you want more more more... so it’s taught me that there’s so much to say and too much to do...”

- “I was a shepherd and walking with goats in mountains. And I really felt that of something in my mind has changed in the way that because I was completely alone, and this connected from anyone I know or anyone to talked with and I smoked a lot of weed and drank a lot of alcohol. Afterwards I really felt that I am not the same person anymore. The way that capture the World, the way that I look at my thoughts is different what it was before I really felt that. I didn’t become more mature but became more aware or less... how can I say? Mmm I think that before I was in a certain illusion and something in this trip has changed it. I think I am more aware in certain aspects in the reality of the way I look at things...”

Skills development: The travelers had a number of anticipations or plans about the travel, especially before they traveled. During the times of travel, they were experiencing involuntary changes in planned activities or they encountered spontaneous situations in visited regions. The travelers often encountered situations that were challenging and that required effort. At times, during the exploration of unknown places, the course of the journey was evolving spontaneously, and the traveler kept pace with that journey. It was understood that the travelers improved their communication skills, problem-solving skills and life skills in such cases — occurring spontaneously, as a prerequisite of traveling as a traveler.

- “This is because people are in certain stereotypes where they live. They are just in the mode of watching things. They just watch. They think that they have won something, but you cannot be sure of that without putting that into practice. It has to be a method of trial and error. You learn when you do something. Let me say it this way: Let’s say you’re going camping. You’re going to set up a tent somewhere. You learn a technique when you set up a tent, too. It sounds simple, but you’re putting that into practice. This also plays a major role in the teaching phase...”

- “Something may happen to you on the road. You need to solve those problems. Especially when I was traveling alone, I’ve created a solution, because I was alone, by myself. So, there’s a lot of difference between the “me” three years ago and the current “me”...”

- “I’d say, I think my travels taught me how to react in different situations and how to solve different problems...”

- “But I’ve also learned to you are a lot more capable than you think you would...”

- “And to find ways to communicate with every person. Even if it with just a little bit of words or just my face, my expressions.”

- “You go out of your house and your country and there is these people you don’t know and their languages. For us we travel with not a lot of money, so we have to deal what we have sometimes...”

Self-confidence: When the travelers began to cope with challenging situations that they faced along the way, or when they communicated again and again with new people, this experience put them into a cyclical learning event. As a result, they drew conclusions from every experience, and their acquisitions in this process contributed to the development of their self-confidence.

- I wasn’t a person with such a self-confidence 3 years or 5 years before I began traveling. I was a shy person. When I began traveling, especially when I began traveling with little money, I realized that I needed to break that shyness and timidity to accomplish some things. As I traveled, that confidence began to be built...”

- “In relation to a person’s own development, his or her self-confidence is improving psychologically...”
CONCLUSION

This study aimed to understand what travelers learn and how they are personally transformed when traveling. Travel and tourism have an instructive, and thus, a transformative effect on travelers. Consequently, some changes occur in travelers as a result of their travels.

According to the literature, travel provides personal and spiritual development, enhances awareness, and builds self-confidence and self-esteem (Gmelch, 1994; Wearing, 2001; Inkson and Myers, 2003; Pearce and Foster, 2007; Scarinci and Pearce, 2012). Theoretically, in order for the transformation to be accomplished, the person is expected to widen his or her worldview, improve his or her awareness and skills, and gain awareness (Mezirow, 1994; Reisinger, 2013). The findings obtained in this study showed that travel experiences of the travelers granted them awareness and self-confidence, and that the travelers had become more sensitive individuals after their travel experiences. Moreover, according to the findings, the “skill development” emerged to be an important outcome of the traveler experience.

When considered in the context of the concept of transformational tourism/travel, it is important for travelers to become more sensitive individuals, to improve their environmental awareness, and to develop intercultural respect and empathy, as a result of their travel experiences, in order to create a better world by establishing a sustainable concept of tourism. These results will help us to have a deeper understanding of travel-related studies, focusing on post-travel individual transformation, and will contribute to travelling research.

REFERENCES


Analysis of Factors Affecting City Brand Loyalty: A Structural Equation Model Proposal

Erkan ARI
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Dumlupınar University
erkan.ari@dpu.edu.tr

Yasin Emre OGÜZ
Res.Assist. Eskişehir Osmangazi University
yeoguz@ogu.edu.tr

Veyesel YILMAZ
Prof.Dr. Eskişehir Osmangazi University
vyilmaz@ogu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT
The main purpose of this study is to reveal the factors affecting the brand loyalty of the residents in Eskişehir. In the recommended model, social life, environment, international recognition and traffic dimensions are investigated. Structural Equation Model (SEM) was used to investigate the relationships between the factors in the recommended model. The validity of the model was evaluated according to the compliance criteria in the literature. Since the chi-square value was calculated as 169.75 and ($\chi^2 / sd$) value was 3.086. It was decided that the model was valid. As a result of the research; the proposed model was adopted. In addition, statistically significant relationships were found between the variables. In this context, this study was supported current literature.

Keywords: City Brand, Life Quality, Structural Equation Model.

INTRODUCTION
All people living in community deserve a quality life. It is a natural and basic right of people to expect a high quality of life from the city they live in (Rogerson, 1999). If the quality of life is defined as being satisfied with the life and feeling good; the quality of urban life can be defined as the satisfaction of people with the living standards offered by cities and the conditions that make them feel good in the environment they live in. (Yavuzcehre and Torlak, 2006:184).

When a city becomes a brand, it means that the city is different from other cities in terms of cultural, social, commercial and political aspects and that people have a positive thinking in their minds. (Demirgunes and Avcilar, 2014: 558). The concept of city brand “instead of perceiving a particular city as an ordinary settlement in the minds of people, by using brand strategies and techniques; all activities carried out to transform individuals into attraction living centers that they would like to continue their lives, work, invest, receive education and visit” (Dinnie, 2011:7).

Some factors need to be provided to create a good city brand. When the literature is examined, the main elements of the city brand come out as social life quality, local government, cultural opportunities, job opportunities, international recognition, food culture, quality of education and environment, and transportation convenience. It is important that these factors, which are closely related to each other, should be evaluated separately and the contribution of these elements is considered as very important in raising the brand value of the city (Dinnie, 2011; Huang et al., 2013: 663; Noni et al., 2014: 218-226; Demirgunes and Avcilar, 2014: 557; Avcilar and Kara, 2015:77).

In this research, the factors affecting the urban brand loyalty of the people living in Eskişehir were investigated based on the examples of the city brand. Factors such as quality of life, environmental quality, traffic comfort and international recognition, which are thought to be effective in life satisfaction and city brand, were presented to the evaluation of the people living in Eskişehir. The scarcity of research on this subject adds to the original value and importance of the research.
LITERATURE REVIEW

The brand is defined as a name, term, word, icon, design, sign and shape that distinguishes a product from its competitors. (Kotler and Armstrong, 2017:248-249). City branding (city branding) is defined as all activities carried out to transform people into attraction life centers that they want to live, work, invest, receive education and visit by using brand strategies and techniques (Dinnie, 2011:7). When the literature is examined, it is seen that the city brand is an important concept for tourism.

Noni et al. (2014) introduced practical applications for local and global destination marketing and management, focusing on efforts to improve perceived image to increase interest in Milan. In their study, a structural equation model was applied to evaluate the attractive aspects of the city. The results of the research show that culture and education are the most prominent features of Milan. It has been determined that the attitudes towards city brand have less but positive effects on social opportunities, health, tourism and internationalization level.

In a study conducted by Demirgunes and Avcilar (2014), it has been shown that the residents of the brand cities are more satisfied than the others. In this study, satisfaction levels of residents in Osmaniye were examined. It was stated that the most important factor determining the satisfaction of Londoners is the living conditions. Yavuzcehre and Torlak (2006) stated that rapid technological change, global competition and political turmoil put great pressure on cities. In this research, the necessity and importance of creating city brands which are influenced by external factors and the attempts to become a center of attraction were mentioned. Determining the quality of life of people living in a city is decisive for both marketing and brand loyalty (Karamustafa, Gullu and Acar, 2010).

In the research conducted by Avcilar and Kara (2015), it was stated that the studies to create a city brand are a great investment in the future of all the citizens living in the city and even in that country or city. In recent years city marketing and city brand have become one of the sub-disciplines of marketing. In the study conducted by X and Y for Adiyaman, it was determined that city branding is a very important economic income provider for the residents (Akcı and Uluisık, 2016). Thus, it is very important to find out the factors affecting the brand loyalty of residents in Eskisehir both for local governments and for the literature.

METHOD

The structural equation modelling is considered as a statistical method for examining multiple relationships between variables. Therefore, structural equation modelling was used in this study.

Data Collection Tools and Sample

In this study, the population of the research was made up of residents in Eskisehir between 2016-2017. The stratified sampling method was used as the sampling type of this study. The study was conducted with a face-to-face interview with 370 people living in Osmangazi, Visnelik, Akarbasi, Yenikent, Uluonder, Baglar, Alanonu, and Batikent districts, which are assumed to have different socio-economic structures in different geographical locations of Eskisehir. The number of units in the respective districts is 100, 40, 30, 100, 20, 50. The measurement instrument developed was based on the literature (Noni et al., 2014; Demirgunes and Avcilar, 2014). The survey used in the research consists of two sections. The first section of the survey form consisted of age, sex, marital status, education level, monthly income, how many years the participant has lived in Eskisehir. In the second section the items related to the quality of urban life and satisfaction from Eskisehir were measured by using a five-point Likert-type scale. The survey was measured with a five-point Likert scale ranging from “5: Strongly agree / 1: Strongly disagree”.

Within the scope of the research, firstly pilot study was applied to 50 people living in Eskisehir. After the pilot study, the questionnaire was finalized. The questionnaires were conducted on 1 April 2017 - 7 May 2017. The reliability of the scale used in the study was calculated as 0.924.

The Research Model and Hypotheses

The model examined in the research is based on the studies of Noni et al. (2014) and Demirgunes and Avcilar (2014). In the research model, the quality of social life, the quality of the city environment, the international recognition of the city and the ease of traffic of the city were determined as external latent variables and city commitment as internal latent variable (Figure 1).
Figure 1. The Research Model

SOS: Quality of Social Life; CEV: Environmental Quality; ULUS: International Recognition; TRF: Traffic Comfort; SAD: City Brand Loyalty

The hypotheses tested in the research are given below:

**Hypothesis 1:** Social quality of life positively affects city brand loyalty.

**Hypothesis 2:** City environmental quality positively affects city brand loyalty.

**Hypothesis 3:** The international recognition of the city positively affects the brand loyalty of the city.

**Hypothesis 4:** City traffic comfort positively affects city brand loyalty.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

**Descriptive Statistics**

Table 1 indicates the descriptive statistics related to demographic information of the participants.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GENDER</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>49,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>50,8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MARITAL STATUS</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>58,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>41,2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGE</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-26</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>39,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27-35</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>26,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-45</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>20,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46-55</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>7,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56-64</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EDUCATION</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary School Graduate</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary School Graduate</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>13,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School Graduate</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>30,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s Degree</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>45,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post Graduate</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>6,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MONTHLY INCOME</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-750TL</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>9,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>751-1500TL</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>24,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1501-2500TL</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>33,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2501-5000TL</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>26,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5001TL+</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LIVING IN ESKISEHIR</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2 year</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5 year</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>17,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10 year</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>26,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 year +</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>45,8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Analysis Results of the Structural Equation Modelling**

Firstly, the LISREL software was used for testing the suitability of the data to the multivariate normal distribution for the selection of the appropriate parameter estimation method. Since chi-square value = 777,836 (p <0,01) was calculated for multivariate normality symmetry and kurtosis, it was concluded that the data set was not normally distributed. For this reason, Robust Maximum Likelihood method was used as parameter estimation method (Table 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skewness</th>
<th>Kurtosis</th>
<th>Skewness and Kurtosis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Z-Score</td>
<td>P-Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>106,859</td>
<td>23,603</td>
<td>0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Z-Score</td>
<td>P-Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>998,415</td>
<td>14,857</td>
<td>0,001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Structural equation modelling analysis basically consists of two stages. First, the model, which is expressed as a measurement model in terms of verification of the factor structure, is tested with the analysis of the data. Then, the causal relationship between external latent variables and internal latent variables is tested with the structural model. Therefore, first level factor analysis (CFA) was performed to confirm the factor structure in the research model. The results of the CFA analysis showed that the 5-factor structure was valid.
Root Mean Square Error of Approximation (RMSEA) was calculated as 0.07, Goodness of Fit Index (GFI) was 0.95 and, \(x^2/\text{df}\) was 3.08. The behavioural model adaptation values of the research model and the good fit and acceptable limit values of the adaptation criteria used in SEM are given in Table 3. The model was acceptable in terms of fitness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fitness Criteria</th>
<th>Good Fit</th>
<th>Acceptable Fit</th>
<th>Research Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RMSEA</td>
<td>0 ≤ RMSEA ≤ 0.05</td>
<td>0.05 ≤ RMSEA ≤ 0.10</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GFI</td>
<td>0.95 ≤ GFI ≤ 1.00</td>
<td>0.90 ≤ GFI ≤ 0.95</td>
<td>0.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(x^2/\text{df})</td>
<td>0 ≤ (x^2/\text{df}) ≤ 2</td>
<td>2 ≤ (x^2/\text{df}) ≤ 5</td>
<td>3.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LISREL software was used to estimate the parameters.
According to the results shown in Figure 2, a statistically significant correlation was found between social life quality and city brand loyalty variables. This value indicates that one-unit change in the Social Life Quality will result in 0.24 changes in city brand loyalty. A statistically significant correlation was found between environmental quality and city brand loyalty variables. This value indicates that one unit change in environmental quality will result in 0.14 changes in city brand loyalty. A positive statistically significant relationship was found between international recognition and city brand loyalty variables. This value indicates that one unit of change in international recognition will be 0.17 units of change in city brand loyalty. Similarly, a positive statistically significant relationship was found between traffic comfort and city brand loyalty variables. This value indicates that one-point increase in traffic comfort will result in an increase of 0.16 points in city brand loyalty.

**Table 4.** Standardized Parameter Estimates and Hypothesis Testing Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Standardized Parameter Estimates</th>
<th>Hypothesis testing results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1: SOS → SAD</td>
<td>0.24***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2: CEV → SAD</td>
<td>0.14**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3: ULUS → SAD</td>
<td>0.17**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4: TRF → SAD</td>
<td>0.16**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SAD = 0.25SOS + 0.14CEV + 0.18ULUS + 0.16TRF; \[ R^2 = 0.30 \]

**Table 5.** Correlation Coefficients Matrix of External Latent Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SOS</th>
<th>CEV</th>
<th>ULUS</th>
<th>TRF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SOS</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEV</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ULUS</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRF</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
When Table 4 and 5 are examined, it is seen that all hypotheses are supported. When Table 5 is analysed, it can be said that the 30% change in city brand loyalty is explained by the variables of social life quality, environmental quality, international recognition and traffic quality.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

In this study, factors that affect city brand loyalty of residents in Eskisehir were investigated using a proposed research model and SEM. The research model includes factors such as social quality of life, environmental quality, international recognition and traffic comfort. In the study, a statistically significant positive correlation was found between social quality of life and city brand loyalty variables. It is understood that as the social activities offered by the city to students, the disabled and the elderly increase, the brand loyalty of the city will increase. A statistically significant correlation was found between environmental quality and city brand loyalty variables. Increasing the number of green spaces in the city, decreasing the air pollution, taking the necessary measures against environmental pollution of the municipalities will increase the brand loyalty of the residents.

A positive statistically significant relationship was found between international recognition and city brand loyalty variables. As the international reputation of the city and the international events organized in the city increase, the loyalty of the residents to the city will increase.

In the study, a positive statistically significant relationship was found between traffic comfort and city brand loyalty variables. The convenience of pedestrians with the means of transportation in the city, appropriate level of public transportation fees, sufficient number of parking lots positively affects the city brand loyalty of residents.

According to these results, local governments who want to create city brands should give importance to social life quality, environmental quality, traffic and internationalization factors (Dinnie, 2011; Demirgunes and Avci, 2014; Avci and Kara, 2015). In this context, this study was supported the literature. In besides, the brand of city is crucial to tourism (Herget, Petru and Abrham, 2015; Soltani, Pieters, Young and Sun, 2017).

This research was conducted for city residents in Eskisehir. Because those who know a city in the best way live there. However, it is thought that the perception of Eskisehir in future studies will be measured and compared with the findings of this study will contribute to the literature.

REFERENCES


Gastronomy as a Tourism Resource: The Case of Gaziantep

Zeynep KARSAVURAN
Res. Assist., Akdeniz University
zkarsavuran@akdeniz.edu.tr

Onur DİRLİK
Assist. Prof. Dr., Eskişehir Osmangazi University
onur@ogu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

This study aims to propose a resource-based approach to the development of gastronomy tourism in city destinations. For this purpose, the case of Gaziantep is examined as an important gastronomy tourism destination of Turkey. Gaziantep is included in UNESCO Creative Cities Network in the field of gastronomy with its rich culinary heritage and therefore, the city presents a relevant case to examine the culinary resources from the resource-based view. The data rely on the documents gathered from the reports, statistics, web pages of various stakeholders, media news and academic studies on gastronomy tourism in the city. Analysis of the documents shows that gastronomy tourism resources of Gaziantep could be classified as facilities, activities, events, and organizations. In addition, five governmental principles for promoting gastronomy tourism are identified; (i) developing projects for sustainable development; (ii) maintaining coordination between industry stakeholders; (iii) implementing initiatives to achieve the objectives of the UCCN; (iv) building the brand of gastronomy tourism destination; and (v) constructing educational environment for gastronomy and tourism.

Keywords: Gastronomy Tourism, Creative Cities, UNESCO, Gaziantep, Resource-based View

INTRODUCTION

Tourist destinations consists of various tangible and intangible products and services. Food is one of these important resources. In recent years, there is an increasing awareness about the role of gastronomy in the process of developing tourism in countries, regions and cities. Gastronomic experiences are important attractions of destinations (Kozak & Rimmington, 1999: 280; Enright & Newton, 2004: 783) which affect destination choice (Kivela & Crotts, 2006: 372), satisfaction level and revisit intention of travellers (Rimmington & Yüksel, 1998: 48-52). Food and culinary culture of destinations also represent intangible heritages and have unique features with their local characteristics. Therefore, gastronomy tourism represents an emerging tourism market for many countries or regions and creates a unique source of competitive advantage for tourist destinations (Horng & Tsai, 2012). Destinations that are aware of this role of cuisine have begun to use their gastronomic elements in their promotions and positioning in the broader tourism market.

UNESCO initiated a Creative Cities Network (UCCN) in 2004 which aims to strengthen creativity and innovation and promote cooperation with and among member cities. The Network covers seven creative fields (crafts and folk art, design, film, gastronomy, literature, media arts, and music) that cities could use for sustainable urban development. Cities that benefit from their gastronomic products creatively in their development plans are included in the creative field of gastronomy in UCCN list. There are, currently, 26 gastronomy cities from 17 countries. Gaziantep from Turkey was designated a city of gastronomy in 2015 by UCCN. In this study, we have adopted a resource-based approach to the development of tourism in city destinations and examined the case of Gaziantep as an important destination for gastronomy tourism. We aimed to discuss the process of developing gastronomy tourism as a way of achieving sustainable competitive advantage. Although the positive impact of gastronomic products on tourism activities is widely accepted in the literature, there is still a paucity to explain its contribution to the competitiveness of destinations. In an aim of addressing this paucity, the resource-based view (RBV) has been adapted to gastronomy tourism resources since the RBV brings meaningful explanations to the process of achieving competitive advantage in the field of strategic management.
LITERATURE REVIEW

In order to understand the process of tourism development in cities, the resources of destinations should be examined with an academic approach. The RBV strives to explain the competitive advantage in the field of strategic management and focuses on the internal resources of the firms. The level of analysis, however, has been expanded and the view has eventually become popular for understanding city or regional competitiveness. The theoretical foundations and explanations of the approach have been reviewed in the following section with the aim of adapting its arguments to tourist destinations. Destinations have various resources. Gastronomy has been selected in this study and later, the relationship among gastronomy, tourism and destinations has been established through the studies in the literature.

Resource-based view

Schools of strategic management have developed various explanations to the questions of what is the source of competitive advantage and how it is sustained. The resource-based view analyses firms from the resource side (Wernerfelt, 1984: 171) and claims that the competitive advantage is due to their specific resources and competencies. The view has two main assumptions (Barney, 1991: 101); resources are heterogeneous in nature and not perfectly mobile across firms. These resources could include all assets, organizational capabilities, human resources, information, knowledge, etc. but not all firm resources provide the firm a sustained advantage in competitiveness. Barney (1991) developed a theoretical framework for discussing the potential of resources for a sustained competitive advantage. According to this framework, a firm resource must have four attributes (valuable, rare, imperfectly imitable, and not substitutable) for generating competitive advantage.

Value. Barney (1991: 106) explains that firm resources can only be a source of competitive advantage if they are valuable; and resources could be considered valuable when they contribute to efficiency and effectiveness of a firm. Considering the traditional “strengths-weaknesses-opportunities-threats” model, resources that reduce the impact of threats while creating opportunities could improve the firm performance and they could be regarded as valuable resources.

Rariness. The second requirement for strategic resources is that the resource should be rare. If a large number of firms possess valuable resources, then they could not generate a competitive advantage (Barney, 1991). Resources which are not commonly found or possessed by competitors are rare resources.

Imperfect imitability. Valuable and rare resources are sources of competitive advantage if they could not be imitated by the organizations which do not possess these resources. Barney (1991: 107-11) argues that strategic resources of organizations could not be imitated for one or a combination of three reasons. First, firms obtain their resources under unique historical conditions and competitors without a similar path cannot duplicate the valuable and rare resources. Second, competitors may not fully understand the link between the resources and competitive advantage since there is causal ambiguity in the relationship between these two. The reason behind a firm’s success and its link with the resources may not be clear for outsiders and competing firms may not know the ways they should follow to imitate the strategies of firms with a sustained competitive advantage. Third, there is social complexity for resources which stands for complex social relations, culture, and the existence of complex interpersonal relations. Resources are complex social phenomena which are not fully managed and thus, they are difficult to imitate.

Non-Substitutability. For a sustained competitive advantage, the last requirement is that there must be no equivalent valuable resources (Barney, 1991). Competitors might not be able to duplicate the strategic resources of other firms exactly, but they could follow the strategies of successful firms to substitute a similar or a very different resource of their own. Then, competing firms would follow similar strategies with their alternate resources which are also valuable, rare, and not imitable.

The resource-based view focuses primarily on the internal analysis and resources of firms and argues that resources and competencies which are valuable, rare, imperfectly imitable, and not substitutable would generate a sustained competitive advantage for the firms controlling these resources. Along with these theoretical foundations, Grant (1991) pointed out the need for an integrating framework to develop the practical implications of the theory and proposed a five-staged model for a resource-based strategic analysis. According to Grant (1991: 115), first, available resources should be identified and classified in order to appraise strengths and weaknesses relative to competitors. In addition, opportunities should be identified for better utilization of resources. Second, the model suggests that capabilities of the firms to use resources effectively should be discussed (Grant, 1991). Third, the potential of resources to generate...
capabilities and sustainable competitive advantage for organizations should be discussed. Fourth, Grant (1991) suggests selecting a strategy that best exploits the resources and capabilities relative to external opportunities. Lastly, strategic analysis is an ongoing process and resource gaps should always be identified that need to be filled and invested in replenishing, augmenting, and upgrading the resource base (Grant, 1991). This model helps to understand the process of resources contributing to the competitiveness and also to generate practical implications.

In strategy formulation, resources and capabilities of firms are central considerations. The RBV explains these internal resources and highly cited in strategic management field of research. The view utilizes a micro analytical approach and examines the internal factors of firms but its theoretical explanations could also be adopted to tourism destinations by developing an evaluation of resources at the destination level.

Resource-based view to the relationship among food, tourism and destination

Destination attributes such as climate and scenery have long been studied as sources of destination competitiveness. Travel and tourism competitiveness index developed by World Economic Forum contains four broad categories; enabling environment, travel and tourism policy and enabling conditions, infrastructure, natural and cultural resources (TTCI, 2017). As in this index, scholars (e.g. Dwyer & Kim, 2003; Enright & Newton, 2004) have also impressed on resources and available tourism services for destination competitiveness. Resources are considered as attractors in tourism industry and competitiveness of a tourist destination depends on attracting tourists (Dwyer & Kim, 2003: 369). It is possible to make a long list of natural and cultural resources that attract tourists but this study focused on the cuisine of destinations.

Resources of gastronomy tourism, on the other hand, require a holistic approach. Gastronomy tourism covers a wide range of resources which are broader than experiencing food as a physical substance. Hjalager (2002) explains that value chain in gastronomy tourism includes all the phases from the basic ingredients to the point of eating, and to food souvenirs taken back home. Smith and Xiao (2008: 290-1) developed a framework for gastronomy tourism resources and listed them in four broad categories; facilities (buildings, structures, land uses, routes), activities (consumption, tours, education/observation), events (consumer shows, festivals) and organizations (classification systems, associations). This view suggests examining not only existing resources in a destination but also improvements and developments in gastronomy tourism products. Crouch and Ritchie (1999: 143) claim that resources provide only a relative advantage, but the real competitive advantage for a destination could only be achieved by development and efficient use of the resources. As suggested by Grant (1991), RBV should include the utilization process of resources.

Literature points out that gastronomy is a valuable resource for tourist destinations. Enright and Newton (2004) conducted a study to determine the competitiveness in urban tourism in the Asia-Pacific region and examined the factors that contribute to the competitiveness of city destinations. Cuisine was found one of the most important attractors in this study which was second only to safety. When the authors have further examined the Hong Kong's relative competitiveness in Asia-Pacific region, they found that cuisine was the most important strength of city. Results of another study (Kivela & Crotts, 2006) with 1067 international tourists in Hong Kong showed that the main reason for visiting the city was food for approximately 21% of the respondents. In addition to being valuable, gastronomy tourism products could be rare resources if destination managers and practitioners could benefit from these resources efficiently. Their efforts and success in developing and implementing strategies could serve as rare elements contributing to the competitiveness (Alonso & Bressan, 2016: 363). Gastronomy of a destination is also very difficult to be imitated by competitors since it reflects the gastronomic identity of a region which is shaped with unique historical conditions. Furthermore, food-related experiences affect destination choice of travellers (Björk & Kauppinen-Raisanen, 2016; Kivela & Crotts, 2006) and, especially for gastronomy tourists, they could not be substituted with other resources.

The study findings provide insightful explanations for both supply side in tourist destinations and tourists' demand for gastronomic products. Earlier studies also allow us to develop a RBV of resources of gastronomy which are valuable, rare, imperfectly imitable and non-substitutable resources. Gastronomy, therefore, regarded as an important resource for destination marketing (Frochot, 2003: 78; Okumuş et al., 2013: 423) and gastronomy tourism is viewed as a market niche (Horng & Tsai, 2012). Despite the increasing awareness about the role of gastronomy, not many cities are successful in using their food products in destination marketing (Okumuş et al., 2007). In this study, Gaziantep is examined as an important gastronomy tourism city of Turkey. Gaziantep is included in UNESCO Creative Cities Network with its rich culinary heritage. Cities that could benefit from creativity as a strategic factor for sustainable urban development are included in the UNESCO’s list and thus, it is important to examine the strategic processes of the city and identify its key success factors.
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study employs case study research methods and document analysis as the data collection technique. Gaziantep is one of these cases, chosen as it stands out with its rich culinary heritage. The city presents a relevant case to examine the culinary resources and to develop a resource-based approach to gastronomy tourism. In case studies, an analysis of all relevant documents is recommended in order to examine the case in detail and develop an in-depth understanding (Gillham, 2003). The reports, statistics, web pages of numerous stakeholders and media news were examined for this study (see the appendix 1 for a list of document sources). In addition, the findings of academic studies conducted in Gaziantep were taken into consideration. In the analysis of the data, content analysis was used. The model developed by Grant (1991) was guided for a strategic analysis of the gastronomic tourism resources of the city.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Gaziantep has important and valuable resources for the development of gastronomy tourism. The city stands out with its rich culinary heritage. The region has unique product, food preparation and consumption patterns. Of the 44 geographical indications registered for Gaziantep, 40 of them are food and beverages. Gaziantep, which is located in Mesopotamia region, has been located at the meeting point of cultures and has been influenced by different cultures. However, in order for tourists to experience this culinary culture, gastronomic tourism products must be available for their visits and consumption in the city. Thus, the first step of strategic analysis should be the identification and classification of gastronomy tourism resources (Grant, 1991). The sources identified for Gaziantep as a result of document analysis were classified by adopting the typology developed by Smith and Xiao (2008).

Identification and classification of gastronomy tourism resources

Facilities. Building/structures, land uses and routes are facilities for gastronomy tourism (Smith & Xiao, 2008). The main facilities available for visitors to Gaziantep are restaurants. Local food and beverages are served in a number of restaurants in the city centre in a unique atmosphere and at a high quality service. 23 of the restaurants are certified by Ministry of Culture and Tourism. In total, there are around 1500 food and beverage enterprises in the city (SGK, 2018). In addition to restaurants, cafes and coffeehouses, there are museums where visitors can get information about local cuisine or city's agricultural products. Emine Göğüş Culinary Museum displays the kitchenware used in Gaziantep cuisine and representations of local dishes. In the Pistachio Museum, the processes carried out from the harvest to the consumption are explained and information is given about the pistachios. It is also possible to visit the historical coppersmith bazaar and see the process of making kitchen utensils and purchase them. Local products such as pistachios and menengiç (turpentine) coffee could be found and purchased in the local markets around the city. A large number of food products are sold in these markets.

Gaziantep is one of the main destinations for gastronomy or gourmet tours. Examination of gastronomy tour routes of the travel agencies showed that Gaziantep is the most frequently included city in these tours. The routes of package tours might include close cities such as Mardin and Şanlıurfa which also have rich culinary culture. In addition, cultural tours organized in the region have gastronomic tourism activities in their programmes. Kızılirmak et al. (2016) examined the gastronomic routes in Turkey and reached similar findings. The study identified 46 routes in the country and found that the majority of these routes were organized in the Eastern Mediterranean and South-eastern Anatolia regions, and Gaziantep was included in almost all of the tours organized in these regions.

Furthermore, it is possible to observe an urban food district among the restaurants and markets that are frequently visited in the city. Gastronomy writers and bloggers also point to these districts. In addition, some of the travel agencies' programs include activities such as visiting pistachio farms and participating in harvesting. However, land uses such as visiting farms are not frequent as restaurant and market visits. The findings show that the city do not benefit enough from its farms and vineyards.

Activities. Consumption, touring, and education/observation could be considered as activities in the scope of gastronomy tourism (Smith & Xiao, 2008). Dining at restaurants and purchasing food products such as baklava and pistachio are the common activities of visitors to Gaziantep. Touring urban districts where visitors could find these products and have their meals or drinks is also an important activity at the city centre. The activities mentioned here are included in the package tours of travel agencies. They are also easily accessible at the city centre for independent travellers. For gastronomy tourists who are interested in receiving education or observing culinary culture of Gaziantep, there are some opportunities. City municipality has published a number of books to promote the culinary culture of the city. Examples of these books are Siveydir-Gaziantep Cuisine, Four Seasons of Gaziantep Cuisine, and Gaziantep Dishes from Tradition to Future.

In addition to these activities, a small number of customized food tours include visiting pistachio
farms and food processing facilities. Participants find a chance to harvest some pistachio in these tours. They also learn about preparation of dishes by observing and also participating during their visits to food processing facilities or restaurants.

**Events.** According to Smith and Xiao (2008), consumer shows and festivals are important resources for gastronomy tourism. Review of documents shows that Gaziantep hosts a number of events every year. Consumer shows such as Natural Life Market have been organized in the city. The second International Gaziantep Gastronomy Festival (GastroAntep) was held this year. Panels, workshops, seminars and consumer shows were in the programme of the festival. Various activities are organized throughout the festival which attract tourists, residents, children, gastronomy students and professionals. In addition, the Shira Festival, which is a product made from grapes, and the Gaziantep Pistachio Culture and Art Festival, which starts at the harvest time of pistachios, are organized annually.

**Organizations.** Associations and food and restaurant classification systems are subheadings of organizations (Smith & Xiao, 2008). The most important association for the case of Gaziantep is UNESCO Creative Cities Network. As explicated in earlier chapters, Gaziantep is affiliated as a creative city in the field of gastronomy by UCCN in 2015. Being a gastronomy city provided a chance for the city to promote itself as a gastronomy tourism destination. The city stakeholders have also applied to classification systems. They mostly benefited from the food classifications provided by Turkish Patent and Trademark Office to identify the geographical indications. The system of geographical indications is important to identify, protect, and promote local foods of the city. Currently there are 40 food and beverages registered for Gaziantep.

Resources of Gaziantep for gastronomy tourism are discussed in four headings (facilities, activities, events, organizations) as suggested by Smith and Xiao (2008). A list of these resources is also presented in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Facilities</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Events</th>
<th>Organizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Buildings/Structures</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Restaurants (Kebab houses e.g. Imam Çağdaş, Halil Usta; Coffeehouses e.g. Tahmıs Kahvecisi; Pastries e.g. Koçak Baklava, Zeki Usta; Soup restaurants e.g. Meta- net)</td>
<td>Consumption</td>
<td>Consumer Shows</td>
<td>Associations (e.g. UCCN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Food-related museums (e.g. Emine Göğüş Culinary Museum, Pistachio Museum)</td>
<td>- Dining at restaurants</td>
<td>- Food shows (e.g. Natural Life Market)</td>
<td>Food Classification Sys- tems (e.g. Turkish Patent and Trademark Office, Geograp- hical Indications)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Markets (Kitchenware e.g. Bakır- çilar Çarşısı; Food and beverages e.g. Almacı, Bakırçilar)</td>
<td>- Purchasing retail food and beverages</td>
<td>Festivals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land Uses</strong></td>
<td><strong>Touring</strong></td>
<td>Harvest festivals (e.g. Pistachio Fes- tival)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Food districts</td>
<td>- City food districts</td>
<td>- GastroAntep, Shira</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Farms (e.g. pistachio farms)</td>
<td>- Agricultural regions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Routes</strong></td>
<td><strong>Education/Observation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Food routes</td>
<td>- Observing food processing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Gourmet trails</td>
<td>- Participating in harvesting, cooking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reading food beverage magazines, books</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** The table is adapted from Smith and Xiao (2008: 290)

### Evaluating governmental principles for promoting gastronomy tourism

As mentioned above, Gaziantep has many resources of gastronomy tourism. Document analysis points out the initiatives and efforts to develop gastronomy tourism in the city by using these resources. However, the resource-based approach also includes steps such as assessing the competences of stakeholders to be able to benefit from these resources, achieving competitive advantage and developing appropriate strategies for this purpose (Grant, 1991). For Gaziantep, the main actor involved in the development and promotion of gastronomy tourism is the local government. A review of documents points out the leader role of metropolitan municipality for the projects, events, and other efforts to promote gastronomy tourism. Governmental principles to develop and promote gastronomy tourism in Gaziantep could be evaluated as follows;
Developing projects for sustainable development. Mayor of the city explains that being a gastronomy centre is not about only having a range of local and unique products, but also about generating employment, improving economy, increasing export, and ensuring sustainable development in the city. For that purpose, the city stakeholders develop projects to effectively use their own resources and local products. The scope of these projects threefold; environmental, economical, and social. For example, a pilot-project for preparing a territorial climate plan was initiated in 2010, which was supported by the French Development Agency and the French Agency of Environment and Energy Management. The Climate Action and Environmental Action Plan has been implemented to develop a plan for strategic sectors (transport, waste management, water management, services, industry, housing) and to proactively take action against climate change. Projects for preserving the local agricultural products of the city have been also implemented. Gaziantep Pistachio Eco-Park Project and Research and Development Centre for Gaziantep Pistachio are two important examples for these attempts. In addition, the city aims to create employment opportunities for young generation with Youth4food project. UCCN explains the projects of Gaziantep as follows; “The Municipality demonstrates a strong commitment to improving urban quality of life and supporting sustainable development through many environmental and ecological programmes including a climate change action plan, an environment protection plan and the creation of an eco-park. This third programme is aligned with the production of renewable energy by transforming pistachio shells, unused until now, into an innovative source of energy foreseen to benefit both industrial and residential use.”

Maintaining coordination between industry stakeholders. The Municipality works together with other stakeholders and also encourages coordination among them. Organizations such as Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Development Agency, Chamber of Commerce work for regional development and improving tourism in Gaziantep. For example, a collaborative platform was created to create cooperation among the chambers of neighbour cities (Kahramanmaraş, Kilis, Şanlıurfa, Adiyaman, Osmaniye, Antakya, Gaziantep). Another cooperation is between Regional Development Agency (IPEKYOLU) and Gaziantep Chamber of Commerce is Gastronomy and Culinary Arts Academy which aims to organize professional culinary education programmes for students and to organize seminars and short term trainings for the food and beverage industry members. Gaziantep Municipality, Chamber of Commerce and Development Agency are coordinating for improving the quality of gastronomy tourism in Gaziantep. Nongovernmental organizations, The Tourism Support and Education Foundation (TUDEV) and Mutfak Dostları Derneği (MDD), also support this project. Furthermore, a partnership protocol has been signed between the municipality and Gaziantep University in 2015. These are only some examples of coordination among stakeholders in the city, but they are important to point out the emphasis placed on coordination to produce joint projects.

Implementing initiatives to achieve the objectives of the UCCN. Cities acknowledge their commitment to follow the objectives of UCCN by joining the Network. These objectives could be briefly listed as sharing best practices, developing partnerships that promote creativity and the cultural industries, strengthening participation in cultural life and integrating culture in urban development plans. Member cities must submit a monitoring report in every four years to show their implementations of the objectives. Gaziantep must submit the report this year as being designated four years earlier in 2015 but for Gaziantep, it is possible to observe the implementations. First, the city both hosts and participates the events in member cities in an aim of establishing cooperation and exchanging ideas with other creative gastronomic cities. The city aims to enhance technical and professional exchange among professionals of restaurants and students of schools of gastronomy. Member cities and also other sister cities are invited to the International Gastronomy Festival of Gaziantep (GastroAntep) which has been organized annually and included workshops and cooking shows of participating cities. Gaziantep also actively participates in the events of UCCN and Silk Road Mayor Forum. Promoting policies and measures for sustainable urban development is also one of the areas of action set in the UCCN Mission Statement and thus, the city’s projects of sustainability mentioned earlier support to objectives of UCCN. The efforts of the city to improve participation in the projects and events for marginalized or vulnerable groups and individuals are also in compliance with UCCN objectives.
Building the brand of gastronomy tourism destination. The designation of the UCCN city of gastronomy is extensively used by the city in all of its gastronomy related events. It helps to develop a brand for the city as a gastronomy tourism destination. The geographical indications, gastronomy events, gastronomy books are important to indicate the local and unique products of the city. In addition, the efforts to integrate culture and food and to promote the culinary heritage by using the background history for storytelling are important in building the brand.

Constructing educational environment for gastronomy and tourism. Providing educational programs and training for students and professionals is especially important for sustainable development. It would also help to support to UCCN objectives of enhancing creativity and innovation. In an aim of encouraging a new generation of culinary experts, Youth4Food project is initiated in a collaboration between creative Gaziantep, Bergen, Dénia, Östersund and Parma. Youth4Food is the abbreviation for the ‘Youth in action for a creative and sustainable gastronomy’ initiative which aims to increase the number of students entering the industry and also tackle the skills-shortage in the gastronomy sector. The metropolitan municipality has also founded two educational centres; Culinary Arts Centre and Culinary Arts Training Centre. These centres both provide training and also strive to revive the traditional dishes and forgotten culinary rituals. Thus, the centres also support to promote culinary culture of the city.

CONCLUSION

This study examines the process of developing gastronomy tourism in Gaziantep. From the resource-based view, tourist destinations must identify and effectively use their core resources for gastronomy tourism (Horng & Tsai, 2012). Thus, the resources of Gaziantep are identified and classified in the first step of strategic analysis. Facilities, activities, events, and organizations are examined for developing a typology of gastronomy tourism resources of the city. Second, government ability and policies for promoting gastronomy tourism are evaluated. Governmental principles are examined in five headings; developing projects for sustainable development, maintaining coordination between industry stakeholders, implementing initiatives to achieve the objectives of the UCCN, building the brand of gastronomy tourism destination, and constructing educational environment for gastronomy and tourism.

Gastronomy has become a major attraction of tourism destinations and it has considerable potential as a means of developing and marketing tourism regions (Richards, 2002). For tourist destinations, however, owning the culinary culture as a resource is not enough for achieving the competitive advantage. There is also a need for the operationalization that will provide the resources for tourists. According to the resource-based approach, a long term competitive advantage could only be achieved if governmental principals support the development and promotion of gastronomy tourism and there are other institutional actors available for the supply of services. In this study, Gaziantep food culture is determined as a competitive resource (rareness, value, imperfect imitability, non-substitutability). Findings also showed the heterogeneity within the core resources of the city, including facilities, activities, events and organizations. Governmental initiatives to make the best use of these resources, to increase the quality of tourist experiences, and to create new experiences are the important attempts for gastronomy tourism development in the city (Hjalager, 2002).

This study identified the key success factors in gastronomy tourism in Gaziantep from the RBV, but there is also a need to discuss the positioning of the city cuisine in the international tourism market. The RBV discusses whether a resource is competitive or not and makes an important contribution to both theoretical and practical strategic analysis. This discussion of resources provides an initial basis for the evaluation of competitive advantage, but fails to explain how to position these valuable resources in a competitive market. For this reason, this study can be considered as the first stage of strategic analysis long-term tourism region planning and a preliminary research by showing that Gaziantep culinary culture possesses the qualifications required to have a competitive position in the global tourism market. To further develop the strategic analysis, how to position the gastronomy of the city and the roles of government, private sector and regional non-governmental organizations in this process should be discussed by both practitioners and scholars in future studies. In this way, it would be possible to position the local cuisine of Gaziantep among the world’s well-known cuisines.
REFERENCES


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document title</th>
<th>Retrieved from</th>
<th>Last access</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gaziantep Culinary Arts Centre (MSM)</td>
<td><a href="https://mutfaksanatlarimerkezi.com.tr/index.html">https://mutfaksanatlarimerkezi.com.tr/index.html</a></td>
<td>06.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaziantep Culinary Arts Training Centre (MUSEM)</td>
<td><a href="https://gaziantepmuseum.com.tr/">https://gaziantepmuseum.com.tr/</a></td>
<td>06.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaziantep Governorate</td>
<td><a href="http://www.gaziantep.gov.tr/gaziantep-turizm">http://www.gaziantep.gov.tr/gaziantep-turizm</a></td>
<td>06.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaziantep Municipality</td>
<td><a href="https://gaziantep.bel.tr/">https://gaziantep.bel.tr/</a></td>
<td>06.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaziantep Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism</td>
<td><a href="https://www.gaziantep.ktb.gov.tr/">https://www.gaziantep.ktb.gov.tr/</a></td>
<td>06.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Gaziantep Gastronomy Festival (2)</td>
<td><a href="http://gastroantepfest.com/en">http://gastroantepfest.com/en</a></td>
<td>09.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCCN news-UNESCO creative cities of gastronomy celebrate sustainable gastronomy day</td>
<td><a href="https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/events/unesco-creative-cities-gastronomy-celebrate-sustainable-gastronomy-day">https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/events/unesco-creative-cities-gastronomy-celebrate-sustainable-gastronomy-day</a></td>
<td>03.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCCN webpage for Gaziantep</td>
<td><a href="https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/gaziantep">https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/gaziantep</a></td>
<td>03.09.2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCCN Youth 4 Food Project</td>
<td><a href="https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/events/lab2030-youth-4-food-encouraging-new-generation-culinary-experts">https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/events/lab2030-youth-4-food-encouraging-new-generation-culinary-experts</a></td>
<td>03.09.2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An Econometric Analysis on Determining the Relationship Between Employment and Tourism: The Case of Turkey

Yaşar SARI
Prof.Dr., Eskişehir Osmangazi University
ysari@ogu.edu.tr

Yasin Emre OĞUZ
Res.Asst., Eskişehir Osmangazi University
yeoguz@ogu.edu.tr

Cansev ÖZDEMİR
Res.Asst.Dr., Eskişehir Osmangazi University
caozdemir@ogu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

This research is aimed to examine the relationship between tourism and employment through econometric analysis. Literature shows that the relations between tourism and employment are generally conceptually discussed. In this research, the relationship between the two concepts has been empirically examined by means of econometric analysis. The number of people employed in hospitality enterprises was used as an indicator of employment and tourism revenue was used as a tourism indicator. Data was collected monthly between 2014 and 2018. Cointegration and causality analyzes were applied to the data set. As a result of the study, long-term cointegration relationship between tourism and employment was determined. After the determination of the cointegration relationship, the causality test was applied to the series. According to the causality analysis, tourism and employment were seen as Granger causes of each other. In this respect, suggestions were given to the decision makers.

Keywords: Tourism, Employment, Cointegration, Causality, Turkey.

INTRODUCTION

Since the 1980s, the tourism sector has become a sector of great importance throughout the world. Therefore, countries cannot remain indifferent to tourism mobilities due to their direct and indirect contribution to the national economies. Tourism has micro impacts in the regional level as well as macro impacts that affect the entire country. One of these macro economic effects is the employment-generator effect (Ünlüönen, Tayfun and Kılıçlar, 2011; Bahar and Kozak, 2014). Employment means the utilization of something on a duty (TDK, 2018). In terms of economic literature, it means the use of labor factor in its narrow sense and in broad terms, the use of all factors of production (labor, capital, natural resources and entrepreneurs) during production activities (Eren, 2015).

Although the employment-generator effects of tourism in the theoretical sense are known, the fact that this situation has not been examined by econometric analyses constitutes the starting point of the research. The main purpose of the research is to determine the direction of the cause and effect relationship between tourism and employment and to propose solutions to decision makers. In this context, it is thought that the analysis of the relationship between these two concepts through econometric analyzes constitutes the original value of the research.

LITERATURE REVIEW

There is a positive relationship between income and employment due to the labor-intensive nature of the hotel industry (Ghosh, Siddique and Gabbay, 2003). There are studies in the literature examining the relationship between tourism and employment in Turkey (Çimat and Bahar, 2003; Dilber, 2007; Yıldız, 2010; Zengin, 2010; Ünlüönen and Şahin, 2011; Tutar, Alpaslan, Tutar and Erkan, 2013). Çimat and Bahar's research (2003) has examined the place and significance of tourism in Turkey's economy through secondary
data. In this context, indicators such as the number of tourists visiting Turkey, tourism revenue, expenditure per tourist, and the contribution of tourism to national income were interpreted. It was foreseen from the results of the study, that implementation of environmentally sound, sustainable and competitive policies could cause Turkey to receive greater benefits from tourism and this would create better employment opportunities. Besides, it is thought that unemployment can be reduced with the employment-creating effect of tourism (Çimat and Bahar, 2003).

Dilber (2007) examined the effects of the tourism sector to Turkey’s economy through input-output table. In addition, the added value created by tourism was determined and future policies were proposed. In this context, input-output tables have been created and interpreted utilizing World Tourism Organization and Turkish Statistical Institute’s reports. As a result of the research, it was determined that 1 unit increase in the tourism sector created 1.03 added value. In addition, the direct contribution of the tourism sector in total employment in Turkey was determined to be 5.1% and indirect contribution was determined as 12.8%. The study argues that tourism is crucial sector for Turkey especially for solving the unemployment problem (Dilber, 2007).

In the study conducted by Yıldız (2010), the tourism sector’s historical development and its power of creating new employment opportunities were conceptually discussed. Within the scope of the research, the effects of the industrial sector and tourism sector on the solution of the unemployment problem were examined comparatively. The study has reached to the conclusion that tourism sector is more effective on reducing the unemployment in Turkey compared to the other sectors (Yıldız, 2010). In another study conducted by Zengin (2010), economic contributions of tourism in Turkey between the years 1980-2009 were studied through secondary data. In the scope of the research, the effects of tourism on employment were also examined. Accordingly, it is underlined that tourism, which is a sector where automation and mechanization is difficult, has significant contributions to employment. According to the results of the research, it was determined that the direct contribution of tourism to employment was 52% in 1993 and 79% in 2008. Additionally, considering that the indirect effect of tourism to employment is 1.5 times more than its direct effect, it was determined that tourism is of crucial importance for Turkey’s economy (Zengin, 2010).

Ünlüönen and Şahin (2011) discussed the importance of tourism in terms of employment. Secondary data were used to examine the relationship between related concepts. As a result of the research, it is stated that investments, which were considered the most effective job generator tools, have started to lose ground and countries have started to look for other exits. Starting from this, it is emphasized that tourism, which is a labor-intensive sector, is a serious option in employment generation.

In a study conducted by Tutar, Alpaslan and Erken (2013), the relationship between tourism sector and employment was examined on a conceptual basis. In this context SWOT analysis was applied to the relationship between the tourism sector and employment in Turkey. The results showed the strong aspects of tourism as its foreign currency inflow and employment generation. However, the inability of tourism activities to break from seasonality and the problems with education were determined as the weak aspects. Turkey’s opportunities were found to be the government incentives and its young population; while the threats were found to be that tourism culture in Turkey remains unsettled and that applied training isn’t sufficient enough yet.

**METHODOLOGY**

In this study, the relationship between tourism and employment is examined by a three-stage time series analysis. In the first stage, the stationary level of the variables was examined with the help of unit root tests. In the second stage, the long-term relationships between the variables were analyzed with the help of the cointegration test, developed by Engel and Granger (1987) and Johansen and Juselis (1990). After the determination of long-term relationships, the causality relationship between variables was investigated in the third stage.

**Data and Model**

In this study, the relationship between tourism revenues and the number of people working in accommodation establishments between 2014 - 2018 was examined. Data were gathered on a monthly basis from Turkish Statistical Institute. The primary reason for the research data to start from 2014 is that
Turkish Statistical Institute has started using household interview surveys for data gathering in 2014. The relationships between the variables are modeled as below:

\[ EMP_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 TG_t + u_t \quad (1) \]

and

\[ TR_t = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 EMP_t + \epsilon_t \quad (2) \]

The EMP in Models (1) and (2) represent the number of people working accommodation businesses, while TR represents tourism revenues. \( \beta_0 \) and \( \alpha_0 \) represent the constant coefficients of the models. \( \beta_1 \) is the slope coefficient of Model (1), which is the effect of a 1 unit change in TR on the EMP. Likewise, \( \alpha_1 \) represents the slope coefficient of Model (2), which is the effect of a 1 unit change in EMP on TR. \( u_t \) and \( \epsilon_t \) represent the error terms of the models.

**Augmented Dickey Fuller (ADF) Unit Root Test**

One of the most important conditions in times series analyses is that the series being worked on are stationary. Analyses on non-stationary series create the problem of false regression. The primary reason for the utilization of Augmented Dickey Fuller Test is its ability to analyze stationarity in a comprehensive manner through three different equations. These equations are as follows: (Sevüktekin and Çınar, 2014):

- None: \( \Delta Y_t = \gamma Y_{t-1} + u_t \)
- Intercept: \( \Delta Y_t = \alpha_0 + \gamma Y_{t-1} + u_t \)
- Intercept and trend: \( \Delta Y_t = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 t + \gamma Y_{t-1} + u_t \)

The \( \gamma \) coefficient is the coefficient that is examined to be whether equal to zero or not during the stationarity test. \( \alpha_0 \) and \( \alpha_1 \) represent the constant coefficient of the models and the trend coefficient respectively. \( u_t \) represents the error terms of the models. The hypotheses of the models are as follows:

- \( H_0: \gamma \geq 0 \) (Y does not stationary, Y has unit root)
- \( H_1: \gamma < 0 \) (Y does stationary, Y has not unit root)

The \( \tau \) test statistic was developed in order to test the above hypotheses in the ADF test. If the calculated test statistic is greater than the critical values or the probability values are smaller than the significance levels, (such as 1%, 5% or 10%), \( H_0 \) is rejected. Otherwise, \( H_0 \) cannot be rejected. In such a case, another unit root test should be conducted on the difference between the variables. For instance, if the variable is stationary on the p difference, it is I(p) for this variable, meaning the difference is stationary.

**Cointegration Analysis**

Cointegration analysis is a type of econometric analysis which examines the long term relationships between time series. The first cointegration test was developed by Engle and Granger (1987). Engle and Granger (1987) said that variables Y and X are not stationary at the level and if they are stationary at the same degree, there will be a cointegration relationship between them. Engle and Granger (1987) test if there is a cointegration relationship in the model by applying unit root test on the error term, which is obtained by creating a regression with the original states of the variables. Later, a stronger cointegration test was developed by Johansen & Juselius in the studies by Johansen (1988) Johansen & Juselius (1990) and Johansen (1991). This test that they have developed is based on the Vector Autoregressive Models (VAR), developed by Sims (1980). This test contains to base test statistics. The first of these is the trace statistic, and the second is the maximum eigenvalue test statistic. The hypotheses of these tests are as below:
**H₀**: There is no cointegration relationship between the variables.

**H₁**: There is a cointegration relationship between the variables

The criterion for deciding between the hypotheses is as follows: if the calculated test statistics are greater than critical values, or the probability values are smaller than the significance levels, the H₀ is rejected. In such a case, it is decided that there is a cointegration relationship between the variables.

## Causality Analysis

In time series econometrics, if there are long-term relationships between the variables, causality relationships are also expected between the variables. The first causality test was developed by Granger (1969). The primary function of the causality test is to determine the direction of the causality relationship between the variables. It is considered as a continuation of the cointegration analysis (Tarı, 2014). Within the scope of the study, the causality relationship between tourism and employment was examined through Granger Causality Test.

## ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

During the analysis phase of the study, in order to determine the causality relationships between tourism and employment, Unit Root Test, Engle-Granger Cointegration Analysis, Johansen Cointegration Analysis and Granger Causality Analysis tests were applied to the data set.

### Unit Root Test Results

As mentioned in the methodology section, the stationarity of the time series were tested before getting to the cointegration and causality analyses. The Augmented Dickey-Fuller Test (ADF), which is the most preferred unit root test in the literature, was utilized in analyzing the stationarity. (Sevüktekin and Çınar, 2014).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit Root Test</th>
<th>Lag Length</th>
<th>TR</th>
<th>EMP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>t-statistic</td>
<td>Prob.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADF</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-0,9147</td>
<td>0,3153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-1,5417</td>
<td>0,5045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Constants</td>
<td>-0,8756</td>
<td>0,9507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADF</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>First Difference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-8,1750</td>
<td>0,0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-8,1513</td>
<td>0,0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Constants</td>
<td>-8,4145</td>
<td>0,0000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the unit root test results in Table 1, both the tourism and employment series are stationary in the first degree. (p<0,0500).

### Cointegration Analysis Findings

It was decided to apply the Engle-Granger and Johansen cointegration analyses in order to examine the long term relationships between the series which were determined to be stationary at the level. An equality was established in the scope of Engle-Granger cointegration analysis. Following this equality, the calculated remainders (error terms) were subjected to stationarity test. According to the Engle-Granger approach (1987), the remainders of the model being stationary at level is a sign of cointegration relationship.
Table 2. LSM Prediction Findings for Engle-Granger Cointegration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variable: D (EMP)</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>T-statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>5290</td>
<td>008</td>
<td>2774</td>
<td>007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D (TR)</td>
<td>0022</td>
<td>5412</td>
<td>0977</td>
<td>033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0120</td>
<td></td>
<td>Durbin-Watson</td>
<td>2205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schwarz Criterion</td>
<td>10396</td>
<td></td>
<td>Akaike Criterion</td>
<td>10326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-statistic</td>
<td>7697</td>
<td></td>
<td>Probability</td>
<td>007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the regression equation in Table 2, the first degree stationary state of employment (D(EMP)) is considered as the dependent variable. The remainder series were established following the equalization.

Table 3. Augmented Dickey-Fuller Test (ADF) Findings for Error Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Augmented Dickey-Fuller (ADF) Test Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
<th>T-statistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Test Critical Values</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1% level</td>
<td>-2612</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% level</td>
<td>-1948</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10% level</td>
<td>-1613</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the unit root test findings for the remainder series in Table 3, the tourism and employment remainder series (error terms) are stationary at level (p<0.050). According to this, tourism and employment act in a cointegrated way in the long term. Following the analysis, the data were subjected to Johansen cointegration analysis for the validation of Engle-Granger cointegration analysis.

Before getting to Johansen cointegration analysis, the lag lengths of the series were determined. The assessment based on Akaike (1974) and Schwarz (1978) information criterion has determined the series to be at the second level of lag length.

Table 4. Johansen Cointegration Analysis Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Null Hypothesis</th>
<th>Alternate Hypothesis</th>
<th>Trace Values</th>
<th>%5 Critical Values</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>r=0</td>
<td>r≥1</td>
<td>50,0212</td>
<td>25,8721</td>
<td>00000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>r≤1</td>
<td>r≥ 2</td>
<td>16,1002</td>
<td>12,5180</td>
<td>01210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Null Hypothesis</td>
<td>Alternate Hypothesis</td>
<td>Max-Eigen</td>
<td>%5 Critical Values</td>
<td>Prob.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>r=0</td>
<td>r=1</td>
<td>33,9210</td>
<td>19,3870</td>
<td>00002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>r≤1</td>
<td>r=2</td>
<td>16,1002</td>
<td>12,5180</td>
<td>01210</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the Johansen cointegration analysis findings in the Table 4, there is a significant long term relationship between the tourism and employment series. (p<0.050). In other words, the Engle-Granger cointegration analysis findings were supported with the Johansen cointegration analysis findings. A vector autoregressive model (VECM) was established following the analysis and the causality relationships between the series were examined.

Causality Analysis Findings

Following the cointegration analysis, the long term cointegration relationship between the tourism and employment series was determined. Later on, the short and long term causality relationships were analyzed by establishing a vector error correction model (VECM).
Table 5. Granger Causality Analysis Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Long-term Granger Causality</th>
<th>t-statistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TR → EMP</td>
<td>-2.9921</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMP → TR</td>
<td>-5.1620</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Short-term Granger Causality</th>
<th>x² statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TR → EMP</td>
<td>21,6053</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMP → TR</td>
<td>18,8069</td>
<td>0.0001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The long and short term Granger causality analysis findings in the context of vector autoregressive model (VECM) are shown in Table 5. The long term causality was analyzed through t-statistics. According to the t-statistics, which were found negative and significant, there is a reciprocal causality between tourism (-2.9921) and employment (-5.1620). Short term causality relationship was examined through probability values. According to the findigs, there is a reciprocal causality relationship between tourism and employment in the short term (p<0.050). In conclusion, both tourism and employment were found to be the Granger causes of each other.

CONCLUSION

This study aims to empirically prove the relationship between tourism and employment, which is accepted on a theoretical level. The findings show parallelism with the existing literature. In other words, tourism has effects on employment. (Çimat and Bahar, 2003; Ghosh, Siddique and Gabbay, 2003; Dilber, 2007; Yıldız, 2010; Zengin, 2010; Ünlüönen and Şahin, 2011; Tutar, Alpaslan, Tutar and Erkan, 2013). However, another finding of the research shows that employment also has a statistical effect on tourism. The study has utilized the personnel statistics in tourism establishments published by Turkish Statistical Institute as the employment indicator. Monthly tourism revenues between 2014-2018 in Turkey were utilized as the indicator for tourism. According to the study results, the increase in the tourism revenues also increases the number of personnel employed in the tourism sector. On the other hand, increases in the number of personnel also leads to an increase in tourism revenues in Turkey. This means that there is a reciprocal causality relationship between the two concepts.

Including different time frames or countries in the future studies is considered to benefit the literature. In addition, this study takes the number of personnel employed directly in the tourism sector as the indicator for employment. It is also thought that utilizing the personnel numbers indirectly employed in tourism sector in future studies would contribute to the literature.

REFERENCES


The Role of Local Entrepreneurs in Urban Tourism: A Study on Hotels in Edirne City Centre

Bilge ÇAVUŞGIL KÖSE
Assist.Prof.Dr., Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University
bilgecavusgilkose@comu.edu.tr

Serol KARALAR
Assist.Prof.Dr., Trakya University
serolkaralar@trakya.edu.tr

ABSTRACT
The aim of this study is to determine the role of local entrepreneurs in urban tourism. For this purpose, the scope of the research consists of hotels owned by local entrepreneurs in Edirne, one of the most important destinations of Turkey in terms of urban tourism and targeted to become a Brand City by the Turkish Ministry of Culture and Tourism. The research data were obtained by using the structured interview method with three different local tourism entrepreneurs (hotel owner) in Edirne city centre. The findings of the research show that the local entrepreneurs are oriented towards this sector because they find the potential of Edirne’s urban tourism strong, and they contribute to the urban tourism and the economy of the city with their businesses. Although the years of establishment and size of the hotel businesses interviewed in the scope of the research vary, the implications of local entrepreneurs regarding the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats of Edirne in terms of urban tourism overlap. Through the research, various suggestions were made for the development of urban tourism in Edirne from the perspective of local entrepreneurs. However, it was concluded that the support and cooperation of local governments were needed to implement these proposals.

Keywords: Urban Tourism, Local Entrepreneur, Hotel, Accommodation Sector, Edirne

INTRODUCTION
Urban areas are considered to be an important destination with different tourist attractions and opportunities, and they are different from sea or rural tourism destinations with their energetic, versatile and intense atmosphere offered to tourists (Uca, 2019, p.47). The factors such as cultural heritage elements, gastronomic elements, recreation areas, festivals and other special events held in the city and a variety of shopping opportunities that allow visitors to experience different types of tourism have a positive impact on the touristic power of an urban destination. The facilities and services offered by hotels, restaurants, coffee shops, pubs, nightclubs, etc., in an urban destination also play an important role in attractiveness of the city and urban tourism economy.

Cities are always visited by tourists and tourism is perceived as having the potential to alleviate unprecedented crises experienced by many urban areas (Nunkoo and Ramkissoon, 2010, p.37). Urban tourism is a powerful force and has significantly influenced the ways cities think about their role and future direction. (Spirou, 2011, p.xvii). In the development of tourism in a city, it can be said that local business people have duties such as contributing to the creation of tourism demands through the strengthening of tourism resources and services.

Currently, urban entrepreneurship prepares a suitable ground for citizens to combat against unemployment and its problems (Hazehjan, Pirannejad, Zarandi and Amiri, 2016, p.82). Economists and policymakers often argue that urban success depends upon a city’s level of entrepreneurship (Glaeser, Kerr and Kerr, 2012, p.1). Audretsch, Belitski and Desai (2015) found that the economic development impact of new-firm start-ups is positive for large, medium and small-size cities. According to Munoz and Cohen (2016)’s study, urban entrepreneurship focuses on building healthy urban environments and improving the well-being of local citizens through new businesses.

It can be mentioned that entrepreneurship is widely accepted as a crucial element of economic development in urban areas and it is also important to analyze this notion in terms of tourism perspective. In this context, this research aims to determine the role of local entrepreneurs in urban tourism and their contribution to the economy of the city.
Local entrepreneurs can provide many different services related to tourism in a city such as hotels, restaurants and cafes. However, in this research, the hotel sector which has the most economic contribution with the multiplier effect created within the tourism industry has been chosen in order to reveal a clear picture of the contribution of local entrepreneurs to the urban tourism. In this direction, hotel businesses belonging to local entrepreneurs in Edirne city centre were identified and face-to-face interviews were conducted with these business owners. The findings of the research include information about the contributions of local entrepreneurs to the urban tourism of Edirne, the problems they face in the field of tourism and their future targets. The results of the research show the support of the central and local governments as well as the contribution of innovative, determined and risk-taking entrepreneurs to the desired goals in the development of urban tourism.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

**Tourism in Edirne**

Edirne was founded by the Thracians who migrated from Central Asia in ancient times and settled there. Alexander the Great later added these to the vast borders of the Macedonian Empire. Later, these lands, dominated by the Romans, fell to Eastern Byzantium in 395 when the Roman Empire was divided into two. The city was conquered by Sultan Murat I in 1361 and became the throne city of the Ottoman Empire until Istanbul was conquered. During these years, it has experienced the most glorious days in its history (Municipality of Edirne, 2019). Edirne, which had been the capital of the Ottoman Empire for 92 years, is one of the few cities in Turkey with its cultural and historical richness.

One of the most important touristic elements of Edirne is the Selimiye Mosque. In addition to the Selimiye Mosque, which was included in the World Cultural Heritage List in 2011, there is one of the largest synagogues in Europe in Kaleiçi, especially where Jewish citizens lived intensively. Also, Edirne has many holy places of different faiths such as the Bulgarian Church (Sv.Georgi), the Sveti Konstantin-Elena Church, the Italian Church and the Baha’i House. Activities such as Kırkpınar Oil Wrestling, which has been held for 658 years, have aroused interest for both local and foreign visitors. Historical Kırkpınar Oil Wrestling, which is a deep-rooted cultural tradition, was accepted by UNESCO as the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2010 and included in the international list (Küçükaltan and Çavuşgil, 2011, p.3). Similarly, the Kakava Hıdırellez Festivities, which is a tradition of nearly 1,400 years, entered the UNESCO List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity on December 2017.

Another important tourist spot is the Edirne Palace. Only the Justice Pavilion, Çıhannüma Pavilion, Turkish Bath, kitchen and entrance door remains of the palace, which was burned down during the Russian occupation, survived to the present day. There are many historical bridges in Edirne where Meriç, Arda and Tunca rivers meet and adorn the historical identity of the city. Historical Bedesten, Semiz Alipaşa and Arasta covered bazaars are the centers of commercial life today as well as the history of Edirne. Edirne houses, which stand out with their original residential architecture, are the elements of cultural wealth with their wood-stone craftsmanship and ornaments. The Complex of Sultan Bayezid II Health Museum, which is one of the most important health, social, cultural and religious buildings of the period and is organized in a thematic style, is the center of attention of many visitors. In 2004 the museum was awarded the European Museum Prize by the Council of Europe. On the other hand; Edirne Cheese, Fried Liver, Edirne Meatball and Marzipan are the local products that are popular with domestic and foreign tourists. Mirror broom, fruit soap, cloth doll and Edirnekari are among the intangible cultural heritage elements of the city (Küçükaltan and Çavuşgil, 2011).

Tourism, by creating employment and income, is an important part of the local economy in Edirne like in many cities of the world. There are 17 accommodation facilities with tourism business certificate and 14 accommodation facilities with local government certificate in Edirne city centre. In 2018, a total of 53,176 foreign, 124,075 domestic and 177,251 tourists stayed in total in accommodation businesses with a tourism business certificate, and 40,257 foreign, 98,949 domestic and 139,296 tourists accommodated in a local government certificated hotels (TUROB, 2019). On the other hand, Edirne connecting Turkey to Europe with its five border gates is much more important than many border cities in terms of tourism. 1,813, 866 foreign visitors entered Turkey from Edirne border gates in 2019 January-June period. With these visitors, Edirne is the third-highest province in Turkey in number of foreign visitors (Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2019). In addition, various researches on Edirne showed that many domestic and foreign visitors travel to Edirne as a daily visitor without accommodation due to proximity to Istanbul and borders to European countries (Boyacıoğlu, 2018; Özer, Köse
and Küçükaltan, 2014). In this context, it can be mentioned that the economic added value created by Edirne in terms of urban tourism, is much higher than the numbers in the accommodation statistics.

Local Entrepreneurs

Entrepreneurs are highly influenced by the characteristics of local economies, but they also determine the future of these economies in general (Glaeser, Rosenthal and Strange, 2010, p.1). It can be stated that local people’s participation in entrepreneurship activities is important in order to provide regional development in a destination and create new employment opportunities. In addition, entrepreneurship and innovation are considered as basic elements for the success of tourism and the continuity of tourism development in global and regional terms (Samiei and Akhoondzadeh, 2013, p.1427). At this point, it is necessary to focus on the notion of local entrepreneur, which enables the more efficient use of local resources. A local entrepreneur is defined as an individual who was born and raised in a local area and carries the roles of entrepreneurship (Adam, 2004, p.94).

Entrepreneurship activities of local people are directly related to the support of destination managers and tourism shareholders on tourism enterprises (Şengül, 2017, p.128). In fact, as a result of global economic restructuring and the decrease in traditional production activities, many city administrators in developed countries apply tourism as a strategy for economic renewal and local economic development (Rogerson, 2004, p.249).

The profits obtained from rural tourism activities remain in the region by creating local entrepreneurs. It can also be mentioned that the investments made by non-local entrepreneurs are more likely to withdraw from the market and therefore threaten the regional economy. Researches also showed that immigration reversed in rural tourism destinations where local tourism entrepreneurs were successful. Local entrepreneurs were also found to be more interested in protecting cultural life and environment in the region (Çakır and Ergüven, 2018, p.162). From this point of view, it is crucial to create and support local entrepreneurship.

METHODOLOGY

The study aims to examine the role of local entrepreneurs in the development of urban tourism. In this respect, the study is in descriptive research type. First of all, literature was reviewed and related notions were defined. Then, the results of the research were revealed in which face-to-face interviews were conducted by using the structured interview method with the local entrepreneurs who own hotels in Edirne.

The hotels to be interviewed were selected from the accommodation facilities with tourism business certificate in Edirne city centre. There are 17 hotels in Edirne city centre. Owners of two hotels could not be interviewed due to renovation in these enterprises during the research. In August 2019, all other hotels within the scope of the study were visited, and 3 out of 5 local entrepreneurs who are from Edirne and accepted the interview were interviewed. Sample of the research consists of one five-star, one three-star and one two-star hotel in Edirne which are important in terms of urban tourism. The five-star hotel was defined as business A, three-star hotel as B and two-star hotel as C in the research.

Twelve questions were asked personally by the researches to local entrepreneurs. Questions about the duration of presence in the sector, the target market and methods of promoting the hotel were included in the interviews in order to determine the experiences of local entrepreneurs in the tourism sector. For the purpose of the research; questions on the reasons of investing tourism sector in Edirne, the difficulties faced as local entrepreneurs in the tourism sector, the steps to be taken for the development of urban tourism, the hotel’s contributions to urban tourism, future plans in the tourism sector and the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats of Edirne in terms of tourism, were directed to local entrepreneurs.

FINDINGS

The data obtained from the research participants were examined and the common ideas of the participants and shared thoughts are summarized below:

Reason for Investing Tourism Sector: The reasons why all three local entrepreneurs chose the tourism sector stem from their views that Edirne has a significant potential for urban tourism. In general, entrepreneurs think that tourism sector is more advantageous than other sectors.

“Tourism sector with high potential and innovation, and its certain existence in the future”
Hotel A

Difficulties Faced by Local Entrepreneurs in Entering the Tourism Sector: Local entrepreneurs faced different kinds of difficulties in starting the sector. The most important reason for this situation is that they stepped into the tourism sector in different years.
“Strict bureaucracy instead of providing convenience to investors during the construction and licensing process” Hotel B

**Difficulties Faced by Local Entrepreneurs in the Tourism Sector:** It was seen that local entrepreneurs touch on similar elements in terms of problems and difficulties experienced in the tourism sector. In this context, local entrepreneurs agree that they have difficulty in finding qualified personnel and that the occupancy of the hotels reach a sufficient level only when there is an event in Edirne.

“The graduates of tourism and hotel management departments not speaking Greek and Bulgarian. Lack of graduates' knowledge in English, which is a sine qua non of the sector.” Hotel B

**Actions to be taken for the Development of Urban Tourism in Edirne:** Local entrepreneurs generally present similar ideas within the scope of what needs to be done for the development of urban tourism in Edirne. Accordingly, local entrepreneurs say that more attention should be paid to the promotion and branding of Edirne and its cultural values. It is emphasized that the lack of airline transportation to the city should be done either by constructing an airport or by increasing the connection with Çorlu airport which is the closest airport to the city. Also, local entrepreneurs see an important tourism potential in the Meriç, Arda and Tunca rivers and their surroundings.

“Organizing activities that will keep the tourists in Edirne and make them stay for a long time… Improving the riverside and making use of the rivers in terms of tourism…” Hotel C

**Cooperation with Local Government Institutions for the Development of Urban Tourism in Edirne:** The majority of local entrepreneurs emphasize that the institutions of local government are inadequate in developing urban tourism in Edirne.

“…local government institutions are considered inadequate” Hotel B

**Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats of Edirne from a Local Entrepreneur’s Perspective in terms of Tourism:** Local entrepreneurs are united in terms of their strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats in terms of Edirne's urban tourism. According to this, entrepreneurs state that the biggest strength of Edirne is being the gateway to Europe. The natural and historical beauties, cultural and gastronomic elements of Edirne are also its strengths while the city's tourism infrastructure and superstructure deficiencies are mentioned as weaknesses. Greek and Bulgarian visitors to the city are considered as the most important opportunity by the entrepreneurs, and because Edirne's proximity to Istanbul, visitors leaving Edirne without accommodate is the most important threat.

“Rich natural and historical beauties, cultural and gastronomic tourism values, border gates” Hotel B

“Tourists living in neighbouring countries meeting their needs in Edirne” Hotel A

“Proximity to Istanbul, tourists often visiting the most known places and going back their homes, short-term accommodation” Hotel C

**The Hotel’s Contributions to the Development of Urban Tourism in Edirne:** Local entrepreneurs rank their contributions to urban tourism as a contribution to bed capacity, promotion of the city and contribution to employment (especially five-star hotel).

**Future Plans in the Tourism Sector:** All three entrepreneurs do not plan to invest in tourism in the near future.

**Target Market of the Hotel and Plans to Expand the Target Market and Steps to be taken:** Research findings show that the target audience of all three businesses is the same and businesses desire to expand this target audience.

“Tourists who live in neighbouring countries and guests from all over Turkey” Hotel A

“Mostly tourists from all over Turkey” Hotel C

**Methods of Promoting the Hotel:** Local entrepreneurs mostly use the internet and social media in hotel promotion.

“Promotions and e-advertisement on social media” Hotel A

**CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION**

Today, considering the contribution of tourism to revitalizing the economy of a city, it increases the interest of public, private and public/private sector cooperation in urban tourism. Similarly, this economic attraction created by tourism attracts the interest of entrepreneurs in this field. However, it was seen that the concepts of entrepreneurship and local entrepreneurship were handled in the context of rural tourism. The tourism-related entrepreneurship activities of local people in urban tourism are important in the development of urban tourism and the growth of the city’s economy. In this context, local entrepreneurs are expected to contribute to the creation of tourism demand by strengthening tourism resources and services.
In the development of a tourism destination, it is important to have entrepreneurs investing in that region. The fact that these entrepreneurs are locals of the region can help them to master both the opportunities offered by that region and the problems of the region. Local entrepreneurship also has economic advantages. The fact that the profits from the region remain in that region may also lead to an increase in the welfare level in general. In the tourism literature, it is seen that local entrepreneurs are heavily associated with rural tourism activities (Bosworth & Farrell, 2011; Komppula, 2014; Paniagua, 2002).

In this research, the concept of urban tourism, which has an important place in the economic development of cities, is discussed from the perspective of local entrepreneurs. Study results show that the accommodation sector cannot adequately assess the resources and attractiveness of Edirne's urban tourism. It was seen that the hotel businesses in the city reach the desired level only when there is an event in Edirne and Edirne is visited by daily tours due to its location. In this context, the basic desire of hotel businesses is to convert the daily flow of national and international visitors into tourists.

Local entrepreneurs offer various suggestions for the realization of this request. First of these suggestions start with deficient of Edirne city center’s touristic infrastructure. Such as the need for more reliable and low-cost parking service, free toilet service at major tourist spots and taking measures against hygiene and pricing problems that will hinder tourism. They advise to all cafes and restaurants in the city to have menus in Greek, Bulgarian or English. They stressed the importance of creating alternative tourism activities such as water sports on rivers or different sports and entertainment activities. These activities will keep the tourists in Edirne and make them stay for a long time.

In sum, the findings of the research show that, besides the marketing activities carried out by the hotel businesses for the urban tourists, the administrative institutions in Edirne should plan the services and activities that may attract the interest of the visitors. In future studies, more local tourism entrepreneurs in Edirne can be interviewed. Also, other local entrepreneurs in the tourism sector such as restaurant and café owners can be included in the research in order to see the whole frame. Besides that, similar interviews can be made in different cities in Turkey.

REFERENCES


Determining The Contributions of Archeological Sites in Turkey’s Cultural Tourism Competitiveness

Eda HAZARHUN
Dokuz Eylül University
edahazarhun@gmail.com

Ceren İŞÇİ
Assist.Prof., Manisa Celal Bayar University
ceren.isci@hotmail.com

Mustafa TEPECİ
Prof.Dr., Manisa Celal Bayar University
mtepeci@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT
Visiting archeological sites and expecting unique experiences at these sites are the main motivation for cultural tourists. Thus, the study aims to determine the role of archeological sites in cultural tourism competitiveness. To reveal the role of the archeological sites on the competitiveness of cultural tourism of Turkey, factor conditions which is one of the four attributes of Porter’s Diamond Model (others are demand conditions, related and supporting industries, and firm strategy, structure and rivalry) was investigated. The interview technique is used to collect data. The interviews were conducted face-to-face and electronically with 14 tourism academics who have expertise in heritage tourism and archeological sites. The data were subjected to content analysis through a qualitative data analysis program. The analysis indicate that factor conditions consist of 16 codes. The findings revealed that the participants had negative perceptions for the followings: the preservation and restoration of the artifacts in the historical sites, adequacy of souvenirs, ancilliary services, cultural activities, organizing events, personnel, infrastructure and budget transfers. On the other hand, the participating academicians gave positive opinions about information services in historical and archeological places.

Keywords: Archeological Sites, Competitiveness, Diamond Model, Factor Conditions, Cultural Tourism

INTRODUCTION
With the globalization, the borders between countries have disappeared and this situation has caused the competitive environment among firms to become more severe than before. In this competitive environment, sectors have turned to different strategies in order to gain competitive advantage. Porter (1990) asserts that nations succeed in certain industries due to their innovative, dynamic and challenging home environment. Further, he provides convincing arguments on how some nations gain competitive advantage over other nations: ‘national prosperity is created, not inherited’ (Porter, 1990:73). The four expansive attributes of a nation compose the diamond of national advantage. These are factor conditions, demand conditions, firm strategy, structure and rivalry, and related and supporting industries. Various sectors can increase their competitiveness by considering the dimensions in the diamond model.

In the tourism sector, it is necessary to provide competitive advantage in order for the destinations to generate more income than their competitors. In other words, nations should protect the existing resources of destinations, train qualified personnel, diversify tourism products and perform demand analysis (Aydemir, Saylan & Aydoğmuş, 2014). To achieve these goals, destinations should analyze Porter's attributes within the framework of the diamond model. The historical and cultural assets of the countries are among the important tourist attractions; culture is one of the main sources of motivation that drives tourists to travel and affects tourists’ choice of destination. In this respect, cultural assets enable the destinations to compete against other destinations.
Turkey is home to numerous cultural assets because it hosted many civilizations since ancient times. Therefore, it is a country with high potential for cultural tourism. According to the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (2018), there are 108,813 registered tangible cultural properties in Turkey. The ruins of these tangible cultural properties are visited by many local and foreign tourists.

The investigation of the competitiveness analysis of the historical and archeological sites in Turkey within the framework of factor conditions will provide guidance to industry managers and government officials to determine the strengths and weaknesses of the country’s cultural tourism and to increase the cultural tourist numbers and boost tourism income. This study aims to determine the roles of historical and archeological sites on the competitiveness of cultural tourism in Turkey. To this end, the results of the study will guide researchers and tourism sector practitioners in terms of determining the strategies for the competitiveness of cultural tourism.

LITERATURE REVIEW

According to Porter (1990)'s diamond model, there are four main factors that will enable a sector or firms to gain international competitive advantage. These factors are factor conditions, demand conditions, firm strategy, structure and rivalry and related and supporting industries. These key elements are interrelated and have an impact on profitability levels as they determine the competitiveness of the industries (Has, 2013). In addition to these factors, chance factor and government support affect the competitive advantage. Each factor on the diamond—and the diamond as a system—influence critical elements for competitiveness. Diamond model is aimed to guide companies to gain success in the international competitive environment (Porter, 1990).

Factor conditions include human resources, infrastructure, natural resources, information resources and capital (Öz, 2019). In order to gain competitive advantage, sectors should first analyze their factor conditions in detail and focus on production and services according to the factor conditions in which they are strong. For example, if a firm employs more people with low levels of education, it must focus more on labor-intensive products and services in order to compete with other firms in the international arena. Conversely, if people with a high level of education are employed in a company, products and services appropriate to their educational level should be produced (Koç and Özbozkurt, 2014). In other words, since qualified personnel are employed in a company with a high level of education, more quality and technology oriented products can be produced and this company can compete with other companies that employ high level of education in the international arena.

Factor conditions for tourism industries include such features as the natural and historical attractiveness of destinations, infrastructure, human resources and capital. Turkey has 18 cultural property inscribed on the UNESCO World Heritage List as of 2018 (UNESCO, 2019). These are given below with the approval year in parenthesis.

- Aphrodisias (2017)
- Archaeological Site of Ani (2016)
- Archaeological Site of Troy (1998)
- Bursa and Cumalıkızık: the Birth of the Ottoman Empire (2014)
- City of Safranbolu (1994)
- Diyarbakır Fortress and Hevsel Gardens Cultural Landscape (2015)
- Ephesus (2015)
- Göbekli Tepe (2018)
- Göreme National Park and the Rock Sites of Cappadocia (1985)
- Great Mosque and Hospital of Divriği (1985)
- Hierapolis-Pamukkale (1988)
- Historic Areas of Istanbul (1985)
- Nemrut Dağ (1987)
- Neolithic Site of Çatalhöyük (2012)
METHODOLOGY

Qualitative research method was used in this study which was conducted to determine the role of historical and archeological sites in cultural tourism competitiveness. Qualitative research provides a thorough in-depth exploration of the subjects to be investigated (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013). In qualitative research, the number of subjects investigated is small and purposeful sampling method is used to explore the events and characteristics in detail (Miles and Huberman, 1994). In the present study, purposive sampling method was applied.

Faculty members who work in tourist guide and tourism management departments of various universities in Turkey were determined in the scope of purposeful sampling scope. The faculty members include in the sample due to the professional experience and knowledge that they have about the archaeological sites and cultural tourism. The interviews have been conducted with the faculty members working in the tourist guidance and tourism management departments and the data collection process was terminated when the information saturation was reached.

During the data collection period, 14 academicians were interviewed. The interviews were conducted by face-to-face with 3 faculty members in their own offices in June 2019 and by electronic mail with 11 faculty members. The use of electronic mail as well as face-to-face interviews in data collection is due to the time constraints. During the face-to-face interviews, reading the questions directly from the interview form was avoided and eye contact was created to ensure the trust of the participants. Face-to-face interviews were conducted for periods ranging from 30 to 45 minutes. Before the start of these interviews, the participants were asked for permission to use a voice recorder and as a result of the consent of the participants, the interviews were recorded with the audio recorder. The questions sent by e-mails included with explanatory cover letter and the responses to the questions were asked to be returned by e-mail within the period determined by the researchers.

For the interviews, a form consisting of structured questions was prepared before the interview in order to prevent the researchers from directing the participants according to their own beliefs and thoughts (Seyidoğlu, 2009). The questions cover the factor conditions in the Diamond Model, more specifically assess the role of the archeological sites on the competitiveness of cultural tourism of Turkey. The questions were prepared by the researchers based on the literatüre review (du Cros and McKercher, 2015; Edwards, 2013; Griffin et al., 2013)

The four main questions and sub questions structured by the researchers are as follows:

1. Would you evaluate the historical and archeological sites in Turkey for improving cultural tourism competitiveness on the following subjects and issues?
   a. The attractiveness and value of historical and cultural monuments, restoration works;
   b. Status of information services; c) Giftware; d) Additional or ancilliary services; e) Cultural activities
   and services in historical sites; f) Environmental arrangements and cleanliness of the ruins, lighting
   levels, the presence of appropriate arrangements for the elderly and disabled.

2. Please evaluate the quality and quantity of human resources (administrators, archaeologists, office
   and cleaning staff) for the competitiveness of cultural tourism in Turkey.

3. What are the conditions of infrastructures of historical and archeological sites in Turkey?

4. Do you think sufficient budget is allocated for the maintenance, protection and promotion of cultural
   monuments and ruins in Turkey?

ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

The data obtained from the interviews were first transferred to computer and converted to text format. Then the data converted to text format was subjected to content analysis. Nvivo 11 qualitative data analysis program was preferred to create codes and themes. Therefore, the interview responses were translated into Nvivo 11 program. Content analysis was conducted by two independent researchers. As a result of the
analyzes performed, the codes formed by the researchers were compared and discussed until an agreement were reached. In the analysis, the participant names (# 1, # 2, # 3…), as well as location, archeological and historical site (XX) names are concealed. As a result of the content analysis, 16 subcodes were created within the scope of factor conditions theme (see table 1). The source field in Table 1 indicates the number of participants with the code, and the reference field indicates the frequency with which the code is repeated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Codes</th>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High value of historical and archeological sites</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preservation and restorations of the ruins and monuments (Negative)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preservation and restorations of the ruins and monuments (Positive)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signs and postings in the sites (Positive)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signs and postings in the sites (Negative)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The adequacy and variety (quality &amp; quantity) of gifts and souveniors (Negative)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The adequacy and variety (quality and quantity) of gifts and souveniors (Positive)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of additional services (Negative)</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of additional services (Positive)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of the Adequacy of Cultural Activities (Negative)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of the Adequacy of Cultural Activities (Positive)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions regarding Arrangements-Cleanliness-Lighting (Negative)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions regarding Arrangements-Cleanliness-Lighting (Pozitif)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shortage of human resources both in quality and quantity</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shortages of infrastructure</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficient Budget Allocation</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Half of the participating academics (n=7) emphasize about the high value of the archeological sites and monuments. For example, one participant (# 10) shares the following words for the value of the artifacts in the ruins. “The attractiveness of historical and cultural areas in our country is indisputable. Depending on the history of each region, it is possible to see and experience the monuments and marks of many cultures.” However, a very negative perspective (n=8) prevails rather than the positive point of view (n=3) on the conservation and restoration of these works.

The opinion of a participant (# 12) with a negative view on the preservation of the sites comes to the fore: “Although these historical and archeological sites are very valuable, I believe that they are not adequately utilized. I think that these very valuable sites are not protected in any way (not even enough). Some of our most valuable sites are exposed to vandalist behavior, and even restoration or preservation efforts to keep them sometimes make them worse. I think that people in our country are not conscious about the protection of these landmarks. Sometimes increasing the security and preservation efforts may damage the historic sites. As we cannot protect the cultural landmarks, the works we do on behalf of protection are done without knowledge and unconscious.

The critical perspective underlines that both tourists and administrations are responsible for the preservation of the sites. Negative expressions were also detected in the restoration studies. For example, participant # 14 told that "the wrong practices in the restoration, failure to hand over the restoration work to the expert causes damages that cannot be corrected in terms of art history, thus seriously damaging the image of the country.”

On the other hand, information services, signs and postings in historical sites are considered as positive (n=10). Academicians who expressed a positive opinion about the information services refer it for the most visited sites and ruins. There are some deficiencies in information services in relatively less visited places. These shortcomings include “lack of direction and sign language” (participant # 1), “inadequate guidance” (participant # 10), “lack of printed information, brochures and maps (participant # 11, # 12, # 8), “insufficient information on the use of mobile guidelines” (# 12), “neglected information plates” (participant # 14). The
majority of the participants (10) talk about qualitative and quantitative deficiencies for souvenirs sold for tourists in historical sites. The most frequently mentioned inadequacy is that the majority of the souvenirs offered are not local and they are not varied.

Another code that emerges under the theme of factor conditions is the perception of additional services. Under this code, it is noteworthy that negative views (n=10) are predominant and the repetition frequency of these views are high (n=17). Additional negative services include hygiene conditions in the toilets, parking problems, inadequate resting facilities, and the lack or absence of meeting points. Perception of cultural activities is also mostly negative (n=8). One of the participants (# 6) said for such cultural activities are not organized in the archeological sites. Sometimes they are organized on very special occasions, maybe a few times a year. Even these cultural events that are arranged to are not professionally laid out.

Under the perceptions for arrangement-cleaning-lighting code, negative opinions (n=10) were found to be higher. In parallel with the additional services code, the lack of hygiene in the toilets was repeated under this code. Other deficiencies indicated by the participants in this code are inadequate arrangements for the elderly and disabled, insufficient and neglected roads and hiking trails in the ruins, and lack of sufficient lighting.

Finally, shortages of human resources both in numbers and qualities (n=11), infrastructure deficiencies (n=11) and insufficient budget allocations (n=9) are expressed by the participants. The negative comments made by the participants about the staff in the historical sites include the lack of tourism education and foreign language problems, the small number of responsible archaeologists or experts, and the insufficiency of the number of employees at some historical sites. In terms of infrastructural deficiencies, technological deficiencies and transportation problems in some historical sites come to the forefront. The majority of the participants (n=9) think that there is not enough budget allocation to solve all the problems mentioned in this theme. To overcome these problems, two participants (# 12 and # 13) suggested that earnings from museum and sites entrance should spend for the maintenance and protection of thesesites. One participant (# 6) emphasize the sponsorship and financial support from the private sector and NGOs for the sustainability of the historical and archeological sites.

CONCLUSION

In this study, the factor conditions of historical and archeological sites, which are an important factor in determining the competitiveness of cultural tourism, are examined. Within the scope of the research, the evaluations of expert academicians on the value, preservation and restoration of the artifacts in the ruins, the quality and quantity adequacy of the souveniers offered for sale, information services, additional services, cultural activities, regulations, personnel, infrastructure and budget allocation were examined.

Overall, the present study evaluated the historical sites in Turkey, and the respondents are dominated by negative perceptions. The majority of the participating academics state that there are deficiencies in the protection of the historical sites. Despite the high values of the artifacts exhibited in the ruins, they are not protected enough and successful restoration studies are not to be realized. Similarly, it is stated by the expert participants that the souvenirs presented in the ruins are insufficient in terms of quality and quantity. In particular, the lack of authenticity and diversity of souvenirs are among the criticisms made. Participants also state that additional services are insufficient. Among the problems frequently mentioned by the participants are the lack of hygiene in the toilets, lack of parking facilities, and inadequate recreational facilities such as cafeterias or benches. Another negative problem is that the roads and paths inside the archeological sites and ruins are insufficient and untidy. This situation is especially dangerous for elderly and disabled visitors.

In addition, expert participants stated that technological infrastructure is inadequate in many historical sites; lack of access to the internet or very slow loadings demotivate cultural tourists to spend time there. Again, in some historical sites, it was found that the number of qualified staff was insufficient; the staff generally did not receive tourism education and did not speak a foreign language. Participant thoughts on cultural activities in historical sites are also mostly negative. Budget deficiencies are seen as an important factor in the presence of problems expressed by experts. In order to overcome the budget deficiencies, it is stated that some of the additional income from the activities and the revenues from the entrance should be used for the maintenance, restoration, repair and marketing of the sites.

Turkey has substantial resources for attracting cultural tourists, who travel specifically to attain a deeper understanding of the cultural values or heritage of a destination (du Cros and McKercher, 2015:3). As
previously stated Turkey has 18 cultural property inscribed on the UNESCO World Heritage List as of 2018. Heritage cities, historic towns, archeological sites, cultural landscapes, cultural routes, monuments and cultural objects would help Turkey attract cultural tourists as the mainstream and mass market of visitors.

REFERENCES


Relationship Between Service Orientation Status and Demographic Characteristics of The Front-Line Employees in Hotel Enterprises

Begüm İLBAY
Dr., Anadolu University
begumilbay@hotmail.com

Meryem AKOĞLAN KOZAK
Prof.Dr., Anadolu University
mkozak@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The property of the inseparability and simultaneous production / consumption of the services provided in hotel enterprises intensify the interaction between the employees and customers. Therefore the front-line employees become the primary actors for meeting the customers’ demand and expectancies. In today’s competitive conditions the thoughts, experiences and expectations of employees as well as customers should be taken into consideration. An approach that cares about the employee will be effective in creating a service oriented approach in the enterprise as well as providing better service.

The service orientation, which is based on customer and employee satisfaction, varies depending on the front-line employees as well as various organizational variables. The purpose of this research is to determine the service oriented status of the employees in the hotels based on the demographic characteristics. The research was carried out in five hotels selected from five different star statuses in Ankara. Data were collected by “face-to-face survey” method. The service oriented (SERV*OR) measure was used in the questionnaires. A total of 49 front-line employees have participated to the survey. In the analysis of the data, Mann Whitney U and Kruskall Wallis H tests were utilized. As a result it is seen that the gender, status and the working time were effective on the service orientation of the front-line employees; however, the age and graduation status were not effective.

Keywords: Hotel Enterprises, Front-Line Employees, Demographic Characteristics, Service Orientation.

INTRODUCTION

In the management discipline which began to develop with the production oriented management approach after the Industrial Revolution, a shift towards a service oriented approach has taken place due to the increased competition, the changes taking place in the global market and the increase of the importance of the human resources (Vargo and Lusch, 2004, p. 2). Service orientation is an approach that uses various resources, competencies, knowledge and skills to meet customer needs by interacting directly with the customer (Grönnroos, 2000, p. 48; Lusch and Vargo, 2006, p. 283).

According to the service oriented approach in hotel enterprises, which have an important place in the service sector, the service’s inseparability and simultaneous production/consumption feature result in the continuous interaction of service employees, customers and the enterprise. Together with this interaction, “value” is put forward by using the resources and competencies of each participant together. (Grönnroos, 1982, p. 33-34; Susskind, Borchgrevink, Kacmar and Brymer, 2000, p. 54-55).

Front-line employees in hotel enterprises are the most important service actors who are constantly in face-to-face communication and interaction with customers. As such, skilled employees have become the most important competitive element for enterprises today, placing them at the core of being service oriented (Doğan and Demiral, 2008, p. 146). In addition to the knowledge, skills, and experience, the personality, appearance, attitude and the behavior of the employees make the service concrete and help the positive enterprise image (Bittner, Booms and Tetreault, 1990, p. 71-72; Hartline and Jones, 1996, p. 208-209). When viewed, the profile or demographics of employees are an important variable in service oriented

1 This research is derived from the doctoral thesis of Dr. Begüm İLBAY titled “The Effect Of Human Sigma Model On Service Orientation in Hotel Enterprises”
and service prone. There are numerous literature findings showing that demographic characteristics of employees such as age, status, experience are important in loyalty to the enterprise and loyalty to the customer (Cohen, 1993; Allen and Meyer 1993; Balay, 2000; Çakır, 2001; İnce and Gül, 2005; Toker, 2007; Karahan, 2008) However, few research findings that directly link the service orientation with front-line employees' profile have established a basis for the idea of conducting this research. The aim of the study is to determine the service orientation status of front-line employees in hotel enterprises according to their demographic characteristics. For this purpose, the data obtained from the front-line employees of five hotels of different star status in Ankara were compiled using the survey technique.

LITERATURE

In the early times of industrialization, employees seen as a cost element in enterprises have become the most valuable resource, along with globalization, the prominence of service enterprises, and the efforts of enterprises to increase production (Asunakutlu, 2001, p. 1; Doğan and Demiral, 2008, p. 146; Akoğlan Kozak, 2016, p. 3). The intense interaction experienced by the hotel enterprises as a result of the labor intensity and the creation of the value of the service together with the customer (co-creation) (Vargo and Lusch, 2004, p. 1-2) affects the customers' general perceptions about the service (Grönroos, 1990, 2000; Lovelock and Wirtz, 2007) and makes it important for the employees to be service oriented.

Service orientation is a strategic approach in which the enterprise focuses on its core ability and resources to deliver more value to the customer compared to its competitors. Service focus is defined as service event, application and procedure (Bowen and Ford, 2004, p. 395) in an enterprise environment that rewards behaviors exhibited in order to provide quality service, create a better experience for customers, maintain that experience, and perform them. Service orientation positively influences overall operating performance (Lytle, Hom and Mokwa, 1998; Kuşluvan and Eren, 2008), financial operating performance (Lynn, Lytle and Bobek, 2000), customer satisfaction and loyalty (Johnson, 1996; Garg and Chan, 1997), employee satisfaction (Saura, Contrí, Tàulet and Velázquez, 2005; Gonzales and Garazo, 2006), organizational citizenship behavior (Gonzales and Garazo, 2006), organizational commitment and service image (Lee, Park and Yoo, 1999).

One of the variables affecting employees' service orientation is leadership (Heskett et al., 1994; Saura et al., 2005; Gonzales and Garazo, 2006; Kuşluvan and Eren, 2008; Gebauer, 2009). In addition, the design of the service system and its functions by using new technology also affects the service orientation of the employees (Johnson, 1996; Lytle et al., 1998; Homburg, Hoyer and Fassnacht, 2002; Antioco, Moengert, Lindgreen and Wetzels, 2008; Yavaş and Babakus, 2010).

In providing service orientation in hotel enterprises where labor is used extensively, especially the Human Resources (HR) department plays an active role. In studies it has been shown that there is a positive correlation between the functions of HR department such as business regulation, recruitment, employee performance evaluation, employee training, management functions and the service orientation (Lowe and Vodanovich, 1995; Harris and Fleming, 2005; Skarlicki and Latham, 1996).

As well as variables such as leadership, HR management, service design and technology, the critical and integral component necessary to implement and maintain service orientation within the enterprise are employees. Therefore, the demographic characteristics or the qualification of the employees are the important dimensions that should be addressed in line with the purpose of the research (Yalçın and İplik, 2005; Çolakoğlu, Ayyıldız or negative correlation between the demographic characteristics of employees and their job satisfaction, commitment to the business, and service orientation levels. For example, studies have shown that older employees have a greater commitment to business and a greater orientation on service (Cohen, 1993; Balay, 2000). This is because young employees have a higher desire to work in a job that suits their training level and individual characteristics, and they have more expectations than the business can provide. This leads to a decrease in loyalty to the business. In addition, older employees tend to be more satisfied with their profession and status in the business (Ketchand and Strawsner, 1998; Çakır, 2001; İnce and Gül, 2005).

Researches in the literature suggest a positive or negative correlation between the demographic characteristics of employees and their job satisfaction, commitment to the business, and service orientation levels. For example, studies have shown that older employees have a greater commitment to business and a greater orientation on service (Cohen, 1993; Balay, 2000). This is because young employees have a higher desire to work in a job that suits their training level and individual characteristics, and they have more expectations than the business can provide. This leads to a decrease in loyalty to the business. In addition, older employees tend to be more satisfied with their profession and status in the business (Ketchand and Strawsner, 1998; Çakır, 2001; İnce and Gül, 2005).

Increasing status in parallel with age and experience is an important factor that increases employee satisfaction and service orientation. (Allen and Meyer 1993; Toker, 2007; Karahan, 2008). The most important reason for this is that employees who remain in the same business for many years and whose status increases have many rights such as retirement and annual leave (Mathieu and Zajac,
In the tourism sector, where employee turnover rate is high, employees who are in the same business for a long time can be said to be more service oriented.

The results of the research by gender factor differ. For example, Serçeöğlu and Selçuk (2016) found that female employees are more service oriented than male employees in accommodation establishments in the TRA1 region. However, there are also researches that reveal a negative directional relationship between gender and service orientation factors (Grusky, 1996; Haller and Rosenmayer, 1971; Mathieu and Zajac, 1990).

Employees with a high level of education accommodate less to their positions because they can find jobs more easily. Therefore, their commitment to business and service orientation is said to be lower (Modway, Steers and Porter, 1979; Abdullah and Shaw, 1999).

In the literature it is seen that the demographics of employees affect their commitment to the business and their service orientation. Therefore, the demographics of front-line employees who interact face-to-face with customers in hotel enterprises are also important variables affecting service orientation.

**METHOD**

The field of study of this research is Ankara, which is carried out in order to determine the service orientation status of front-line employees in hotel enterprises according to their demographic characteristics. The fact that Ankara is a city with different hotel categories, that hotels provide service all year round, that hotels are a city hotel, that they have a certain occupancy rate (60%), that employees are more likely to be working in the same hotel for a long time and that they are easily accessible to the researcher has been decisive in this election. In the study, it was deemed appropriate to select a sample from each of the hotels of different status in Ankara (between one-star and five-star). It has also been noted that hotel businesses have been operating for at least five years.

The research data was collected by face-to-face survey technique. The people to whom the survey was conducted are the front-line employees of the hotels participating in the survey according to the service configuration of the hotel. The service orientation (SERV*OR) scale used as a questionnaire is a scale for measuring employee perception regarding the level of service orientation of the employees and the enterprise. This scale, consisting of 35 items expressions in total, was developed by Lytle et al. (1998). However, this scale was shortened by Robinson and Williamson (2014) for easier implementation by managers and researchers, and applied to front-line employees of service enterprises in the United States with the Likert type 5 attitude scale (1=strongly disagree and 5=strongly agree), and the reliability of this short scale increased to over 0.90. The short form of the SERV*OR scale has been preferred for reasons such as avoiding too many questions, ensuring that the answering rate is high, saving cost and time, and the reliability of the abbreviated scale is also high. The short form of the scale consists of four factors and 16 items.

The first factor, “leadership” of the SERV*OR scale has four items, the second factor, “customer satisfaction” has six items, the third factor, “service system and technology” has three items and the final factor, “HR Management and employee training” has three items. The scale was first translated into Turkish by a three-person translation group, including the researcher. Subsequently, the scale has been transformed into a form in which experts can interpret and express their views in terms of scope validity.

The expert opinion form prepared has been presented to 14 experts, including seven academics and seven sector experts. In determining the groups as experts, attention was paid to the knowledge of English as well as its dominance in the field, and the scale was presented in English and Turkish form and the opinion was asked. Expert opinions were obtained via e-mail. Experts rated the scale as “necessary,” “necessary but inadequate” and “unnecessary.”

With the aim of evaluating the obtained expert opinions, the content validity ratio (CVR) which was developed by Lawshe in 1975 and which requires for at least 5 and up to 40 expert opinions was utilized. For the ease of calculation, at the “α=0.05” level of significance minimum values of CVR were converted to table by Veneziano and Hooper (1997) (Yurdagül, 2005).
Table 1. $\alpha=0.05$ Validity Level Minimum Values for CVR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Experts</th>
<th>Minimum Value</th>
<th>Number of Experts</th>
<th>Minimum Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>0.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>0.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>40+</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Since the number of experts referenced is 14, the value of CVR must be 0.51 or higher for each item in order for items to be valid according to Table 1. The two remaining items below this value are subtracted from the scale. In the final case of the scale, there are 14 items and 6 demographics; age, gender, duration of work, mode of work, graduation status and status. In order to determine the relationship between these characteristics and service orientation, the following hypotheses have been established:

- $H_1$: The service orientation in hotel enterprises differs according to the gender of the employees.
- $H_2$: The service orientation in hotel enterprises differs according to the age groups of the employees.
- $H_3$: The service orientation in hotel enterprises businesses differs according to the duration of the working of the employees.
- $H_4$: The service orientation in hotel enterprises differs according to the status of the employees.
- $H_5$: The service orientation in hotel enterprises differs according to the graduation status of the employees.

Since the number of employees was 49, nonparametric tests were used to test hypotheses. The “Mann Whitney U test” tested whether service orientation differs according to the gender and age groups of employees; and the “Kruskal Wallis H test” was used whether it differs according to working times, status, and graduation status.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS**

In this section, the findings are given under two headings. Under the first heading, the physical characteristics of the hotel enterprises and the demographics of the employees of the front-line which were included in the research were given; under the next heading, the findings of the hypothesis tests were included.

**Demographic Findings**

All of the hotels surveyed are located in central Ankara. The managers of the hotels said that the customers are made up of customers who stay constantly, who often travel for work, and who prefer the hotel for its location. One-and two-star hotels have stated that customers care about low accommodation prices, while three-, four-, and five-star hotels care about continuous accommodation customers' business treats and/or company price agreements. According to the size of the five hotels in the survey, the services offered are shown in Table 2.

Table 2. Physical Characteristics of Hotels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number of Rooms</th>
<th>Food and Beverage Service</th>
<th>Meeting / Organization Hall</th>
<th>SPA and Wellness</th>
<th>Customer areas (lobby, garden, etc.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One-Star</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two-Star</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three-Star</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four-Star</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Five-Star</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


$^1$ No hypothesis has been established regarding the mode of work, since the number of seasonal/temporary employees among front-line employee is “1”, and the number of full-time employees are “48”.
In order to carry out the surveys, date and time planning was made by appointment of hotel managers. Surveys were applied face-to-face to front-line employees within a permitted one week duration. A total of 49 employees who took part in front-lines during the research period in the five hotel businesses in which the research was carried out were all involved in the research. Distribution of employees of hotels in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employees’ Task Distribution</th>
<th>Five Star</th>
<th>Four Star</th>
<th>Three Star</th>
<th>Two Star</th>
<th>One Star</th>
<th>Number of employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reception</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concierge/Bellboy</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guest Relations</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The demographics of the front-line employees who participated in the study are included in Table 4. Out of a total of 49 employees, 23 were female and 26 were male. The lack of much difference between the number of women and the number of men suggests that the gender profile of employees is evenly distributed. The majority of employees are between the ages of 31-40 (71.4%), the age range (18-30) were represented by 28.6%, while there are no front-line employees aged (41-50) and between the ages of 51 and older. This indicates that employees are concentrated in the young and adult group. 42.9% of the employees were educated at undergraduate level. This is followed by associate graduates at a rate of 32.7%. High school (12.2%) and graduate (10.2%) graduation rates are close to each other and have a low representation rate. The lowest rate was calculated at secondary school graduation (2%). Nearly all (98%) of front-line employees are full-time employees. The term of office is 6 months to 1 year (32.7%) and 1 year to 3 years (30.6%). Accordingly, the group of employees for up to three years constitutes the most concentrated slice of experience. Given the fact that the working times of the employees in the same enterprise are short in the tourism sector, it can be said that the employment times of the employees are relatively high. The fact that the hotels are city hotels may have affected this situation.

While the proportion of those with employee status is highest (59.2%), intermediate managers are represented by 26.5%, while those with manager status are represented by the least (14.3%). In fact, it is important to show a hierarchical organizational structure and point to the most commonly encountered form of management pyramid.

The reliability test was applied to the SERV*OR scale and the reliability of the scale (Cronbach Alpha) was determined to be 0.98. Then the frequency distribution, mean values and standard deviation results of the scale is checked. According to the results in Table 5, all 49 employees who participated in the study
responded to all items. According to their response to the SERV*OR scale items directed at employees, their participation in the items can be said to be high. The number of those who responded “strongly disagree” and “disagree” to the statements appears to be minimal. Employees generally respond “agree” and “strongly agree” to items regarding the attitude and behavior of the employees on the scale. For example, to the “item 1” , 57% of the employees responded, “I agree” and 26.5% responded, “I strongly agree. “ Employees often think that they are doing best to satisfy the customers. However, employees’ opinions about the enterprise are concentrated in “neither agree nor disagree” (42.9%).

### Table 5. Frequency Distribution of SERV*OR Scale, Mean Values and Standard Deviation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neither Agree Nor Disagree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>S</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Employees do their best to please customers.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>26.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The behavior of this hotel to the customers is kinder and more respectful than the behavior of other hotels.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>32.7</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Employees are doing all they can to reduce customers’ problems.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>42.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Instead of reacting when problems arise, they try to prevent them from occurring.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>34.7</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Customers’ complaints and suggestions are carefully listened to and evaluated.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The hotel’s ability to provide services is enhanced by the use of new technologies.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>26.5</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The latest technology is being used to deliver better quality services.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. New technology is being used to support the efforts of customer-to-person interacting employees.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>30.6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>26.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Management regularly measures the quality of service.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>36.7</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Management is leading the employees to provide a better service.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>34.7</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>38.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. This hotel provides resources to improve the capabilities of the employees for better quality service.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>40.8</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. The recruitment of employees is conducted through rigorous interviews.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>34.7</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>34.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. People with the necessary knowledge and skills are recruited to provide a good service.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Attention is paid to the predisposition of employees to service in recruitment.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>34.7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Hypothesis Test Results

The test results for determining whether the service orientation is differentiated according to the demographics of the front-line employees in the hotel enterprises participating in the research are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Rank Average</th>
<th>Rank Sum</th>
<th>U</th>
<th>p*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>20,35</td>
<td>468,0</td>
<td>192,0</td>
<td>.031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>29,12</td>
<td>757,0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 6, the service orientation differs according to the gender of the employees (p*<0.05). When the rank averages are taken into account, it is seen that men are more service oriented than women. The H₁ hypothesis has been accepted. This result is similar to studies in the literature. The results of the studies on commitment to the enterprise and identification with the enterprise have been reached that male employees have a higher organizational commitment than female employees (Güçlü, 2006; Güneş, Bayraktaroğlu and Özen Kutanis, 2009; Şama and Kolamaz, 2011; Aydin, Sarier and Uysal 2011; Altın Gülova and Demirsoy, 2012).

There were no significant differences in age groups. Because the value p* is greater than “.05” (113>.05). The H₂ hypothesis has been rejected. This can be attributed to the fact that the employees have a close age and that the employee in each age group has experience and training to take an approach that cares about customer satisfaction.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Working Time</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Rank Average</th>
<th>Sd</th>
<th>χ²</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6 months or less</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15,36</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9,799</td>
<td>.044*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Months 1 year</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>21,44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-3 years</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>26,0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5 years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>34,0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 years and over</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>36,1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 7, service focus differs according to employee’s working time and status (χ²(4) = 9,799, p* ≤ 0.05; χ² (2) = 12.8, p**<0.05). Looking at the rank averages, it is seen that employees which have 5 years or over work time are the most service oriented. This is followed by employees with work times 3 to 5 years and employees with work times 1-3 years respectively. It can be said that those who work between 6 months and 1 year and those who work 6 months and less can be said to be less service oriented. Checking the rank average of the status groups shows us that the managers are more service oriented, followed by the supervisors. Hypotheses H₃ and H₄ have been accepted. Increased working time and thus increased status in the same enterprise enables employees to exhibit more service oriented behavior and to have stronger ties with the enterprise and the customers. Those who work for 3-5 years in the enterprise and who are in manager and supervisor status are more service oriented and depend more on customers and the enterprise than those who have less than 1 year of working time and those who are not in management status. These results are similar to the results in the literature. Increased working time and status in the same enterprise increases employee satisfaction, contributes to the professional achievements of employees and increases their commitment to the enterprise (Allen and Meyer, 1993; Balay, 2000; Emir and Baytok, 2004; Toker, 2007; Karahan, 2008).
Whether the service orientation differs according to the graduation status of the employees, the $p^{***}$ value is greater than $0.05$ and there is no significant difference ($x^2(4) = 11.712; \text{,2}>0.05$). **In this case the $H_5$ hypothesis has been rejected.** This can be attributed to the close representation rate of employee graduation degrees, as well as the fact that the education status is from the field related to tourism education or is supported by in-service training in this field.

**CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

The service orientation of the employees in hotel enterprises determines the customers’ perceptions about the enterprise, and also affects service performance, service quality, customer satisfaction and loyalty. Hotel businesses that treat employees’ service orientation as their core business strategy are more efficient in service production, more competitive and more preferable. Today, it is known that the demographics of the employees are the main factors affecting the service orientation of the front-line employees, whose role in hotel enterprises is more prominent. In this context, it is aimed to determine service oriented situations according to the demographics of the front-line employees who are constantly in face-to-face interaction with the customer in hotel enterprises.

In line with the purpose of the research, a field survey was conducted in Ankara and five hotel enterprises of different star status (between one-star and five-star) were included in the study. Hotels have been selected among those that have been operating relatively long. Considering the context of the tourism sector, it is important that the front-line employees of the hotels included in the study, should be at work in the same business between 6 months and 3 years in order to increase the quality of the findings.

In research findings it is seen that the demographics of front-line employees affect their service orientation status. According to research in the field, the rise of status of the long-time employee in the same enterprise, the increase in wages and job satisfaction make them more service oriented (Mathieu and Zajac, 1990; Allen and Meyer 1993; Hamarneh, 1998; Toker, 2007; Karahan, 2008). Of the front-line employees involved in this study, those with a longer working period and higher status were also found to be more connected to the business and customers and more service oriented.

The fact that male employees are more service oriented than women when compared to the gender element is another striking result in the research findings. There are also studies that conclude that women are more service oriented than men (e.g. Serçeoğlu and Selçuk, 2016), indicating a negative relationship between the two elements (Haller and Rosenmayer, 1971; Mathieu and Zajac, 1990; Grusky, 1996). In this research, it is thought that female employees are unable to make the desired effort to be service oriented due to some sectoral constraints and behavior patterns such as distance in customer relations. Also, men generally work in better positions than women and at higher pay are the most important reasons why they are more committed to the enterprise and their jobs. According to another view, because women are based on their role in the family, the institution they work for is secondary and they are generally less connected to the enterprises than men (Aven, Parker and McEnvoy, 1993; Hewlett and Luce, 2006). However, Kurşunoğlu, Bakay and Tanrıöğen (2010, p. 110) suggested that the predominance of the social roles of men in Turkish society, such as home support and family leadership, led men to feel more responsibility for their profession than women. In this context, increasing the status of women employees, ensuring their participation in management and providing different training in developing better customer relations can be suggested in order to ensure that they are more service oriented.

Research in the field suggests that older employees are more satisfied with their profession and status, more connected to the enterprises they work in, and more service oriented (Cohen, 1993; Ketchand and Strawser, 1998; Balay, 2000; Çakır, 2001; İnce and Gül, 2005). However, according to the results of this research, there is no effect of the age variable in terms of service orientation. The most important reason for this is that the ages of the employees involved in the research are close to each other. This can also be attributed to the fact that employees from all age groups have the experience to take a service oriented approach.

As a result, the service orientation of front-line employees in hotel enterprises is influenced by the organizational elements as well as the demographics. Therefore, businesses should take into account the demographics of employees and the results of these features in ensuring service orientation, which is the basis of customer satisfaction. In addition, employees with different demographics are required to work according to their profiles, to provide equal opportunities for each employee and to manage differences in harmony are the facilitative steps that should be taken into account in providing service focus in hotels.
REFERENCES


A Comparison of Perceptions of Local People Regarding Tourism and Tourism Support According to Their Socio-Economic Status and Educational Level

Ayşen Nevin SERT
Assist.Prof.Dr., Selçuk University
nevinsert@selcuk.edu.tr

Sıla KARACAOĞLU
Assist.Prof.Dr., Bilecik Şeyh Edebali University
sila.karacaoglu@bilecik.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The robust development of tourism is not possible without the support of the local people. On the other hand, the local people are the main stakeholders who are directly affected by the development of tourism in a destination. Therefore, it is very important to determine the perceptions and attitudes of the local people towards the effects of tourism for the sustainable and successful development of tourism. The aim of this study was to compare the perceived effects of tourism by local people and their perceptions of support in terms of tourism development according to income and education levels. The questionnaire prepared for this purpose was applied to the local people residing in Beypazarı district of Ankara between September 25 and October 1, 2018 selected by the convenience sampling method. A total of 418 usable questionnaires were analyzed. In the study it was determined that those with lower education and income levels had a higher perception about the negative effects of tourism while their perceptions about the positive effects of tourism were lower.

Key Words: Local People, Effects of Tourism, Support to Tourism Development, Beypazarı.

INTRODUCTION

The perceptions of local people about the positive and negative effects of tourism is critical to the success of the planning and management of a sustainable tourism development through support and participation in tourism development (Gursoy, Jurowski and Uysal, 2002). Although the ways in which the host community members perceive the effects of tourism differ, in general, a positive perception of the effects of tourism by the local people increases their likelihood of supporting tourism development whereas a higher perception of negative impacts makes them indifferent to such support (Perdue, Long and Allen, 1990; Andrecek, Valentine, Knopf and Vogt, 2005; Látková and Vogt, 2012, Nunkoo and So, 2015). Changes between individual and community benefits and costs perceived by local people are often explained by the theory of social change which suggests that if perceived benefits are greater than perceived costs, individuals will support tourism development and participate in tourism activities (Ap, 1992; Látková and Vogt, 2012). In other words, if local people perceive more cost than benefits from tourism development, they are likely to oppose and generate conflict (Lankford, 1994; Chen and Chen, 2010). The change can be based on economic and concrete resources such as goods and money, as well as intangible social ties such as mutual trust and friendship (Lambe, Wittmann and Spekman, 2001). Therefore, change can be realized with both economic and social resources (Nunkoo, 2016).

Most studies indicate that perceived costs adversely affect the support of local people for tourism development (Jurowski, Uysal and Williams, 1997; Gursoy et al., 2002). In this respect, it is important to balance the benefits and costs of tourism development (Ap, 1992; Andrecek and Vogt, 2000; Dyer, Gursoy, Sharma and Carter, 2007). Therefore, it is necessary to evaluate the current perception of local people about tourism development (Nunkoo, Gursoy and Ramkissoon, 2013). In this way, it may be easier for tourism planners to strengthen positive elements and develop optimal strategies for the development of sustainable tourism for the benefit of the local people (Sinclair-Maragh, Gursoy and Vieregge, 2015). Although the effects of tourism development on local people, perceptions and attitudes of local people about tourism development have been investigated by many researchers especially in developed countries and / or regions (Perdue, et al., 1990; Carmichael, 2000; Ko and Stewart, 2002), it can be said that this issue is a relatively
new source of concern for developing countries and / or destinations (Long, 2012). The aim of this study has been to examine the perceptions and attitudes of local people living in Beypazarı district of Ankara, which is a rural tourism destination within the scope of some socio-demographic characteristics.

LITERATURE

Many studies have been carried out on the impact of tourism in the last 30 years. Most of these studies examined the impact of tourism development on local people and their perception and attitudes towards tourism development (Gursoy and Rutherford, 2004; Dyer, et al., 2007; Nunkoo and Ramkisson, 2011). The main reason for this interest is the awareness that tourism development has positive and negative impacts at the local level (Ko and Stewart, 2002). As a result of the studies, there is a common consensus in the literature that tourism development in a region has mainly economic, socio-cultural and environmental positive and negative effects (Belisle and Hoy, 1980; Liu and Var, 1986; Choi, 2003; Kuvan and Akan, 2005 Chen and Chen, 2010). Like many other industries, tourism is often used as a national and / or regional development tool (Jackson, 2008; Liu and Var, 1986), however with proper planning, integration with local values and the environment, socio-cultural, environmental and economic benefits can be achieved for the local community (Lee, Li and Kim, 2007; Long 2012).

Increased household incomes (Haralambopoulos and Pizam, 1996; Jurowski et al., 1997), diversification of shopping opportunities (Liu and Var, 1986; Choi, 2003), strengthening the local economy (Perdue et al., 1990; Gursoy and Rutherford, 2004), creating more jobs and employment (Belisle and Hoy, 1980; Milman and Pizam, 1988) and improving the flow of tax revenues (Andereck et al., 2005; Ko and Stewart, 2002) can be listed among the positive economic effects of tourism. The negative economic effects of tourism include increased cost of living (Liu and Var, 1986; Rasoolimanesh, Jafar, Kock and Ramayah, 2015), prices of products (Andereck et al., 2005; Brunt and Courtney, 1999), increase in home, land and property values and taxes (Tosun, 2002, Latkova and Vogt, 2012). In addition, the growth of economic dependence on tourism (Garg, 2002; Kozak, Kozak and Kozak, 2010), the increase in seasonal employment and employment of foreign workers (Kim, 2002; Kozak et al., 2010) and injustices in income distribution (Garg, 2002; Choi, 2003) are some of the negative economic effects manifested as a result of traditional tourism development in a destination. Tourism reveals many social and cultural effects, both positive and negative (Kim, 2002; Gursoy and Rutherford, 2004; Dyer et al., 2007). Positive socio-cultural effects of tourism development include the development of an environment of tolerance and understanding in destinations (Ap, 1992; Harrill, 2004), improving the quality of life of local people (Gursoy et al., 2002; Nunkoo and So, 2015), increasing the availability of recreational facilities for host communities (Kim, 2002; Tovar and Lockwood, 2008), reduction of gender discrimination (Dunn, 2007; Boley, 2013), specialization in occupations (Lankford, 1994; Cerina, 2007), strengthening the social structure and identity (Besculides, Lee and McCormick 2002; Boley, 2013), encouraging the protection and revitalization of traditional arts, cultures and works of art (Kim, 2002; McGeehee, Andereck and Vogt, 2002), enabling the manifestation of a community pride in recognizing their resources, products (Kim, 2002; Johnson, 2010) and the transfer of these assets to future generations (Onderwater, 2011; Aref, 2011). However, hostility and resentment among local people due to the striking differences in tourism gains and inequalities in income distribution along with the development of tourism in a region (Doxey, 1975; Kim, 2002), the increase in unethical behavior due to the increase in crime rates (Andereck et al., 2005; Nunkoo and Ramkisson, 2011), corruption of traditional, social and family values (Besculides et al., 2002; Andereck et al., 2005), the occurrence of cultural conflicts with tourists (Kim, 2002; Choi, 2003), the increasing number of foreign language words included in the mother tongue (Ap and Crompton, 1998; Kozak et al., 2010), the commercialization of the culture of the host community and the increasing number of imitation products paving the way for the disappearance of traditional handicrafts (Haralambopoulos and Pizam, 1996; Dyer et al., 2007) are negative socio-cultural effects generated by tourism development. Another factor that closely concerns the perception and attitude of local people about tourism is environmental impacts. Tourism and the physical environment are inextricably linked. Therefore, the attraction elements related to the physical environment are highly effective on tourism demand (Avcıkurt, 2009; Kozak et al., 2010). While tourism development is seen as a mechanism for improving natural and artificial areas and reducing the demand for environmental pollution and excessive use of resources (Dwyer, Edwards, Mistilis, Roman and Scott, 2009) on one hand, on the other hand, it is possible that tourism activities may also negatively affect natural and physical resources (Lankford, 1994; Andereck et al., 2005; Sinclair-Maragh et al., 2015). Increasing crowds (Ko
traffic (Kim, 2002; Dyer et al., 2007) and environmental pollution caused by waste (Ko and Stewart, 2002; Nunkoo and Ramkisson, 2011), air, water, soil and noise pollution (Tosun, 2002; Latkova and Vogt, 2012), parking problems (Sheldon and Abenoja, 2001; Ko and Stewart, 2002) depletion of natural resources (Ko and Stewart, 2002; Sinclair-Maragh et al. 2015) and unplanned construction (Lee, Li and Kim, 2007; Avcukurt, 2009) are examples of the negative impacts of tourism on the environment. In this context, Julio (2001) describes tourism as ‘goose that not only lays a golden egg, but also fouls its own nest’.

An examination of the literature reveals that some of the studies focus on the attitudes of local people towards tourism development (Stylidis, Biran, Sit and Szivas, 2014), while other studies have focused on the perception of socio-demographic variables related to local people in terms of tourism development (Kasarda and Janowitz, 1974; Gursoy and Rutherford, 2004; Harrill, 2004). The data obtained from these studies show that the perception, attitudes and behaviors generated by tourism on local people are realized at various levels and the results change when these concepts are examined through different variables. Therefore, it is not possible to speak of a universal consensus on the effects of variables that affect the perception, attitude and behavior of local people. In fact, some study results indicate that socio-demographic variables affect local people’s perception of tourism development (Milman and Pizam, 1988; Nunkoo and Ramkisson, 2010; Almeida-García, Pelaez-Fernandez, Balbuena-Vazquez and Cortes-Macias, 2016) while others indicate that these variables do not display any causal effect (Jurowski, 1994; Kuvan and Akan, 2005; Wang and Psifter, 2008).

Socio-demographic variables can be listed as age (Haralambopoulos and Pizam, 1996; McGeeha and Anderdeck, 2004), gender (Pizam and Milman, 1984; Kuvan and Akan, 2005), marital status (Haralambopoulos and Pizam, 1996; Smith and Kranich, 1998), having children (Milman and Pizam, 1988; Haralambopoulos and Pizam, 1996), education level (Teye, Sonmez and Sirakaya, 2002; Kim, Park and Phandanouvong, 2014), income (Haralambopoulos and Pizam, 1996; Kuvan and Akan, 2005), economic dependency on tourism (Pizam, 1978; Perdue et al., 1990), place of birth (Pizam, 1978; Um and Crompton, 1987) and residence time in the destination (Liu and Var, 1986; Lankford, 1994). Furthermore, there may be some differences between rural and urban areas regarding how tourism impacts are perceived (Wall and Mathieson, 2005). In this respect, the study aimed to examine the positive and negative effects of tourism and the perception of support for tourism development among the local people living in Beypazarı district of Ankara according to their monthly income and education level.

METHOD

The population of this study consists of local people living in Beypazarı district center of Ankara. The data were collected with face to face interviews between September 25 and October 1, 2018. The convenience sampling method was used for sampling which was preferred in the study instead of using the whole population. Since the population of Beypazarı is more than 10,000, the n = S2Zα2/d2 formula proposed by Özdamar (2001) for quantitative studies and infinite populations was used to calculate the sampling size. The standard deviation in the formula was S = 1, considering similar studies using the questionnaire and 5-point Likert scales while α = 0,05 significance level was countered by Za = 1,96 and effect width d = 0,1 to calculate the minimum sample size to be at least 385. In this context, 500 questionnaires were distributed and 418 were evaluated by taking into account incomplete, inaccurate and low reliability questionnaires.

A questionnaire technique was used as data collection tool in the study. The survey consisted basically of two parts. The first part included 6 questions (gender, occupation, age, education level, marital status, income status) in order to determine the demographic characteristics of the individuals in the sample group. The second part consisted of the scales for the effects of tourism perceived by the local people and the support for tourism development. The scale of the effects of tourism perceived by the local people was taken from the study of Segota, Mihalic and Kuscer (2017). The Cronbach’s Alpha coefficient of the scale was 0.77. The tourism support scale was taken from the studies of Stylidis et al. (2014). The Cronbach’s Alpha coefficient of the scale was found to be 0.92. The items in the scales were subjected to a five point Likert rating and the level of participation of the individuals in the sample group for each item was rated as Strongly Disagree = 1, Disagree = 2, Neither Agree or Disagree = 3, Agree = 4, Strongly Agree = 5. SPSS 18.0for Windows program was used for data analysis. For the construct validity of the scales, explanatory factor analysis was applied and the internal consistency of the reliability analysis was calculated by Cronbach’s Alpha coefficients. On the other hand, the demographic characteristics of the individuals have been presented with frequency and percentage distributions while the positive and negative effects of tourism and the perceptions of
support for tourism development of individuals have been presented with percentage distributions as well as arithmetic mean and standard deviation.

**FINDINGS**

The distribution of the participants according to their demographic characteristics is presented in Table 1. Accordingly, 65.4% of the total 418 respondents were male, 78% were married, 65.3% were under the age of 40, 81.1% had high school or less education and 35.7% earned 3500 TL and less in income. However, 19.4% were employers, 34.2% earned salaries and 46.4% had other occupations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>Number (n)</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>35,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>269</td>
<td>64,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital Status</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>326</td>
<td>78,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>22,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>29 ≤</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>29,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>35,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>21,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50 ≥</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>13,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Primary school</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>9,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary school</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>16,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High school</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>55,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bachelor degree</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>18,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment Status</td>
<td>Employer</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>19,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>34,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>26,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>9,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Housewife</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Others (unemployed, retirement etc.)</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly salary (Turkish Liras)</td>
<td>2.500 ≤</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>7,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.501-3.500 TL</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>27,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.501-4.500 TL</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>29,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4.501-5.500 TL</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>15,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5.501 TL ≥</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>19,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>418</strong></td>
<td><strong>100,0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Cronbach's Alpha coefficient of the perceived effects of tourism by the local population was determined to be 0.79 and the Cronbach's Alpha coefficient of the tourism support scale was determined as 0.82. The effects of tourism perceived by local people and perceptions of support for tourism development were compared according to monthly income and education level in this study and significant differences were found (p <0.05).
An examination of the averages revealed that the participants with low education and low income levels had higher perceptions of the negative effects of tourism and lower perceptions of the positive effects. Likewise, those with low education and low income levels had lower (negative) perceptions of support for tourism development.
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The success of the tourism industry depends on the local attractions and the hospitality of the local people (Gursoy et al., 2002). In general, tourists are reluctant to visit places where they do not feel well (Belisle and Hoy, 1980; Diedrich and García, 2009). Therefore, hostile behavior on the part of the local people towards tourists may be an obstacle to the tourism sector while a sincere attitude can support tourism development. (Yoon, Gursoy and Chen, 1999). The attitudes of the local people also affect a positive or negative effect on the tourism development and sustainability of any destination (Sirakaya, Teye and Sonmez, 2002; Harrill, 2004).

An examination of the literature reveals that there are differences in the ways in which local people perceive the effects of tourism and develop an attitude regarding this perception because each community has its own structure and circumstances (Harrill 2004; Dyer, et al., 2007). Therefore, this study regarding how perceptions and attitudes of local people living in Beypazarı differ according to income and education variables is expected to contribute to literature. The findings indicate that the participants with low education and low income levels had higher perceptions of the negative effects of tourism while their perceptions about the positive effects of tourism were lower. Similarly, the perceptions of participants with low education and income levels in support of tourism development were more negative. It is noted that these findings obtained within the scope of the study coincide with the results of many studies in the literature (Hernandez, Cohen, and García, 1996; Haralambopoulos and Pizam, 1996; Teye et al., 2002; Almeida-García et al., 2016). In their study, Hernandez et al. (1996) stated that the local people who had not completed secondary school had a less positive attitude towards tourism development than those with a high education level. According to the authors, those who have a lower education level think that they have less chance of finding employment and / or getting direct benefits from tourism than those who have a higher education level. He also pointed out that local people with lower levels of education are more conservative in protecting their lifestyles and are more likely to be more sensitive in this matter. In their studies, Kuvan and Akan (2005) determined that the local people with a lower education level had a more critical perspective regarding tourism development. Furthermore, Haralambopoulos and Pizam (1996) and Kuvan and Akan (2005) found a significant association between higher income levels and positive attitudes of local people towards tourism development. Accordingly, more affluent residents with more positive attitudes supported tourism development more while low-income residents supported it less.

The findings of the study can be interpreted as the higher the education and income level of the people of Beypazarı, the more positively the effects of tourism will be perceived and support for tourism development will develop accordingly. In this context, some suggestions have been developed regarding the activities that can be carried out with the local people in order to ensure successful tourism development in Beypazarı. As a priority, local governments should take action in order for the local people, who earn their living mainly from agriculture, animal husbandry and trade, to participate more in tourism activities and gain economic benefits from tourism. In this context, it is considered to be useful to provide guidance on how to generate income by providing various trainings and courses to the housewives who are currently producing tarhana, homemade macaroni, handicrafts and jewelry products for the tourist demand as well as local people who do not generate income from tourism. Courses can be initiated by the municipality by making the local people aware that traditional culture such as filigree, coppersmithing, quilting, weaving, local home cooking are a means of income from tourism. Thus, both the local people earn more income and the cultural heritage is conserved and maintained. Within the scope of rural tourism, Beypazarı’s villages can be brought to the forefront by creating different opportunities such as eco tourism, farm tourism, adventure tourism, thermal tourism and the destination of tourists will not be limited to Beypazarı district center. A joint cooperative can be established in which the production, sales and marketing of local products produced in Beypazarı can be carried out. In this context, local administrations, development agencies, universities and NGOs can join forces to provide local people with training on business, entrepreneurship, co-operative, marketing and tourism, and visits to exemplary tourism destinations can be organized. The establishment of foreign language courses at a basic level in the district with the cooperation of the Municipality, Ministry of National Education and universities is likely to contribute to a more positive outlook of the local people regarding tourism development.

The study involves a number of limitations in view of time, cost and application constraints. First of all, the convenience sampling method was preferred for obtaining data. The study was carried out with local people who live in Beypazarı district of Ankara and agreed to complete the questionnaire voluntarily. Therefore, the study findings cannot be generalized to the local population. It is thought that it will be
possible to monitor and predict the support for tourism development by repeating this study in the future. Furthermore, it is considered that examining the perception, attitude and support of different stakeholders of tourism in future studies will contribute to the literature.

REFERENCES


Boley, B.B. (2013). Sustainability, empowerment, and resident attitudes toward tourism: Developing and testing the resident empowerment through tourism scale (RETS). (Doktora tezi), Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA. Erişim adresi: https://vtechworks.lib.vt.edu/handle/10919/51756


Choi, H.S.C. (2003). Measurement of sustainable development progress for managing community tourism. (Doktora tezi), Graduate Studies of Texas A&M University, USA.


Jurowski, C. A. (1994). The interplay of elements affecting host community resident attitude toward tourism: A path analytic approach (Doktora Tezi), Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA. Erişim adresi: https://vtechworks.lib.vt.edu/handle/10919/39998


Kim, K. (2002). The effects of tourism impacts upon quality of life of residents in the community. (Doktora Tezi), Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, USA. Erişim adresi: https://vtechworks.lib.vt.edu/bitstream/handle/10919/29954/Title_and_Text.pdf?sequence=1


Concept Restaurants

Pınar ŞENEL
Res.Assist., Anadolu University
pinargoksu@anadolu.edu.tr

Hakan YILMAZ
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Anadolu University
hyilmaz5@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

In the 21st century, differences, individuality and identity notion has come to the forefront and it has affected demand and supply in markets. Behind the restaurants which compete in the monopolistic market should be perceived different from other enterprises. As a result of these development's concept restaurants which reflect a stated theme to customers with their menus, services and interiors has emerged in recent years. Concept restaurants create both a new service style and identity in the sector. Although service quality, customer satisfaction and preference factors of restaurants are frequently investigated in the literature, it is seen that the studies on concept restaurants are extremely limited. On the other hand, a study examining concept restaurants among restaurant type, has not been found in the literature. The aim of the research is defining the concept restaurants, examining the examples in the world and classifying concept restaurants in terms of themes among restaurant type. In this context, in the research, restaurant literature and application examples in the world were examined and it is seen that concept restaurants can be classified in its kind and among restaurant type.

Key Words: Restaurant History, Restaurant Type, Themed Restaurants, Concept Restaurants.

INTRODUCTION

Changing environmental conditions has affected the demand and supply in the marketing sector continuously. Businesses that want to be active in their sectors must keep pace with this change. Considering that the most important requirement it is clear that today's restaurants should take into account both the demands and trends focused on experience (Hotelling, 1990). On the other hand, the fact that restaurants compete in the monopolistic market where there are similar businesses in terms of food and beverage, service quality and price, constitutes the necessity to be perceived differ from other enterprises. In this context restaurants want to locate in a different place for customers have to constitute an identity (Bell, Meiselman, Pierson and Reeve, 1994). In the 21st century, where the effects of postmodernism are so high, the individuality, differences and identity come to the forefront and restaurants serve experiences to customers through their own identity (Featherstone, 2007). Food, beverage, service and interior design are the basic elements of the identity for the restaurants. Restaurants which have many similar competitors in terms of food, beverage, service quality and price must create a different with service style and interior design for the identity. In addition, many researches showed that restaurants should pay attention to interior design and service for shaping customer perception (Namkung and Jang, 2008). For all these reasons, concept restaurants have emerged in recent years, and they have created a new service style while reflecting a specific theme with their food, beverage, services and interior design. Although service quality, customer satisfaction and preference factors of restaurants are frequently investigated in the literature (Wall and Berry, 2007; Heung, Wong and Qu, 2000; Mattila, 2001), it is seen that the studies on concept restaurants are extremely limited. On the other hand, a study examining concept restaurants among restaurant type, is not found in the literature. The aim of the research is defining the concept restaurants, examining the examples in the world and classifying concept restaurants in terms of themes among restaurant type. In this context, in the research, restaurant literature and application examples in the world were examined in detail.
Restaurant History

The first transformation of food establishments, which were established to meet the needs of travelers and eat and serve the commons, took place in France, in 1766. It is not a coincidence that the foundations of the modern restaurant, which is defined as commercial enterprises that provide the needs of individuals outside the house through a space and serve according to a certain service system, are realized in France. With the revolutions taking place in France, the chefs serving the noble class became unemployed and the quest for haute cuisine, which the noble class could consume outside the palace, was the basis of the emergence of the first modern restaurants (Morgan, 2006). In 1766, Maison de Sante, which can be expressed as the first example of concept restaurants with food and beverage theme, was opened in France by Boulanger. The restaurant, which means a health house, has become history as the first modern restaurant by offering healing broths prepared with vegetable juices to individuals sitting at separate tables through a menu and service system. Another modern restaurant of this period, Le Grande Taverne de Londres, opened in 1782 in Paris, serves fine cuisine. It was the first example of today’s luxury restaurant type by presenting it with a superior service understanding in a place with stylish design also (Spang & Şener, 2007).

The spread of restaurants in France was realized in 1791 with the abolition of guilds and the emergence of the concept of competition by multiplying commercial enterprises. In addition, this is linked to the Industrial Revolution both France and the world. Living and working conditions in the city, which emerged as a result of the Industrial Revolution, led to the emergence of the first examples of restaurants offering fast food as individuals searched for places to eat at lunch breaks (Schlosser, 2012).

Restaurants in Turkey have developed in 1820. Tourists who came to Istanbul by steam ships and trains met the need to eat outside in Pera. Pera was the first modern and national themed concept restaurant example in Istanbul. It reflected French culture with its menu, service and interior design. There are also examples of table d’hui restaurants in Istanbul that offer a few pieces of mutton, rice, salad and yoghurt (Onaran, 2015).

With all these, in the 2000s, restaurant type and functions have increased gradually and the restaurants that want to differ from the other restaurants in the sector are trying to differentiate by using food, beverage, service, interior design or all these elements together. In the literature, restaurants are categorized according to regulation, scale, structure, service and type based. Besides, restaurants are categorized type based as follows (Montagne, 1977):

- Upscale restaurants (restaurants are served fine dining in lux interior space),
- Ordinary restaurants (restaurants are served with a normal quality),
- Fast-service restaurants (Restaurants are served quick and usually unqualified food),
- Ethnic Restaurants (restaurants are served with specific country’s or nation’s food, service type and interior design),
- Specialized Restaurants (restaurants focusing on food such as kebab, meatball, pizza),
- Family Restaurants (Non-alcoholic restaurants for families).

Concept restaurants, which reflect a stated theme with food, beverage, service and interior designs, do not appear in these classifications. In this research, concept restaurants and its type are examined in detail.

Concept Restaurants and Concept Restaurant Type

The origin of the word concept derives from the Latin conceptus (embrace, comprehend, be pregnant) verb. According to Cambridge Dictionary, concept means principle and idea (Cambridge Dictionary, 2019). The word “theme” means “main subject” (Cambridge Dictionary, 2019). In this context, concept restaurants can be defined as restaurants that reflect a stated theme with food drinks, services and interior designs. With these feature’s concept restaurants also create an identity for their differentiated food and beverage service process. Ethnic restaurants and themed restaurants are considered very limited in the literature (Bekar and Dönmez, 2014). However, ethnic restaurants and themed restaurants should be evaluated under the title of concept restaurants. Considering the dictionary meaning of concept (Cambridge, 2019), it is clear that concept restaurants cover ethnic or themed restaurants in terms of food, beverage, service and interior designs. On the other hand, concept restaurants can be classified in different themes according to examples in world.
Food and Beverage Themed Concept Restaurants

Food and beverage themed concept restaurants which are one type of concept restaurants design their menu contents, services and interiors in harmony with a food or beverage theme they choose. Meat restaurants, fish restaurants, wine and coffee houses are the examples of these type of restaurants. Food and beverage themed concept restaurants offer food and beverage as a theme and differ from the specialized restaurants offering only one food in the menu content. However, it should be said that, with serving only soup Maison de Sante, being the inventor of Margharita Pizza Pietro and borek and panch restaurants in Ottoman are first examples of food and drink themed concept restaurants (Morgan, 2006; Castaldo, 2014). While these restaurants in history focus on a single food for ease of purchase, preparation and presentation, concept examples of today provide cost, quality and niche marketing with single food and beverage. Zauo Restaurant in New York City is one of the food-themed concept restaurant examples. The restaurant focuses on fish and seafood products in its menu and adapts successfully this theme to service and interior design. The restaurant serves its customers in a ship-designed space and includes customers with hunting experience. Customers who catch fish and seafood in the pools can eat their caught food. Their food is served with suitable service equipment for fish and seafood theme with regard to colors and materials also (Tripadvisor, 2019).


El Capricho, another successful example of food themed concept restaurants, has become one of the best meat restaurants in the world by reflecting the meat theme to its menu, service and interior design. The restaurant is located on a cattle ranch in Jimenez de Jamuz in Spain and serves the meats with meat cutting and cooking shows (Tripadvisor, 2019). History of beverage themed concept restaurants date back to the oldest breweries and wine houses. U Fleku, is one of these restaurants opened in Prague in the 1499. Restaurant has served to banquets, cocktails and event as well as being a museum (U Fleku, 2019). Nowadays, beverage themed concept restaurants have also opened for soft drinks such as coffee and tea. One of them is The Coffee Academics serving in Hong
Kong since 2010. The restaurant is a good example that can adapt the theme of coffee to service and interior design. The interior design was based on an open kitchen for interaction with the customers and the service is carried out with various equipment to perform a cooking coffee show (The Coffee Academics, 2019).

Image 2. The Coffee Academics, Hong Kong (The Coffee Academics, 2019).

National and Ethnic Themed Concept Restaurants
National and ethnic themed concept restaurants reflect their regional food culture with their services and interior designs. Turkish, French, Italian restaurants are national themed while Circassian and Bosnian restaurants are ethnicity themed concept restaurant examples. Salamis Chinese Restaurant is one of the examples of national themed concept restaurants in North Cyprus. The restaurant serves Chinese dish to customer with Waribashi and Chinese special spoon on table covered with a special Chinese table cloth. Interior design of Salamis Chinese Restaurant was constituted generally red, black, yellow colors and wood materials (Salamis Chinese Restaurant, 2019).

An example of an ethnic themed restaurant is located in Eskişehir, where the Circassian people emigrated during the Ottoman period. Kafkas Kültür Evi, which serves Circassian dish to customer with special ethnic music was designed according to Circassian culture ingredients. In addition, the restaurant is a living museum (Foursquare, 2019).

Place Themed Concept Restaurants
Place themed concept restaurants constitute their menus, services and interiors through the place theme. The place as a theme can be related to the establishment of the restaurant or independent. Considering that service location is the primary effect among the restaurant preference factors of the customers (Rapoport, 1990), it is important that restaurants use the place to increase the impact of their experience. In this context, Fortezza Medicea, which was established in a historical prison in Fortezza Medicea Castle in Italy, is one of the concept restaurants that reflects its theme through its establishment. In the restaurant, menu was composed of a table d’hote menu and customers have eaten their food with the supervision of the guard (Tripadvisor, 2019).
Christon Cafe is located in Tokyo as an example of a restaurant that reflects the theme of place to the menu and service through interior design rather than the establishment place. The restaurant’s interior was designed with a church theme and Italian cuisine is served related to the church. In addition, meals are served in a coffin in the restaurant and are eaten with special crusade service equipment’s (Christon Cafe, 2019)

**Fairy tale, Series and Movie Themed Concept Restaurants**

Fairy tale, series and movie themed concept restaurants reflect international fairy tale, series or movies to their menus, services and interior designs. There are mostly fairy tale and movie themed in application. The idea that restaurants make a difference by choosing fairy tales and films as a theme is related to influences and revenue of fairy tales and films, and even more fantastic films. On the other hand, individuals who want to escape the true stories in they live, explain the desire to experience the free time in the restaurant with this theme (Lim, 2009). The Green Dragon Inn is an example of a concept restaurant that reflects the fantastic film of The Lord of the Rings, which does not accidentally reach a huge fan by telling the battle between remain good and the desire to be bad and strong. Located in Hobbit Village, where the film was shot in New Zealand, the restaurant integrated its interior with this place. The restaurant adapted its menu according to the legendary hobbits and menu was composed of vegetarian-friendly dish. Service reflects hobbits dining eating from the same table (The Green Dragon Inn - Hobbiton Movie Set Tours, 2019).

The Hogwarts Cafe reflects the film of Harry Potter, which makes a great impression with its fantastic subject is located in New Delhi. The restaurant uses the name and the logo of the school of witchcraft and designs its interior with flags, posters and accessories of witch groups. The Hogwarts Cafe composed of the menu groups from the film series, also serves the dish like witch meals in the film in point of appearance (The Hogwarts Cafe, 2019).

**Historical Event and Phenomenon Themed Concept Restaurants**

Historical event themed concept restaurants reflect to historical events such as revolutions, explorations and inventions while phenomenon themed concept restaurants make it through some daily phenomenon. An example of a technology is one of the most important phenomenon today and shape our lives. In this context, Eatsa is a technology phenomenon themed concept restaurant and it is located in California. In the restaurant, which does not have any kitchen, service and safe staff, customers order their menu on smart
menu screens and then take their meals from digital food receiving units. Also, the customers pay their meals through digital payment system (Eatsa, 2019).

An interesting example of menu, service and interior design based on the phenomenon of war is located in the Beirut. Buns and Guns Restaurant which design its interior as military base, serves the meal by staff wearing military uniform with gun and bomb sounds. Also, the restaurant serves its menu including meals such as killer burger, poisoned sandwich (Facebook, 2019).

An example of a historical event themed concept restaurant is the Gasova Lampa in Ukraine Lviv. The restaurant reflects the invention of the gas lamp and design its interior with sculpture and pictures of Ignacy Lukasiewicz who invented the gas lamp. The restaurant’s menu constituted cocktails weightily and serves with scale containers to remind the experiment (Tripadvisor, 2019).

![Image 4. Eatsa, Kaliforniya (Eatsa, 2019).](image)

![Image 5. Model Proposal for Restaurant Type](image)
CONCLUSION

As a result of the French Revolution, the chefs in the palace became unemployed, and the industrial revolution led to the supply of food that meet the need for eating out in the modern city. In this context, in the 1800's, the concept of modern restaurant emerged first in France. The increasing number of restaurants that can be defined as food and beverage establishments that meet the needs of individuals to eat out through a space and service system has led to the differentiation of restaurants by acquiring various functions. On the other hand, the fact that the restaurants have become inseparable due to the competitive conditions, has encouraged the restaurants to constitute their identity. As a result of all these developments the concept restaurants have emerged as an experience space with stated one theme. Concept restaurants which can be defined as food and beverage establishments, reflect a stated theme with food and beverage, service and interiors. Although there is a very limited number of studies on concept restaurants in the literature, there are no findings of studies that classified concept restaurants among restaurant type. In the study, restaurant literature and application examples in the world were examined and it is seen that concept restaurants can be defined among the type of restaurants. It is seen that also concept restaurants can be classified in its kind as follows:

- Food and beverage themed concept restaurants,
- National and ethnic themed concept restaurants,
- Place themed concept restaurants,
- Fairy tale, series and movie themed concept restaurants,
- Historical event and phenomenon concept restaurants.

As a result of the research, it is suggested for the literature that concept restaurants should be examined with different techniques and aspects, new restaurant applications in the world should be examined in terms of menu, service and new restaurant classification should be made.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT
The aim of this study is to develop and validate a scale to measure the perception of the gastronomic experience of tourists in destinations. In this respect, data were collected from 485 domestic and foreign tourists through surveys. Firstly, exploratory factor analysis was performed and a 4-factor structure (food and beverage establishments, food and beverages, staff, and other gastronomic components) was obtained in accordance with the theoretical framework. It seemed that Hierarchical cluster analysis (Ward's Method) proved the existence of this 4-factor structure. Finally, the four-factor structure was validated by confirmatory factor analysis. Recommendations have been made regarding the use of the four-factor structure in future research.

Keywords: Gastronomy Experience Scale, Gastronomy Tourism, Ward's Method.

INTRODUCTION
For recent decades, tourism has experienced continued growth and deepening diversification to become a global phenomenon. Besides, the desire to taste authentic and ethnic food is also emerging as a new phenomenon in the industry. Destinations are aware of the importance of gastronomy in order to diversify tourism and stimulate local, regional and national economic development. According to Symons (1999) regional gastronomy is a key component of a destination for attracting tourists as a pull factor. Kivela and Crotts (2005:51) suggest that destination's gastronomy can create remarkable and loyal market segment in terms of economic value. For this reason, it can be said that the gastronomy experience is a powerful tool in destination marketing. In this sense, destination's gastronomy performance is very important and for Smith and Costello (2008:100) satisfaction is a critical indicator of destination’s performance. Finding out how well a destination’s gastronomy is performing, a necessary tool should be examined in order to measure the level of satisfaction. This study aims to propose a measurement tool for the level of tourist’s gastronomy experience perception in a destination by an empirical research. For this purpose, the structures of the scale were examined by exploratory factor analysis, hierarchical clustering analysis, and confirmatory factor analysis.

LITERATURE REVIEW
The measurement of tourist satisfaction at the destination level has been explored before by tourism researchers. According to Lee (2016:472) at first, the “tourist satisfaction” research centered upon the product and service, for example, studies on the influencing factors on the satisfaction serving to improve the service quality of the hotels, hostels, and restaurants and so on. Yet in the recent years, an increasing number of scholars consider the competition among tourism destinations has evolved from one of the tourism resources, products and the tourism industry, to one of comprehensive strength, and one of the important facets to evaluate the tourism destination is precisely the tourist satisfaction (Chen, et al. 2012:593). Satisfaction scales that started with such as Servqual, ServPerf, HotelZot and Dineserv have been pioneers in developing satisfaction scales that measure destination performance such as HOLSAT, TourServQual (Yarış, 2014:4). Tibe and Snaith (1998) developed HOLSAT, a service quality measurement model for tourist destinations, to compare the negative and positive aspects of experience and expectations of vacationers. Eraqi (2006) developed TourServQual, also called TServQual, to evaluate customer satisfaction in tourism sector. When we look at the studies about the gastronomy satisfaction of tourist in the literature there are some studies which overemphasizing food service or gastronomy. For example; Nield, Kozak, and Legrys (2000) examined the role of food service in tourist satisfaction. Along with components such as quality, diversity, food service standard, presentation of food, and speed of service, Nield et al. (2000) found that food service is an important factor in tourist satisfaction. Kim et al. (2011) point out that food is...
considered one of the most important components in tourism. According to Quan and Wang (2004), food should be considered a primary attraction and peak experience that motivate tourists to visit because tourists’ food experience is one of the major activities and expenditures of tourists at a destination. Another study undertaken by Kivela and Crotts (2006) demonstrated that Hong Kong gastronomy played a significant role in creating a quality visiting experience for tourists, which in turn influenced their revisit intentions. Kivela and Crotts (2006) also found that dissatisfaction with gastronomy would negatively influence tourists’ quality perceptions of a destination.

Satisfaction of destination’s gastronomy is not just about the perceived food quality, food price, appearance and etc. Duttagupta (2013:41) states that in relation to a culinary experience, satisfaction is predicated on a range of elements as opposed to individual aspects of the experience such as taste, service, and ambience. Liu and Jang (2009) point out that satisfaction in a hospitality setting is a factor of the material product, the behavior and attitude of employees, and the environment. Correia et al. (2008) suggest that gastronomy satisfaction in a tourism setting is a multidimensional construct comprising three factors: ‘gastronomy’, ‘price and quality’ and ‘atmosphere’. According to their study, among these three factors, ‘gastronomy’ was the most important determinant of tourist satisfaction. This study aims to find what are the key characteristics of the top gastronomic destinations? According to Karagkouni (2012), gastronomic destinations (e.g., France, Spain, Italy, etc.) gastronomy in the tourism context includes a mix of products, services, activities that underline the typical products and recipes of a region, the talent and creativity of those who prepare them, and the uniqueness and tradition of a place, so that they can offer the visitor a complete and memorable gastronomic-travelling experience. In this context, it can be said gastronomy satisfaction is not just about foods and restaurants but also about other factors such as employees, events and gastronomic activities. In other words, according to Ha and Jang (2010) quality of food is the most critical component of food experience. Existing researches (Ha and Jang, 2010; Namkung and Jang, 2007) show that the quality of the food has a positive effect on customer satisfaction. Food related dissatisfaction affects the image of both the operator and the destination negatively. The abovementioned food is the foods served in the enterprises.

F&B Establishments

F&B establishments are places where production and consumption activities take place simultaneously (Yüksel and Yüksel, 2003). And according to Shenoy (2005), they are the primary places for gastronomy tourism due to the fact that the dining experience happens. F&B establishments are the most important component of food experience. Measuring of food experience was first developed as meal experience by Campell-Smith (1967) for the commercial hospitality industry. Campbell-Smith (1967) noted that customers assess not only the quality of food but also the dining experience in terms of service quality, atmosphere and other factors.

F&B Employee

F&B service is an art that leads people to socialize and customers enjoy not only the beautiful appearance of the restaurant but also cultured and skillful service staff (Sökmen, 2010:300). A study conducted by Mei et al. (1999) in Australia to investigate service quality with a Holserv found that the most important dimension is the staff. Existing researches (Albacete-Sáez et al., 2007; Arslan, 2010; Ha and Jang, 2010; Mohsin et al., 2006) show that F&B employees’ performance is prerequisite for customer satisfaction.

Other Gastronomic Components

Gastronomic activities are often considered as a tourist product because they are accepted as part of tourism (Hall and Sharples, 2008). In order to promote gastronomy, in addition to cuisines and culinary cultures, gastronomy events also needed such as food processing, food stores, food-related museums, urban restaurant districts and culinary routes or trails (Horng and Tsai, 2011:287). Gastronomy events, particularly food festivals, and such as gourmet tours, food exhibitions, have been drawing attention in recent years. Furthermore, especially festivals are becoming increasingly important in creating recreational experiences and conveying cultural values (Lin, 2006:37). One another fact that gastronomic identity is essential.

Food and Beverage (F&B)

Food and beverages, the raison d'être of gastronomy, affects customer satisfaction and their next choices. In other words, according to Ha and Jang (2010) quality of food is the most critical component of
According to Parasecoli (2005), food has always been one of the defining aspects of any social group, whose members acknowledge each other as such by the way they eat, by what they eat and by what they abhor. Gastronomic identity has been used in many locations to create a unique and memorable experience for guests (Harrington and Ottonbacher, 2010). Local food does not refer to food served only in F&B establishments. According to Jahromy and Tajik (2011) “local” should not be understood food that only grows in the region but produced and sold. In brief, other gastronomic experiences are vital for gastronomy satisfaction.

METHODOLOGY

Research Goal
This study aims to measure structure validity of a scale used for gastronomy experience perception in a destination with both principal component analysis (PCA) and hierarchical clustering analysis (HCA). In addition, performing HCA after EFA is expected to produce similar and / or identical results. Namely, it is intended to investigate the aspect of HCA confirming EFA. Confirmatory factor analysis was applied for both analyses to test how well the measured variables represent the number of constructs. The comparison of PCA and HCA was made for the scale of statistical attitude previously by Doğan and Başokçu (2010).

Sample and Data Collection
The survey method was used to obtain the required data. The research sample included both domestic and foreign tourists so that the questionnaire was built in two languages: Turkish and English. The questionnaire was developed based on a review of previous literature and was modified by the researcher using a literature review. The items in the questionnaire were taken from past studies (Albacete-Sáez et al., 2007; Arslan, 2010; Akgöl, 2012) on gastronomy and foodservice evaluation and five items were added by the researcher. According to the research framework, the items of the questionnaire were designed for four factors. Appendix B shows items and factors. The questionnaire was used to acquire empirical data related to each of the variables on a 29 item, 5-point Likert-type scale which 1= strongly disagree and 5=strongly agree. The sample size was set at 500 and the survey time frame was designated for 2 months period. The survey was conducted at the hotels of Mardin Province as the research is about only domestic and foreign tourists. Tourist is defined as a person who travels and stays at least one night apart from the place of residence. Because of this definition, for the validity of research, the survey needs to be applied to the people staying at the hotels. Over the 2-month period, the survey was conducted only on weekends and a total of 520 questionnaires were gathered. 485 questionnaires were evaluated finally because some of them had too much incomplete information.

Prior to the main research, a preliminary examination and a pilot study were conducted to validate the literature-based attributes. Face validity and content validity in the preliminary examination process were conducted. Some of the statements in the questionnaire have been changed with feedback received after the preliminary examination. The pilot study was conducted for 60 tourists to measure pre-test internal consistency. The result of the reliability analysis (Cronbach’s α: 0.92) showed that scale is acceptable and coefficients of Cronbach’s α of four dimensions were between 0.88 and 0.79.

Analyses and Results
A number of statistical procedures were carried out for this study. To reduce 29 items into four correlated meaningful factors, “principal component analysis” (PCA) for exploratory factor analysis (EFA) and “Ward’s Method” for hierarchical cluster analysis was employed. According to Murtagh and Legendre (2014), PCA and Ward’s method involve different yet complementary spatial and clustering models that are fit to the data using the same mathematical principal. For this purpose, the data was coded to a statistical program. In PCA, relatively small numbers of variables are mathematically derived to use to convey as much of the information in the measured variables as possible. In other words, PCA is simply directed toward enabling one to use fewer variables to provide the same information that one would obtain from a larger set of variables (Lecho et al., 2005). According to Revelle (1979:57), hierarchical clustering algorithms can be useful for scale construction using large item pools. According to Tuma et al. (2009), Ward’s method is the most popular hierarchical clustering method used in the marketing research. Similar to use in conjunction with PCA, Ward’s method is complementary to the use of correspondence analysis. Ward’s method applied to the output of correspondence analysis, i.e. to the factor projections, implies equally-weighted observations, endowed with the Euclidean distance (Murtagh and Legendre, 2014). After PCA and Ward’s method employed, first-order confirmatory factor
analysis (CFA) was employed for both results. CFA has been widely used as evidence of construct validity in theory-based instrument construction (Li, 2016:936). The missing data and its rate were investigated by the missing data analysis. It was seen that the missing data of the items were no more than %0.8. There is no fixed limit to an acceptable percentage of missing data in the data set for the current statistical inferences in the literature. Schafer (1999) argues that a missing rate of 5% or less is insignificant. So that, series mean imputation was performed. Appendix - B shows, description of items in the questionnaire, means, standard deviation and number of missing values.

PCA with Direct Oblimin rotation was conducted to reduce 29 items into four factors. Barlett’s test of sphericity and the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO) Measure of Sampling Adequacy were used to check the degree of inter-correlations among the variables and the appropriateness for factor analysis. Bartlett’s Test of Sphericity was 6455.2 (P=000) and KMO measure of sampling adequacy was 0.919, indicating that correlation matrix was suitable for PCA (Leech et al., 2005). The examination of the factor loadings showed that 2 items (Q9 and Q10) factor loads fell below the 0.50 threshold and cross-loaded. After removing these two items, Second PCA was conducted. In pattern matrix item Q8’s factor load fell below 0.50, therefore it was removed. Third PCA revealed a clear structure and defined items were observed to be grouped under theoretically defined factor. Table 1 shows the result of the third PCA.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Factor 1</th>
<th>Factor2</th>
<th>Factor3</th>
<th>Factor4</th>
<th>Var%</th>
<th>C. A</th>
<th>I-I</th>
<th>I-T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F&amp;B Establishments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>0,692</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14.028</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>0.615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>0,725</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>0,660</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>0,527</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5</td>
<td>0,702</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q6</td>
<td>0,663</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q7</td>
<td>0,515</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.481</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Food and Beverages |          |         |         |         |      |      |     |     |
| Q11             | 0,576    |         |         |         | 15.727 | 0.86 | 0.47 | 0.580 |
| Q12             | 0,733    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.700 |
| Q13             | 0,750    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.667 |
| Q14             | 0,749    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.646 |
| Q15             | 0,690    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.680 |
| Q16             | 0,584    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.516 |
| Q17             | 0,640    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.609 |

| F&B Staff |          |         |         |         |      |      |     |     |
| Q18         | 0,528    |         |         |         | 13.992 | 0.87 | 0.48 | 0.613 |
| Q19         | 0,591    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.643 |
| Q20         | 0,712    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.713 |
| Q21         | 0,688    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.495 |
| Q22         | 0,761    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.711 |
| Q23         | 0,706    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.698 |
| Q24         | 0,600    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.617 |

| Other Components |          |         |         |         |      |      |     |     |
| Q25         | 0,648    |         |         |         | 11.212 | 0.79 | 0.43 | 0.519 |
| Q26         | 0,702    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.543 |
| Q27         | 0,734    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.645 |
| Q28         | 0,718    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.587 |
| Q29         | 0,686    |         |         |         |       |      |     | 0.518 |

Var: Variance extracted, C.A.: Cronbach’s Alpha, I-I: Inter-Items correlations, I-T: Item-Total correlations

Total data variances explained of factors are as follows: Food and beverage establishments 14.03%, food and beverages 15.73%, food and beverage staff 14%, and other gastronomic components 11.21%. Thus,
these four factors explain approximately 55% of the total data variance.

For hierarchical clustering analysis (HCA), Ward’s method was applied and Squared Euclidean distance measure was used. This technique helps to group items in a way that maximizes the similarity within clusters (Cebeci, 2016:2). In the analysis, 26 items were included since 3 items were removed in PCA due to the low factor loads and cross-loads. Table-2 shows the cluster membership result and Figure shows the Ward’s Method dendrogram.

Table 2: Cluster Membership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster 1 F&amp;B Establishments</th>
<th>Cluster 2 Food and Beverages</th>
<th>Cluster 3 Other Components</th>
<th>Cluster 4 F&amp;B Staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q11</td>
<td>Q27</td>
<td>Q22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q12</td>
<td>Q29</td>
<td>Q23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q13</td>
<td>Q28</td>
<td>Q24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5</td>
<td>Q15</td>
<td>Q25</td>
<td>Q18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q6</td>
<td>Q17</td>
<td>Q26</td>
<td>Q19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q14</td>
<td></td>
<td>Q20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q7</td>
<td>Q16</td>
<td></td>
<td>Q21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1: Ward’s Method Dendrogram

According to dendrogram shown in Figure-1, items were grouped into four different clusters. Cluster membership results are exactly the same to PCA results. Hereby, the cluster analysis confirmed the four theoretically predicted factors - the fixed numbers of factors to extract - in PCA.

For the normal distribution, skewness and kurtosis values of each item in the scales were analyzed. It has been noted that for each item, skewness and kurtosis should not exceed ±2.0 (Field, 2013; Larson-Hall, 2015; Tabachnick & Fidell, 2007). The average inter-item correlation coefficients give information about how scale items are related to each other. It is undesirable that the scale items have a high correlation with each other. According to Neuendorf (2011), the average inter-item correlation coefficients should be close to 0.40 - 0.50 with a high alpha coefficient. Ferketch (1991) recommended that corrected item-total correlations should range between .30 and .70 for a good scale. The results of inter-item correlations and item-total correlations are given in Table 1.

PCA and HCA results were tested by first order confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). For construct reliability, average variance extracted (AVE) and discriminant analysis were evaluated. The fit of the model
was evaluated using Chi-square (CMIN), the ratio of the Chi-square to the degrees of freedom (CMIN/DF), Goodness-of-fit index (GFI), Comparative fit index (CFI), and Root Mean Squared Error Approximation (RMSEA). The fit indices suggested by Hair et al. (2016) were used to evaluate the model adequacy. According to Hair et al. (2016) for sample of 250 and over, CMIN/DF values less than or equals 3 indicates a good model fit, and between 3 and 5 is an acceptable level. CFI and GFI values should be greater than 0.9 and RMSEA values less than 0.08 indicate good fit.

After CFA was performed, factor loads were observed from the standardized regression coefficients table. It was seen that the factor loadings varied between 0.55 and 0.77 in the standardized regression coefficients of scale. According to Hair et al. (2016), factor loadings of 0.50 and greater are considered very significant in practice. Then, the fit indices of CFA were examined. CMIN/DF was 3.527, GFI was 0.86, CFI was 0.86 and RMSEA was 0.07. Covariance between errors terms were examined in modification indices. After a few covariance treatments made model fit obtained good values. The results of the goodness-of-fit of the final modified of the model showed that CMIN/DF was 2.874, CFI was 0.91, GFI was 0.88, and RMSEA was 0.06. Appendix-A shows the adequacy of the final modified of the model.

Table – 3 shows confirmatory factor analysis item reliability, construct reliability and average variance extracted. Construct reliability is a superior reliability analysis that illustrates standardized regression weights and measurement correlation errors for each item (Peterson & Kim, 2013). According to Hair et al. (2016), the construct reliability coefficient of 0.70 and above indicates good reliability. The construct reliability of the factors is between 0.79 and 0.87. However, AVE values of factors are below 0.50. Fornell and Larcker (1981) state that if the AVE value is less than 0.50, but the CR is above 0.60, the construct validity is still sufficient. In addition, all calculated t-values were statistically significant (p<0.01). It was found that the correlations between the factors were not higher than the square root of AVE value so that the discriminant validity was ensured.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Item reliability</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>AVE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Factor loading</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>t-values</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food and Beverage Establishments</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>0.65 **</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q5</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q6</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q7</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food and Beverages</td>
<td>Q11</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q12</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q13</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q14</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q15</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q16</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q17</td>
<td>0.70 **</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Q18</td>
<td>0.71 **</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q19</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q20</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q21</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q22</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q23</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q24</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Gastronomic Components</td>
<td>Q25</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q26</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q27</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q28</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q29</td>
<td>0.60 **</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**fixed parameter, *p<0.01**

**CONCLUSION**

The increasing importance of gastronomic components for destinations encourages tourism researchers to study on these issues. Henceforth, studies focusing on tourists’ satisfaction with their gastronomic experience will increase without a doubt. This study aimed to measure structure validity of a scale used for gastronomy experience perception in a destination. It is quite obvious that the gastronomy experience in a destination is influenced by more than one factor. After PCA and HCA revealed a clear structure of four factors obtained, first-order confirmatory factor analysis validated four-factor gastronomy experience scale. It has been observed that the results of the PCA and Ward’s method showed compatibility. However, based on the results, it is not possible to say that either model is fully compatible. It is important to highlight that the findings of this study are limited to the scale created by the author and research sample. Thus, researcher suggests further research because further research about gastronomy experience in a destination could use different approaches attempting to compare the factor structure of gastronomy experience. In addition, the relationship between the 4-factor structure obtained in this study and the different variables such as perceived satisfaction or revisit in destinations should be examined. In this study, Ward’s Method which is one of the hierarchical cluster analyzes is used as supportive of exploratory factor analysis. After performing exploratory factor analysis with the fixed number of a factor based on the theoretical framework, it may be useful to verify the number of factors with Ward’s method. In this study, this role of Ward’s Method does not provide sufficient evidence. Therefore, it is necessary to carry out many studies examining the relationship between exploratory factor analysis and hierarchical clustering analysis in the field of social sciences. In the future, researchers may associate this scale with different variables. Moreover, researchers may add or remove items from this scale for future studies.

**REFERENCES**


Harrington, R. J., & Ottenbacher, M. C. (2010). Culinary tourism—a case study of the gastronomic
## Appendix B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Dv.</th>
<th>M. Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>F&amp;B Establishments They place a great emphasis on service quality</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>The service is fast at the restaurants</td>
<td>3.68</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Menu is satisfying (understandability, variety, age group)</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Menu includes local foods.</td>
<td>4.04</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5</td>
<td>Communal and individual areas, along with its fittings (corridors, central heating, etc.) are in a good state of repair</td>
<td>3.76</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q6</td>
<td>Communal and individual areas are clean</td>
<td>3.65</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q7</td>
<td>All areas are well indicated with signs</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q8</td>
<td>Internal decoration(furniture, ceilings, lightings, floors, etc.) is pleasant, simple, homey and in harmony with the local culture*</td>
<td>3.83</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q9</td>
<td>External decoration (buildings, gardens, etc.) is attractive and in harmony with the local culture*</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q10</td>
<td>The music is compatible with identity of the restaurant*</td>
<td>3.65</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11</td>
<td>Food served at the restaurants are healthy</td>
<td>3.72</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q12</td>
<td>Food served at the restaurants are delicious</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q13</td>
<td>Food served at the restaurants are nutritious</td>
<td>3.78</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q14</td>
<td>The portions are big enough</td>
<td>3.98</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q15</td>
<td>The ingredients of meals are fresh</td>
<td>3.76</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q16</td>
<td>Price of items on the menus are reasonable</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q17</td>
<td>Presentation of food is nice and appetizing</td>
<td>3.95</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q18</td>
<td>Staff know their job, do it well and do not make mistakes</td>
<td>3.42</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q19</td>
<td>Staff treat us politely and with warmth</td>
<td>3.79</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q20</td>
<td>Staff give us good advice regarding gastronomy of the place</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q21</td>
<td>Staff speak foreign languages</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q22</td>
<td>Staff look well-groomed and dressed</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q23</td>
<td>Staff pay attention to personal hygiene</td>
<td>3.51</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q24</td>
<td>Staff have knowledge on the menu</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q25</td>
<td>Destination has many gastronomic products (wines, candies, spices, etc.) other than dishes</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q26</td>
<td>Destination has gastronomic activities to attract tourists</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q27</td>
<td>Gastronomic products are tasteful and high quality in general</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q28</td>
<td>Gastronomic products’ prices are reasonable in general</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q29</td>
<td>Gastronomic products represent destination</td>
<td>3.98</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Std. Dv: Standard Deviation, M. Value: Missing value, * Deleted due to the low factor loading
Corporate Social Responsibility Activities in Food and Beverage Enterprises: The Case of Eskişehir

Duran CANKUL
Assist.Prof.Dr., Eskişehir Osmangazi University
dcankul@ogu.edu.tr

Selçuk YÜCESOY
Eskişehir Osmangazi University
selcukyucesoy@yandex.com

ABSTRACT
The aim of this study is determine to level of corporate social responsibility activities of food and beverage enterprises which are operating in Eskişehir and they having the capacity to implement their corporate social responsibilities. For this purpose, quantitative data collection method was used in the research. The population of the research consists of food and beverage enterprises in Eskişehir. However, in order to have the conditions to fulfill corporate social responsibility activities, food and beverage enterprises with a capacity of less than 50 people were excluded from the research universe and 57 food and beverage enterprises were selected for the research sample. The obtained data were described by calculating arithmetic mean and standard deviation values as well as frequency and percentage distributions. The results show that food and beverage establishments in Eskişehir implement their social responsibilities towards the state so much, but they do not implement excessively their social responsibilities towards suppliers and subcontractors.

Keywords: Social Responsibility, Corporate Social Responsibility, Food and Beverage Enterprises, Eskişehir.

INTRODUCTION
Businesses have same basic objectives like; make a profit, survive, grow and to carry out social responsibility activities. For many businesses, the most important of these basic objectives are increase to profits. Nowadays, it is not possible for companies that focus only on profit and ignore their social responsibilities to succeed in competitive conditions. Especially with globalization, the competitive structures of the markets in which the enterprises operate are getting difficult. In order to effectively meet the consumer needs of businesses are necessary to increase the quality, reliability and product diversity of the products and to extend the services it provides to customers.

In the competitive environment experienced in food and beverage businesses, consumers now prefer enterprises that are sensitive to social problems (Reich, Xu and McCleary, 2010). In this context, food and beverage businesses carry out corporate social responsibility projects to ensure the loyalty of existing customers and to attract potential customers. In this research conducted in Eskişehir. Firstly, information about the concept of corporate social responsibility was given and then corporate social responsibility activities were mentioned. In the last part of the study, social responsibility application areas of food and beverage enterprises were investigated.

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK
The literature on social responsibility (SR) term was first used in a book in 1953 by H. Bowen book which is Social Responsibilities of the Businessman. In the first literature Corporate Social Responsibilities (CSR), were called as a social responsibility activities. Because at this time, today's modern companies are not at forefront of the business world (Carroll, 1999:268). Although the concept of corporate social responsibility is not a new concept in the literature, this subject has been given great importance recently in scientific studies (Aktan, 2007:11). The concept of corporate social responsibility was first discussed economically and it was attempt to determine the extent of responsibilities. However, the researches made in the following years suggested that the issue is not only about the economic dimension but also there are different dimensions than the economic dimension (Carroll, 1991;1999).
Today, it is seen that there are quite different definitions of corporate social responsibility in the literature. A few of these definitions are described below. But first of all, it will be useful to examine the definitions of international organizations about corporate social responsibility.

According to European Commission, corporate social responsibility is voluntary integration of businesses with social and environmental issues, organizational activities and interactions with social stakeholders (Commission of the European Communities, 2001:6). The European Commission considers CSR as a voluntary activity rather than fulfilling legal requirements.

The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) addresses that corporate social responsibility in the context of how businesses relate to the needs and goals of a society.

Social responsibility is desire to use the resources of society not only for the interests of private individuals or institutions, but for interests and benefits of society (Frederick, 1960: 60).

According to Davis and Blomstrom (1966), social responsibility is the obligation to consider the effects of one’s decisions and actions on the whole social system. Business people carry out social responsibility activities when they consider the needs of people who may be affected by business actions. In conducting social responsibility activities, business people look beyond the economic and technical interests of their companies.

Corporate social responsibility is a concept in which companies have an obligation beyond the stipulated by law and union agreements to shareholders and other groups in the society. In this definition, two aspects of corporate social responsibility are emphasized. The first is the obligation must be voluntarily accepted. The behavior affected by the coercive forces of law or the union contract is not a social responsibility behavior. The second one; obligations of the business provide a service beyond the traditional business of the business to social groups such as customers, employees, suppliers and other communities (Jones, 1980: 59-60).

As seen in the description made social responsibility, the company is more than a concept that only the applications that will satisfy their shareholders. Social responsibility goes beyond the interests of shareholders in enterprises; it is a set of activities that help increase the profits of customers, employees, partners, investors and communities (Anderson ve Bieniaszewkska, 2005:7).

First CSR practices in Turkey is modern application brought by multinational companies (Ararat, 2008: 255). However, when the practical aspect of the work is examined, it is seen that since Seljuk period Turkish society has adopted a strong institutional philanthropy tradition and an institutional mechanism which was called the foundation. Even today, this traditional practice seems to be continuing. Today, family companies have established foundations and allocated some of their profits to these foundations in order to realize social assistance. When CSR activities of foundations are examined, educational expenditures, construction of hospitals, art or cultural centers are the areas where these foundations frequently perform CSR activities (Turker, 2008: 412).

**REASONS FOR THE FORMATION OF CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY**

Today, the formation of a discreet consumer and investor profile, increased sensitivity to nature, globalization and international standards become clearer, states are sometimes inadequate on some issues; the expectations of the information age group from the private sectors increased. This situation forces businesses to change. The factors that increase the social responsibility practices of enterprises are as follows (Robbins, 1994: 122):

- **Public expectations**: Today’s society expects not only economic expectations from enterprises, but also social expectations beyond economic expectations.
- **Long-term profitability**: Businesses carrying out social responsibility activities find consumers safer in long-term investments.
- **Ethical responsibility**: Businesses are socially responsible for the environment in which they operate, while voluntary social actions are the right actions to take.
- **Public image**: Businesses have a positive public image through social responsibility activities.
- **Environmental awareness**: Businesses carry out activities to protect nature through social activities.
- **Support to state intervention**: Enterprises are undertaking social responsibility projects in place of states and reducing the investments of the state in social areas.
- **Equalization of responsibility and power balance**: They balance the power of enterprises with the social responsibilities they undertake. Thus, negative behaviors that may be created by companies holding power are prevented.
Shareholder interests: Stock prices of enterprises undertaking social responsibility activities increase in the long run.

Availability of required resources: Businesses sometimes have the necessary resources to support social projects and support the projects they need with their own resources.

Prevention: The necessity of resolving social problems that will pose a great risk in the future without overgrowing causes enterprises to mobilize their social projects.

APPLICATION AREAS OF CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY

Responsibilities to Nature
When some businesses engage in an activity that affects the external environment, the enterprise distorts the environment in various ways. For instance, the formation of waste heaps from a mining operation adversely affects the environment. In this respect, the determination of risks related to environmental threats in the production of goods and services, production processes for the benefit of the public or the environment can facilitate the design of goods or services (Mitroff, 1994: 102).

Some international companies voluntarily carry out environmental practices even in the absence of legal sanctions on the environment. Considering the factors that lead businesses to act voluntarily; the structure of the market in which they operate, non-governmental organizations, media or investor pressures, the image of the business, competition, and the desire to act proactively against possible environmental disasters (Acutt, Ross and O’Riordam, 2004).

Responsibilities to Consumers
Consumers are one of the most important stakeholders of an enterprise in order to ensure the continuity of an enterprise. Therefore, it is of great importance for enterprises to fulfill their responsibilities towards consumers in full in terms of continuity (Bayraktaroğlu, İltér and Tanyeri, 2009: 19). Consumers seem to consider three factors, especially in terms of products and services. These are health, trust and quality (Bartol and Martin, 1994: 106-107).

For example; Volkswagen, Europe's largest automobile manufacturer, acknowledged that the US diesel vehicles distorted the results of emissions tests and they recalled 11 million vehicles (Özpeynirci, 2015). According to some analysts, Volkswagen's decision will cost the company more than 6.5 billion dollars. But in terms of legal sanctions and the image of the company, Volkswagen had to make this decision.

Responsibilities to Employees
The most basic stakeholder for businesses is their employees. Businesses with no employees, unhappy or inefficient employees cannot be expected to succeed. Therefore, the fact that the enterprises make their employees happy will provide them with more efficiency (Bayraktaroğlu, İltér and Tanyeri, 2009: 11).

Businesses have some responsibilities towards their employees. Some of these responsibilities are; determine the appropriate wage level according to the standard of living, provide job satisfaction and improve working conditions, provide working environment where human relations are valuable, support career development with vocational training, create healthy working environments (Torlak, 2001: 52). Corporate social responsibility movements against workers’ rights began in the 1990s. Since 90s, many companies have accelerated their efforts to improve labor practices and workers’ rights on global scale (Hoepner and Yu, 2008: 23).

Responsibilities to Society
Businesses are part of the society in which they live. Many businesses think they have responsibilities to local communities and the community. However, it is difficult to determine exactly what these responsibilities cover. Businesses think that they create value for society by providing employment, paying taxes and minimizing negative environmental impacts in production. However, some enterprises are directly involved in social activities. For instance, educational aids and donations, concerts, festivals, sports events and so on. In addition, some businesses show respect for local culture, traditions and customs and have some practices to protect these cultures (Pedersen, 2010: 160). For instance; within the framework of the "Kız Haydi Kızlar Okula" campaign initiated by Turkcell and the Association for Supporting Contemporary Life, 150.000 girls were educated in two years (Bayraktaroğlu, İltér and Tanyeri, 2009: 15). Coca-Cola 250.000 dollars for this campaign, İbrahim Etem Ulagay pharmaceutical factory 100.000 dollars, UNICEF 420.000 dollars, Professor. Dr. İhsan Doğramaci personally contributed 125,000 dollars (www.unicef.org, 2016).
Responsibilities to the State
Among the stakeholders of the enterprises, the state is the most powerful system. The state regulator and the state having legal sanction power directly affect the existence and activities of the enterprises. However, the decisions of some powerful enterprises can also affect states (Ak, 2016: 20).

Responsibilities to Suppliers
Businesses need suppliers to perform on their activities. Responsibilities towards suppliers include supporting suppliers in developing countries (Leiberwitz, 2005: 5). The enterprises that supply the raw materials and services required for the production of goods offered by enterprises to the market are very important in terms of the success of enterprise in the market (Bakırtaş, 2005).

Using the power of enterprises, price pressure on suppliers, corruption in the purchase of raw materials, failure to act in accordance with the agreements, the establishment of cartels and endangering the assets of suppliers are important ethical problems between enterprises and suppliers (Aydemir, 2009: 13).

Social Responsibilities to Competitors
Businesses must compete against their competitors within the framework of fair competition rules. Unethical pricing, efforts to exclude other companies from the market, their agreement with each other in order to be stronger, act together in the market, causing unfair competition and damaging other businesses. Businesses are in direct relationship with businesses that provide goods and services and companies that buy goods and services in the production process. In addition to these enterprises, it is necessary to act responsibly towards competing companies during their activities. Moving with the aim of eliminating other businesses in the same market, the enterprise will become a monopoly. Eliminating competing competitors or using competition irresponsibly as a force may also cause harm for the country. (Steel, 2004: 12).

Responsibilities to Shareholders
Another issue that falls within the scope of social responsibility is responsibility of the enterprise and managers to shareholders or owners of capital. According to Rok (2001: 32), CSR is the philosophy of conducting production and service activities in order to establish lasting and positive relations with all stakeholders. Social responsibilities to shareholders may include accurate registration of accounts, realistic calculation of profit and loss, and failure to provide unrealistic missing or misleading information to shareholders in terms of investments, activities and plans (Ak, 2016: 19). According to the principle of transparency in accounting, companies aim to be transparent to interest groups. In this regard, businesses should comply with accounting standards, basic policies, goals and values should be shared with the public clearly (Özkol, Çelik and Gönen, 2005: 139).

METHOD
Purpose of the Research
This research was carried out to determine the corporate social responsibility practices of food and beverage establishments in Eskişehir as a tourist destination.

The questionnaire used in the research; Türker (2009), Oberseder et al. (2013), Pérez and Bosque (2013), Alvarado et al. (2015), Moisescu (2015), Akremi et al. (2018), developed a current and more comprehensive scale consisting of 7 dimensions. Thus, it was tried to determine the purpose (economic, ethical, legal, voluntary) corporate social responsibility activities of the enterprises within the scope of the sample. The scale consists of 67 expressions and 7 dimensions. 10 of the 67 statements are to employees of the enterprise, 13 to customers, 9 to state, 6 to competitors, 10 to the environment, 10 to the community in which the enterprise lives and 8 to the suppliers and subcontractors of the enterprise to determine the dimensions of responsibility. There is also a dimension of responsibility to the shareholders, which are composed of the above-mentioned scales and generally composed of 8 statements, but this dimension is not included in the survey since the companies operating in Eskişehir do not have shares in the commodity exchanges. Cronbach’s Alpha value, which indicates the overall reliability ratio of the scale, is 0.96. When each of the dimensions is examined separately, the reliability coefficient of corporate social responsibility for employees is 0.94, 0.93 for customers, 0.99 for government, 0.94 for competitors, 0.96 for competitors, corporate social responsibility for society 0.96, corporate social responsibility for society and the social responsibility dimension to suppliers and subcontractors was 0.98.
Findings of Food and Beverage Enterprises Subject to Research

57 food and beverage establishments, one middle or top manager answered the questionnaire. The data obtained are shown in Table 1. According to the data, 47 enterprises have a capacity to accommodate more than 100 people. The enterprises participating in the survey are relatively young. 37 enterprises have a year of activity less than 10 years and the majority of the enterprises employ 20-40 employees. While the enterprises have a second branch or branches, these enterprises are generally composed of luxurious restaurants.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capacity (person)</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Activity Year</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Personal number</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>11-20</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>51-100</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>17,5</td>
<td>1-5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>31,6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7,0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101-200</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>50,9</td>
<td>6-10</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>33,3</td>
<td>21-30</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>28,1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>201-300</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>24,6</td>
<td>11-15</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>7,0</td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>33,3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>301-400</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3,5</td>
<td>16-20</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>41,0</td>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>28,1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-600</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3,5</td>
<td>21-30</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5,3</td>
<td>51-40</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3,5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>5,3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5,3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant Type</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Other Branch</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lux Restaurant</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>35,1</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>26,3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Class</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>28,1</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>73,7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Class</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14,0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cafeteria</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>22,8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Corporate Social Responsibility Practices Analysis Results

Within the scope of the example, corporate social responsibility activities performed in food and beverage establishments in Eskişehir were measured with a scale of 67 statements. The scale has seven basic dimensions of corporate social responsibility. The results of the analysis and standard deviations regarding the means of corporate social responsibility and dimensions are presented in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>$\bar{x}$</th>
<th>$\sigma$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social responsibility to employees</td>
<td>5,72</td>
<td>.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social responsibility to customers</td>
<td>6,10</td>
<td>.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social responsibility to the state</td>
<td>6,13</td>
<td>.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social responsibility to competitors</td>
<td>5,41</td>
<td>.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social responsibility to the environment</td>
<td>5,64</td>
<td>.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social responsibility to society</td>
<td>5,81</td>
<td>.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social responsibility to suppliers and subcontractors</td>
<td>5,13</td>
<td>1,26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the results of the analysis conducted to determine the corporate social responsibility activities performed in the food and beverage establishments surveyed, the highest average is the responsibility towards the state (6,13). The end result of legal regulations and sanctions or violations of the law is considered as a natural consequence of the highest average in this dimension due to the risks that may be encountered. The second is corporate social responsibility to customers with an average of 6,10. At this point, it can be said that food and beverage businesses operating in Eskişehir perform more customer-oriented at social responsibility practices. In the research, it is seen that the least average dimension (5.13) is corporate social responsibility practices against suppliers and subcontractors. It has been observed that food and beverage establishments in Eskişehir are insensitive about whether their corporate social responsibilities are carried out outside their own businesses. In order to better understand the responses to deviations and expressions, it is not enough to comment on average. Therefore, it is useful to examine frequency distributions of answers.
The average and frequency distributions of the food and beverage enterprises in Eskişehir and participating in the survey questions are shown in the tables below. According to the tables below, the top and middle managers who answered the questionnaire generally answered the questions positively.

**Table 3: Responsibility Dimension of Employees of Food and Beverage Enterprises**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsibility to Employees</th>
<th>1 (%)</th>
<th>2 (%)</th>
<th>3 (%)</th>
<th>4 (%)</th>
<th>5 (%)</th>
<th>6 (%)</th>
<th>7 (%)</th>
<th>( \bar{x} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our business provides a variety to improve the quality of life of its employees.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees in our company are provided with a reasonable salary to maintain acceptable quality of life.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>40.4</td>
<td>45.8</td>
<td>5.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company offers a safe and healthy working environment to all employees.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>5.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business supports employees who wish to receive additional training.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business provides opportunities for those who want to improve their skills in the profession.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>50.9</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business management is primarily concerned with the needs and desires of employees.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>43.9</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>5.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management decisions regarding the employees of our company are fair.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>5.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company is against all forms of discrimination (age, gender, disability, ethnic or religious origin) in recruitment and promotion policies.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>50.9</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>5.82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company applies flexible policies to provide a good work and life balance to its employees.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>56.1</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>5.82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Corporate Social responsibility dimension of the employees in the first part of the survey is examined, 72% of the food and beverage managers in Eskişehir state that they are against all kinds of discrimination in recruitment and promotion policies. 86.2% of the managers think that their employees are given a reasonable salary. Managers stated that 42.1% agree and 12.3% strongly agree that they make various and indirect contributions to improve the quality of life of their employees. During the surveys, it is seen that this practice is usually performed in form of football competitions with colleagues, dinners that go along with those who work on work or leave days, or organizations that are described as personnel nights. 86.3% of the respondents think that they give a reasonable salary to the employees. Participants state that they are against all kinds of discrimination in recruitment and promotion policies and one of the biggest averages in this dimension is in this expression (50.9% agree, 21.1% strongly agree). Similarly, managers stated that they acted fairly in equal opportunities.
Table 4. Responsibility Dimension of Food and Beverage Enterprises to Customers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsibilities to Customers</th>
<th>1 (%)</th>
<th>2 (%)</th>
<th>3 (%)</th>
<th>4 (%)</th>
<th>5 (%)</th>
<th>6 (%)</th>
<th>7 (%)</th>
<th>( \bar{x} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One of the basic principles of our business is to provide high quality products to its customers.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>6.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our products comply with national and international standards.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>52.6</td>
<td>29.8</td>
<td>6.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The service quality of our company is the most advantageous choice in the market.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>43.9</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>6.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company offers complete and accurate information about its products to customers.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>35.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business respects consumer rights beyond legal requirements.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>38.6</td>
<td>45.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer satisfaction is very important for our business.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business responds to the complaints of customers.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>50.9</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>6.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business is known as a reputable and reliable company.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>47.5</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>6.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company attaches importance to making its products and / or services accessible to all customers.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>29.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company regularly checks the quality of goods or services offered to customers.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>57.9</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>6.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company strives to identify customer needs.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>57.9</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>5.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our customer satisfaction as an indicator of business leadership in the market base is situated.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>61.4</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business invests in innovations to customer advantages.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>54.4</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>6.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As can be seen in Table 4, the highest average dimension is corporate social responsibility practices towards customers. It is understood that managers give importance to statements in this dimension. Providing high quality products for 84.2% of managers is the basic principle of the company. The fact that quality is so important in the food and beverage sector is seen as a natural result. Similarly, managers state that their products meet standards. In the case of human health, the application of hygiene and sanitation rules is seen as both a legal and conscientious responsibility. Similarly, 84.2% of managers perceive this responsibility as a conscientious responsibility rather than legal responsibilities. It is the expression of the managers who have the least average of the statements in this dimension to invest in innovation. 24.6% of managers stated that they partially participated in innovation investments. Technological innovation is widely used in food and beverage establishments. It is seen that these practices create competitive advantage in food and beverage enterprises by creating differences compared to competitors (Cankül et al. 2018: 576). It can be said that approximately \( \frac{1}{4} \) of the food and beverage business is somewhat reluctant to innovate because of the investment cost.

Table 5. Responsibility Dimension of Food and Beverage Enterprises to the Government

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsibilities to the State</th>
<th>1 (%)</th>
<th>2 (%)</th>
<th>3 (%)</th>
<th>4 (%)</th>
<th>5 (%)</th>
<th>6 (%)</th>
<th>7 (%)</th>
<th>( \bar{x} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our business according to the needs of society schools, hospitals etc. provides support to institutions / organizations.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>54.4</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>6.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business contributes to campaigns and projects aimed at increasing the welfare of society.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>29.8</td>
<td>6.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company is trying to create employment opportunities.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>57.9</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>6.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company pays its taxes regularly and continuously.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>63.2</td>
<td>22.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company applies legal regulations completely and timely.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>56.1</td>
<td>29.8</td>
<td>6.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business is trying to help the state to solve social problems.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>56.1</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>6.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company acts in accordance with the law in all matters.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>68.4</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>6.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The main principle of our business is honesty in every work done.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>5.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
On the other hand, corporate social responsibilities to the state are the highest average corporate social responsibility practices. The statements in this section are generally very positive. 91.3% of the managers stated that they applied the regulations completely and timely. Similarly, 91.2% of the managers stated that they were trying to create employment opportunities. It was a pleasing conclusion that the statements in this dimension were supported by the administrators both as a legal sanction and some statements in the dimension beyond the conscientious law.

Table 6: Responsibility Dimension of Food and Beverage Enterprises to Competitors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsibilities to Competitors</th>
<th>1 (%)</th>
<th>2 (%)</th>
<th>3 (%)</th>
<th>4 (%)</th>
<th>5 (%)</th>
<th>6 (%)</th>
<th>7 (%)</th>
<th>x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our company competes with its competitors in an ethical framework.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>38.6</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>5.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business has a competitive pricing policy.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business always avoids unfair competition.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business does not take any negative propaganda against its competitors.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>29.8</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company takes an attitude against all kinds of monopolization.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>38.6</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>5.71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the fourth part of questionnaire, responses to the statements of social responsibility towards the competitors had a less average than the first three dimensions. 61.4% of managers do not hesitate to cooperate with their competitors in social responsibility projects. 52.6% of the managers stated that they avoided unfair competition. Again, at a level approaching this rate (50.8%), they stated that they did not engage in negative propaganda against their competitors. Again, 54.4% of the managers stated that they were against monopolization. The consistent validation of the answers given to the statements in this section proves that the questionnaire was compiled correctly.

Table 7: Responsibility Dimension of Food and Beverage Enterprises to Natural Environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsibilities to the Natural Environment</th>
<th>1 (%)</th>
<th>2 (%)</th>
<th>3 (%)</th>
<th>4 (%)</th>
<th>5 (%)</th>
<th>6 (%)</th>
<th>7 (%)</th>
<th>x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our company participates in activities aimed at preserving and improving the quality of the natural environment.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In order to reduce the negative environmental impact, our company has the necessary equipment.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29.8</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business makes well planned investments to prevent environmental degradation.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>45.6</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business aims to achieve sustainable growth that takes future generations into consideration.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>52.6</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>5.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company realizes applications that reduce energy consumption.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>50.9</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company realizes applications to reduce carbon emissions.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>56.1</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business invests in environmentally friendly technology and renewable energy.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>50.9</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company takes care to use only the necessary natural resources in product production.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>43.9</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>5.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our facility tries to recycle waste materials appropriately</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>54.4</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>5.77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to statements of the survey on the corporate social responsibility dimension towards the natural environment, it is seen that 64.9% of the executives implement practices that reduce energy consumption. The reason why this ratio is not higher is thought to be due to the high energy consumption required to provide a luxurious service. However, 64.9% is considered an acceptable level. 61.3% of the managers stated that they have the necessary equipment to reduce the negative environmental impacts of their businesses and 59.6% stated that they made investments to prevent environmental degradation.
Similarly to this result, 59.7% of the managers stated that they participated in activities aimed at protecting and improving the natural environment.

**Table 8: Responsibility Dimension of Food and Beverage Enterprises to Society**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsibilities to Society</th>
<th>1 (%)</th>
<th>2 (%)</th>
<th>3 (%)</th>
<th>4 (%)</th>
<th>5 (%)</th>
<th>6 (%)</th>
<th>7 (%)</th>
<th>( \bar{x} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our business conducts R&amp;D projects to increase the welfare of society in the future.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>61.4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business provides financial support to charities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>59.6</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company encourages employees to participate in voluntary social activities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>64.9</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business sponsors non-governmental organizations working in problematic areas.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>64.9</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>5.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business considers all warnings of non-governmental organizations.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>63.2</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business respects local values, traditions and local culture</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>19.1</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>5.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company produces its products with local product and raw material resources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>26.1</td>
<td>19.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company sponsors cultural programs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>70.2</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business training program sponsors are</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>52.6</td>
<td>24.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sixth part of the questionnaire is the corporate social responsibility of the enterprises against the society. These responsibilities do not have any legal sanctions and are the practices carried out entirely at the initiative of the enterprises. 84.2% of the managers stated that they were sponsoring cultural programs and 77.2% of them were sponsoring education programs. Similarly, 77.2% of the managers stated that they encourage their employees to participate voluntarily in social responsibility activities. Again, the majority of the managers (71.9%) stated that they donated to charities. The fact that the responses given to the statements in this dimension are generally positive shows that the value given to the social responsibility activities of the food and beverage enterprises in Eskişehir is high.

**Table 9: Responsibility Dimension of Food and Beverage Enterprises to Suppliers and Subcontractors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responsibilities to Suppliers and Subcontractors</th>
<th>1 (%)</th>
<th>2 (%)</th>
<th>3 (%)</th>
<th>4 (%)</th>
<th>5 (%)</th>
<th>6 (%)</th>
<th>7 (%)</th>
<th>( \bar{x} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our company tries to ensure that its suppliers and subcontractors respect the rules of law in their workplaces.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business attaches importance to the implementation of labor laws by all suppliers and subcontractors, wherever they may be.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our company does not make agreements with suppliers or subcontractors that do not comply with business laws.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>5.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business helps suppliers and subcontractors create a working environment that their employees have it.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business establishes open and honest communication with its suppliers and subcontractors.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>5.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business offers fair terms and conditions to its suppliers.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>5.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our business negotiates fairly with its suppliers.</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>5.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scale: 1 = Strongly Disagree, 7 = Strongly Agree

In the last part of the survey, the institutional responsibilities to the suppliers and subcontractors of the enterprise are the dimension which has the least average of the scale dimension means. More than half (56.1%) of enterprises try to ensure that their suppliers or subcontractors respect labor law. Again, 45.6% of these enterprises emphasize that they do not enter into agreements with suppliers or subcontractors who do not comply with labor law. Likewise, 45.6% of the managers stated that they helped suppliers and subcontractors to create a working environment that their employees had.
RESULT

The main purpose of this study is to determine the corporate social responsibility activity levels of food and beverage enterprises operating in Eskişehir Province of the corporate social responsibility practices, which are very important for the enterprises. In this context, 57 of the food and beverage establishments operating in Eskişehir were included in the sample. The survey technique was applied to the senior and middle level managers of these enterprises. In the survey, corporate social responsibility was measured through seven basic dimensions. The highest average of these dimensions is the social responsibility activities carried out against the state (6.13). According to this result, it can be said that food and beverage establishments operating in Eskişehir engage in social responsibility activities with legal concerns and implement practices within the scope of these responsibilities. Similar to this study, Akdoğan et al. 2011, Cingöz and Akdoğan, 2012 It is concluded that the enterprises in Kayseri Organized Industrial Zone perform social responsibility activities mainly due to legal concerns. In addition to this, it is seen that some of the regulations introduced by the government in the process of membership to OECD and European Union are shaping the activities of their enterprises in terms of corporate social responsibility (Ararat, 2008: 277).

In this survey conducted in Eskişehir. Corporate social responsibility dimension that food and beverage companies attach importance to is the responsibility of enterprises to customers with an average of 6.10. This means that food and beverage establishments carry out corporate social responsibility activities beyond legal factors and with some economic concerns. One of the main reasons for this situation is that corporate social responsibility practices may have a positive effect on the financial performance of enterprises. In some studies, it has been emphasized that social responsibility activities increase the competitiveness of enterprises and positively affect the financial performance of enterprises (Grigore, 2009: 95). Behind the corporate social responsibility of business activities they perform as volunteers operating in Turkey is thought to obtain some economic interests, they announced to the public through the media is seen as particularly large enterprises social responsibility activities. However, in Turkey, after the donations and help enterprises carry out activities, significant tax advantages to these businesses by the government are implemented. This situation differentiates the voluntary purpose of corporate social responsibility (Küskü & Fraser, 2004: 69). Sometimes there is a perception that the public is engaged in philanthropic initiatives in order to benefit from various tax reductions and exemptions.

This research conducted in Eskişehir is aimed at determining the situation. In future studies, new variables can be added to the research variables and models can be developed to determine the predecessors and results of corporate social responsibility. On the other hand, studies can be conducted on larger and different groups by increasing the sample. However, the enterprises included in the sample were selected from the food and beverage sector. However, corporate social responsibility is an issue that is also emphasized and emphasized by the enterprises located outside these sectors. Therefore, similar studies can be carried out in other sectors.

REFERENCES


Aktan, Coşkun, Can (2007), Kurumsal Sosyal Sorumluluk, İktisadi Girişim ve İş Ahlaki Derneği yayını, İstanbul.


Tourism Market Research of Antalya City Against Competitors in The Scope Of Destination Competitiveness

Mehmet BAHAR
Assist.Prof.Dr., Cappadocia University
mehmet.bahar@kapadokya.edu.tr

Nedim YÜZBAŞIOĞLU
Prof.Dr., Akdeniz University
nedimy@akdeniz.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The economies have begun to give more importance to tourism policies and strategies with the exponential increase in tourism mobility. Each country develops and implements policies and strategies to get a share of the tourism market. However, it is seen that regions, even cities, in the tourism industry are now competing with cities in other countries and with other cities in the country due to the increased concentration of tourism activity in some regions of the country. Accordingly, tourism strategies and policies have been developed on the basis of regions and cities. Therefore, the main purpose of this study is to determine the markets in Antalya, Istanbul, Izmir and Muğla in which area they are expert and to identify profits of the competition between these cities have. For this aim, Russia, Germany, Britain, Iran and Ukraine was selected for the study. These are the countries sending the most tourists to Turkey in 2018, and Shift-share analysis was performed by utilizing the tourist data (secondary data) of Antalya, Istanbul, Muğla and İzmir in 2013-2018. Thus, the weak areas of the four destinations used in the study will be identified and recommendation will be given to improve the weak areas of Antalya.

Keywords: Destination Competitiveness, Shift-Share Analysis, Antalya

INTRODUCTION

The economic impacts and size of the tourism sector accelerate the efforts of countries to develop tourism and achieve a strategic competitive position. Thus, the conditions of competitiveness in the sector are constantly changing. New services and new destinations are emerging as a result of increased competition in tourism sector. Destinations and new destination strategies and policies are becoming more important in terms of increasing the share of countries in tourism. One of the most striking changes in tourism and service sector since the early 1980s is the globalization of tourism. Over time, the activities of the tourism sector in regional or national clusters have shifted to global scale (Ritchie and Crouch, 2003). The global scale of today's tourism system and the globalization of the tourism sector brought together the importance of destinations. Countries that want to increase their share of tourism revenues have started to give more importance to their destinations. This development has brought destination competitiveness.

Countries that want to generate more income from tourism and plan to expand development throughout the country focus on destinations. Therefore, the competition in the tourism sector is based on destinations. Destination competition, which is defined as the ability of a destination to present and maintain the tourism product that will satisfy the tourists to the maximum extent, different from other destinations, with good quality and good (Bahar, 2005).

Tourism is a sector where the main input is human. For this reason, both tourists and tourism enterprises encounter problems in certain periods and they tend to change their routes and investments. Since the tourism sector provides high amounts of income for the countries' economy, countries are taking serious steps towards this sector. It is important to follow the return on investments, development and new trends of the sector and implement the necessary applications. , the main purpose of this study is to determine the markets in Antalya, Istanbul, Izmir and Muğla in which area they are expert and to identify profits of the competition between these cities have. Secondary data were used for this purpose. The weak areas of the four destinations in the study were identified, and recommendations were given to improve the weak areas of Antalya.
LITERATURE REVIEW

Competitiveness is defined as the ability of a destination to create and integrate high value-added products while maintaining its market position compared to its competitors (Hassan, 2000). According to Ritchie and Crouch (2003) competitiveness (a business, country or city) is generally both a relative (more competitive than what?) and a multifaceted concept (what are the distinctive qualities of being competitive?). Numerous studies have been conducted on destination competitiveness. These studies can be examined in three groups. Most of the studies in the first group (Ahmed and Krohn, 1990; Vanhove, 2002; Miller et al., 2008) are aimed at examining the competitive position of specific destinations. In the second group includes, destination positioning (Chacko, 1998), destination management systems (Baker et al., 1996), destination marketing (Buhalis, 2000), price competitiveness (Dwyer et al., 2002), destination environment (Mihalic, 2000), nature based strategic management of tourism (Huybers and Bennett, 2003). The third group of research (Crouch and Ritchie, 1999) includes models and theories for the development of destination competitiveness.

The Brazilian case can be used to explain how the competitiveness level of the destination varies according to the approaches used in research. Hypothetically, Brazil’s size, accessibility, broad territory and general awareness make Brazil a competitive destination among its South American neighbors, however Brazil’s competitiveness may be reduced if compared to other destinations such as Indonesia or Australia. In this context, the unique conditions of the tourism cities in our country affect the tourism mobility in these regions. The nationalities involved in this tourism activity that are also influenced by the unique characteristics of the city. In order to determine this, it is seen that shift-share analysis is used in the literature.

The shift-share analysis technique has been applied in tourism (Alavi and Yasin, 2000). The first study in the tourism sector, at the beginning and end of a particular analysis period, performed a typical margin analysis by measuring employment in the tourism industry in South Carolina for various sectors (such as air transport, museums, art galleries and golf courses) and then compared them with a benchmark. The growth that emerged during the period later turned into national growth, industry mix and competitive impact. The second study focused on the characteristics and dynamics of the tourism market for the four Middle East countries. In the third study, Sirakaya et al. (2002) examined the employment in the tourism industry using the shift-share technique. According to Sirakaya et al. (2002: 304), the shift-share technique is an alternative to econometric methods for policy makers who need a rapid analytical tool to assess the performance and composition of the tourism industry. Yasin et al. (2004) analyzed the growth in the number of tourists from five major destinations (Portugal, Spain, France, Italy and Greece) from four major regions of the world (America, Europe, East Asia and Oceania, others) between 1992 and 1996.

METHOD

In the study, shift-share analysis was conducted by using the number of tourists arrivals to Turkey by cities within the scope of 2013-2018 periods. It is a different version of the shift-share analysis technique developed by Esteban-Marquillas (1972) and used by Alavi and Yasin (2000) to measure the growth in the number of tourists in the Middle East region (Egypt, Israel, Jordan and Syria). In the study, shift-share analysis was used to determine the growth and change in the number of tourist arrivals from Russia, Germany, England, Iran and Ukraine (the countries with the highest number of tourists according to nationality in 2018) to Antalya, Istanbul, Muğla and İzmir.

The shift-share equation for the tourist received of city (j) from the region (i) is obtained as follows:

\[ T^1_{ij} - T^0_{ij} = T^0_{ij}(G_{AREA}) + T^0_{ij}(G_{iAREA} - G_{AREA}) + T^1_{ij}(G_{ij} - G_{iAREA}) + (T^0_{ij} - T^1_{ij})(G_{ij} - G_{iAREA}) \]

The terms of the above equations are defined as follows;

- \( T^1_{ij} \) = Number of tourists visiting city (j) from region (i) for the 1st period.
- \( T^0_{ij} \) = Number of tourists visiting city (j) from region (i) for the 0th period.
- \( G_{AREA} \) = Overall growth rate of the total number of tourists arrivals from all regions from 0 period to 1 period.
- \( T^0_j \) = Total number of tourists visiting city (j) from all regions in period 0.
- \( T^0_{iAREA} \) = Total number of tourists arrivals to area from the region (i) in the 0th period.
- \( T^1_{iAREA} \) = Total number of tourists arrivals to area from the region (i) in the 1st period.
\( G_{\text{AREA}} \) = Growth rate of the number of tourists arrivals to area from region (i) from 0 period to 1 period.

\( G_{ij} \) = Growth rate of the number of tourists arriving to city (j) from region (i) in 0th period to 1st period.

\( T_{ij} \) = When the number of tourists from the region (i) is equal to that of the comparators; it represents the number of tourists from region (i) to city (j).

According to this equation, the real growth in the number of tourists arrivals from the region (j) to the city (i) from 0 period to 1 period is divided into four components. These components;

- **Area effect** \( [T^0_{ij} (G_{\text{AREA}})] \). This effect measures the change in the rate of change in the expected number of tourists in a city with an equal growth rate compared to the city in which it is compared. The field effect shows the share of that city in tourism compared to the cities in which it is compared.

- **Region mix effect** \( [T^0_{ij} (G_{\text{AREA}} - G_{\text{AREA}})] \). This effect measures the difference between the tourism growth rate of the number of tourists arrivals from the region (i) and the overall growth rate of the number of tourists arrivals from the whole region.

- **Competition effect** \( [T_{ij} (G_{ij} - G_{\text{AREA}})] \). This effect measures the difference between tourism growth rate within the number of tourists arrivals from (i) region to (j) city and tourism growth rate within the number of tourists arrivals from (i) region.

- **Allocation effect** \( [T^0_{ij} - T_{ij} (G_{ij} - G_{\text{AREA}})] \). This component, also known as the interaction effect, measures the growth in the number of tourists attributed to the interaction of the regional compound effect and the competitive effect.

As Alavi and Yasin (2000) point out, a city (i) may have competitive “advantage” or “disadvantage” in attracting tourists from its region and may be “specialized” or “non-specialized”. These four possibilities are shown in Figure 1.

![Figure 1. Possible Explanations of Allocation Effect](image)

Table 1 shows the number of tourists arrivals from the selected region to be used in the shift-share analysis of the destinations in the study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Russia</th>
<th>Germany</th>
<th>England</th>
<th>Iran</th>
<th>Ukraine</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Antalya</td>
<td>2013 3,338,166</td>
<td>2,834,413</td>
<td>443,851</td>
<td>36,902</td>
<td>384,778</td>
<td>7,038,110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2018 4,651,709</td>
<td>2,292,996</td>
<td>632,086</td>
<td>715,011</td>
<td>715,011</td>
<td>9,006,813</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mugla</td>
<td>2013 229,407</td>
<td>208,330</td>
<td>1,337,045</td>
<td>3,118</td>
<td>53,333</td>
<td>1,831,233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2018 398,596</td>
<td>218,195</td>
<td>1,027,304</td>
<td>1,766</td>
<td>176,871</td>
<td>1,822,732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İzmir</td>
<td>2013 33,724</td>
<td>357,303</td>
<td>114,400</td>
<td>27,930</td>
<td>4,540</td>
<td>537,897</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2018 34,422</td>
<td>381,131</td>
<td>76,970</td>
<td>44,376</td>
<td>20,611</td>
<td>557,510</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İstanbul</td>
<td>2013 573,528</td>
<td>1,179,397</td>
<td>456,172</td>
<td>386,339</td>
<td>246,950</td>
<td>2,842,386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2018 618,511</td>
<td>1,071,634</td>
<td>455,608</td>
<td>934,860</td>
<td>323,454</td>
<td>3,404,067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2013 4,174,825</td>
<td>4,579,443</td>
<td>2,351,468</td>
<td>454,289</td>
<td>689,601</td>
<td>12,249,626</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2018 5,703,238</td>
<td>3,963,956</td>
<td>2,191,968</td>
<td>1,696,013</td>
<td>1,235,947</td>
<td>14,791,122</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Calculations related to general growth rates were made before the shift-share analysis. These calculations and their results are as follows:

General Growth Rate ($G_{\text{AREA}}$): \((14,791,122 - 12,249,626) / 12,249,626 \times 100 = %20.75\)

The above general growth rate formula was applied to all markets and the growth rate of each market was found. Growth rates of markets:

- Russia: % 36.61
- Germany: % -13.44
- England: % -6.78
- Iran: % 273.33
- Ukraine: % 79.23

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

Shift-share analyzes were conducted in the context of tourists arrivals from Russia to the region and the results are given in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Real Growth</th>
<th>Area Effect</th>
<th>Region Mix Effect</th>
<th>Competition Effect</th>
<th>Allocation Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Antalya</td>
<td>1,313,543</td>
<td>69,258,731</td>
<td>-68,036,621</td>
<td>65,700</td>
<td>25732.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muğla</td>
<td>169,189</td>
<td>4,759,630</td>
<td>-4,675,644</td>
<td>231,795</td>
<td>-146593</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İzmir</td>
<td>698</td>
<td>699,690</td>
<td>-687,344</td>
<td>-63,320</td>
<td>51671.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>İstanbul</td>
<td>44,983</td>
<td>11,899,294</td>
<td>-11,689,325</td>
<td>-278,672</td>
<td>113685.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When Table 2 is examined, the determined changes of tourists arrivals from Russia to the region are as follows;

- All cities were not able to capture the expected market share in Russia, as the are impact was positive for all cities in the study.
- The fact that the region mix effect is negative for all cities in the study indicates that all cities are focused on attracting tourists from the Russia region and the average growth rate of Russian tourists in relation to the general regional area is slowing down.
- When the competition effect is examined, it can be said that Russian tourists preferred to go Antalya and Muğla instead of İzmir and İstanbul.
- When the allocation effect is examined, it is determined that the allocation effect of Muğla is negative and other cities are positive. The four cities are positioned as in Figure 2 was made taking into account the area effect, regional mix effect, competition effect and allocation effect.

![Figure 2](image-url)

**Figure 2.** City Locations as a Result of Shift-Share Analysis of Tourists from Russia

As shown in Figure 2, Muğla has a competitive advantage in the Russian market, while it is not specialized in this market. İzmir and Istanbul have competitive disadvantage in the Russian market and are not specialized. Antalya has a competitive advantage in the Russian market and also specializes in this market.
In Table 2, shift-share analyzes performed for the results given for Russia were performed in other markets. The four cities where the comparison was made taking into account the area effect, regional mix effect, competition effect and allocation effect obtained in the shift-share analysis results for Germany are positioned as in Figure 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specialization</th>
<th>Competitive Advantage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-) Non-specialized</td>
<td>Muğla</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(+) Specialized</td>
<td>İzmir İstanbul</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 3.** City Locations as a Result of Shift-Share Analysis of Tourists from Germany

As shown in Figure 3, Muğla has a competitive advantage in the German market, while it is not specialized in this market. İzmir and İstanbul have competitive advantage in the German market and also specialized in this market. Antalya has no competitive advantage in the German market, but specialized in this market. The most important reason for this is that while the number of German tourists arrivals to Antalya decreases with each passing year, the number of German tourists increases in İzmir and Muğla. In İstanbul, however, there has been a slight decrease and it continues its advantageous position.

The four cities where the comparison was made taking into account the area effect, regional mix effect, competition effect and allocation effect obtained in the shift-share analysis results for England are positioned as in Figure 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specialization</th>
<th>Competitive Advantage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-) Non-specialized</td>
<td>Antalya İstanbul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(+) Specialized</td>
<td>Muğla İzmir</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 4.** City Locations as a Result of Shift-Share Analysis of Tourists from England

As shown in Figure 4, Antalya and İstanbul have a competitive advantage in the England market, but they are not specialized in this market. While Muğla and İzmir do not have competitive advantage in the England market, they specialize in this market.

The four cities where the comparison was made taking into account the area effect, regional mix effect, competition effect and allocation effect obtained in the shift-share analysis results for Iran are positioned as in Figure 5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specialization</th>
<th>Competitive Advantage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-) Non-specialized</td>
<td>Antalya Muğla</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(+) Specialized</td>
<td>İzmir İstanbul</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 5.** City Locations as a Result of Shift-Share Analysis of Tourists from Iran
As shown in Figure 5, Antalya has a competitive advantage in the Iran market, while it is not specialized in this market. While Izmir and Istanbul have no competitive advantage in the Iran market, they are specialized in this market. Muğla has no competitive advantage in the Iran market and is not specialized in this market.

The four cities where the comparison was made taking into account the area effect, regional mix effect, competition effect and allocation effect obtained in the shift-share analysis results for Ukraine are positioned as in Figure 6.

As shown in Figure 6, Antalya, Muğla and İzmir have a competitive advantage in the Ukraine market, but they are not specialized in this market. While Istanbul has no competitive advantage in the Ukraine market, it specializes in this market.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The number and nationality of tourists to a city in a given period of time depends on the characteristics, diversity, quality of service and specialization and competitive advantage of the tourist supply. Thus, it is possible to know which market in that city is more advantageous or disadvantageous or in which market it specializes or does not specialize, and it can be seen in comparison with other cities in a similar position. In this way, issues such as what the market potential of that city is and how it evaluates this potential and how this potential develops are revealed.

In this study, the shares they received from the markets of Germany, Russia, England, Iran and Ukraine to Antalya, Muğla, İzmir and Istanbul in 2013 and 2018 were examined. According to this;

When we examine the cities that have a share in the Russian market, it is seen that Muğla has benefited from its competitive advantages although it is not specialized. In addition, it is seen that Antalya is both specialized and benefiting from its competitive advantage. İzmir and Istanbul, however, are not specialized and do not have competitive advantage in this market. According to this; Antalya should continue its practices to date in order to maintain its strong position in the Russian market. Despite its current advantageous position, Muğla should make market-specific research in order to specialize in this market. İzmir and Istanbul should investigate the characteristics and expectations of these market guests in order to use their competitive advantage in order to specialize for the Russian market and arrangements should be made to meet these characteristics and expectations.

When we examine at the German market, Muğla province is similar to its position in the Russian market, although it is advantageous in this market is not specialized. Studies regarding the German market should be carried out especially to meet the expectations of guests. Although Antalya specializes in the market, it is disadvantageous in terms of competitive advantage. İzmir and Istanbul are seen to be specialized and advantageous in this market, however especially since the German market uses these numbers in these two cities as a hub especially because of the Sunexpress center, and the registration of German citizens of Turkish origin living in Germany through İzmir year-round. The same situation is also the case for Istanbul, and it is thought that German citizens of Turkish origin living in Germany use Istanbul as a hub in their travels to our country. If it is possible to differentiate between the tourist and non-touristic entrances to our country, it is thought that in the light of these new data, Antalya which is at a disadvantage in the competition in the German market, will turn into an advantageous position. What makes us think is the personal experience of the German market as a result of article writers having more than 30 years of industry experience and more than 20 years working as a senior executive in a German-based company.
When we examine the England market, it is seen that Antalya and Istanbul do not specialize in the market despite the competitive advantage. Especially the England market has been preferred for these two cities in recent years and the quality and features of the existing facilities are increasing day by day. General difficulties experienced in this market may cause problems in the service quality of the facilities which are physically advantageous from time to time due to the lack of specific details of this market. Moreover, Muğla and İzmir are disadvantaged due to their lack of competition due to their competitive advantage, the physical characteristics of the facilities and the price-service performance due to their experience in the English guests they have worked for many years.

In light of analysis, the evaluations made on the Iranian market Antalya is advantageous although Antalya is not specialized and Muğla is disadvantageous although it is not specialized. İzmir and Istanbul, on the other hand, seem to be specialized in this market, but they seem to be disadvantaged. The most important assessment to be made regarding this market is that the current Iranian tourist figures do not reflect 100% accuracy due to the fact that direct flights from the cities of Antalya and Muğla to the cities of this country serving similar concept are not allowed by the Iranian State. Due to this prohibition, a significant portion of the tourists coming to Muğla region are transported through İzmir and Iran flights to Isparta within Antalya region are carried to Antalya by road. For this reason, it is not possible to find out how many of the Iranian guests who seem to have come to İzmir from these data, how many they actually stayed in İzmir and how many they were transported to Muğla region by road. Similarly, the lack of numbers of Iranian guests who appear to have entered Isparta does not give the right result for Antalya. Again, according to the article author’s sectoral experience, if the real data could be obtained, Antalya is predicted to be both a specialized and competitive advantageous city for the Iranian market and Muğla as a specialized but competitive disadvantageous city. However, it is assumed that İzmir will change its position in the specialized as non-specialized while preserving the current competitive disadvantage. Since the Istanbul data is assumed to be as close to reality as possible, no change in the current status is foreseen.

When we examine the Ukrainian market, it is seen that Antalya, Muğla and İzmir provinces have competitive advantage although they do not specialize in this market, while Istanbul has a competitive disadvantage despite being specialized in this market. As can be seen in the light of these findings, it is a known fact that the Ukrainian guests are mixed with Russian guests. However, Ukrainian guests exhibit different characteristics due to their personal characteristics and tensions between the two countries and the guests of the two countries do not like to be together. Therefore, in spite of the price advantage, it seems that we specialize in these markets because of the lack of services that Ukrainian guests feel special in their facilities. This distinction is important, especially since these three provinces serve this market with an all-inclusive concept. However, due to the high price of accommodation, this market has an economically low income level and has put Istanbul at a disadvantageous position compared to other cities.

In this case, it is thought that the data does not fully reflect the real situation due to the airport-based data. For this reason, it is recommended that a similar study be conducted through the "Daily Reported Police Station Lists" based on the mentioned cities for confirmation purposes.
REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to investigate the levels of happiness among tourism students and to examine the effects of demographics on levels of happiness among them. A questionnaire-based study was conducted on 302 tourism students studying at Manavgat Vocational School of Akdeniz University. Data were collected using the Oxford Happiness Scale-Short Form and personal information form. The survey was carried out between May and June 2019. Research data were analyzed with SPSS 23.0 statistical package program. The level of happiness of the students was found to have a moderate level. Firstly, the reliability values of the scale used in the study was found to be sufficient. For the purpose of identifying and examining the underlying dimensions of the scale, a factor analysis using principal component method was used. As a result of factor analysis, one dimension was obtained from happiness scale as in the original scale. Analysis of variance (ANOVA) and t-tests were computed to assess differences in level of happiness related to demographic variables. Among the demographic variables gender, status of doing sports, and frequency of doing sports weekly were significantly related to happiness. However, class, department, working status, social media usage, number of siblings, spending status, whether mother and father were alive, and whether they were together or separated were not significantly related to happiness. Considering the impact of sport on happiness, university and school administrations should develop activities and projects to support students’ ability to do sports. However, studies on happiness can be executed in different universities and departments.

Keywords: Happiness, Demographic Variables, Tourism Education, University Student

INTRODUCTION

Researchers in several disciplines are increasingly involved in the research of one of the most complicated and universally debated topics: the pursuit and achievement of good life (Delle Fave, Brdar, Freire, Vella-Brodrick, & Wissing, 2011). On the other hand, subjective well-being, particularly measured with regards to happiness and life satisfaction is increasingly considered a substantial policy purpose around the world (Tiefenbach & Kohlbacher, 2013). Happiness is used instead of well-being, in some cases it is used in the same meaning. People desires to be happy and happiness may be the ultimate main aim that people pursue in their lives. The question of what generates happiness and well-being is the subject of a great number of current research, much of it fitting under the section of positive psychology, a developing field that also considers problems such as what makes for ideal relationships, ideal group functioning, and ideal societies (Sheldon & Lyubomirsky, 2007). Happiness has various senses in popular discourse, as well as in the scientific literature. For instance, happiness can mean a general positive mood, a global assessment of life satisfaction, living a good life, or the causes that make people happy, with the remark depending on the context (Diener, 2006). Happiness also can be thought of as an umbrella term that contains low-intensity positive feelings (e.g. tranquility), high-intensity positive feelings (joy, euphoria), and everything in between (Lyubomirsky & Kurtz, 2008). In recent years, research has been continuing to understand what makes individuals happy in many disciplines besides psychology. In this context, the purpose of this study is to investigate the levels of happiness among tourism students studying at vocational school and to examine the effects of demographics on levels of happiness among them. Besides, it is important for tourism students to know how to be happy and to learn how to make tourists happy.
LITERATURE REVIEW

There has been a growing interest in the description and features of a good life for a long time. Positive psychology tries to give information about the quality of life of people (Kose, 2014). In this context, positive psychology focuses on understanding and explaining happiness and subjective well-being (SWB) and accurately predicting factors that affect such situations (Carr, 2004). Happiness is a popular term that can refer to pleasant moods and emotions experienced at any given moment (positive affect), to general evaluations of life such as life satisfaction, or to subjective well-being (Diener & Ryan, 2009). In the literature, the term happiness is sometimes used synonymously with subjective well-being (Diener, 1994). According to Diener (2000), happiness or SWB refers to: people's evaluations of their lives---evaluations that are both affective and cognitive. On the other hand, Lyubomirsky, Sheldon, & Schkade (2005) define happiness as frequent positive affect, high life satisfaction, and infrequent negative affect. Indeed, when psychologists speak of happiness or well-being, they mean the experience of frequent positive impact, rarely negative impact, and a sense that life is good and valuable (Lyubomirsky & Kurtz, 2008).

Many research have been conducted to identify the determinants of happiness or subjective well-being. For instance, well-being has been indicated to be related to a wide range of factors, including demographic variables (e.g., Diener, 1984; Diener & Diener, 1995; Diener, Suh, Lucas, & Smith, 1999; Myers, 2000), personality traits and attitudes (e.g., Diener & Lucas, 1999), and goal characteristics (e.g., McGregor & Little, 1998) (Lyubomirsky, et al. 2005). Happy individuals may think about their positive life incidents more often than their negative life incidents, a tendency that serves to pursue their long-term happiness (Seidultz & Diener, 1993). Also, several studies show that happy persons are successful across multiple life domains, including marriage, relationships, income, health, longevity, and work performance. These people are more creative, able to multitask and endure boring tasks, more trusting, helpful, and sociable (Lyubomirsky, King, & Diener, 2005; David, Boniwell & Ayers, 2013).

The happiness of students is an important topic. According to Seligman (1995), the roots of our happiness as adults are developed in our childhood (as cited in O’Rourke & Cooper, 2010). Especially, college years are formative for students and can lead to lifestyles that endure for the years ahead (Ibrahim, 2018). The characteristics and behaviors of the faculty also have important implications for student development. On the other hand, students’ values, beliefs, and aspirations tend to change in the direction of the dominant values, beliefs, and aspirations of the peer group in the college years (Astin, 1993).

Studies have been realized to better understand the relationship between demographic factors and university students’ happiness. For example, Çakır & Demirel (2019) analyzed the happiness and life satisfaction levels of university students by various factors and to reveal the relationship between those two terms in Turkey. Ibrahim (2018) determined the degree of 654 male and female students’ happiness and identify which life domains have the greatest or least influence on their well-being at one federal university in the UAE. Cicic (2018) investigated the physical activity and quality of life of sports department students and other department students attending university. In this study, a total of 300 university students participated in Turkey. Abbasi, Timareh, Ziapour, & Kiani (2018) analyzed the components of happiness and the role of demographic variables among the 350 university students in Iran. Gonener, Ozturk, & Yilmaz (2017) investigated whether mental (psychological) well-being has an effect on the level of happiness of university students according to age, gender, department, class and perceived academic achievement in a sample of 182 sports science students. Kaya (2016) examined the effect of the participation of 1464 college students in leisure activities and their level of leisure satisfaction on their happiness based on various parameters. Lesani, Mohammadpoorasl, Javadi, Ansari, & Fakhr (2016) evaluated happiness among 541 college students of medical sciences in Iran terms of socio-demographic variables. Tunc (2015) examined the effects of sports on social anxiety and subjective well-being levels in a sample of 600 university students at one public university in Turkey. Eraslan (2015) also investigated the level of psychological well-being in a sample of total 306 physical education and sport department students in Turkey. Flynn & Macleod (2015) determined which life domain had the greatest influence on student happiness in 192 students from a small undergraduate university. Lustyk, Widman, Paschane, & Olson (2015) investigated the impact of exercise frequency, intensity, and volume along with exercise motives on quality of life reports. 169 college students from a liberal arts university in the Pacific Northwest participated in this survey. Cetinkaya (2013) revealed that Turkish college students’ subjective wellbeing in regard to psychological strength and demographic variables. Zullig, Huebner, & Pun (2009) investigated the demographic correlates of the Brief Multidimensional Students’ Life

**METHODOLOGY**

**Participants and Procedure**

This study was executed in three basic stages: sampling, data collection, and data analysis. Sampling design and sample size are significant subjects to statistically represent the population and to be able to suggest implications in both theory and practice. The participants of this study are comprised by 302 tourism students studying at Akdeniz University Manavgat Vocational School. The survey was carried out between May and June 2019.

The socio-demographic details of the students are given in Table 1. The average age of the students in the study was 20.6. 57.9% of the students were male and 42.1% were female. Concerning class of the students, 58.6% were first-grade and 41.4% were second-grade. The majority of the students (80.8%) attended the daytime course. The rest of the students (19.2%) attended the evening course. Distribution of the students’ department was as follows: 50.3% tourism and hotel management, 27.5% were gastronomy, and 22.2% were tourism and travel services. The vast majority of the students (41.1%) spent 501-1000 TL per month. 45.3% of the students were doing sports. On the other hand, 54.3% of the students were not doing sports. Weekly average sports time of the students in the study was 1.32 (S.D.=0.11).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Demographic Profile of the Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First-grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second-grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daytime course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evening course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism and travel services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism and hotel management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gastronomy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly expenditure (TL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>501-1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1001-1500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1501-2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2501 and more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doing Sports Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average social media usage per day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average doing sports per week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The average age</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Measures**

To examine tourism students’ happiness, a questionnaire including 20 items, in two parts were designed: 7 questions related to happiness; 13 items related to the demographic data. The most commonly used measurement tool in happiness research is the Oxford Happiness Inventory (OHI) with its various forms...
The OHI was developed by Argyle, Martin, & Crossland (1989) and comprises 29 items, each involving the selection of one of four options that are different for each item. Argyle et al. (1989) claimed that happiness included three main components: the frequency of positive affect or joy, the high level of life satisfaction experienced during a specific life process, and the lack of negative emotions such as anger, anxiety, fear (Dogan & Akıncı Cotok, 2011:166). The Oxford Happiness Questionnaire (OHQ) has been derived from the OHI by Hills & Argyle (2002). The OHQ includes similar items to those of the OHI, each presented as a single statement which can be endorsed on a uniform six-point Likert scale. In the same study (Hills & Argyle 2002), the Oxford Happiness Questionnaire short form (OHQ-SF) is developed eight-item measure of happiness. The OHQ-SF was translated into Turkish and its validity-reliability studied by Dogan & Akıncı Cotok (2011).

The questionnaire also included a demographic section, which asked for the following information: gender, class, department, course status, status of doing sports, frequency of doing sports weekly, working status, social media usage, number of siblings, amount of monthly expenditure, whether mother and father were alive, and whether they were together or separated. Cronbach’s a coefficient was used to evaluate the internal consistency of the short form of the OHQ. The alpha coefficient for this study was 0.73 and this is similar to Dogan & Akıncı Cotok (2011). For the purpose of identifying and examining the underlying dimensions of the instrument, a factor analysis using principal component method was used. Analysis of variance (ANOVA) and t-tests were computed to assess differences in level of happiness related to demographic variables. Analyses were performed using SPSS 23.

ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS

Mean, standard deviation, and alpha score of the OHQ short form are shown in Table 2 for the students. As can be seen in Table 2, the mean (standard deviation) were 3.36 (±0.76) for happiness. This result indicates that the happiness level of the tourism students was found to have a moderate level.

Factor Analysis

A principal factor analysis was performed on items in order to identify dimensions of the instrument. Bartlett’s test of sphericity with a value of 572.374 (p < 0.001) and the calculation of Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin statistics of 0.82, pointed out that data seemed suitable for factor analysis. Taking the distribution of the scree-plot into consideration, principal component factors with an eigenvalue of one or greater were rotated by the varimax analysis. About 7 items from the factor analysis resulted in one factor grouping and explained 44% of the total variance. Most of the factor loadings were .0.60, indicating a good correlation between the items and the factor grouping they represent. Consequently, factor structure of the OHQ short form in this study was same from the factor structure of the original OHQ short form.

Table 2. The Factor Analysis Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Factor loading</th>
<th>Eigenvalue</th>
<th>Percentage of variance explained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Factor</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.108</td>
<td>44.394</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>satisfied with life</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>find beauty in things</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mentally alert</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>can organize time</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>life is rewarding</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pleased with self</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>happy memories</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Group Differences

ANOVA (with post hoc tests - Tukey) and t-tests were computed to determine differences in means for happiness by gender, class, department, course status, status of doing sports, frequency of doing sports weekly, working status, social media usage, number of siblings, amount of monthly expenditure, whether
mother and father were alive, and whether they were together or separated. Among the demographic variables gender, status of doing sports, and frequency of doing sports weekly were significantly related to happiness. However, class, department, working status, social media usage, number of siblings, amount of monthly expenditure, whether mother and father were alive, and whether they were together or separated were not significantly related to happiness.

Female tourism students (M=3.47, SD=0.76) were happier than male tourism students (M=3.27, SD=0.75). Students who were doing sports (M=3.49, SD=0.77) happier than students who were not doing sports (M=3.28, SD=0.75). On the other hand, students who were doing sports just one day in a week (M=3.59, SD=0.84) have significantly higher mean levels of happiness than students who were doing sports more than one day (M=3.36, SD=0.71), and students who were not doing sports (M=3.29, SD=0.75). The results are shown in Table 3, Table 4, and Table 5.

### Table 3. Results of the ANOVAs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.545</td>
<td>.580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of doing sports weekly</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.030</td>
<td>.050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of doing sports daily</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.398</td>
<td>.249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social media usage</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.206</td>
<td>.814</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 4. One-way ANOVA and post hoc Multiple Comparison Tests (Tukey) of Happiness by Frequency of Doing Sports Weekly

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F ratio</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Post hoc analysis (Tukey)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>3.493</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.746</td>
<td>3.030</td>
<td>.050</td>
<td>1=3.2900 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>172.328</td>
<td>299</td>
<td>.576</td>
<td>2=3.5988 *</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>175.821</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>3=3.3683</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 1=not doing sports, 2=1 day in a week, 3=more than one day in a week

### Table 5. Results of the t-tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>2.231</td>
<td>.026</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>1.515</td>
<td>.131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education status</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>-.744</td>
<td>.457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status of doing sports</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>2.351</td>
<td>.019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working status</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>-.232</td>
<td>.817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whether parents together or separate</td>
<td>296</td>
<td>.973</td>
<td>.331</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION**

The Oxford Happiness Questionnaire short form was used to evaluate the happiness of tourism students in this study. Tourism students showed a moderate level of happiness with an average of 3.36.

The OHQ short form items were exposed to a principal component analysis with varimax rotation in this study. One factor structure was obtained as a result of this factor analysis. This factor structure was the same with the original structure of the OHQ short form. Dogan & Akıncı Cotok (2011) also reported that the exploratory and confirmatory factor analysis results demonstrated that the OHQ short form had a unidimensional structure.

Among the demographic variables gender, status of doing sports, and frequency of doing sports weekly were significantly related to happiness of tourism students. Female tourism students were happier than male tourism students in the current study. Similarly, Çakır & Demirel (2019) stated that according to the happiness scale a significant difference has been observed with respect to gender, department, grade and department satisfaction parameters. Ibrahim (2018) found that happiness was significantly greater for female students than for male students. Abbasi et.al. (2018) reported that there was a significant
relationship between the total score of happiness and gender. Coşkun (2017) also revealed that female students were found to have higher levels of happiness than male students. Cetinkaya (2013) stated that gender was found to be associated with college students’ subjective wellbeing. Eraslan (2015) found that psychological well-being of female students is significantly higher than the male students. However, Gonener et.al. (2017) revealed that there was no significant difference between happiness scores of the students according to their gender. Kaya (2016) also reported that happiness levels of the students do not show a significant difference according to the gender variable. Flynn & Macleod (2015) found that there was no difference in happiness related to gender. Mohammadi, Batvandi, & Saberi (2015) revealed that there were no significant differences in the happiness levels between the male and female university students. Zullig et.al. (2009) found that mean overall scores did not differ significantly by gender, year in school, or race. Alavi (2007) also reported that there was not a meaningful relationship between gender and happiness of the university students.

Students who were doing sports happier than who were not doing sports. Besides that the difference in means of happiness for students who were doing sports just one day was statistically different and higher than who were not doing sports. In the frequency of doing sports weekly groups, students who were doing sports just one day also have significantly higher mean levels of happiness than who were doing sports more than one day. Cicek (2018) also found that the students in the sports faculty had a higher level of physical activity and quality of life scores than students in other department. Alemdag, Alemdag, & Ozkara (2016) found that university students who participated in physical activity showed subjectively higher levels of perceived happiness. Lesani et.al. (2016) revealed that people with high happiness scores had a healthier lifestyle, i.e. more physical activity and less tobacco smoking. They stated that college students should be encouraged to do regular exercise as a way to increase the happiness level. Tunc (2015) explored that well-being scores of university students who do sports are higher than the ones who don’t do sports. Mohammadi et.al. (2015) claimed significant differences in happiness levels between physically active and semi-active students, and between physically active and non-active students. Lustyk et.al. (2015) explored that high-frequency exercisers had significantly higher health, helping, and community-related quality of life than those who exercised less frequently. The authors noted significantly higher health related quality of life in the heavy volume group compared with the other volume groups. However, Diener & Seligman (2002) reported that compared with the less happy groups, the happiest respondents did not exercise significantly more, participate in religious activities significantly more, or experience more objectively defined good events.

Class, department, working status, social media usage, number of siblings, amount of monthly expenditure, whether mother and father were alive, and whether they were together or separated are not significantly related to happiness of tourism students in the current study. Likewise, Gonener et.al. (2017) found that there was no statistically significant difference between the average scores of happiness and departmental and class variables. However, Chow (2005) expressed that students were most satisfied with relationship with mother, living environment, relationships with close friends, relationships with siblings, and living arrangement. Valenzuela, Park, & Keefind (2009) found positive relationships between intensity of Facebook use and university students’ life satisfaction. Dogan (2016) also claimed that social network site (SNS) usage significantly and positively predicts happiness; in other words, usage makes high-school students happy.

Happiness of university students is an important matter that needs to be researched further in the universities. Because, it is related to many important factors, such as quality of life, student performance, productivity, physical, and mental health. On the other hand, studies on the happiness of university students can help the university managements and teachers to develop the quality of education. This study has also significant implications for university managements. Primarily, the results from this study can help the school and the university managements to increase the happiness level of students. Besides, the results of this study can guide university managements to understand the factors that affect happiness of the students. Above all, it is important for university students who study tourism to learn the ways of being happy and to know how to make tourists happy when they enter work life.

On the other hand, it would be useful that future studies should be replicated within the prescribed time limits, considering variables such as social support, self-esteem, student performance, stress, depression, and insomnia.
REFERENCES


Is It Only “Urban” That Counts: An Extra-Urban Approach in Tourist Guiding Training

TOLGA GÜL
Assist.Prof.Dr., Alanya Alaaddin Keykubat University
tolga.gul@alanya.edu.tr

Yalçın ARSLANTÜRK
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
yalcin.arslanturk@hbv.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Other than overly-consumed mass tourism, the preferences for recreational activities, vacationing in untouched, clean and extravagant surroundings with nature far from the city have become an aspiration for many people. The changes in consumption behaviours have driven people away from sea, sun, sand tourism to direct source-based leisure activities, where they can be alone with nature. In this context, one of the most commonly used recreational behaviours is Alpinism. In a modern sense, Alpinism is more different than climbing to the top of a mountain or the face of a rock (Mahruki, 1996). In modern Alpinism, climbing, hiking, trekking, exploring and climbing and walking in bouldering is a recreational activity performed together in mixed techniques. In these tours, the tour guides are responsible for the security of the tourists and the logistics by solving all kinds of problems. In this sense, training of the guides is crucial to increase their knowledge and skills.

Realise quality service in the environment; it is necessary to have a good education. In this context, the curricula for the people to be educated must have a dynamic structure. Therefore, updating of curricula is necessary for qualified learning. In the field of tourism guidance education, it is crucial to determine the appropriate methods and techniques employing needs analysis and to prepare the curriculum according to the needs of the individual, society and work area. Within the framework of the knowledge skills and competencies that Alpinism gait leaders should have within the scope of the laws, it is thought that giving pieces of training in tourism guidance undergraduate programs will contribute to professional specialisation.

For this reason, it will be a more scientific approach to include the changes seen in tourist consumption behaviours and the knowledge of the programs prepared for tourism guidance education in the sub-branches of alpinism. Bearing these in mind, this study aims to examine whether there are skills and competencies offered at the undergraduate level of tourism education in Turkey Mountaineering Federation. In this context, the curriculum in 25 guidance programs has been investigated with specific reference to Turkey Mountaineering Federation Gait Leadership Instructions. After the examination of the curricula, the congruence to the program of Turkey Mountaineering Federation will be discussed, and general recommendations will be put forward.

Keywords: Tour Guides, Alpinism, Guiding Curriculum, Guiding Education

INTRODUCTION

While the developments in the fields of politics, economy, technology and education in the globalised world lead to social enrichment, this situation has become inversely proportional to the lifestyle of individuals and prefer a more lifestyle away from luxury. Except for the ones in the living environment; desire for the natural has caused a significant change in the leisure activities outside the working and leisure time of individuals. The most important recreational activity to get away from urban life is; mass is tourism. However, in the reality of the twenty-first century, people adopt the concept of vacationing away from the city, surrounded by nature, virgin, clean and not exaggerated. As a result, changes in consumption behaviours have driven people away from mass tourism based on sea, sun, sand and culture, leading them to resource-based leisure activities where they can be alone with nature. In this context, the most resorted recreational behaviour, which is far from all human and technological elements, is carried out to isolate from the city life in all weather conditions.
by staying alone with nature in the countryside is Alpinism (Arslantürk and Gül, 2019).

In the statistical reports prepared by the World Tourism Organization and Adventure Tourism and Trade Union, it is stated that economic mobility created by resource-centred recreational activities has a share of 400 billion dollars in the total tourism movement of 1.2 trillion dollars in the world in 2014. This shows that the economic value has a share of 30% in general tourism activity. Global tourism movements around the globe show an average growth of 4 to 7%, while resource-based recreational activities are reported to have increased by 20 to 30% (Türsab, 2014).

In the Global Report on Adventure Tourism report published by the World Tourism Organization in 2014, it was determined that the travel agencies providing resource-based tourism activities with easy-qualified tourism services spend an average of 308 dollars per person per day in the organisations realised in 2012. With an average of 8.8 days on organised trips, the total cost per person, excluding flights, is US $2,710 (ATTA, 2013). Everest mountain climbing is the most suitable example to determine the numbers of difficult tourism services that are resource centred. For permission to climb Mount Everest, the Nepalese government is required to pay USD 11,000 per person for 2018. Besides, the total costs of training, equipment, air tickets, tour guides, etc. cost around $ 48,000 per person for Everest. Among these, the Nepalese government confirms that the climbing guides receive approximately $ 6,000 per climb. It is also known that the total wages paid by the mountain guides up to 10,000 dollars (GRAT, 2014, Mountlet, 2019).

In this context, Turkey is surrounded by sea on three sides, face measurement of the 28% covered with forest, unmatched in the Mediterranean basin and relatively unspoiled natural beauty, experiencing at the same time the four seasons is a more wealthy country than European countries. The majority of resource-based recreational areas are protected national parks, nature areas, nature protection areas, nature monuments and wetlands (Orfamder, 2018). As of 2018 in Turkey; There are 44 national parks, 247 natural parks, 114 natural monuments, 30 natural conservation areas and 81 wildlife development areas. Other significant resource-centred recreational resources are wetlands. In terms of these sources, it has 53 wetlands of national importance to Turkey. It has the wealthiest wetlands compared to Europe and the Middle East (DKMP, 2019). A total area of protected areas in Turkey, which corresponds to 8.1% of the country’s surface area (Orfamder, 2018).

All the countries in the Mediterranean basin, its commercial competitor Turkey in tourism, considering that focus on plans and strategies for eco-tourism must firstly give importance to infrastructure. Given the wealth of resource-centred recreational areas, it will serve in these areas; Having qualified tourism workers will be the most significant infrastructure work. The purpose of this study, graduate-level programs in Turkey, tourist guides, is to reorganise by Alpinizm leadership training. In this context, the department of a graduate-level tourist guide in Turkey, Turkish Mountaineering Federation's Leadership in Alpinism instructions; should reorganise their curriculum according to their knowledge, skills and competences. According to the examination results, 29 pieces tourist guide department located at the undergraduate level in Turkey should be given to proposals for curriculum.

LITERATURE

Resource-centred Recreation Activities are recreational activities that are performed in places defined as rural open areas outside the boundaries of the city, where people realise the resources offered by nature and only nature without using any artificial facilities for their recreational activities (Gül, 2014). Examples of resource-based recreation activities include Climbing, Orienteering, Expedition, Hiking, Trekking, Camping, Mountain Biking and the like. The resource-centred spaces used for these activities are national parks, nature monuments, nature conservation areas, nature parks, wildlife development sites and wetlands. To explain resource-centred recreation areas with a paragraph;

National Parks: According to IUCN (International Union for Conservation of Nature), are mainly natural and cultural areas devoted to protecting the spiritual foundations of protection and ecological processes of the region to defend the environment and culture. National parks offer scientific, educational and recreational opportunities to their visitors, whose main objective is to preserve the natural biological diversity and the ecological structure below it and to support environmental processes, to promote education and recreation. (National Parks - Eurosai, 2019).

Natural Monument is all kinds of formation caused by natural events. It is called natural parts which have various features and scientific values reserved for the protection of a particular natural monument which is a living feature with its geological features and protected within the principles of a national park. Examples from the world; Devils Tower, Monument Valley, The Needles (Wikipedia, 2019; Prezi, 2019).
Natural Conservation Area is natural areas which are essential in terms of science and education and are primarily dedicated to the conservation of biological diversity and natural and related cultural resources, including elite examples of natural phenomena that are rare or disappearing in ecosystems. Examples from the world; Blue Mountain-Birch Cove Lakes, Mt Athos, the Andros marine zone, Kekova (IUCN, 2019; TÜKÇEV, 2019).

The Natural Park is a natural area with biological or landscape features designed to provide protection. Parks focus their attention on the protection and preservation of flora and fauna. They may be terrestrial or marine; they can be found in the mountains, the sea, the desert or any other geographically defined area (Edukalife, 2019).

Wildlife Development Area is the area where prey and wild animals and wildlife are protected, developed, and prey animals are placed, measures are taken to improve the habitat and hunting can be performed within the framework of particular hunting plan when necessary (Milliparklar, 2019).

Wetlands are defined as natural or artificial, continuous or seasonal, fresh, bitter and salty, stagnant or flowing water bodies, swamps, peatlands, and ponds with a depth of not more than six meters. Examples of wetlands in the Mediterranean and surrounding areas are estuary, river delta, coastal lagoon, lake, swamp and oasis, salty swamp, natural or artificial salt and dam lakes (Doğakorumaderneği, 2019).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Types of Resource-Based Recreational Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Backpacking Soft 13 Hunting Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Birdwatching Soft 14 Kayaking/sea/whitewater Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Camping Soft 15 Orienteering Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Canoeing Soft 16 Rafting Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Caving Hard 17 Research expeditions Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Climbing (mountain/rock/ice) Hard 18 Safaris Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Eco-tourism Soft 19 Sailing Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Educational programs Soft 20 Scuba Diving Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Environmentally sustainable activities Soft 21 Snorkeling Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Fishing Soft 22 Skiing/snowboarding Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Hiking Soft 23 Surfing Soft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Horseback riding Soft 24 Trekking Hard</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: UNWTO (2014)

Table 1 shows examples of the types of activities that can be performed within the resource-centred recreation areas. Orienteering, Climbing, Hiking and Trekking, known as a resource-centred recreational activity, are commonly referred to as Alpinism. Alpinism consists of a combination of two words as a concept; Alpine-style. Alpinism, which means mountaineering in its original form, is used in the literature as a synonym for mountaineering. Alpinism; small and fast teams, all kinds of physical and security needs from the beginning to the end of the need to carry the load, carried out at one time (Kargi, 2010). However, in the modern sense, Alpinism is more different than climbing to the top of a mountain or the face of a rock (Mahruki, 1996: 11). In modern Alpinism, hiking, trekking, exploring and climbing and walking in bouldering is a recreational activity performed in a combination of mixed techniques (Somuncu, 2004: 6). Alpinism tours are a type of adventure tourism which is applied in steep terrain and climate, requiring specialised equipment, clothes and food, and dealing with risk, danger and wild nature (Weber, 2001; Hall and Weiler, 1992; Gyimóthy and Mykletun, 2004; Buckley, 2006; Różycki and Dryglas 2014).
With the introduction of the Alpinism done as a tourism activity, it is useful in spreading this sport, and it is known that Turkey prohibited the release of professionalism in the mountains begin with. For example, it is stated that the legend of Noah's Ark on Mount Ararat gave him a mystical dimension and created a tourism potential by emphasising at least mystical importance in the international mountaineering market. With the spread of Alpinism to the mountains of the world, the tourism industry develops, thus developing new transporters, guides and similar businesses in the mountain regions, and many sectors are cross-affected (Çakıcı, Yavuz and Çiçek, 2014: 79). In this context, in Alpinism activities, mentoring, guidance, leadership or guidance has to be realised by one or more skilled guides who accompany and manage the tour. In such organisations, guides are responsible for the safety of the participants and the logistics by solving any problems that may occur. Besides, one of the main tasks of the climbing and hiking tour is to explain the nature of the participants (Leister, 2019: 1). As defined, guided hiking and climbing tours consist of various tangible and intangible components that affect the experience and satisfaction of the participants. These;

a) The organisation of the Alpinism Tour;

b) Quality of Infrastructure (Accommodation, Food, Roads, Transportation);

c) The attractiveness of the Selected Route (Landscapes, Tourist Sites, Area, Difficulty, Season);

d) Environmental Conditions in the Organization Dates (Weather, Temperature, Drought, Humidity, Flood);

e) Information provided to tourists before and during the tour;

f) Knowledge and Skills

METHOD

The purpose of this study using more active in the tourism sector's resources based on recreational areas with Turkey, to obtain more revenues from tourism train human resources for the provision of the necessary infrastructure. According to the reports prepared by the world tourism organisation, the income generated from the nature-based tourism types is higher than mass tourism, and people's perception of tourism has changed entirely, and the changing tourism perception caused different recreational behaviours to create different demands in the tourism field. In this context, the knowledge, skills and competences given in the field of tourism education are required according to the current changes. Due to the high incomes obtained from resource-based recreational activity-based tourism movements, contributing to the effects of countries on the balance of payments and giving importance to the infrastructure studies to be made makes this study significant.

In this study, the academic knowledge necessary for Turkey Mountaineering Federation hiking leadership, to apply the skills and competencies in the curricula of tourist guides section of the 29 tourism faculties in Turkey, to determine the course which is available balances and in this direction is qualitative research was prepared to harmonise the program. Secondary data were used as the data collection method. In the OSM's Preference Guide, published in 2019 for current tourism guidance programs, 29 tourist guidance sections that will be active in the 2019-2020 academic year were examined. Examination of the curricula The 8-semester curricula used in the official web sites of the faculties was utilised.

FINDINGS

The results obtained from the study conducted within the scope of 29 tourism guidance departments are given in Table 2. When Table 2 is examined, it is determined that only 21 of the 29 departments can access the curriculum on the web. As a result of the examination, it was observed that only one of the courses in tourism guidance departments had five (5) classes consistent with the subjects of gait leadership knowledge, skills and ability. It was found that the three departments that were examined had four (4) courses of gait leadership knowledge, skills and competencies, and only one department was consistent with one (1) gait leadership knowledge, skills and ability.
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The training of tourist guides is crucial to increase knowledge, skills and competences. In this context, tourist guides should use leadership that can be defined to achieve goals by organising activities in a group of people (Shooter, Sibthorp and Paisley, 2009). Leadership skills of the mentors include difficult skills (first aid, navigation, how to do things, knowledge, physical abilities) and easy skills (communication, empathy, determination, time management, flexibility). In this context, what are the needs of individuals and societies and their source are the changes and developments in the fields of science, technology and art that affect daily life.

For this reason, a good education is required for quality service in the global competitive environment depending on individual and social progress. In this context, the curriculum for the people to be raised should have a dynamic structure. In other words, the curriculum needs to be continuously transformed according to the needs of the individual and society. Therefore, updating the curriculum is necessary for qualified education. In the field of tourism guidance education, it is essential to determine the appropriate methods and techniques using needs analysis and due diligence to prepare the curriculum according to the needs of the individual, society and work area. In this context, it is useful to carry out a needs analysis to be performed at the national level (Coşkun, 2017: 8).

The economic dimension of resource-centred tourism mobility is 3/1 of the total tourism income, which is around 400 billion dollars annually. It is said that this study aims to make studies on the curriculums in the field of Alpinism necessary. Mainly in the tourism curriculum of schools in Turkey, it is known to be just as focused on mass tourism. In this context, their curricula should be reshaped according to changing human preferences in tourism. In this respect, it is vital to provide training in tourist guidance undergraduate programs within the framework of the knowledge, skills and competencies that Alpinism gait leaders should have within the scope of the Laws, to contribute to professional specialisation. For this reason, it will be a more scientific approach to include the changes seen in tourist consumption behaviours and the knowledge of the programs prepared for tourism guidance education in the sub-branches of alpinism. 05.21.2016 date and 3289 No. of Youth and Sports General Directorate of Organization and published in the Official Gazette No. 28358 dated 19/07/2012 Duties and entered into force the Law on Independent to lead the group in this context, the borders of Turkey Sports Federation of Labor 01.10.2014 date and 29136 numbered with regulations on Procedures and Principles of Mountaineering Federation of Turkey reiterated Official Gazette prepared based on principal Status Mountaineering Federation of Turkey Gait Leadership is determined within the framework of the general instructions. According to these instructions, guidance resource-based areas to have given the leadership of the Mountaineering Federation of Turkey Gait document is a legal requirement.
Tourist guidance curricula should be rearranged to enable students to get the gait leadership certificate, and program development should be done by evaluating the curricula according to current consumer behaviour in tourism.

REFERENCES


IUCN, (2019). Natural Protected Areas, https://www.iucn.org/theme/protected-areas/about/protected-area-categories


Mahruki, N. (1996), Bir Hayalin Peşinde, Yedi Zirveler Batman Yarıküre ve Antarktika, Yapı Kredi Yayınları, İstanbul


Environment and Tourism In Sustainable Cities

Tuğba USTA
Dr.
tugbausta28@gmail.com

Adem Usta
Lect., Giresun Üniversitesi
medaatsu@hotmail.com

Aslı TENDERİS
Beykent Üniversitesi
asli.tenderis@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Unconscious industrialization, the development of technology and the assumption that natural resources are expendable have resulted in climate changes, ocean levels and degradation of natural habitats over the last two decades. Countries began to take measures to reduce these problems with the Stockholm Conference in 1972, and have taken measures to protect the environment more actively since the 2000s. Since the 1970s, it has been emphasized that every environmental initiative should be sustainable. The environment comes first to mind when it comes to urban sustainability. For this reason, the concept of sustainability is important in environmental and tourism-related issues. Economic and social sustainability should also be taken into account in the protection of environmental health for sustainable cities. More than fifty percent of the world’s population lives in cities. Cities, which are the main source of environmental pollution, are the ones that consume non-renewable natural resources. With urbanization, the depletion of natural resources accelerated due to the supply of nutrients, energy, water, and other needs. The fact that melting glaciers as a result of climate change causes an increase in ocean levels threatens the ocean and seacoast cities. For this reason, the concept of environmental sustainability in cities has been one of the main issues of the last decade. The United Nations and the United Arab Emirates have put forward important projects in the development of sustainable tourism cities. In this study, it is aimed to reveal the perspectives of UN and UAE within the scope of sustainable city, environmental protection and city tourism in the transition from environmentally damaging cities to sustainable environment-friendly cities. As a method, two cross-sectional researches were carried out in the literature which is an example for the variables.

Keywords: Sustainable Cities, Cittaslow, Environment Protection.
Smart Cities in The Scope of Industry 4.0: Analysis Of Official Applications

Ebru GÖZEN
Assist.Prof.Dr., Akdeniz University
ebrugozen@akdeniz.edu.tr

ABSTRACT
The industrialization process has started the evolve fourth time with the new generation of information and communication technologies. Internet of things, artificial intelligence, sensors, cognitive technologies, nanotechnology, quantum computing, wearable technologies, augmented reality, robots, big data, 3D and intelligent networks technologies are lead to the fourth industrial revolution called as Industry 4.0. New generation technologies have started to change business environments and lifestyles by using them rapidly in the fields of doing business, communication and education. It is inevitable that smart cities will provide services through the official application (app) due to gain competitive advantage and especially Z generation citizens actively using technology. In Turkey, some cities have now started to serve through the official application. However, there are paucity of studies on the services provided by the applications and the opinions of the users. Therefore, the aim of the study is to examine the official applications of the first five major cities of Turkey (Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Bursa, Antalya) and to give suggestions. According to the results, the most offered services are city guide, wifi points, social facilities, public transport, pharmacies. When the comments of the five cities' applications are evaluated in general, it can be said that the users mostly complain that the applications are sometimes broken.

Keywords: Industry 4.0, Smart City, Official Applications

INTRODUCTION
While advances in technology have distorted all memorization, new concepts are placed in every area of life. The concept of smart tourism has become widely used to processes that use all kinds of technology applications that are developed with the human mind, augmenting human labor, which is the essential element of production. Every word that has an smart title at the beginning shows that it is technology based. In this context; smart cities can be defined as living spaces where new technologies are used to ensure the effectiveness of the traditional services provided by the city administration to residents and foreigners. There is no doubt that restructured sectors in technology-based cities will also be smart.

The concept of smart city emerges due to the complexity and management difficulties faced by the authorities to cope with the rapid growth of the urban population. Harrison et al. (2010) defined “smart” as using real-time and real-world data, integrating, sharing, and using analytics, modeling, and visualization to make better operational decisions. This adjective has been added to cities (smart cities) to define efforts to use innovative technologies to achieve resource optimization, effective and fair governance, sustainability and quality of life (Gretzel et al., 2015).

Many problems started in the first years of the 20th century, such as population growth, traffic problems, excessive consumption of natural resources and environmental pollution due to rapid urbanization, regional development and economic incentives (Kim and Han, 2012). After the implementing the new generation information technology to hospitals, railways, bridges, tunnels, roads, buildings, water systems, dams and pipelines via Internet within the scope of smart cities by IBM firm in order to reduce these problems and provide service to the citizens in the cities (Zhang, 2010) the concept of smart city has started to gain importance. The concept of smart city refers to an environment in which technology integrates with the city. This technology creates synergies with the social components of the city in order to improve the quality of life of citizens and at the same time to reduce energy use and increase the efficiency of city services such as better traffic monitoring (Vicini et al., 2012).

Topsakal et al. (2018) conducted a smart tourism and smart city study, which describes the application of smart city concept and technologies in the context of tourism. In their studies on smart tourism destinations, Topsakal and Çelik (2017) stated that smart cities also increase tourism competitive advantage. Focusing on the functionality and adoption of smartphone applications, Topsakal (2018) stated that local administrations provide numerous benefits to their citizens through smart applications. It is inevitable
that smart cities provide competitive advantage and serve cities through official application. In Turkey, some cities have now started to serve through the official application. However, there are paucity studies on the services provided by the applications and the opinions of the users. Therefore, the aim of the study is to examine the official applications of the first five major cities of Turkey (Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Bursa, Antalya) and to give suggestions.

SMART CITY AND SMART TOURISM

The concept of smart city has evolved with a technology-centric evolution based on the Internet, mobile services, wireless sensor networks (WSN), smart technologies and the Internet of Things (Monathy et al., 2016). Cities such as Seattle, Singapore, Montreal, Santiago, Amsterdam and Casablanca have attempted to position themselves as smart cities (Khomsi and Bedard, 2016). According to Komninos (2002) a smart city should solve the problems in that city by using Information and Communication Technology (ICT). Smart cities;

- Uses the existing technology for the citizens and the city,
- Uses digital data to improve the quality of life and the quality of the workplace,
- Integrates ICT with the city,
- Realizes good practices throughout the region to promote innovation, learning and knowledge transfer.

Harrison et al. (2010) stated that a smart city interconnects physical infrastructure, ICT infrastructure, social infrastructure and business infrastructure. Piro et al. (2014) defined smart city as an urban environment supported by a widespread ICT system and stated that smart cities can provide advanced and innovative services to citizens in order to improve the quality of life. Boes et al. (2015) suggested that the technologies used in smart tourism destinations are different from those used in smart cities. For example, the authors state that tourists use technology before, during and after travel; but it is limited to the use of technology in a smart city.

Giffinger (2007) developed a model to determine the scope of the smart city. Giffinger’s work was followed by other models defining the dimensions of the smart city (Anthopoulos, 2015). Cohen (2012) identified six dimensions that should be considered in smart cities. These dimensions can be explained as above (Cohen, 2012):

- Smart Environment: Refers to renewable energy sources, ICT supported energy networks, measurement, pollution control and monitoring, renewal of buildings and facilities, green buildings, green city planning, energy efficiency, reuse and resource substitution. City services such as street lighting, pollution reduction, drainage systems and water resources should be monitored by smart city system, pollution should be reduced and water quality should be improved.
- Smart Living: Refers to ICT supported lifestyles, behavior and consumption. Smart living is also linked to high levels of social cohesion and social capital. Smart living offers healthy and safe living in a lively city with cultural diversity and quality housing and accommodation.
- Smart Transportation: It means the smart city has ICT-supported transportation and logistics systems. For example; it should cover sustainable, safe and interconnected transport systems and integrate modes of transport (tram, bus, train, subway, car, bicycle and pedestrian paths).
- Smart Economy: Refers to e-commerce and e-business, ICT-integrated and advanced production / service delivery, ICT-supported innovation, innovative products and services, new business models. The smart economy brings local and global connections and international recognition with the flow of physical and virtual goods, services and information.
- Smart Governance: For example, European Union means a combination of urban and inter-city governance, including services and interactions that integrate effectively and efficiently as an organism. The key facilitating tool to achieve this is ICT, which is provided by data, intelligent processes and interoperability. Smart city can be defined as a globally networked hub with international, national and hinterland connections. Smart objects include transparency and open data by using ICT and e-government in participatory decision-making and co-created e-services.
- Smart People: Refers to people who work with ICT support, have e-skills, have access to education and training, know human resource management and capacity management, develop creativity and promote innovation.
European Union has defined a roadmap of smart cities, and create interconnecting human capital, social capital and ICTs for more sustainable economic development and better quality of life based on this roadmap (Manville et al. 2014).

The focus of smart cities is the citizens of the city, however smart tourism destinations focus on improving the tourist experience (Figueredo, 2018). In a similar way, Lamsfus and Alzua-Sorzabal (2013) stated that smart city approach focuses on citizens, does not include visitors, and smart destination approach includes tourists and passengers. Wang et al. (2016) provides a conceptual model for smart tourism destinations. According to this model; the basis of the concept of smart tourism destination is an inclusive ‘service’ logic that directs the design and operation of the destination. The physical characteristics (sources) of smart tourism destinations and the technological state of smart tourism destinations (in terms of cloud computing, Internet of Things, artificial intelligence and mobile communication) shaped the demand for ‘new’ tourists (Wang et al., 2016). Lamsfus et al. (2015) similarly stated that smart tourism destinations help to develop new services in the tourism industry. For example, smart phones that emerged with the mobile industry have changed the tourism experience and moved the travel and tourism sectors to advanced service areas (Lamsfus et al., 2015). Destination management organizations can spread tourists to a wider area instead of concentrating at certain points. This improves the experience of individual tourists, provides access to a wider set of services, and attracts more tourists and motivates them to stay in destinations for longer (Kramer et al., 2008).

Buhalis and Amaranggana (2014) note that smart tourism destinations require dynamically interconnected stakeholders through technological platforms to gather, create and exchange information that can be used to enrich tourism experiences in real-time. Interconnected tourism organizations provide real-time and personalized services to tourists and also collect data for the optimization of strategic and operational management (Wang et al., 2013). Destination management organizations work as a ‘smart center’ that collects and distributes all the information about destinations, thus providing a competitive advantage over competitors.

**METHOD**

Case study, one of the qualitative research methods, was used in the study. Qualitative research is defined as a study in which qualitative data collection techniques such as observation, interview and document analysis are used, and a qualitative process is carried out to present perceptions and events in a realistic and holistic manner in the natural environment (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2008). According to Creswell (2007) it is a qualitative research approach in which the researcher deeply examines one or more situations in time by means of data collection tools (observations, interviews, audiovisuals, documents, reports) containing multiple sources, identifying situations and related themes. In this context, the official applications of Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Bursa and Antalya Metropolitan Municipality have been downloaded to the smart phone and examined in detail. A word cloud was made through edwordle.net about the fields that five applications serve. Then, the user comments (from IOS and Andorid) given about these applications were examined by content analysis and negative opinions of the users were revealed.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

Table 1 shows the average user scores (over 5) of the official municipal applications on Android and IOS.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Android</th>
<th>IOS</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Istanbul</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ankara</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Izmir</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bursa</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antalya</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As seen in Table 1, the application with the highest scores in Andorid and IOS belongs to Antalya Metropolitan Municipality. While the application with the lowest score in Andorid belongs to Istanbul, the application with the lowest score in IOS belongs to Izmir.

The official application of Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IMM) provide services range from public transport to the traffic situation of the city, from IMM Wifi hotspots to whietable (complaints and suggestions service). The application is also used in English. City guide service provides access to information about pharmacies on duty, sports facilities, social facilities. Instant weather is seen through the application. IMM Wifi provides uninterrupted internet access in many points of the city such as the square and the park and in the metrobuses. Thus, current news can be accessed through the application. Touristic cameras in different parts of the city convey live beauties of Istanbul to users. Users can access the indoor and outdoor parking information closest to their location from Ispark points with the application. There are other official applications of the municipality that provides services depending on IMM official application. Users can get real-time traffic information about traffic in the city with IMM Mobile Traffic application. Users can plan their route to their destination in real time using bus, subway, metrobus, ferry and all other amenities with public transportation. Complaints, ideas and suggestions in transportation, infrastructure, environment, zoning, health, social support and other fields can be conveyed and solutions are provided in a short time with the IMM WhiteTable application. QR codes positioned in the social facilities from the gymnasium to the touristic areas can be accessed quickly with up to date information with IMM QR Code application. Users can call the nearest taxi by location with the iTaxi application. Users can access information about Istanbul's attractions and how to get there with the Walk & Discover application. In addition, users can access information about such activities through IMM City Theaters and IMM Culture applications.

The official application of Ankara Metropolitan Municipality was examined within the scope of the study. The application provides access to bus information, water cut information and water bill information. The 14 parks, Sincak shelter, Hacı Bayram-ı Veli Mosque and pet park are watched live by camera through the application. Social and cultural events and on-call pharmacy information are available to users. From the sacrifice part, the question of animal type is made with the number of earrings. City guide feature provides information about health, education, sports, tourism and historical sites. Public transportation, vehicle stops, parking and fuel points are provided with the transportation feature. The application provides access to metropolitan announcements, zoning plans, metropolitan council resolutions, metropolitan council agenda, metropolitan teams' work programs and daily burial information. QR codes are scanned at the points where QR code service is provided and users can access the necessary information with QR code scan feature. Information about free Wifi hotspots offered by metropolitan is presented in the application. In the cultural and social activities section, access to the children theater, adult theater, cinema, festival, concerts, exhibitions, seminars, sports, museums and event calendar is provided. Complaints, ideas and suggestions for transportation, infrastructure, environment, health, social support and other areas can be conveyed to bluetable, and solutions are provided in a short time through the application. The news section of the application provides access to current news. Ankara AR application also serves depending on the official application of Ankara Metropolitan Municipality. When you view posters or billboards with Ankara AR application, you are shown pictures, videos or 3D promotional images about the content.

With the official application of Izmir Metropolitan Municipality, news, announcements and cultural and art activities of the municipality can be seen. From the transportation section; users can learn the buses approaching the station, Bisim (bicycle) station status, izmirim card balances, nearby bus stops, transportation (bus, metro, ferry, car ferry, Izban and tram) hours. The users can see the prices of vegetable and fish, photos of Izmir, results of Eşrefpaşa Hospital analysis, announcements of instant water cuts and pharmacies on duty. Users can get directions to the selected pharmacy on duty. The application provides access to council decisions and Wizmir (Wifi) hotspots. Culture and art activities organized by the Municipality and information about all activities notified to the Municipality throughout Izmir are provided through the application. Camera broadcasts of historical or important points published by the municipality and the YouTube channel İzmirTUBE are accessed through the application. The application also provides emergency telephone and contact information of Izmir Metropolitan Municipality. Complaints, ideas and suggestions in transportation, infrastructure, environment, reconstruction, health, social support and other areas can be conveyed and solutions are provided in a short time through the application.
Current news, announcements, events and printed publications are provided through official application of Bursa Metropolitan Municipality. In the e-municipality inquiries section, debt inquiry, e-payment, document follow-up, state prices and grave location can be accessible. However, the application for these e-queries directs to the e-municipality website of the municipality. Complaints, ideas and suggestions can be forwarded from the whitetable section in application. Application also has a city guide section. In this section, users can learn places to visit in Bursa and pharmacies on duty with interactive map. The activities section provides information on activities in the city theater, art galleries, youth centers and museums. Metropolitan TV is watched and participation in surveys is provided through the application. The application also offers the contact information of Bursa Metropolitan Municipality.

News, announcements, weather and information about events can seen with the official application of Antalya Metropolitan Municipality. In transportation section, where the bus, bus routes, balance inquiry, information about the nearest stops, balance loading points açan be reached. In city guide section courthouse, hospitals, fuel stations, shopping centers, banks, football fields, basketball fields, mayors, mosques, recreation facilities, safety buildings, baths, zoo, parking lots, churches, port, picnic areas, museums, cemeteries, important points, parks, beaches, post offices, cinemas, tourist information offices can be seen. The tour guide contains information and locations on canyons, ancient cities, streams, caves, museums, parks, waterfalls and resorts. The locations of the free wifi hotspots can be seen through the application. The find taxi section provides information about the nearest taxi stations. Users have access to prices of fruit / vegetables and pharmacies on duty with the application. Information about free sports and fitness centers, arts and vocational training courses and social facilities was provided in the social services part. The e-municipality part provides guidance to the website of the municipality for debts and payment. Complaints, ideas and suggestions can be forwarded through the application. The information about the telephone numbers of the units such as emergency aid and municipal police are included in the application. Antalya Metropolitan Municipality official application has the smart city section. In the smart city section, information about smart irrigation, smart illuminating, kiosk, free wifi, panic button, chronical patient tracking and audi steps for disabled are given.

After examining the official applications of the five metropolitan municipalities, a word cloud was made about the areas they serve. The word cloud is given in Figure 1.

![Figure 1. World cloud of service areas of applications](image)

In the word cloud, the service areas in the five applications are given in a larger to small according to their frequencies. Service areas can be divided into three importance categories according to the weight scores obtained as a result of the word cloud made. The first importance category has city guide, wifi points, social facilities, public transport, pharmacies on duty, events, suggestions, complaints, museums, announcements, dealth inquiry, parking, city cameras and city theater words. The second importance category has whitetable, taxis, good prices, bus stops, council decisions, fuel statitons, daily burial, weather, cinemas, historical sites, e-payment, QR code, water cuts, health, emergency numbers, contact information and sports words. The rest are in the third importance category.
The comments of those using the official applications of the metropolitan municipalities were examined for each city. The themes of the comments regarding the official application of the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality are given in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thema</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes the application broken</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of services</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cameras failing</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not work with update</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activation code errors</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bus times are out of date</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incorrect location display</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incorrect display of traffic density</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barcode reading does not work</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Street names are out of date</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wifi error</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When Table 2 is examined, users of the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality official application experience the most problems that the application sometimes broken. The second problem is that the application has lack of services.

The themes of the comments on the official application of the Ankara Metropolitan Municipality are given in Table 3. It can be said that the users of the Ankara Metropolitan Municipality official application does not experience much trouble. The most common problem is that the application sometimes broken.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes the application broken</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wifi error</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low number of cameras</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of e-payment service</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The themes of the comments regarding the official application of the Izmir Metropolitan Municipality are given in Table 4. The users of the Izmir Metropolitan Municipality official application experience the most problems that the application sometimes broken. The other important problems are the post-update problems, the bus information is sometimes not seen and there is no real-time update in the application.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes the application broken</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-update problems</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bus times are sometimes not seen</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No real-time updates</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Error when displaying balance</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of services</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having a navigation problem</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low number of cameras</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The themes of the comments regarding the official application of the Bursa Metropolitan Municipality are given in Table 5. The users of the Bursa Metropolitan Municipality official application experience the problem that the application broken most of the time. Other important problems are the abolition of the cameras, the lack of services and the small text.
Table 5. Comments of Bursa Metropolitan Municipality Official Application

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes the application broken</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abolition of the cameras</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of services</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small text</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The themes of the comments regarding the official application of the Antalya Metropolitan Municipality are given in Table 6.

Table 6. Comments of Antalya Metropolitan Municipality Official Application

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes the application broken</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of services</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small text</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When Table 6 is examined, it can be said that the users of the Antalya Metropolitan Municipality official application have not experienced much problems. The most common problem is that the application sometimes broken. When the comments of the five cities are evaluated in general, it can be said that the users mostly complain that the application sometimes broken. Another important issue is the inadequate and incomplete services provided through the application.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

The industrial revolution that emerged in the 1800s has evolved three times with new technologies and innovations that have evolved over the years, and today for the fourth time, has started to evolve again under the name Industry 4.0. Although the first revolutions were developed primarily for wars, they have found application in every industry over time. However, Industry 4.0 and new generation technologies have directly affected all sectors and technology is now the key to competition. Cities have also begun to adapt to Industry 4.0 technologies. For this purpose, cities have started to serve the citizens with smart applications. Some cities in Turkey have developed smart applications and started to provide some services through these applications. The applications of Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, Bursa and Antalya Metropolitan Municipalities were examined. Considering the results, the following recommendations were given;

- E-payment systems that can be considered as missing services in the applications, city tour arrangement routes should be included and a section should be created for tourists.
- These applications should be promoted at the airport, bus station and touristic places of the city. Even the city tourist cards integrated with the application can be created and sold.
- Users should be able to access city cameras, especially in busy areas, for planning. The problem at this point could be privacy. Necessary legislation and regulations should be made on this subject.
- Applications run according to the users’ location. That’s why developers need to keep applications up-to-date in order for them to run correctly on most smartphones.
- The times and routes of transportation lines such as buses, ferries and trains are sometimes changed in cities. These changes need to be updated instantly in the application.
- Text in the applications should be international standard size. If necessary, the application’s texts should be able to be enlarged or reduced.

The study examined the official applications of the top five cities of Turkey with secondary data. In the following studies, empirical studies can be applied to the users.
REFERENCES


The Web-Based Travel Intermediaries Loyalty: The Influences of Trust and Satisfaction

Şükrü Fırat ÇİFTÇİ
Res.Assist., Kırklareli University
ciftci_firat@hotmail.com

Beykan ÇIZEL
Prof.Dr., Akdeniz University
beykan@akdeniz.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

There are few studies investigated the relationship among trust, satisfaction, and loyalty together in the literature in terms of web-based travel intermediaries. The main aim of this study is to investigate the factors such as trust and satisfaction creating customer loyalty in web-based travel intermediaries. It was explored the degree of importance of trust, besides satisfaction, when it is associated with loyalty. Multiple linear regression was used to examine the relationship among web based travel intermediary loyalty, satisfaction and trust. The research was conducted between February and April 2018 in Istanbul. Total of 362 data were collected by questionaires and analyzed. The results indicated that participants' satisfaction and trust predicted web-based travel intermediary loyalty at 68.9% level. Accordingly, satisfaction and trust seems to have a significant and positive affect on the web-based travel intermediary loyalty. The results provide evidence that trust is a strong influence on customer loyalty as well as satisfaction.

Keywords: E-trust, E-satisfaction, E-loyalty, Web based travel intermediaries.

INTRODUCTION

Internet has occurred as a new distribution channel and marketing medium in tourism and travel industry since mid-1990s (Xiang et al., 2015: 246). According to reports of 2017, in the world, the number of internet users reached 3,578 billion, the number of mobile phone users reached 4,68 billion, and the number of smartphones users reached 2,1 billion (Statista, 2018). These technologies have played a critical role both in the competitiveness of tourism organizations and in the experience of tourists. Internet and other information technologies have changed customer behavior. Nowadays, almost all of travel information searches, reservations and payments are done online and during the preparation stage of a trip (Huang et al., 2017).

With the commercializing of the internet, a great transformation and unique chances emerged for travel and tourism industry and this process changed the tourists’ behaviour in some ways. B2B (business-to-business) and B2C (business-to-customer) relationships were made more interactive and viable for travel-related companies. One of the most important transformations was the formation of an original and high-powered distribution and communication channel in that process filled up the gap between the customers and the travel intermediaries. After establishing a new distribution channel (internet), those travel intermediaries found a new way to reach their customers, and through this new way, they have started to make much more profits. In the terms of customers; lower prices, markdowns and time savings were the positive outcomes of this process (Amaro and Duarte, 2015).

For the web-based travel intermediaries, internet has also negative effects such as online pricing transparency, price competition, high risk perception and lack of confidence which make customers less loyal to web based travel intermediaries (Wen, 2009: 759). Additionally, there are a lot of alternatives for online customers and they have a great amount of knowledge. Online customer behaviour is more changeable and the switching costs are lower in online world (Lopez-Miguens and Vázquez, 2017: 398). The reasons why loyalty is of great importance for companies can be summed up as followings: Loyal customers can increase the income of a company; they might buy more additional products and services and they can create new businesses for the company through word-of-mouth advices. Loyal customers
can also help reducing costs because dealing with them is probably less costly, and the costs of sales or marketing and set-up can be amortised more easily by the companies. A sustainable competitive advantage can be provided by customer loyalty for the companies over time. Loyalty is the key factor for success and also companies can not survive without creating a loyal customer source (Pamies, 2012: 1257).

Even so strategies on loyalty are important for all sectors, it can be accepted that it is more suited to service sector, especially because they offer more opportunities to improve loyalty due to their nature. The concept of loyalty has become even more important for tourism-based companies selling touristic products or services which are defined as abstract, experiential, imperishable and operating in the service sector. As a reason of that it should be better understood by companies the key factors developing customer loyalty, but there is few studies about those mechanism creating customer loyalty in the literature in the terms of online transactions (Pamies, 2012: 1259).

Satisfaction and trust are two popular factors investigated extensively by researchers because of their impact on repurchase (Kim, 2012: 220; Chiu et al., 2013: 284). According to the results of previous studies (Kumar et al., 2013; Gommans et al. 2001; Özdemir et al., 2012; Bhattacherjee, 2001; Aldas-Manzano et al., 2011; Anderson and Srinivasan, 2003; Srinivasan et al., 2002; Balabanis et al., 2006; Floh and Treiblmaier, 2006; Casalo et al., 2008; Gummerus et al., 2004; Kim et al., 2009; Liang and Chen, 2009; Reichheld and Schefter, 2000; Aldas-Manzano et al., 2011; Sahin et al., 2011); there is a very strong relationship between loyalty and satisfaction, but as they stressed that satisfaction could not be translated as loyalty in any cases, even though most loyal customers emerge from satisfied ones.

In the literature, few studies have investigated the relationship among trust, satisfaction, and loyalty together in terms of web-based travel intermediaries. Therefore, the main purpose of this study is to examine the factors such as trust and satisfaction creating customer loyalty in web-based travel intermediaries. It was explored the degree of importance of trust, besides satisfaction, when it is associated with loyalty. Istanbul -one of Turkey’s most important and biggest tourism destination- was chosen for field research. Data were collected on the basis of volunteerism from international tourists visiting Istanbul via web-based travel intermediaries. Research was carried out in February-April period of 2018. 362 questionnaires were collected. The results of regression analysis shows that trust and satisfaction affect positively and significantly the web-based travel intermediary loyalty.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

E-trust is defined as “An attitude of confident expectation in an online situation of risk that one’s vulnerabilities will not be exploited” (Beldad et al., 2010; Corritore et al., 2003). E-trust, according to another definition, is to trust that company in relation to its commercial activities in the electronic environment, especially the website (Shankar et al., 2002; Beldad et al., 2010). Whereas the former definition applies to online interactions commonly, the latter is more adjusted to trying to understand e-trust in the circumstances of electronic commerce exchanges (Beldad et al., 2010: 860).

Loyalty is defined as a positive attitude towards business and repetitive buying behavior (Dick and Basu, 1994). In order to be able to talk about loyalty, positive attitudes developed by the customer towards the brand should lead the customer to repurchase behavior (Keller, 1993). Customer loyalty is recognized as an important factor which provides long-term profitability for businesses (Ribbink et al., 2004). It has been seen that a real loyal customer has a committedness and adherence towards the retailer and does not leave the retailer when a more attractive alternative emerged (Shankar et al., 2003). The importance of online trust is increased by the lack of physical contact with online companies and the lack of touch inherent in online shopping. The important nature of online trust is accepted not only by buyers and suppliers, but also by lawmakers and those concerned about the erosion of constitutional rights. While Stewart (2003) suggests a strong relationship between trust and purchasing, Sirdeshmukh et al. (2002) positions trust in direct relation to loyalty. The link between customers’ trust in a brand and brand loyalty was investigated by Lau and Lee (1999), and they found a significant positive relationship. Chaudhuri and Holbrook (2001) extented these approaches and they had a strong evidence to support the important relationship between brand trust and purchasing and commitment.

Alhabeeb (2007) describes the dynamic relationship between customer trust and product loyalty and investigates the mechanism by which these structures are formed. According to findings of their study; the last forming of product loyalty is governed not only by the change between trust and trustworthy, but also by the customer’s sense of trustworthiness, the desire to broaden the range
of self-esteem and appreciation of experience and satisfaction. These effects are particularly high if they are collected at the country level and data from participation is used. At the individual level, especially in the parliament, trust increases the likelihood of voting. Husain (2017) worked for understanding the impact of trust and satisfaction for customers in a developing country as the priorities of behavioral and attitudinal loyalty. The findings of the study show that trust and satisfaction are a strong positive effect on behavioral and attitudinal loyalty.

Satisfaction is found to be a strong positive relationship with trust, as well. Chinomona and Dubihlela (2014) have noted that although the number of studies on customer behavior has been increasing, studies on customer satisfaction, loyalty and the intention to repurchase have not been very successful in the context of African retailing. Therefore, the study, which examines these relations in South Africa retailing context, shows that as a result, the relationship between customer satisfaction and trust, customer satisfaction and loyalty, customer loyalty and repurchase intention and customer trust and repurchase intention are significant and positive. Kumar et al. (2013) investigate the direct relationship between satisfaction and loyalty (direction, shape, explained variance) and then examines the moderators, mediators, and other determinants of loyalty. According to the findings of the study, customer satisfaction impacts positively on loyalty, but just satisfaction explains the variance in quite small rate. Jambulingam et al. (2011) investigates the role of trust as a management mechanism in relation to justice and loyalty under different interdependence structures between suppliers (wholesalers) and buyers (retailers). The findings of the study show that trust as a management mechanism under the conditions of symmetrical independence is entirely mediated by the link between justice and loyalty. However, under the conditions of both perceived independence (ie lack of interdependence) and asymmetric recipient dependence, trust does not play an intermediary role but directly affects loyalty. Sahin et al. (2011) tested an overall framework for establishing a customer-brand relationship from an experiential point of view. The findings showed that brand satisfaction is a very positive effect on brand loyalty. Also, brand trust is an important influence on brand loyalty. Lau and Lee (1999) suggests three factors that affect the confidence in a brand. These three factors correspond to the three entities involved in the brand-customer relationship: The company behind the brand, the customer interacting with the brand and the brand itself. At the same time, it is also advised that trust in a brand will lead to brand loyalty. Last of all, the findings of the study reveal that the influence of a customer of brand characteristics on brand trust is important. It also shows that trust in a brand has a positive association with brand loyalty. With respect to Paulssen et al. (2014), commercial-customer relations between an auto brand and its customers are being investigated by applying structural equation modeling. The findings of the study show that brand satisfaction determines brand loyalty when the perceived risk is low, while brand trust determines brand loyalty alone when perceived risk is high.

Harris and Goode (2004) centered the loyalty and trust in the context of retailing. They found out that there is a meaningful relationship between trust and loyalty, trust and satisfaction but it has not reached a clear conclusion on the nature of relationship between satisfaction and loyalty. Büyükdag and Kitapci (2017) have investigated whether there is a moderate effect over the relationship between internet experience level, e-satisfaction and e-loyalty. According to the findings of the study, customers who have low internet experience show more e-loyalty than those who have high internet experience. It also shows that e-satisfaction significantly effects e-loyalty. Yasın et al. (2017) worked on the factors that influence customers shopping online loyalty (e-loyalty) to e-retail sites. As a result of that study, it has been found that there is a direct effect of satisfaction with the service of the relevant site and their trust on the site, while indirect effects of quality of web site they percieved via electronic trust and satisfaction in the developing process of customer loyalty to the online retail shopping site. The quality of the web site that they perceive, besides customers’ trust on that web site, is an important determinant in the formation of the customer satisfaction of the e-retail site

Kassim and Abdullah (2010) empirically investigate the relations of perceived quality of service, satisfaction, trust and loyalty in e-commerce environments in two cultures such as Malaysia and Qatar. According to the findings of the study, the perceived service quality is an important effect on customer satisfaction. Customer satisfaction is a critical influence on trust, as well. Both customer satisfaction and trust has significantly impact on loyalty. Aldas-Manzano et al. (2011) analyze the role of satisfaction, trust, frequency of use and perceived risk as the ancedents of loyalty towards customers’ e-banking sites. The results of the study show that the individual is closely linked to the level of trust and perceived risk of loyalty to a banking website. Also satisfaction has a positive relationship with loyalty.
Bozbay et al. (2017) examined the relationship among e-trust, e-loyalty, and electronic word-of-mouth communication for e-shopping sites of social media users. The findings of the research revealed that there is a meaningful relationship between e-trust, e-commitment and electronic word-of-mouth communication. In addition; according to the socio-demographic characteristics of social media users, electronic trust, e-loyalty and electronic word-of-mouth communication differ. Özdemir et al. (2012) added new informations to knowledge accumulation in the field of target management and marketing by providing a better understanding of the relationship between tourist profile, satisfaction and loyalty. According to the findings of the study, there are significant relations between tourist profile, satisfaction and loyalty and they imply strongly support that there is a meaningful relationship between tourist satisfaction and loyalty to the destination. Pesämaa et al. (2007) presented a model that suggests loyalty among tourism companies. This model has been developed on the assumption of a well-defined partner and shared expectation and experience trust. According to the findings of the study; trust is an important and powerful indicator of loyalty.

Martínez and Bosque (2013) set forth an impact model, showing the direct and indirect impacts of corporate social responsibility (CSR) on hotel customer loyalty, including trust, customer identification with the company, and satisfaction as a mediator. According to the findings; customer trust will positively influence on customer loyalty and customer satisfaction will positively influence on customer loyalty. Kim et al. (2011) to examine the factors affecting trust, satisfaction and loyalty. It is set forward that navigation functionality and perceived security have a significant positive effect on trust by results of the study. According to the findings; customer satisfaction impacts trust, which renders a critical duty as a premise of customer loyalty in online shopping for tourism products and services.

Kim et al. (2012) found that perceived security, web site features, and navigational functionality have a significant and positive effect on trustworthiness. Moreover, loyalty has strengthened the relationship between perceived security, web site features, navigation functionality and trust. Flavian et al. (2006) set forth that to determine the effect of perceived user availability on the websites visited by users, perceived usability of system increases the level of loyalty to the web site, user's trust increases as well. Also, greater usability was found to have a positive effect on user satisfaction, which in turn positively affected website loyalty. Finally, user trust is found to be partially. Loureiro and González (2008) examined that satisfaction is associate with trust and as a result, between satisfaction and trust, trust and loyalty, there is a positive relationship. According to the study; the effect of trust on satisfaction is higher than on loyalty. The study, developed by Pamies (2003), shows that trust has a positive effect on customer loyalty in retail travel agencies in Spain.

The following hypothesis has been developed and tested in accordance with the literature summary given above.

H1: Perceived Satisfaction significantly effect perceived web-based travel intermediary loyalty
H2: Perceived Trust significantly effect perceived web-based travel intermediary loyalty.

**METHODOLOGY**

In this study, we aimed to investigate the factors such as trust and satisfaction creating customer loyalty in web-based travel intermediaries. It was explored the degree of importance of trust, besides satisfaction, when it is associated with loyalty. Multiple Linear regression was used to examine the relationship among web based travel intermediary loyalty, satisfaction and trust.

Owing to investigation the relationship among web-based travel intermediary loyalty, satisfaction and trust, this study can be considered as a descriptive study. Within the scope of the research; tourists visiting İstanbul through web-based travel intermediaries were included. The convenience sampling method which is nonprobability sampling. The research was conducted between February and April 2018 in İstanbul. Istanbul was chosen because it is one of the most biggest destination visiting by tourists who use web-based travel intermediaries in Turkey. 381 data were collected from participants and after missing data were extracted, a total of 362 data were analyzed.

Survey form was employed as data collection tool in the research. The survey form included demographic questions and scales of trust, satisfaction and loyalty. For measuring the trust, the scale used for the study of Kim (2005) was utilized. For measuring satisfaction and loyalty; the scale of Yap et al. (2012) was used. A 7-point Likert-type scale (1 = strongly disagree and 7 = strongly agree) was used.

As a result of the preliminary examinations, questionnaires with missing and unsuitable data were extracted for analyses. One of the methods...
for analyzing the data set is extreme value analyses. Finally, extreme values were checked. For univariate extreme values for dependent and independent variables, a significant Z table value of 0.01 was checked in ascending or descending order, and extreme values were extracted from the data set. Cook's distance was investigated for multivariable extreme values and no value was found above 1. (Tabachnick ve Fidell, 2007). Before the data was analyzed, it was examined whether the data corresponded to the normal distribution. Since the values of skewness and kurtosis are between -1.5 and +1.5, the data were considered to be normally distributed. (Tabachnick ve Fidell, 2013).

First, the validity and reliability analyses of the measurement tools were made. Validity and reliability are the most basic features needed to be found in a measurement. Reliability is the degree to which measures are independent of error. The most widely used criterion for reliability of the scale is the Cronbach Alpha internal consistency value.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale Items</th>
<th>Standardized Parameter Values</th>
<th>T-Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trust in E-tailer (AVE=.70; CR=.87; α=.87)</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>17.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This site is trustworthy.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This Website vendor gives the impression that it keeps promises and commitments.</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>20.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I believe that this Website vendor has my best interests in mind</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>16.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction (AVE = .80; CR = .92; α=.92)</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>22.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall, I am satisfied with web-based travel intermediaries</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>22.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web-based travel intermediaries meet my expectations</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>22.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The overall quality of the service provided by Web-based travel intermediaries is excellent</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>19.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loyalty (AVE = .71; CR = .91; α=.91)</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>18.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I prefer this web-based travel intermediary above others.</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>18.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I intend to continue using this web-based travel intermediary.</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>20.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would recommend this web-based travel intermediary to others.</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>20.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am a customer loyal to this web-based travel intermediary.</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>18.82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Compliance Indexes of Measurement Model

\[
\chi^2 = 736.15, \text{sd}=349, \chi^2/\text{sd}=2.10, \text{RMSEA}=0.055, \text{CFI}=0.98, \text{PNFI}=0.83, \text{SRMR}=0.048
\]

Note: All loadings are significant at the 0.01 level. AVE; Average variance extracted; CR; Composite reliability; α;Coefficient alpha; CFI; Parsimony normed fit index; SRMR; Standardized root mean square residual RMSEA; Comparative fit index; PNFI; Root mean square error of approximation.

Cronbach Alpha values (α), which indicates the reliability coefficient of all scales used in the research, are above 0.70 (Nunnally, 1970). As a result; the measurement tools and dimensions used in the research questionnaire appear to provide internal consistency measures. (Tablo 1). Confirmatory factor analysis was used to test the construct validity of the measurement tools. Standardized parameter values, T values, of the measurement model are given in Table 1. The parameter estimates belonging to the model are included in the table and the factor weights are calculated as the coefficient estimates standardized according to the maximum likelihood method. All the coefficients were found to be significant in the order of 0.01. The compliance indexes of the model are shown collectively in Table 1. These findings show that the expressions are correctly explained by the factors and can be regarded as proof of construct validity of the scales.

For the convergence validity, Fornell and Larcker (1981) calculated item reliability, construct reliability and average variance extracted. Composite reliability is the main measure used in the measurement model. The composite reliability calculated for each dimension is shown in Table 2.1. All values are above the acceptable limit of 0.70 (Hair et al., 1998; Nunnally, 1978). One of the indicators of convergence validity is the average variance extracted (AVE) ratio. This value is expected to be equal to or higher than 0.50 (Bagozzi et al., 1991). In this study, all AVE values were over 0.50.
RESULTS

In this section, descriptive statistics and the outcomes of the analysis from testing hypotheses for the purpose of the research are given. 51.4% (186) of participants were male and 48.6% (176) were female. 41% (93) were aged between 18 and 24 years, 35.1% (127) were 25-31 years, 19.6% (71) were 32-38 years, 9.1% 45 years, 4.1% (15) 46-52 years, 6.4% (23) 53 years and above. The total number of customers’ years of usage of web-based travel intermediaries consist of 46.1% (167) for 1-5 years, 39.2% (142) for 5-10 years, 12.7% (46), 1.9% (7) for 16-20 years. When the web-based travel intermediaries five most frequently used by participants were examined: 35.36% (128) booking.com, 17.96% (65) expedia.com, 13.54% (49) airbnb.com (28) skyscanner.com, 3.87% (14) trivago.com.

The mean, standard deviation and correlation coefficients for the variables are given in the table 2. The Variance Inflation Factor (VIF), which investigates the correlation between independent variables before the regression test, was examined. This factor was well below the grade value of 10, and the tolerance statistics were well above the limit value (1-R²) of 0.309 (Satisfaction tolerance value= 0.777; Trust tolerance value = 0.777). That is, there is no perfect linear relationship between predictor variables, each variable explains the different dimensions of the variance and the results of the regression analyzes are significant.

| Table 2. Descriptive Statistics and Correlation Values |
|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
|           | Mean      | Std. Deviation | Loyalty   | Trust     |
| Loyalty   | 5.4793    | 1.05144     |           |           |
| Trust     | 5.2240    | 0.74778     | 0.449     |           |
| Satisfaction | 5.5727 | 1.08535 | 0.828 | 0.472 |

Multiple linear regression analysis was conducted to examine to what extent satisfaction and trust determines loyalty to web-based travel intermediaries. The results of multiple linear regression analysis were statistically significant. F= 400.753, P<0.05. The value of R² is 0.691 (table 3). This result tells us that 69.1% of loyalty on the web-based travel intermediary depends on independent variables. The value of Adjusted R² is 0.689. This result shows that the variance of 68.9% of loyalty on the web-based travel intermediary is predicted by trust and satisfaction.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3. Results of Regression Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Independent variables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When Beta coefficients in the table were examined, after all of the independent variables were introduced into the regression model, there was a significant “trust” (β = 0.074, p <0.05) and “satisfaction” (β = 0.79.3, P<0.001) contribution in explaining web based travel intermediary loyalty. According to there results; it can be said that the significance order of the independent variables on the dependent variable is “satisfaction” (β =0.79.3, P<0.001) and “Trust” (β =0.074, P<0.05). It is seen that “satisfaction” (β=0.79.3) is a very important factor affecting web based travel intermediary loyalty. The relationship between trust (β= 0.074) and web-based travel intermediary loyalty is relatively low. This means that one standard deviation increased in trust will lead to a 0.074 standard deviation increase in web-based travel intermediary loyalty.
when other variables are under control. According to these results; Hypothesis H1 and H2 were accepted. Regression analysis shows that trust and satisfaction affect positively and significantly the web-based travel intermediary loyalty. Therefore, hypothesis, perceived trust and perceived satisfaction significantly effect perceived web-based travel intermediary loyalty was supported by this study.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

In this study, the effect of trust and satisfaction on the loyalty of tourists using web based travel intermediaries was examined. The results of the analysis provide evidence that trust is a strong influence on customer loyalty as well as satisfaction. Trust and satisfaction are the terms that describe the relationship between the suppliers and customers in the world of e-commerce. In this study, inter-variable relationships were set forth by using linear regression and we found out that participants’ satisfaction and trust predicted web-based travel intermediary loyalty at 68.9% level. Accordingly, satisfaction and trust seems to have a significant and positive affect on the web-based travel intermediary loyalty. This is in line with the results of previous studies (Moriuchi and Takahashi, 2016; Pamies, 2012; Şahin et al., 2011; Husain, 2017; Martínez and Bosque, 2013), and they have stressed the importance of achieving customer trust in e-commerce, beside satisfaction. In the light of the findings of this research, It can be recommended that web-based travel intermediaries should effort to obtain their customers’ trust if they want to reduce the negative effects of internet on customer loyalty. Thus they can easily create a loyal customer source for stability and success under intense competition conditions.

This study conducted on tourists who visited Istanbul through the web-based travel intermediaries. Therefore, the results of this study limit the generalization. In order to obtain generalizable results, it is suggested to test in different samples. For further studies, different variables can be added to first model which is not included in the scope of this study, such as service quality, website features etc. In addition, researches can add “information quality” as an other cognition based trust antecedent and “reputation,” “feedback of buyers”, “word-of-mouth” as other affect-based trust antecedents to hierarcical regression models to explain different dimensions of variance in trust in web based travel intermediaries. Moreover, alternative models can be proposed to understand the relationships between the structure in first model studied in our work. For example, trust can be positioned as a moderator of the relationship between satisfaction and loyalty.

REFERENCES


Fornell, C., & Larcker, D. F. (1981). Structural equation models with unobservable variables and measurement error: Algebra and statistics. *Journal of Marketing Research, 18*(1), 382-388.


Dehumanizing Tourism and the Despair

Atilla YÜKSEL
Prof. Dr., Adnan Menderes University
atilliayuksel@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Tourism is an evolved form of colonization, an agent invented to control the economies of developing countries, and a means of terrorism with high economic, social, ecological and cultural destructive power. This paper likes to ask three simple questions to those who are happy to see their town among the most visited towns: “Do you know how many dollars did you spend to make 1$ income in tourism?”; “What goods/services did you have to import for investment in tourism?” and “What is the difference between the zoo and the locals whose lives are mortgaged for tourism and whose fates are trapped for the taste and gaze of tourists?”

INTRODUCTION

Considering the growing annual volume of international tourist arrivals, the generated total revenue and the jobs, it is not surprising to witness that governments worldwide take tourism as a panacea to remedy economic bottlenecks. But, despite its so-called window-dressed benefits, along with ceaseless goodwill statements and biased claims of politicians and authorities, tourism destinations, particularly in developing countries, by and large still continue to face with one of these three problems, characterizing classical mentality of tourism development: That is;

i. either large foreign capital purchases domestic capital resulting in a change in the status of ownership and hence the attractiveness of locality (e.g., naturalness, localness, heritage etc.) is destroyed for the sake of urbanization and rapid economic returns;

ii. employees are kept underqualified, sometimes consciously, and customers are therefore unhappy due to low quality of services and products, resulting in an increase in bargaining power of tour operators intimidating locals with shifting their operations to another cost-effective destination; or

iii. that local people are marginalized or excluded from the economy resulting in income leakages outside the economy fueling community resentment. This “dehumanizing” nature, with a very narrow biased economic perspective, is notoriously obsessive for creating an “open museum” in which wealthy and bourgeois visitors enjoy their time while staying oblivious to the real problems of those who are kept in the social prison against their free will.

Thus far several adverse consequential aspects of tourism development have been studied, including environmental, economic and socio-cultural. More specifically, tourism and its generally overlooked negative consequences on locals, limited exchanges between hosts and the visitors akin to master-slave relationships, rising visitor numbers and diminishing carrying capacities of destinations, as well as, environmental degradations, social segregations resulting from overtourism, etc., have been much debated and well documented. However, the individual well-being (i.e., what tourism really triggers in physical, mental and spiritual states of individuals e.g., holiday makers, locals, employees) has not been deservedly taken on board. Not surprisingly, voices continue to rise from different parts of the world echoing that tourism makes life miserable, particularly for residents and locals as employees:

• “Employment in the tourism industry is often dehumanizing”;
• “Tourism kills the city, we are sick of gentrification”;
• “Tourist: your luxury trip is my daily misery.”

Classical tourism, driven by capitalistic greediness, has reached a point where tourism has become related to “objects only”, not to the individuals nor to their life. Several dehumanizing examples can be listed. For example, many men from the western world, aiming to have an opportunity of “good time”, continues to flock into Asian destinations to choose under-aged Asian girls, who is even unable to make any verbal communication, for sex encounters and all human related attributes such as names, values, family history
are not being exchanged in these encounters. Lives of Asians are ruined because all tourists, without any exception, want to feel like a hu’man.” Hence it would not be wrong to claim that tourism in most of the cases deprives people of positive human qualities, as broad range of indignities exist. Subtle (looks, gestures, tone of voice, disrespect to local customs, patronizing interactions etc.) or brutal forms of dehumanization occur not only when one group of people (tourists) see others as objects not human, but also when the powerful (tourists) take the very humaneness of others by trying to manage their economic and social relations. Arguing that classical form of tourism and dehumanization stand to be the two sides of the same coin should not be an overstatement.

Very recently a new concept, humanistic tourism has emerged from the ruins and mist of the mistakes, cultural discourses of classical tourism and it has gently reminded us of we must return being “human” again. From my point of view humanistic tourism should indeed defend human dignity in the face of its vulnerability. To defend human dignity means to respect for human freedom and be against the instrumentalization of human beings into human capital and mere means for profits. In this respect, humanistic tourism seems to hold a potential as an experiential tourism activity including characteristics of both conventional tourism and its own unique characteristics, particularly the morale aspects with an aim to help people fulfill their potential and maximize their well-being. Some view this new concept as “a revolutionary way of reducing the negative impacts of tourism and takes into account the relationship between hosts and guests as based on the tourist experience” (Bizzari, 2016, p. 110.).

From these flimsy attempts; however, there arises four intriguing questions.

i. Why now, all of a sudden, the tourism industry seems to have started to be concerned with morale issues and spiritual world of tourists?

ii. How so-called “humanism”, a popular recent movement, will bind up the wounds stemmed from the destructive structure of classical tourism which continues to flourish despite the suffrages (hosts sufferings from pollutions, crowds, environmental problems, segregations etc.)?

iii. What are the most important features that separate humanistic tourists and humanistic tourism, offered as a new commodity to consume, from other types?

iv. Will tourism investors control their economical and ideological urges and change their attitudes and behaviors at a short notice?

I believe the search for new concepts in tourism (humanistic, exotic, erotic, ecotic, artic…) is kind of a game, researchers, marketers, tourist authorities have been playing somewhat for serving capitalistic desires. But not all games are harmless! The consequences of participating in that game and believing that humanistic tourism etc., is the exact saver or it is the ultimate remedy will be disputable. Taking narrow and biased perspectives, grand narratives and centralized theories of classical tourism and insisting that this is what it is to be humanistic, this theory is what it is to explain humanistic tourism best and this method of analysis tell us what it is to be the humanistic effect will be a fruitless loss of time unless dehumanizing nature of tourism is recognized, better understood and accepted. The continuation of the production of special types to fragment tourism may turn into an important obstacle that prevents us from seeing the big picture in the tourism industry. First and foremost, tourism can no longer be a specialized consumer product or a consumption type. Tourism has long changed from being a mortal and a short ritual to a modality through which ever-increasing modern life is being organized. It is thus time for us to perceive tourism as a global social life experience rather than being seen as the behavior of those who are far away from home. Secondly, there exists a fatal desire to exoticize and eroticize tourism but the current tourism research cannot go beyond “what other people do in situations away from home”. Consequently it produces nothing but “formalized gossips.” Third, humanistic movement may mistakenly be seen akin to another type of nomadism. Humanistic tourism cannot be nomadism but it can be viewed as a migration site for modern nomads. This tourism movement is not just about leaving and going back to where it is departed, but it is a the very mixed emotions, such as being homesick and yet yearning for a new home, missing the new life on the way back to home. Fourth, the current state of “masculinity in how we see the world around us” is another major issue. Almost everything, which is being subject of tourism and tourism research is the produce of the man’s world. If this gendered issue is the case, how can we talk about humanism? Tourism at present can be liken to an open museum, in which all the feminine subjects and objects are thought, designed, transformed and exhibited to serve the men, in response to the quest for devoursing desire of masculinity: “to give pleasure to man”. Neither the tourists traveling nor the tourism researchers have any domestic responsibilities as in the case of so-called man’s everyday mentality. There is a rising need for a non-gendered perspective that senses and embraces the new concepts, social happenings, free
will, self-actualisation etc., tenderly before anyone starts competing with one another. It is high time to move away a bit from the men domination in viewing the tourism world. Fifth, the idea that humanistic tourism should be purely visual is a great mistake, wrongly assuming that the humanistic individual almost always has subjective freedom. That is, it is wrong to believe that humanistic tourism is just a subjective world in which the tourists would like to see the artificial structure created for seeing. The humanistic tourists is in pursuit of a return to the essence, to the self, and look at things with a second eye, immerse in the details of the daily life of the unimportant matters rather than the details of the artificial structure erected for the tourist business. Hence humanistic tourism is not just the consumption of visual repertoire. Humanistic tourist doesn't want to separate herself from the real environment and she does want to merge and melt within the real environment with her self-styled manner, not in commercially designed touristic site. Last but not least, humanism movement should abandon seeing human beings as homo economous and should regard them as homo ludens.

In line with Tribe (2006, 2010), tribe and Airey (2007), Franklin and Crang (2001) I believe that tourism cannot be understood unless the present mentality in research, which has made an unfortunate marriage with marketing and management disciplines, continues. In particular, the marriage with these disciplines and the “positivist ambitions” behind scientific labeling and classification in research has led to the emergence of flat-footed child who is unhappy both psychologically and sociologically. The first, and perhaps the most important criticism is that responses of people who are forced to respond to research questions are considered correct without considering the possibility and impact of chemistry change as a result of being on a holiday (Yüksel 2017). It would be a scientific deception to expect that the chemistry of a man, struggling with jetlag and / or insomnia after a long journey, forcing extra tensions to the already crippled cognitive functions, will produce uncontaminated answers to the questions. Secondly, the obsession with “exact certainty” and “generalization through standardization” inherited from other disciplines in tourism research are destroying individual based realities catastrophically that is unique to each person. Certainty in tourism research is doubtful since whether human nature is determinist or not is still a question, an unresolved issue. Thus, the current logic followed in many tourism research, largely coming from determinist approach, itself is extremely controversial. According to the classical logic of this paradigm, one hypothesis is to be accepted or rejected as true or false. However, to say fully “yes” or fully “no” for a concerning hypothesis, that is to be certain about the result for hundred percent, is not always possible in the real world. Third; one should start with questioning the “secret whys” of tradition in which “extreme” values are victimized and sacrificed for the sake of taking a mathematical average or standardization. Note that, extreme cases may contain much more valuable information. Fourth; the development of good questions has been abandoned due to the popular culture and ready-made so called universal sets (copy-paste) of questions has been taken as a panacea. Note that, not just the answers but the questions rule the life. Objectivity in research is much desired but more diluted condition, an artefact of artificial reality. Note that, objectivity in research is a subjective illusion. I must not that what is valuable research anyway? For a research to be valuable should it find a difference/relationship or prove that the difference/relationships (if any) found is coincidental or not?” Last but not least; the conventional tourism persists to use a “defective research template”. In fact, this template produces stale, mostly useless information, repeats the same issues over and over again. Thus, thanks to the researchers tourism has evolved into an effort to classify a series of actions of travel, stay, and departure, which can be counted as one of a series of different, local incidents of a ruthless but sensible economic man. Hence the aim of tourism research has been shifted to find a subclass under a general class, the subclass under the subclass, and the subclass under the prior subclass. This is a big delusion. As a result, it is assumed that tourism can be organized and managed through research-based “to-do lists.” This is a far-fetching dream. If questionable practices of small sample sizes, tiny effects, underpowered experiments, invalid exploratory analyses, flimsy replications and flagrant conflicts of interest, together with an obsession for pursuing fashionable trends of dubious importance continue in the humanistic tourism era as it is, then we will hear the following lines more often:

- “All the research findings acquired through the Likert and Semantic differential scales are questionable” (Rossiter, 2011);
- “Most of the findings that modern science has yielded is false” (Ioannidis, 2005);
- “It is not false to say that 90% of all the findings are false” (Kollat et al., 1972).

In sum, research practices should reconsider their roots in the history, where they originate from and should not forget that “reasoning” through observing, thinking and asking questions from real
life is science. Hence, a comprehensive inquiry into the hegemony of current logic and other misconceptions that prevail in research practices and literature in the name of doing better science for understanding and explaining tourism phenomenon is warranted more than ever. And I strongly suggest the Nobel Prize Committee to consider devising a new award/prize scheme or expand the scope of the existing Holberg prize for social scientists in tourism who dare to replicate his study before publication.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

This study aims to investigate the satisfaction level of the residents in Eskisehir from the tram services in the city through the European Customer Satisfaction Model (ECSI). Structural Equation Model (SEM) was adopted in order to test the model. The factors taken into consideration in the research model are image, Customer Expectations, Perceived Quality, Perceived Value, Customer Satisfaction, Customer Complaints and Customer Loyalty. For this purpose, 360 passengers waiting for tram at 9 tram stations in Eskisehir in May 2019 were surveyed. The analysis was based on the data obtained from 354 survey forms. The research model was analyzed with SEM and the suitability of the model was evaluated according to various compliance criteria. According to analysis results, the chi-square value calculated for model fit was 176,22 and (χ²/sd) value was calculated as 1,43. As a result of the study, statistically significant relationships were found between the variables.

Keywords: Tram, Image, Customer Satisfaction, ECSI, Eskisehir, Structural Equation Model

INTRODUCTION

Public transport services are considered to be one of the most important factors demonstrating the quality of a city. It is vital that the residents can go to their jobs and schools easily and do not encounter any problems related to transportation in their social lives. It has been observed that improvements in public transport services in recent years affect customer satisfaction and the quality of life. The awareness of public transportation services has attracted the attention of the scientific world. Therefore, many articles on public transport services have been published in recent years. Public transport services, especially in crowded destinations, are a cost-effective solution for traffic congestion. Also its improvement is critical for the city managers and decision-makers. One of the most important public transport services that facilitate the lives of residents is the tram (Gronau and Jagermeier 2007; Le-Klähn et al., 2014; Isikli et al., 2017). Thus, the opinions of the residents are needed for the improvement of tram systems. This view makes up the starting point of this research.

In May 2002, the Eskisehir Metropolitan Municipality signed a construction and supply contract with Bombardier Transportation Consortium to construct a modern tram system in the city in line with the transportation master plan. The project was completed in 20 months. ESTRAM, which won the 2004 Light Rail System Award of the year in International Transportation, was put into service in Eskisehir in December 2004. In this process, the integration project of ESTRAM and other public transportation services was carried out. Bus and minibus routes have been determined to support ESTRAM passing through the city center. The aim is to reduce the traffic density in the city center and increase pedestrian areas. In this context, the pedestrian zones and public parks were restructured. Eskişehir is the city with the highest rate of rail system usage in Turkey. The tram system of Eskisehir is awarded by the UITP in 2004. The length of the
rail system in Eskisehir is 37 km. There are 37 tram vehicles in the rail system fleet. According to 2017 figures, passenger capacity is 41.6 million. There are 7 routes on the 37 km long tram network. These routes are; Otogar-SSK, OGU-SSK, Otogar-OGU, 71 Evler-Opera, OGU-Çankaya, SSK-Batikent, SSK-Camlica (Eskişehir Urban Rail Systems, 2019). In this study, the satisfaction of the residents in Eskişehir from tram services was investigated with the European Customer Satisfaction Model (ECSI). Structural Equation Model (SEM) was used to test the research model.

LITERATURE REVIEW

In order to reach an appropriate level of service quality in rail systems, service providers should consider many service quality factors associated with public transport. Isikli et al. (2017) investigated key service quality factors that increase passenger satisfaction in Istanbul’s rail transport network system using the data obtained from a comprehensive survey conducted by Istanbul Public Transportation Inc. The importance of service quality factors has been evaluated in order to prioritize service delivery and increase passenger satisfaction by using various social selection techniques. According to the results of the research, the main service quality factors for the public interest are; costs, waiting and crowds.

Mouwen and Rietveld (2013) evaluated several factors that determine whether competitive systems in the Netherlands are effective in terms of service quality, number of trips, timing, speed and cleanliness. Dell'olio et al. (2011) described waiting time, cleanliness and comfort as the most important public transport factors. Redman et al. (2013) conducted a comprehensive study on service quality factors in public transport. According to this study, reliability, price, speed, access, comfort and convenience are the most important factors driving people to use public transport. Hassan et al. (2013) stated that the most desired service quality factors of public transport services consist of travel time, travel distance, service time, reliability, frequency, capacity, price, cleanliness, comfort, security, personnel and information.

Brouns et al. (2009) investigated the balance between the impact of access to the station on passenger overall satisfaction and the factors of public transport services. It is claimed that the interest in the railway network can be increased by improving services in some parts of the public transport network. Eboli and Mazzulla (2007) investigated the effect of the relationship between global customer satisfaction and service quality characteristics. Another study conducted by Eboli and Mazzulla (2012) analyses how passengers perceive different quality factors of public transport services. According to the results, the most important factors are speed, consistency, frequency and cleanliness. Yilmaz, et al. (2016) investigated the satisfaction of service quality, image and customer impact on customer complaints and loyalty.

METHOD

This section contains information about the research model and hypotheses, the universe and the sample of the research and the data collection tool.

European Customer Satisfaction Index (ECSI)

Customer and satisfaction are accepted as important factors in improving the quality of products and services for companies / institutions / organizations (O’Loughlin and Coenders, 2002). Customer satisfaction is a concept that is given importance by the manufacturers. Higher customer satisfaction creates higher profit and higher market-share. In addition, it gives companies a sustained competitive advantage (Fornell, 1992). Customer satisfaction is generally recognized as an important determinant of repeat sales, positive opinion and customer loyalty. The customers who are satisfied with the bought products purchase the same product again and tell their satisfaction to other consumers (Fornell et al., 1996). Higher consumer satisfaction has many benefits to companies such as increased customer loyalty, improved firm reputation, low price flexibility, lower costs of future transactions and higher employee productivity (Anderson and Fornell, 1994).

The ECSI model is a structural model based on the assumptions that customer satisfaction consists of a number of factors such as perceived quality (PQ), perceived value (PV), customer expectations, and the image of the firm. These factors are pioneers of overall customer satisfaction. This model also predicts results when a customer is satisfied or not. Each factor in the ECSI model consists of a latent structure managed by multiple indicators (Johnson et al. 2001).
ECSI that was a modified version of the ACSI model considers the European economy as a whole. Therefore, the countries’ Customer Satisfaction Index (CSI) scores can be compared with each other countries and with the European average (Eklöf and Westlund, 2002). The customer satisfaction PQ, PV, customer expectations and loyalty structures in the ECSI model are modelled like ACSI. The main difference between ACSI and ECSI models is the ECSI model contains the company image as a latent variable in the model. In the ECSI model, the company image is expected to have a direct impact on customer expectations, satisfaction and loyalty. The image structure evaluates the basic image of the company (Andreassen and Lindestad, 1998). The image is considered to consist of an important component of the customer satisfaction model. The image consists of reliability, professionalism, innovation and prestige. The main purpose of image is to contribute to the society (Martensen, Kristensen and Grønholdt; 2000; Grigoroudis and Siskos, 2003).

Customer expectations (CE) are identified as the level of quality that customers expect from the product they want to buy. It is the result of previous consumption experience of a product or service (O’Loughlin and Coenders, 2002). Customer expectations predict the capability of service providers to deliver quality products in the future. Therefore, it has a direct and positive relationship with the evaluation of the firm’s performance.

Perceived quality (PQ) is vital to overall customer satisfaction (Fornell et al., 1996). Perceived quality is expected to have a positive impact on overall customer satisfaction (Anderson et al., 1994). Perceived quality is a widely studied and discussed issue (Cronin and Taylor, 1992). In the literature, PQ was modelled as a direct measure of value (Cronin et al., 2000). Parasuraman and Grewal (2000) asserted that the quality-value-loyalty chain is a subject that needs more experimental research. In the literature of management information system (MIS); PQ has been accepted as the determinant of user / customer satisfaction of information systems along with information quality, system quality and service quality (DeLone and McLean, 1992). The quality is expected to have a direct impact on value (Anderson and Sullivan, 1993; Fornell, 1992). Quality and value are measured and adjusted for the price factor (Anderson et al., 1994). Therefore, CE and PQ are expected to have a positive relationship (Fornell et al., 1996).

Perceived value (PV) is the level of perceived product quality according to the price paid or the direction of customer expectation (Parasuraman et al., 1988). The value is defined as the ratio of perceived quality to price (Anderson et al., 1994). The literature of service management has shown that customer satisfaction is the result of a customer’s perception of value (Hallowell, 1996) and an important measure of overall satisfaction (Fornell et al. 1996). Also, the addition of PV to the Customer Satisfaction Index (CSI) model increased the comparability of results for companies and sectors (Anderson and Fornell, 2000).

Customer loyalty (CL) is defined as the continuous re-purchase of a preferred product / service in the future (Oliver, 1999). It is important for marketers to understand the consequences of customer satisfaction, including customer loyalty (Bei and Chiao, 2001) and the intention to continue working with a particular provider (Burnham et al. 2003). Customer satisfaction leads to more customer loyalty (Anderson and Sullivan, 1993; Fornell, 1992). Customer loyalty increases future revenue (Fornell, 1992), reduces production costs (Reichheld and Sasser, 1990) and reduces price flexibility (Anderson, 1996). Customer satisfaction is considered to be an important impact on the formation of consumers’ future purchase intentions (Taylor and Baker, 1994). Therefore, it is thought that there is a positive relationship between customer satisfaction level and customer loyalty.

Complaint is defined as a conflict between the customer and the organization (Yu vd., 2005).

The satisfied customer tells the other potential customers about his or her positive experiences. In other words, it is possible to make word of mouth marketing (File and Prince, 1992). Fornell et al. (1996) claimed that the result of increased customer satisfaction is a reduction in complaints and therefore the relationship between customer satisfaction level and customer complaints should be negative. The relationship between customer complaint and customer loyalty depends on the complaint management capabilities of company. The ESCI model assumes that customer complaints have a positive impact on loyalty.
The Research Model and Hypotheses

ECSI was used as the research model in this study. The ECSI Model is shown in Figure 1.

The hypotheses proposed to test the relationships in the model are:

H₁: Customer expectations have a positive effect on perceived quality.
H₂: Customer expectations have a positive effect on customer satisfaction.
H₃: Customer expectations have a positive effect on perceived value.
H₄: Perceived quality has a positive effect on perceived value.
H₅: Perceived quality has a positive effect on customer satisfaction.
H₆: Perceived value has a positive effect on customer satisfaction.
H₇: Corporate image has a positive effect on customer expectations.
H₈: Corporate image has a positive effect on customer satisfaction.
H₉: Corporate image has a positive impact on customer loyalty.
H₁₀: Customer satisfaction has a positive impact on customer loyalty.
H₁₁: There is a relationship between customer satisfaction and customer complaint.
H₁₂: There is a relationship between customer complaint and customer loyalty.

Data Collection Tool and Sample

The survey used in the study consisted of two parts as Eskisehir tram customer attitudes towards satisfaction and demographic information. The first section of the survey form consisted of demographic characteristics of participants such as gender, age, the frequency of tram use, etc. The second section of the survey form consisted of 5-point Likert type questions related to attitude. In this context, the survey was applied to 360 participants who waited tram at 9 tram station in May 2019. The analysis was based on the data obtained from 354 surveys that were fully filled. The related stations consisted of Ismet Inonu, Alanonu, Uluonder, Buyukdere, Ataturk Bulvari, Porsuk Sports Hall, Carsi, Eskisehir Osmangazi University and Espark. In the recommended model of attitude; customer satisfaction, loyalty, customer complaint, perceived value, perceived quality and customer expectations factors are included.
ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

Descriptive Statistics
Table 1 shows the descriptive statistics related to demographic information of the participants.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GENDER</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>49,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>50,8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGE</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-25</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>44,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-33</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>17,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-41</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>14,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42-48</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>9,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48-55</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>7,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56-63</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64+</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2,3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EDUCATION</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary School Graduate</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>13,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary School Graduate</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>25,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s Degree</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>61,3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FREQUENCY OF TRAM USE</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>35,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-3</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>29,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-5</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>18,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6+</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>16,1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOAD MONEY</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>70,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100-200</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>24,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200-300</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300+</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1,4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Results of Structural Equation Modelling
The goodness and acceptable fit values of the structural equation model is given in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fitness Criteria</th>
<th>Good Fit</th>
<th>Acceptable Fit</th>
<th>Research Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NFI</td>
<td>0.95 ≤ NFI ≤ 1</td>
<td>0.90 ≤ NFI ≤ 0.95</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NNFI</td>
<td>0.97 ≤ NNFI ≤ 1</td>
<td>0.95 ≤ NNFI ≤ 0.97</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFI</td>
<td>0.95 ≤ CFI ≤ 1</td>
<td>0.90 ≤ CFI ≤ 0.95</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GFI</td>
<td>0.95 ≤ GFI ≤ 1</td>
<td>0.90 ≤ GFI ≤ 0.95</td>
<td>0.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGFI</td>
<td>0.95 ≤ AGFI ≤ 1</td>
<td>0.90 ≤ AGFI ≤ 0.95</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMSEA</td>
<td>0 ≤ RMSEA ≤ 0.05</td>
<td>0.05 ≤ RMSEA ≤ 0.08</td>
<td>0.035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRMR</td>
<td>0 ≤ SRMR ≤ 0.05</td>
<td>0.05 ≤ SRMR ≤ 0.10</td>
<td>0.038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( \chi^2 )</td>
<td>0 ≤ ( \chi^2 ) / df ≤ 2</td>
<td>2 ≤ ( \chi^2 ) / df ≤ 3</td>
<td>1.43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to Table 2: the Root Mean Square Error of Approximation (RMSEA) value calculated for the fit of the model is 0.035, Goodness of Fit Index (GFI) value is 0.95, $X^2$ value is 116.30, Standardized RMR value is 0.038, $X^2 / df = 116.30 / 81 = 1.43$. When the results of the recommended model are examined, it can be said that the ECSI model is within acceptable limits.

Firstly, the suitability of the data to the multivariate normal distribution was tested for the selection of the appropriate parameter estimation technique. The chi-square value was calculated as 600.274 ($p < 0.01$) and it was determined that the data set was not distributed normally. Therefore, Robust ML was used as the parameter estimation method. The standardized parameter estimates of the ECSI model are given in Figure 2.

According to results shown in Figure 2, a positive relationship was found between Image and Customer Expectations variables. One unit increase in the image variable causes a 0.88 unit increase in the customer expectations variable. On the other hand, there was no statistically significant relationship between Image and Customer Satisfaction and Image and Customer Loyalty variables. A positive relationship was found between Customer Expectation and Perceived Quality variables. This result shows that one unit increase in customer expectations will result in an increase of 0.68 units in perceived quality. There was a positive relationship between Customer Expectation and Perceived Value variables. This result indicates that one unit increase in customer expectations will result in an increase of 0.34 units in perceived value. A positive relationship was found between Customer Expectation and Customer Satisfaction variables. One unit increase in customer expectation increases customer satisfaction by 0.41 units.

There was a positive relationship between Perceived Quality and Perceived Value and Perceived Quality and Customer Satisfaction variables. In addition, a positive relationship was found between Perceived Value and Customer Satisfaction variables. A positive relationship was found between Customer Satisfaction and Customer Loyalty variables. This value indicates that one unit of change in customer satisfaction will result in 0.51 units of change in customer loyalty. There was a positive relationship between Customer Satisfaction and Complaint variables. Accordingly, one unit change in customer satisfaction causes 0.74 units change in the complaint. There was no significant relationship between Complaints and Customer Loyalty latency variables.
The summary path diagram of research model is given in Figure 3.

### Table 3. SEM Results for Research Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Standardized Loads</th>
<th>Error Variance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IMJ:</td>
<td>IMJ9: Estram has good relations with its customers.</td>
<td>0,72***</td>
<td>0,52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IMJ10: Estram’s technology is new.</td>
<td>0,67***</td>
<td>0,45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IMJ11: Estram has a good image.</td>
<td>0,75***</td>
<td>0,56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COM:</td>
<td>COM26: I can easily convey my complaints and requests about the tram.</td>
<td>0,90***</td>
<td>0,80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>COM27: Estram manages customer complaints quickly and efficiently.</td>
<td>0,81***</td>
<td>0,65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOY:</td>
<td>SAD 29: Tram is my first choice in urban transportation.</td>
<td>0,58***</td>
<td>0,33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SAD 31: I recommend that people prefer to take the tram for their</td>
<td>0,96***</td>
<td>0,92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>journeys in Eskisehir.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAT:</td>
<td>SAT23: I am satisfied with the performance of the tram.</td>
<td>0,74***</td>
<td>0,54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SAT24: I am satisfied with the comfortable travel by tram.</td>
<td>0,76***</td>
<td>0,57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SAT25: I am generally satisfied with the tram services.</td>
<td>0,84***</td>
<td>0,71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXP:</td>
<td>EXP12: General service quality of tram transportation is sufficient.</td>
<td>0,80***</td>
<td>0,64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EXP13: Tram services meet customers’ expectations.</td>
<td>0,76***</td>
<td>0,58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EXP14: The customers are unlikely to encounter negative situations in</td>
<td>0,57***</td>
<td>0,33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>tram services.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PV:</td>
<td>PV16: Tram ticket prices are consistent with service quality.</td>
<td>0,75***</td>
<td>0,56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PV32: I think that the quality of service provided by tram meets the fee paid.</td>
<td>0,89***</td>
<td>0,79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PQ:</td>
<td>PQ18: Attention is paid to the cleanliness of the tram.</td>
<td>0,52***</td>
<td>0,27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PQ19: Tram times are good for me.</td>
<td>0,58***</td>
<td>0,34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PQ20: The tramway ventilation system is suitable.</td>
<td>0,69***</td>
<td>0,48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*** p < 0,01;
Table 4. Standardized Parameter Estimates, t-t Values and Hypothesis Test Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Flow Direction</th>
<th>Standardized Parameter Estimates</th>
<th>Hypothesis Test Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H₁</td>
<td>EXP → PQ</td>
<td>0.68***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₂</td>
<td>EXP → MEM</td>
<td>0.41**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₃</td>
<td>EXP → ADEG</td>
<td>0.34***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₄</td>
<td>PQ → PV</td>
<td>0.34***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₅</td>
<td>PQ → SAT</td>
<td>0.43***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₆</td>
<td>PV → SAT</td>
<td>0.24***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₇</td>
<td>IMJ → EXP</td>
<td>0.88***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₈</td>
<td>IMJ → SAT</td>
<td>-0.05</td>
<td>Is not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₉</td>
<td>IMJ → LOY</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>Is not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₁₀</td>
<td>SAT → LOY</td>
<td>0.51***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₁₁</td>
<td>SAT → COM</td>
<td>0.74***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H₁₂</td>
<td>COM → LOY</td>
<td>0.01***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p < 0.10 ; **p < 0.05; ***p < 0.01

According to Table 4, all other hypotheses are supported except for H₈, H₉ and H₁₂.

Table 5. Structural Equations of ECSI Model

EXP = 0.88xIMJ  
\( t = 14.93^{***} \)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equation</th>
<th>R²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXP</td>
<td>0.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PV</td>
<td>0.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PQ</td>
<td>0.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOY</td>
<td>0.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COM</td>
<td>0.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p < 0.10 ; **p < 0.05; ***p < 0.01

According to the results shown in Table 5, 77% of the change in customer expectation is with image, 39% of the change in perceived value with customer expectations and perceived quality, 47% of perceived quality change with customer expectation, 81% of change in customer satisfaction perceived quality, perceived value and customer expectation and 55% of the change in the complaint are explained by customer satisfaction.

CONCLUSION

The residents in Eskisehir frequently use tram services in their daily lives. In this context, determining the quality of service provided by ESTRAM is of vital importance for residents in Eskisehir. The attitudes of the residents in Eskişehir towards tram services were investigated by utilizing ECSI model and SEM in this study. ECSI model consists of customer satisfaction, perceived value, customer loyalty, perceived quality, complaint, customer expectation factors. In the research context, a positive relationship was found between image variable and customer expectation variable. This result indicates that ESTRAM will have a positive impact on the quality of service as the relations with customers are established, technology develops and corporate image increases. No statistically significant relationship was found between image and customer satisfaction and image and customer loyalty variables and hypotheses were not supported. A positive relationship was found between the expectations and the perceived quality variables. This result indicates that the perceived quality level of the tram company meets the expectations of customers. Similarly, a
significant relationship was found between customer expectation and perceived value variables and the hypothesis was supported. There is a positive relationship between customer expectations and customer satisfaction variables. This means that customer satisfaction for the tram company increases as expectations of customers are met. A positive relationship was detected between perceived quality and perceived value. In other words, if the passengers are satisfied in the service that they receive, their assessment of the fee that they pay for the service will also be positive. Similarly, a positive relationship was found between perceived quality and customer satisfaction variables. Accordingly, it can be said that the better the travel experience, the more positive their satisfaction will be.

There was a statistically significant relationship between perceived value and customer satisfaction variables. The satisfaction of the customers who think that the quality of service provided on the tram meets the fee will be positive. Likewise, a positive relationship was found between customer satisfaction and customer loyalty variables. Accordingly, as satisfaction of customers increases, so does the loyalty of customers. There is a statistically significant relationship between customer satisfaction and complaint latent variables. According to this result, as the tram services offer solutions to the complaints of customers, the satisfaction of customers increases. On the other hand, there was no statistically significant relationship between complaint and customer loyalty variables and hypothesis was not supported.

REFERENCES


The Evaluation of Business Travelers Profiles and Preferences from The Perspectives of Hotel Executives in Manisa

Mustafa TEPECİ
Prof.Dr., Manisa Celal Bayar University
mtepeci@yahoo.com

Eda HAZARHUN
Dokuz Eylül University
edahazarhun@gmail.com

Ceren İŞÇİ
Assist.Prof.Dr., Manisa Celal Bayar University
ceren.isci@hotmail.com

ABSTRACT
This study aims to identify the profiles and preferences of business travelers staying in hotels in Manisa from the perspectives of hotel general managers. Face to face semi-structured interviews were carried out with ten general managers of touristic hotels in Manisa. Content analysis which is a qualitative method has been applied to the data that have been gathered through interviews, by using NVivo 11. As a result of the content analysis, four main themes emerged from the data as “profile of the business tourist”, “buying behaviors of business tourist”, “types of reservation” and “leisure activities of business tourist”, and thirteen codes have been identified under those four main themes. The results indicate that majority of the business tourists staying in the hotels are domestic (Turkish) travelers. Another significant finding is that majority of the business travelers are on average staying for 3-4 days and most of them are doing their reservations through employing firms.

Keywords: Business Travelers, Business Tourism, Hotels, Intermediary Firms, Manisa

INTRODUCTION
Individuals are not traveling just with the motivations of entertainment and leisure but also they are traveling to join meetings or do tasks related to their work and occupation. In this regard, business travel and tourism (business travel and business tourism are used interchangeably) is one of the oldest types of tourism (Seebaluck and Naidoo, 2015). Business tourism has an imported role on development of local and regional economies because it increases the occupancy rates of accommodation facilities during the low season and the consumption of food and beverage products and helps developing activities (Seebaluck and Naidoo, 2015; Quariti and Hamri, 2014).

There are many forms of business tourism which is an important type of urban tourism (Uca, 2019). Major forms of business travel are individual business trips, group trips, meetings, incentive travel, congresses, exhibitions, team meetings, and training trips (Niculaa and Elena, 2014). Among these business tourism forms, congresses and meetings are the leading ones with the highest participation rate. According to Mill (1990) 20% of the business trips are for participating in meetings.

Turkey is one of the leading countries in business tourism thanks to its developing economy and due to its rich cultural heritage and accommodation facilities with new generation technology. According to International Congress and Convention Association (ICCA) 215 congress have been held in Turkey in 2015. With those statistics Turkey is 18th in the world and 11th in Europe (Kaya, 2017). Major cities with developed infrastructure and superstructure such as Istanbul, Izmir, Antalya, Ankara are the main centers of attraction for business tourism in Turkey (Kozak et al., 2017).

Along with these provinces Manisa is also an important province with a vast business tourism potential due to its geographical location, developed infrastructure and superstructure. Manisa hosts organized industrial zone where 224 national and international enterprises and factories located for production. In
addition to responding to domestic market needs, these companies export to over 100 countries of the world and total foreign trade volume amounts 8.1 billions USD (MOSB, 2019). Having an organized industrial zone gives Manisa a certain advantage in regards of business tourism. Those enterprises and factories get many domestic and international visitors throughout the year for individual business trips, delivering goods to customers and taking goods to markets, factory opening, technical service, consulting, visiting a branch factory, and meetings and training seminars they host. Those business related trips and meetings keep province's business tourism alive all year. In 2018, 18,589 foreign and 487,599 tourists stayed in hotels in Manisa and majority of those tourists visit the city for business purposes (Manisa Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism, 2019).

Despite the fact that business tourism has a considerable ratio among the overall tourism potential of Manisa, studies on that subject is very limited (Özleyen and Tepeci, 2017) and there is almost no actual statistical data related to Manisa's business tourism. In this regard, determining the general profiles and preferences of business tourists that visit Manisa and underlining the gap in the literature can be considered important step for providing guidance for future research on this subject. In addition, this study is also important in regard to preparing action plans for improving business tourism, and to putting the right strategies into practice to increase Manisa’s business tourism numbers in the future.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Business travel is regarded to be the backbone of the tourism industry because businesspeople repeatedly travel for purposes related to their work and they are not price sensitive as leisure travelers (Cook et al., 2018:54). Direct spending on business travel worldwide reached $1.33 trillion in 2017 and is forecasted to grow by 7% in 2019 (Global Business Travel Industry, 2018). Globalization and economic activities throughout the world will enhance business travel and tourism in the future.

Business tourism is defined as the travels of individuals on issues related to their occupations (Davidson, 1994). Nicula and Elena (2014) stated that business tourism is a type of tourism which includes the business travels of individuals related to their business fields and includes participation in the activities organized by various commercial and administrative organizations. Fairs, exhibition visits, educational trips, seminars, incentive travel, international congresses, professional conferences and conventions are all covered by business tourism. Individuals who participate in the congress with the aim of learning different information about their jobs and for the purpose of personal development are also included in the scope of business tourism (Uç, 2019).

Business tourist who is coming for conferences, seminars, exhibitions, and congresses spend 2.5 to 3 times more than regular tourists do (Quariti and Hamri, 2014). It is a known fact that leisure tourists spend on average 750-800 dollars while business tourists spend about 2000-2500 dollars (Kaya, 2017). Business tourists are mostly young and middle aged males and their income level is high (Cook et al., 2018). Further, along with their business activities, business tourists also participate in leisure activities and visit cultural and historical places within the destination during their leisure times.

Business travelers are critical for the success of most tourism service providers, therefore managers of these service providers need to know more about business travelers. Previous studies found that business travelers are more experienced users of hotel products and services and they are more critical of service quality than leisure travelers (Radojevic et al., 2017). Business travelers will probably endure to be more demanding of hospitality and tourism services as they hope to get at a minimum the current level of services and offerings as a standard level of performance (Cook et al., 2018:54). Hoteliers offer a wide array of benefits and offerings such as frequent-guest or loyalty programs, corporate pricings and discounts, special floors and sections including business centers and upgrades to satisfy and retain business travelers. The competition among the hoteliers are intense, and the winners will be those who constantly identify and respond to the needs and wants of these demanding visitors.

Hotel selection for business travelers is mostly determined by the convenience of the hotels’ location, proximity to facilities to be visited and availability of business-related facilities such as business amenities of the room, business center with internet access, conference rooms and free parking. Business travelers appreciate having a business center and free internet access; they prefer properties with a fitness center with a gym and a spa, and with a no smoking policy (Çobanoğlu et al., 2003, Radojevic et al., 2018). Hotels in Manisa offer similar facilities and amenities mentioned above to respond to the needs of business travelers. Indeed, Özleyen and Tepeci (2017) investigated the satisfaction of business travelers to Manisa and found that the service standards and attributes
of the hotels contributed to the satisfaction of business travelers. The current study aims to get further information on the profiles and preferences of business travelers staying in hotels in Manisa from the perspectives of hotel general managers.

METHODOLOGY

Interview method which is one of the common methods of qualitative research is adopted in this study to gain a detailed insight on the business tourism in the province of Manisa. Due to the nature of qualitative research, purposive sampling method is used with a smaller sample to make it easier to inspect the structure of instances and facts in detail (Miles and Huberman, 1994). The sample has been determined by a convenience sampling, which is one of the purposive sampling method. With the aim of determining the profiles and preferences of business related visitors, hotel managers were interviewed.

The sample of the study has been composed of the hotel managers working in ministry licensed tourism operations (3 to 4 stars) in the center of Manisa (and in Turgutlu and Salihli, districts of Manisa). According to the data of Manisa Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism (2019) there are 14 hotels in the stated towns and the city center. The managers of 10 of those 14 facilities voluntarily participated to the study.

Face to face semi-structured interviews have been held with the general managers of the participating hotels. In semi-structured interviews “the number and the order of the questions are not fixed” (Kozak, 2015: 90). Thus, during the interviews, researchers did not strictly stick to the forms and they asked additional questions to interviewees when further information is needed. Interviews have been held during July of 2019 and they all have been held face to face in interviewees’ hotel offices. Interviews lasted about 20 to 30 minutes. Prior to the interviews, all interviewees have been informed about the aims of the study and they have been ensured that their identities will remain anonymous. All participants were asked for their permission for the use of voice recorders and all interviews have been recorded with the approval of the interviewees. Researchers had an interview form with them during the interviews.

The questions in the study have been prepared by doing a comprehensive literature review (Cook et al., 2018; Radojevic et al., 2018) and by consulting two academicians who are specialized in business tourism. The questions in the study are related with the following subjects:

- Profile of the business tourist (number of business tourists, nationalities).
- Buying behaviors of business tourists (the amount of extra spending, average length of stay, type of the facility, number of the other people in the travel party, etc.).
- Who made the hotel reservations?
- Participations of leisure activities of the business tourist.

ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

The interviews were recorded with the voice recorder and audio recording was transferred to the computer and turned into text. The data, which became text, were subjected to content analysis which is one of the qualitative research methods. Nvivo 11, a qualitative data analysis software was preferred for the determination of codes and themes in the content analysis. In this context, the interview texts were transferred into Nvivo 11 program. Content analysis was conducted and compared by two independent researchers. As a result of the content analysis performed in this program, subcodes were created within the scope of 4 themes (Table 1). The resource field in Table 1 indicates the number of participating hotels in which the codes occurred.
Table 1. Themes ve Codes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Codes</th>
<th>Resource</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Business traveler profile</strong></td>
<td>Share of business travelers 0-50%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51%-60%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>61%-70%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>71%-80%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>81%-90%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>91%-100%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nationality of business traveler Majority are Turkish</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Smaller percentage International</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Buying behavior of business traveler</strong></td>
<td>Length of stay 1 to 2 days</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 to 4 days</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 days and over</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Large extra expenses</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hotel board types</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bed &amp; breakfast</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Half board</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Food and beverage consumption in hotel</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single occupancy</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reservation types</strong></td>
<td>Employing companies</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Travel agents</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By person</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Online booking channels</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Leisure activities during the business trip</strong></td>
<td>Low interest to Manisa's attractions</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Preference for Izmir destination</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All of the participating hotel managers stated that they did not keep any formal statistics about business tourism. Therefore, managers were asked to give an approximate number. All managers informed that the majority of the tourists staying in their hotels were business travelers. When the ratio of the tourists coming for business purposes in the total number of tourists is examined, it is found that it is between 81% to 90% at most. This high rate indicates that business tourism is a major market for hotels in Manisa. One participant manager (# 10) states that the number of business tourists varies during the summer and winter seasons; the numbers are high in the winter season. When the distribution of business tourists by nationality is examined, all managers assert that the majority are Turkish guests. The rate for Turkish guests varies from 55% to 95%. Germany, Italy, China, Korea and the United States are among the countries where smaller proportion of foreign guests (45% to 5%) come from.

Within the scope of the theme, in which the buying behavior of business tourists was examined, it was found that business travelers mostly preferred (n=7) 3-4 days stays, shorter stays of 1 to 2 days and stays longer than 5 and more days were realized less. It is stated that the duration of the stay varies according to the purpose of business tourist arrival. For example, participant manager # 4 comments that “if there are training groups, the average length of stay is slightly longer but the training groups are not much… for example, if a machine is installed, the length of stay is generally longer for the business visitor.

Five of the managers pointed out that the extra spendings of business tourists in hotels is high. Within the scope of this code, there is a daily extra expenditure ranging from 150 TL to 500 TL. In particular, two hotel managers made a comparison with leisure tourists and expressed that they spend more than leisure tourists do. As a justification for over-spending, the participant manager (# 4) remarked that especially the business tourists from Europe have high alcohol consumption. Purchasing power of European tourists is high. Therefore, the prices are reasonable for them. A participant manager (# 10), on the other hand, points out that the extra expenses of the business tourist varies; some business tourists do everything in the hotel, some eat at the company's direction, use the company's dry cleaner, and prefer the hotel only for accommodation. In such a case, the expenses fall… Sometimes the company pays the extra expenses of the guests (in-hotel) and in this case the expenditures are rising.
When the hotel board types are examined, it is determined that the majority of the hotels (n=8) serve bed (room) and breakfast and only 2 hotels serve half board. In addition, for the meals not included in the accommodation price of the business tourist, it was found that they mostly preferred the hotel’s à la carte restaurants (n=7). The location of the hotel, especially its proximity to other food and beverage services, is important for the guests whether they prefer the hotel for food and beverage services. Looking at the number of people staying in the business tourist, it is also stated that they usually stay alone but the number varies. For example, participant manager # 2 reported that sometimes business travelers have accompanying people. The person accompany to them is mostly colleagues. A business traveler rarely comes with his wife, but he usually comes with his colleagues.

Within the scope of the booking type theme, the channels through which business tourists make their reservations are investigated. The highest number of hotels was booked through company channels followed by travel agencies, by person and online channels. Participants state that the company reservations are made by department assistants or general manager assistants in the companies. Some companies, on the other hand, have established their own travel agencies due to the intensity of their business trips. The participant manager # 7 and # 1 said that some factories have their own agencies. For example, there are X companies and X agencies, both here and in Istanbul. “Business travelers’ visiting companies make reservations from their travel agencies; this practice has been a trend for the last few years. The reservations come in this way have a 10% to 15% of share among all bookings. One of the managers (#8), who states that they also receive individual direct bookings from the travelers; In these occasions, the company he / she works for makes the reservations first, but then for the following visits the individual traveler calls hotels for future stays.

Within the scope of the theme of leisure activities of business tourists, codes of preference for Izmir destination (n=5) and low interest in the attractiveness of Manisa province (n=8) have emerged. Most of the managers (n=8) state that business tourists do not wonder about Manisa’s tourist attractions and interests. Two participants stated that they put Manisa’s promotional brochure in hotel lobbies to increase interest, but these brochures did not attract attention. One participant (# 10) observed that business tourists are curious about the city of Manisa. Business travelers desire to visit Manisa during long stays, especially the interest of foreign tourists is more than domestic visitors. Five of the participants stated that business travelers were more curious about Izmir than Manisa in summer months; tourists ask questions about Izmir destination. For example, a manager on this issue (# 2) stated that “Izmir is more attractive to people. It is preferred more because of the night life in Izmir. Izmir has become even closer with the opening of Sabuncubeli Tunnel. You arrive in Izmir in half an hour. In the same way, business travelers prefer to stay in Izmir. The number of companies that do not prefer to stay in Manisa is notable.”

**CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS**

The purpose of the study was to explore the profiles and preferences of business travelers staying in hotels in Manisa from the perspectives of hotel general managers. Face to face semi-structured interviews were carried out with ten general managers of ministry licenced hotels in Manisa. Previous studies mostly included business travelers as the samples and required them to provide responses to the questions regarding hotel preferences and satisfaction (Çobanoğlu et al., 2003, Özleyen and Tepeci, 2017, Đadojievic et al., 2017). This study reflects the knowledge and opinions of hotel managers and the study findings benefit local investors and policy makers as well as hotel executives and investors and researchers in general.

Because business travelers are repeat customers for hotels and they spend more on their hotels and food and beverages per trip compared to other tourists, it is important to determine the profiles and preferences of business travelers for the cities to get a larger share from this tourism segment. According to the results of the study, majority of the tourists staying in the hotels are business travelers. Turkish travelers consist most of those business tourists. Along with the Turkish business tourists there are limited number of foreign tourists and their nationalities are mostly German, Italian, Korean, Chinese and Americans in descending order.

The length of business tourists’ stay in Manisa Hotels is varied in regard to their purposes of visit and majority of them stay 3 to 4 days and they also stay alone. Business tourists spend on average 150 to 500 TL for such extras as drinks, souvenir, massages and spas during their stay in addition to their rooms and breakfast. Hoteliers should provide different services and activities appealing for business tourists to increase the length of their stay and the amount they spend for extras. These offerings may be à la carte restaurants, live music shows at nights, spas and massages, sport activities and contests and they encourage tourists to take part in those activities and events.
It seems that business tourists are showing little interest to the attractions of Manisa during their free time and they prefer to spend their leisure time in Izmir. If business tourists spend their leisure time in Manisa it helps the economic growth of the province and the tourism services and enterprises within the province get benefit of it. In the name of keeping business tourist in Manisa, restaurants, cafes, bars with different concepts must be opened, shopping malls must be built, and events and entertainments must be held.

REFERENCES


Evaluation of Ecomuseum Concept in Terms of Sustainability

Halil KORKMAZ
Assist.Prof.Dr., Canakkale Onsekiz Mart University
halilkorkmaz@comu.edu.tr

Ilayda Zeynep NIYET
Canakkale Onsekiz Mart University
ilaydaniyet@hotmail.com

ABSTRACT

After the 1960s, traditional museums began to change according to the needs of society. Many museums have been established at the local level to link with local identity to preserve cultural heritage factions. Revolutionary concerns in society have emerged with new ideas about the nature and purpose of museums. The ecological museum was the focus of international discussions on the purpose of the museums. Within the boundaries of the geographic area or region, Eco museums offered a strong importance on community membership, meeting the demands of society for conserving its natural heritage and material culture (Davis, 2011:50).

Hugues de Varine, Secretary of the International Council of Museums (ICOM), coined the term of Ecomuseum. It emerged from the combination of the concepts of “ecology” and “museum. This concept was developed in 1971 for the purposes and aspirations of Robert Poujard who is French Minister of the Environment (de Varine, 1971). Georges Henri Rivière introduced the first definition of eco-museum in 1985. According to him, an eco-museum is a tool designed and managed jointly by a public authority and local population. Professionals, amenities and assets provide public authority’s participation where the local people’s involvement rely on its ambitions, awareness and individualistic approach. Eco-museums are laboratories that contribute to the past and present studies about the local population and the environment, and encourage the work of relevant experts in these areas. They are conservation centres that help to preserve and enhance the natural and cultural heritage of the local population. They are schools engage and encourage the local population to understand their own future and environment protection (Rivière, 1985: 182-183).

Eco-museums change and adapt to time, place and most importantly to community in which they operate, the (local people) and their development needs. Therefore, the definitions of eco-museum are always evolutionary (Babić, 2009: 245). Classic museum could be described as the sum of culturel heritage, collections, expert team, building and visitors where ecomuseums much more than these ones (Figure 1).

Figure 1. Graphical Exhibition of Ecomuseum Concept
According to dimensions ecomuseum can be examined in 4 categories which are micro-history, umbrella, antenna, village ecomuseum. Micro history ecomuseums are usually installed in a single domain and can consist of many buildings already used for traditional and local activities. The Ecomusée du Pays de Rennes in Frésnes, the Usson en Forez ecomuseum in France, or the Museum of Peasant History in San Martino di Bentivoglio in Italy are examples of micro history ecomuseum.

Umbrella eco-museum is developed on a geographical area with a large number of heritage elements connected together by a common history or common material. It is in an area covering different municipalities and usually has more than one museum site. The link between the different elements is governed not only on the designated routes, but also through a regional development project with a joint local governing organisation. Bergslagen ecomuseum in Sweden is an example of umbrella eco-museums.

Antenna eco-museum shares many common features with traditional museums. It normally has a single museum site and is dependent on another authority in its administration. This limited independence naturally obscures the possibility of being a mirror of the local community.

The village-ecomuseum provides a series of sites grouped together to create a highly contextual environment. By nature, it is suitable for staging live events. Such eco-museums also allow reconstructed buildings to be sometimes used as a closer representation to open-air museums or theme parks than to eco-museums. The d’Alsace ecomuseum in France and the Zuiderzee museum in the Netherlands are examples of village ecomuseums.

Several studies have explored the effects of ecomuseum (Bowers, 2005; Corsane, 2007; Corsane, et al. 2008; Dogan, 2010; Dogan, 2015; Palvis, 2017). A study conducted in the north-east England, the forgotten traditions specific to that region were revived and as a result an increase was observed in the self-acceptance levels and identity formation of the locals living in the region. In addition, various types of ecomuseum concepts are highly necessary in terms of sustainability (Corsane, et al. 2008). A study conducted in Gokceada in Turkey found that an eco-museum has positive results for the stakeholders (Dogan, 2010). Mencarelli & Pulh (2015) compared traditional museums and new-style museums. In traditional museums, there is no active participation while people are visiting, but in museums where active participation is possible in eco-museums, they have concluded that participation is high and there is an increase in the general consumption levels of visitors. Another study conducted by Liu & Lee (2015) found that the impact of eco-museums on the region and its contribution to the promotion of the historical area are great. However, it is stressed that natural beauties and resources were rapidly damaged in the area. In the light of previous studies it could be said that eco-museum concept has many advantages in terms of marketing, management and sustainability. On the other hand, carrying capacity and protection usage balance should be taken account.

Keywords: Ecomuseum, Sustainability, Rural Development
REFERENCES


A Theoretical Proposal For Modelling Tourist Types and Behaviours

Engin BAYRAKTAROĞLU
Res.Assist.Dr., Anadolu University
enginbayraktaroglu@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

When the literature on tourist behaviours reviewed, there we find a basic concept related to tourists that can be termed as seeking. Tourists seek a variety of experiences and they all participate in tourist mobility in their way. In this study the concept of seeking analysed in the light of memetics. Tourist memes have defined as establishing bridges between tourism research and memetics. The tourist meme is identified as a meme that in a close or wide relation with tourist mobility which are carrying information about a place, an era or period of time, a culture, sub-cultures, cultural items, styles, behaviours, individuals themselves, completely imaginary things, a religion or a belief, an event, events or other memes and so on. It is accepted in meme/gene analogy when a meme spread into a brain, it associates with other memes in a kind of package or other words, in a memeplex. For this reason, tourist types re-identified as tourist memeplexes and tied theoretically with the concepts of awareness, focus and goal. Kanerva’s conception of focus is used to more broadly define what a meme was associated with, as Gabora does. In this statement, memes have accepted in the form of information patterns encoded within the focus indicating the scope and experiential quality of the individual’s awareness. The proposed theoretical model consists of three dimensions: tourist memeplex, focus and goal. With this proposal, it is aimed to assess different types of tourist experiences together which were defined by different authors. On the other hand, this model gives a chance to develop a new and complex taxonomy to assess various types of tourist experiences in a single framework.

Keywords: Tourist Types, Memetics, Focus, Goal

INTRODUCTION

One of the earliest interpretations of seeking in tourism, travel and leisure sciences is used by H. P. Gray (1970) to define sunlust and wanderlust. In his words, ‘the pleasure traveller or tourist will be forced to seek new areas further afield irrespective of whether s/he seeks wanderlust or sunlust activities’ (H. P. Gray, 1970, p. 131). Regard to his construct, in sunlust, tourists seek ‘domestic amenities and accommodations’ and in wanderlust, they seek ‘different culture, institutions and cuisine’ (H. P. Gray, 1970, p. 14). Within the same period, a similar thesis with sunlust was suggested by Williams and Zelinsky (1970, p. 565) under the term ‘heliotropic’ and defined as a factor ‘namely a strong southward surge of sun-seeking, cold-shunning tourists’. Later, Cohen (1972, p. 176) suggested on the drifters, as they seek ‘the excitement of complete strangeness and direct contact with new and different people.’ One another concept mentioned by MacCannell (1973) as the ‘search’ for the authentic experience which is also mentioned in the introduction section of this study. Then he adds that, almost everyone ‘in search of authentic experience, roots and self-awareness’ (MacCannell, 1977). Addition to this, Dann (1977, p. 188) suggests ‘related to anomie’ that tourists seek ‘to overcome the humdrum, the normlessness and meaninglessness of life with more satisfying experiences’. Then we see this again in Buck (1978) as pleasure-seekers who are ‘seeking escape from egalitarian affirmative action norms.’ Later, Cohen (1979) exactly defines tourists as seekers. For example, his ‘experimental tourist is in search of himself’. S/he ‘seeks to discover that form of life which elicits a resonance in’ him/herself. He thinks that ‘such seekers… experiment with among the alternative lifeways’. One another interpretation made upon ‘the recreation-seeking tourist’ who ‘thrives on what Boorstin (1961) call pseudo-events’ (Cohen, 1979, pp. 184, 189). These kinds of studies are studies that try to understand the phenomenon from an anthropological perspective.

There are also some business-driven perspectives which are based on psychological insights such as the study of motivations. One of the earliest papers on tourist motivations studies has written by Waugh (1956) related to tourist data use. In that paper, there are some concepts such as satisfaction, expectation, decisions, likes, dislikes were used with the concept of motivation. These concepts are still used as basic concepts of tourist behaviours. In addition to this, these concepts are also used above in the section that tourist memes were defined. Another paper related to travel motivations is mainly about the
transportation business. In that paper Hurst (1969) also talking about satisfaction, decision making, behaviours, attraction, perception. It is also possible to find other pioneer studies related to the study of tourist behaviours in tourism, travel and leisure sciences. For example, in a study on travel behaviour, interrelated concepts such as desire, satisfaction, motivation, decision making were used in a planning perspective (Gilbert, Peterson, & Lime, 1972). At this point, it is useful to talk about a cornerstone study written by Crompton (1979), in which ‘the concepts of pull and push’ is re-evaluated. He defines motives for pleasure vacations in socio-psychological terms and classifies as: an escape from a perceived mundane environment; exploration and evaluation of self; relaxation; prestige; regression; enhancement of kinship relationships; and facilitation of social interaction (Crompton, 1979, p. 416). Two years later, Dann (1981) initiates to unite anthropological, socio-psychological and industry-driven perspectives in terms of tourist motivations. In that study, he mentions that ‘tourists seek a variety of satisfactions, each in its own way contributing to the richness of the travel experience’ (Dann, 1981, p. 203).

In this study, concept of seeking accepted as starting point with the perspectives of tourist motivations. As mentioned above, tourists seek variety of experiences and they all participate in tourist mobility in their own way. It is possible to widen these ways. For example, in Urry and Sheller’s (2006, p. 207) new mobilities paradigm, it is mentioned that ‘asylum seekers, international students, terrorists, members of diasporas, holidaymakers, business people, sports stars, refugees, backpackers, commuters, the early retired, young mobile professionals, prostitutes, armed forces; these and many others fill the world’s airports, buses, ships, and trains’. When looking at his mobility, it is really easy to say ‘all the world seems to be on the move’. Reasons for these mobilities change for one to other. When we talk about tourists, it is possible to classify them under different classes. For example, Cohen’s (1972) organized mass tourist, individual mass tourist, existential, drifter and explorer classification can be accepted as this type of taxonomy. These examples can be increased with various types such as adventure tourists, culture tourists, sex tourists etc…

It can be easily said in the light of arguments have made above that, tourists are in seeking of various things such as exotic tastes, quite an environment, sex –legal or illegal–, drugs, history, landscapes, scene, adventure, peace, sea, sun, snow, sports and much more… And these all can be tied with different focuses such as relaxation, joy, pleasure, intellectual enrichment, satisfaction, being healthy, amusement, curiosity etc. This concept of focus is the key we use, to link tourist behaviours with memetics.

From this point of view, it can be said that it is possible to assess tourist motivations by starting from a solitary point in the context of memetics (see. Bayraktaroğlu, 2016). At the same time, analysing cultural changes and commodification in the host community is possible too (see. Bayraktaroğlu & Wee, 2016). But it is also possible to think about tourist stereotypes, host–guest relationships and many other research topics under this theoretical framework. In this study, creating a framework in the light of memetics is aimed, in terms of seeking discussed under tourist motivations.

**TOURIST MEMES**

Memetics, mainly, deals with the ability of ideas and practices to replicate throughout and between different cultural entities (Blackmore, 1991). The definition of such a field of research resembles, in one aspect, propaganda. This aspect is related with shape, at least to manipulate, people’s thoughts. Propaganda can be understood in such terms, with the dissemination of ideas and actions throughout culture a unifying theme within many disparate approaches to the topic (Sparkes-Vian, 2018, p. 395). On the other hand, in contemporary business research, these kinds of attempts to persuade individuals to buy certain goods or services were called marketing. O’Shaughnessy (1996) asserts that ‘even in the sophisticated discourse, the words propaganda and marketing are used almost interchangeably’. Resolving this conceptual dilemma is not the aim of this study since a definition could be useful. Ellul (1973, p. 61) defines propaganda as ‘a set of methods employed by an organised group that wants to bring about the active or passive participation in its actions of a mass of individuals, psychologically unified through psychological manipulations and incorporated in an organisation’. In Sparkes-Vian’s study (2014), propaganda and marketing concepts were assessed under the memetic framework and some arguments made about it. It is also possible to examine ‘post-truth’ with these concepts. But as it was mentioned in the previous paragraphs, this study is aiming to clarify how this approach can be used in tourism research rather than resolving conceptual difficulties (see. Bayraktaroğlu, 2016; Bayraktaroğlu & Wee, 2016).

Tourist memes, in the context of tourist behaviours, can be identified as memes that in a close or wide relation with tourist mobility which are carrying information about ‘a place, an era or period of time, a culture, sub-cultures, cultural
items, styles, behaviours, individuals themselves, completely imaginary things, a religion or a belief, an event, events or other memes etc...” by looking at meme analogy of Dawkins mentioned. These memes can be; a magazine poster, part of a novel, a TV advertisement, a narrative or a story that an individual tells another, part of a documentary or lyrics, a cartoon frame related Giza Pyramids or the other things that carrying information about “the moment” of a screaming individual over the rollercoaster in Europa-Park when upside-down or an image of an individual sitting on the rock alone and watching the sunrise over mountains. Most of the given examples are the memes that can be observed within its meditator such as magazine, photograph, books etc. Another way to observe memes is to observe meme products, as it is mentioned above. Maybe, souvenirs can be accepted as a good example of the products related with tourist memes.

When this was exemplified via Urry (1990), it can be said that what shaped the tourist gaze was memes settled in the memeplex of a tourist. When Cohen's (1979) tourist typologies are taken into consideration, for example, it can be asserted that these typologies are actually the categories that have been put forward as a result of the classification of tourist memeplexes with similar characteristics. Thus, it can be concluded that the new types of tourists have emerged as a result of the ongoing evolution of social cultures in general. In particular, for tourism, post-tourists can be accepted as an example for this kind of evolution. The point to be reached here is related to the constant replication of the memes in the tourist mobility, the change of shape and the acquisition of new forms.

**A MODEL PROPOSAL**

Gabora (1997) used Kanerva’s (1988) conception of ‘focus’ to more broadly define what meme was associated with. In this statement, memes are accepted in the form of ‘information patterns’ encoded within the ‘focus’ indicating the scope and ‘experiential quality’ of the ‘individual’s awareness’ (Gabora, 1997: 6). At this point, it may be useful to explain the concepts of focus, awareness and information patterns in an example. Gabora’s (1997) ‘cookie jar’ is an open framework for developing a case. For example, the child is hungry, and this hunger situation can be described as a need and also it is a need of the first step according to Maslov (1943: 370-397). The focus of the child can be summarized as to satisfy this need. At this point, that is, to appease his hunger. Now, let’s think that Gabora’s cookie jar stands on the table in the same environment with the hungry child. In order for this child to have the awareness that the cookies inside the jar can meet her/his needs, he needs to have information about reaching out to the jar, opening the lid, taking the cookie in it and eating it; or s/he needs other kinds of information that help her/him to predict this information or simply to reach cookies in the jar (e.g. as breaking the jar). According to this approach, it can be said that memes are information patterns coded into the focus of suppressing hunger, which is forming the idea of eating the cookies inside the jar that stands on the table.

In Gabora’s cookie jar example, it is mentioned that memes can be accepted in the form of information patterns encoded within the focus. This focus can be a need, a habit or something new. It can simply be defined as a part of an individual's life. When the focus is accepted as self-amusement, individual’s awareness regard to options of amusing her/himself is being the main determiner of the type of experience and experiential quality. Let’s, think about a sex tourist. S/he seeks self-amusement. And s/he is aware of sexual intercourse is a kind of experience that s/he can amuse her/himself. This can be summarized as the behaviour of a sex tourist. In memetics, it is accepted that this behaviour of the sex tourist is determined by the memeplex. And memeplex is defined as a structure consisting of various associated memes. We can call this memeplex the sex tourist as the shallowest definition.

It is time to illustrate this approach through a widely accepted concept. Cohen's (1979, p. 184) ‘recreation-seeking tourist’ was found appropriate. In his words, this tourist is looking for ‘the pleasure of entertainment’. Now we can add another concept termed as the goal. Now the goal of the tourist becomes the pleasure –or ‘the pleasure of entertainment’ in Cohen's words–. Her/his focus can be identified as, entertaining her/himself. We accept that s/he is aware of recreational activities are entertaining. And also, we accept that her/his level of awareness or her/his framework of awareness is the main determiner of the type of tourist experience and experiential quality.
In another example, for authentic seekers, self-enhancement, relaxation, entertainment can be defined as the goal. It is possible to multiply these kinds of examples, but it is not found useful in this study since, the main objective of this study to develop a memetic model to understand complex tourist experiences rather than to develop a taxonomy. The crucial point in this framework is the focus, and her/his awareness of the experience which s/he focuses, will get her/him to her/his goal. This perspective gives a chance to model complex tourist experiences in a single framework (Figure 1).

CONCLUSION

Memetics is accepted as a steppingstone to understand tourist behaviours in a single complex structure. With this study, it has been tried to present an approach that will make these initiatives meaningful by forming the basis of the attempts made to explain tourist mobilities and the reasons underlying the tourist motives.

MacCannell’s staged authenticity, Cohen’s types of tourist experiences, Urry’s often mentioned post-modern tourists and Adler’s analogy of travel as a performed art, have failed to explain the whole tourism movement and have been critically criticized but they provided very valuable information about the nature of the tourist mobility. Numerous theoretical approaches such as destination attractiveness and destination competitiveness have risen on the legacy of these first initiatives. In this study, it is aimed to take this knowledge to the next stage and to fill some remaining gaps and to make contributions of some new insights on tourist behaviours research.

This model gave the opportunity to understand various kinds of tourist experiences in a single framework. In Figure 1, we assess Cohen’s (1979) recreation-seeker, MacCannell’s (1973) authentic-seeker, Gray’s (1970) sunlust and unspecified concept of sex tourist together. Through this model, it is possible to assess different types of tourist experiences together which were defined by different authors. On the other hand, this model give chance to develop a totally new and complex taxonomy to assess various types of tourist experiences in a single framework.

By its nature, the memetic approach has the potential to provide a new perspective on many issues such as tourist motivations, tourism marketing, tourism sociology, tourist-local relations, and the socio-cultural effects of tourism. It is another important aspect that it claims to make explanations about the nature of tourism by bridging it with the nature of humankind. In this respect, the use of the concept of meme to understand the nature of tourism does not only provide a chance to explain tourist motives but also opens up new research areas for tourism marketing and tourist behaviours research.
REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

When the developmental process of the tourism sector is examined, it is seen that the progress in the transportation sector has an important role in the development of the tourism sector. Technological advances in the transportation sector have led to the expansion of the market and brought intense competition among transportation alternatives. For this reason, it is of great importance that transportation companies know the reasons why passengers prefer one alternative over the other. Customer satisfaction, which is the core of marketing activities for enterprises; is a psychological concept that expresses the feeling of well-being of customers during the consumption of the delivered goods or services.

This research was conducted to find out the contribution of Turkey’s High-Speed Train (YHT) project to creating loyal customers, to measure the quality of delivered goods and services on YHT through the eyes of passengers and to determine the importance of the satisfaction levels in the intention of revisiting. In this study, a questionnaire was used as a data collection tool. There are 36 questions in the survey. In the first part, there are 7 questions to determine the demographic characteristics of the participants, and in the second part, there are 29 questions designed in the form of 5-point Likert scale to determine the satisfaction levels of the passengers travelling by YHT. Considering that passenger profiles may vary, the questionnaires were administered on different rail lines on different days and times of the week. A total of 400 questionnaires were administered by random sampling method and 311 of them were found to be appropriate and submitted for analysis. In order to determine the thoughts of the passengers travelling by YHT regarding the quality of the service they receive and the effect of their thoughts on their intention of travelling again, 4 dimensions were expected to emerge in line with the dimensions of a similar study conducted by Kılıçlar, Sarı and Seçilmiş (2011). These dimensions were named “The Effect of Staff Attitude”, “Cleanliness and Comfort”, “Scheduling of Train Hours” and “Quality of Food and Beverage Services”.

When the relationship between personality variables and satisfaction sub-dimensions was examined, it is understood that the positive perception of satisfaction sub-dimensions has a positive effect on the intention of revisit and recommending YHT to others. It can also be concluded that the passengers whose expectations have been met want to travel again by YHT. In the study, the hypotheses suggesting that there are significant and positive relationships between satisfaction sub-dimensions and behavioral intentions were confirmed.

Keywords: YHT, Tourism Transportation, Satisfaction, Behavioural Intention

INTRODUCTION

Tourism and transportation, which is a movement of displacement, are two closely related economic activities. While the development of tourism started and progressed depending on the advancements in transportation systems, the spread of tourism also developed the transportation facilities. Many studies
are claiming that there is a significant relationship between transportation infrastructure and demand in tourism sector (Martin and Witt, 1988; Gürdal, 1990; Khadaroo and Seetanah, 2008). In terms of holiday satisfaction, the place of transportation is very important in providing satisfaction.

In terms of tourism transportation facilities in the world, airlines are preferred more for long trips, and railways are demanded especially for short trips. Railway transportation has become a means of transportation which is preferred more than other transportation systems with its advantages, speed and comfort in recent years. Railway transportation has become an important alternative with the emergence of high-speed trains in order to meet the increasing and diversifying travel movements in line with the increasing globalization (İnan and Demir, 2017).

The rate of car accidents happening on highways around the World, traffic jam resulted from busy traffic and the air pollution caused by land transportation have caused railways to come to the fore and to be popular in most Asian and European countries (Kızılırmak, Kaya and Çifçi, 2014).

Turkey has started to gain momentum in rail transport since the early 2000s in parallel with the related developments in the world. When we have a look at the history of railway development in Turkey, it is seen that it began with the construction of the İzmir-Aydın railway line in 1856. During the last periods of the Ottoman Empire, 4100 km of railways were built in 68 years (1856-1918) when today's borders are considered. (Darkot, 1972). In the first years of the Republic Period, railway construction was given importance and in the first 15 years, approximately 3000 km of railway line was built. In 1989, the length of the constructed railway line was 10,382 km. The railways, which were forgotten after 1950, were re-considered as state policy and railway construction campaign was started in 2003 as done in the first years of the Republic. The most important indicator of this is that the railway investment, which was 483 million TL in 2003, increased by 14.5 times in 2015 and reached 8 billion TL. Between 2003 and 2011, 1,085 km of new railway lines were built. 2.078 km high-speed and conventional railway line is still under construction. Establishment of a core high-speed rail network covering the lines of İstanbul-Ankara-Sivas, Ankara-Afyonkarahisar-İzmir and Ankara-Konya, keeping Ankara in the centre, has been identified as the primary target of the new state policy. In this context; the Ankara-Eskişehir section of the Ankara-Istanbul High-Speed Railway Project was completed in 2009, and the İstanbul section was opened to the High-Speed Railway Operations in 2014. Thus, Turkey has been among the major countries with high-speed train technology. While Ankara-Istanbul travel time has decreased to 3.5 hours with YHT, the other YHT line, Ankara-Sivas, which is still under construction, continues to be completed rapidly in 2019. On August 24, 2011, passenger transportation started in Ankara-Konya High-Speed Railway line.

It is expected that railway transportation will continue to improve in the next years. In order to sustain this positive development in the railways, customer satisfaction should be measured and service quality should be increased accordingly (Kızılırmak, Kaya and Çifçi, 2014).

Customer satisfaction, which is the focus of marketing activities for enterprises is a psychological concept that expresses the feeling of well-being of the customer during the consumption of delivered goods or services (Pizam and Ellis, 1999, 327; Choi and Chu, 2000, 119). According to Oliver (1997: 37), customer satisfaction is the evaluation of the customer’s post-consumption experience based on the relationship between the perception of a service or product by the customer and the objective elements of that service or product. According to Parasuraman et al. (1994: 202), customer satisfaction is usually one-time customer satisfaction. Service quality is an attitude that emerges as a result of long-term performance evaluation (Eleren and Kılıç 2007: 241). In order to understand the concept of “service quality” accurately, the characteristics of the service must be well known. Various scientists have evaluated the quality of service in different dimensions. While Gronroos (1984: 37) considered service quality as technical, functional and reputation quality, Lehtinen and Lehtinen (1982: 6) evaluated interaction with physical and institutional quality dimensions. Hedvall and Paltschik (1989: 11) defined the quality of service in their study and focused on willingness, serviceability and physical and psychological access to service. While the quality and performance indicators of concrete products are easy to measure, it is more difficult to measure quantitatively how service companies perceive and evaluate the quality of the abstract services provided by the enterprises (Eleren and Kılıç 2007: 237; Ardiç and Sadikoğlu 2009: 170). In addition, Sachdev and Verma (2004: 96) reported that service quality could be measured in terms of customer perception, customer expectation, customer satisfaction and customer attitude. The most appropriate approach in evaluating the quality of service is to measure the perceived quality of the service by the customers due to the reasons such as abstract nature of the service and
lack of objective measurement tools in evaluation (Türk 2009: 401). Providing services in order to meet the demands and needs of customers is a must for providing quality service. Only with his way, businesses can meet their customers’ expectations and increase the quality of the service perceived by the customers (Okumuş and Duygun 2008). After receiving the service, customers compare the perceived service quality with the expected service quality. If the perceived service quality is lower than the expected service quality, customers may lose their interest in the business and the service provided. If perceived service quality meets the expectations, customers continue to purchase that service (Kotler 1997). The fact that companies have loyal customers is an indispensable element to have a competitive advantage (Piplani and Yonghui, 2005, 598; Avcıkurt and Köroğlu, 2006, 6).

Customer focus, which is defined as unconditional customer satisfaction, aims to meet the needs and expectations of customers during and after-sales and to ensure customer satisfaction continuously. In this way, it can be ensured that satisfied customers tend to receive the product or service from the same provider and become loyal customers (Xu et al., 2002, 442; Öcer & Bayuk, 2001, 26). Having consumer satisfaction helps positive behavioural intentions to emerge. The concept of behavioral intention covers the customer behaviours in light of what they think about the service after receiving. Behavioral intentions are generally seen in the literature as re-buying, re-visiting, recommending to others, and encouraging positive thoughts. The increase in satisfaction leads to an increase in behavioral intentions (Liu et al., 2005).

Based on the above-mentioned literature, a model has been developed to determine the opinions of the passengers travelling by YHT on the quality of the service they receive and the effect of these thoughts on their revisit and recommendation intention. With this model, it was seen that 5 dimensions could emerge from the above-mentioned literature. These dimensions were named as “Effect of Personnel Attitude”, “Cleanliness and Comfort”, “Scheduling of Departure Hours”, “Price” “Quality of Food and Beverage Services”. Satisfaction level of each of these dimensions is thought to have a direct and positive effect on behavioral intentions. Accordingly, the following hypotheses were created and tested in the study:

**H1:** There is a significant relationship between passengers’ satisfaction of the service personnel and their behavioral intentions.

**H2:** There is a significant relationship between the passengers' satisfaction of cleanliness and comfort and their behavioral intentions.

**H3:** There is a significant relationship between passengers’ satisfaction with the scheduling of departure hours and their behavioral intentions.

**H4:** There is a significant relationship between passengers’ satisfaction with food and beverage services and their behavioural intentions.

**H5:** There is a significant relationship between the passengers’ satisfaction with the prices of the YHT and their behavioral intentions.

With this research, railway transportation which has been gaining popularity as an alternative in tourism was investigated through the eyes of YHT passengers. In this context, the satisfaction of the passengers concerning railway transportation, organization/scheduling, personnel behaviors, cleanliness/comfort, price and food and beverage opportunities are discussed and alternative suggestions for railway transportation are presented based on the results to improve railway services.

**METHOD**

**Sampling and Data Collection Tool**

The population of the research is High-Speed Train passengers travelling on Ankara-Eskisehir-Ankara, Ankara-Konya-Ankara and Ankara-Istanbul Ankara lines. From this population, the trains numbered 81001, 81003, 81005, 81010, 81009, 81209, 81205, 81207, 81055, 81058, 81057, 81053, 81015, 81004, 81002, which are thought to be the busiest ones were chosen. The questionnaires filled by 311 passengers who volunteered were considered in the study for further analysis. In this study, the questionnaire technique was used as a data collection tool. There are 36 questions in the study. In the first part, there are 7 questions to determine the demographic characteristics of the respondents, and in the second part, there are 29 questions in the form of 5-point Likert scale to determine the satisfaction levels of the passengers travelling in the YHT. In the survey form, in which tourists were asked to mark the option that best represents their opinion choosing the option ranging from “1=Strongly Disagree” to “5=Strongly Agree”. The questionnaires were completed by face-to-face interviews with the passengers travelling by YHT between 10 May - 30 May 2019.
Purpose and Significance of the Research

The study aimed to find out to what extent meeting or failure in meeting the expectations of passengers travelling by YHT, which is one of the most popular projects of Turkey, affected the passengers’ satisfaction with the other services and their behavioural intentions. This research will contribute to the determination of the wishes, needs and expectations of the passengers, the satisfaction levels of the passengers and the effect of this satisfaction on the formation of loyal customers by examining the YHT case as is it is used by more and more passengers with new lines coming into service every year. In the literature, there are studies in the literature examining the relationship between service quality dimensions, customer satisfaction and behavioural intentions. However, the main difference of this study from the other studies in the literature is that it determines the relationships between passengers’ perceptions of satisfaction and behavioral intentions travelling by YHT which has been an emerging tourism transportation tool. Considering the size and objectives of the project, it is important to carry out such studies on YHT.

Data Analysis

In the analysis of collected data, the latest statistical programs in the field of social sciences were used. The results obtained from the study were tabulated with the Weighted Mean, Standard Deviation, Percentage and Frequency Method used in almost every study and comments were made in the light of the findings. It is important whether the structure that is measured in any research has the same values continuously in order to move onto the next stages of the research. For this reason, this study used the scale of the study conducted by Kılıçlar, Sarı and Seçilmiş (2011) "A research on the reasons why passengers prefer high-speed train". Cronbach's alpha coefficients were used to calculate the reliability of the scale. Cronbach’s alpha was found to be between -1 and +1. As the value gets closer to +1, the reliability level of the scale increases (Kılıç, 2016, s. 47). Cronbach Alpha coefficient calculated for the whole scale was found to be 0.823.

In this study, correlation analysis was conducted to determine whether there was a significant relationship between passengers’ perception of satisfaction and behavioral intentions. A positive correlation coefficient indicates that there is a linear relationship between variables, and a negative correlation indicates that there is an inverse relationship between variables.

FINDINGS

The findings obtained from the questionnaire administered to the passengers travelling by YHT were evaluated under three headings as "the findings related to personal variables", "the findings related to the evaluation of scale items" and "the findings related to the relationships between satisfaction dimensions and behavioral intentions". The findings regarding the control variables are presented in Table 1. When the age distribution of the visitors was examined, it was seen that the young people aged between 18 and 30 had the highest proportion with 53.1%. According to this result, it is seen that the majority of the passengers travelling by YHT are between the ages of 16 and 30, and it could be concluded that young people generally travel in YHT.
Table 1. Findings Regarding Personal Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Yaş</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>40.2</td>
<td>18-30 yaş</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>53.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>59.8</td>
<td>31-45 yaş</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>26.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>46-60 yaş</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Status</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Yaş</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary School</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundation Degree</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s Degree</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>47.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post Graduate</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>19.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>31.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose of Travelling</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Yaş</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>40.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Touristic</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>31.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Yaş</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Officer</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>29.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worker</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>25.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artisan</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>24.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housewife</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N:311</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is seen that 1.6% of the participants in the study are primary school graduates and 19.9% of them had a post-graduate degree. The rate of those with an undergraduate degree is 47.9%. These results show that the education level of passengers travelling by YHT is high. Moreover, 59.8% of the participants were male and 40.2% of them were female. When the occupations of the passengers were examined, the officers ranked the first with 29.6% and the students ranked the second with 25.1%. According to these results, it could be concluded that passengers travelling by YHT mostly travel for business and education.

Table 2 shows the average participation level of the survey participants in the satisfaction related items towards the YHT and the kurtosis and skewness values regarding these items. The skewness and kurtosis values of the items were found to be between -1,813 and +1,998. The fact that the skewness and kurtosis values of the data are between -2.00 and +2.00 means that they have a normal distribution. (George and Mallery, 2010).
Table 2. Arithmetic Means and Skewness and Kurtosis Values Regarding The Opinions of Passengers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Arithmetic means</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
<th>Skewness</th>
<th>Kurtosis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cleanliness and comfort</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.6</td>
<td>3.9678</td>
<td>.89745</td>
<td>-.718</td>
<td>.256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.7</td>
<td>4.1801</td>
<td>.84608</td>
<td>-.963</td>
<td>.937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.8</td>
<td>3.7653</td>
<td>.93991</td>
<td>-.642</td>
<td>.297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.9</td>
<td>4.0579</td>
<td>.78895</td>
<td>-.539</td>
<td>.069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.13</td>
<td>3.1125</td>
<td>1.29398</td>
<td>-.229</td>
<td>-1.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.15</td>
<td>3.9743</td>
<td>.88317</td>
<td>-.572</td>
<td>-.107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Departure Hours and Scheduling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.1</td>
<td>4.4019</td>
<td>.80874</td>
<td>-1.483</td>
<td>1.982</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.2</td>
<td>4.1833</td>
<td>.94109</td>
<td>-1.075</td>
<td>.793</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.3</td>
<td>3.9614</td>
<td>1.21222</td>
<td>-.997</td>
<td>-.057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.14</td>
<td>4.1254</td>
<td>.92998</td>
<td>-.955</td>
<td>3.093</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.25</td>
<td>4.4405</td>
<td>.90989</td>
<td>-1.813</td>
<td>.322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.4</td>
<td>4.4566</td>
<td>.68430</td>
<td>-1.058</td>
<td>.595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.5</td>
<td>4.1961</td>
<td>.81327</td>
<td>-.917</td>
<td>.673</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food/Beverage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.10</td>
<td>3.8039</td>
<td>.98543</td>
<td>-.758</td>
<td>.346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.11</td>
<td>4.2251</td>
<td>5.33468</td>
<td>1.925</td>
<td>1.988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.12</td>
<td>4.0225</td>
<td>.82078</td>
<td>-.922</td>
<td>1.801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.16</td>
<td>4.1254</td>
<td>.97403</td>
<td>-1.055</td>
<td>.704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.21</td>
<td>4.4952</td>
<td>.76568</td>
<td>-1.286</td>
<td>.760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural Intentions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.27</td>
<td>4.4341</td>
<td>.88791</td>
<td>-1.636</td>
<td>1.926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.28</td>
<td>4.3955</td>
<td>.81982</td>
<td>-1.234</td>
<td>.911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.29</td>
<td>4.2090</td>
<td>.98606</td>
<td>-1.100</td>
<td>.613</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The highest level of participation among the statements related to the effect of personnel attitude in the survey was in the item “the high-speed train personnel are kind, friendly and helpful” with 4.44. The statements regarding the attitude in the survey had high participation rates. It is seen that the passengers are satisfied with the attitude of YHT personnel towards them. This result reflects that YHT personnel are conscious of their work and this situation is perceived positively by the passengers. Passengers participated in the statements regarding behavioral intentions with a score well above the average. The statements with the highest participation rates in the survey are the statements related to the effect on behavioral intentions. The average level of participation in the statement “I will recommend the High-Speed Train to my friends and relatives” is 4.39; The average level of participation in the expression “My habit of using railway services has increased with High-Speed Train” is 4.43. And these two items are the ones with the highest participation rate. These values show that passengers positively perceive YHT as a means of transportation. Among the items in the questionnaire, the one with the lowest participation average is “music and video services in High-Speed Trend are sufficient (3,11).
Table 3. Arithmetical Means Regarding the Reasons Why Passengers Prefer YHT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>A.O</th>
<th>S.S.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I prefer YHT as it is comfortable</td>
<td>4,122</td>
<td>.8638</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I prefer YHT as it is punctual</td>
<td>4,032</td>
<td>1,1008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I prefer YHT as it is safe</td>
<td>3,787</td>
<td>1,1611</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I prefer YHT as its fee is reasonable</td>
<td>3,906</td>
<td>1,0508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I prefer YHT to save time</td>
<td>4,495</td>
<td>.7656</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows the average level of participation of the respondents in the statements regarding the reasons why they prefer YHT. The statement with the highest participation in the questionnaire was found to be “I prefer the High-Speed Train to save time” with 4,49 average. Among the reasons for preferring YHT, the lowest average was found to be “I prefer High-Speed Train as it is safe” with 3,78%. This shows that railways are now preferred for speed and comfort it offers.

Table 4. Arithmetical Means Regarding the Reasons Why Passengers Prefer YHT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-dimension</th>
<th>PER</th>
<th>YIY</th>
<th>DAV.NİY</th>
<th>FİYAT</th>
<th>TEM/KON</th>
<th>PLAN/OR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PER</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YIY</td>
<td>.098</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAV.NİY</td>
<td>.487**</td>
<td>.229**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FİYAT</td>
<td>.401**</td>
<td>.252**</td>
<td>.382**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEM/KON</td>
<td>.525**</td>
<td>.359**</td>
<td>.500**</td>
<td>.304**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLAN/OR</td>
<td>.579**</td>
<td>.340**</td>
<td>.564**</td>
<td>.436**</td>
<td>.561**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Correlation analysis was conducted to find out the relationship between the sub-dimensions of satisfaction with YHT and behavioral intentions. The results of this analysis are presented in Table 4.

There are positive relationships between all sub-dimensions of satisfaction variable except satisfaction with staff and satisfaction with food and beverage services. As the satisfaction of the passengers with YHT increases, their positive behavioral intentions also increase. When the correlation coefficients of the study variables were examined, it was found that the lowest correlation coefficient was r: 0.229 and the highest correlation coefficient was r: 0.564.

There was a very low, positive and statistically significant relationship between behavioral intentions and satisfaction with food and beverage services (r = 0.229; p <0.05), and satisfaction with staff (r = 0.487; p <0.05), and There was a low, positive and statistically significant relationship between price satisfaction (r = 0.382; p <0.05), satisfaction with cleanliness and comfort (r = 0.500; p <0.05), and satisfaction with scheduling and organization (r = 0.564; p <0.05).

According to the results of the correlation analysis conducted to find out the level of relationship between the perception of satisfaction sub-dimensions and behavioral intentions, it was found that positive perception of satisfaction sub-dimensions affected behavioral intentions positively. It can be concluded that the passengers whose expectations were met in the sub-dimensions which form the satisfaction are willing to travel again by YHT and tend to recommend YHT to others. As seen in the research findings, the hypotheses suggesting that there are significant and positive relationships between satisfaction sub-dimensions and behavioral intentions were confirmed.
Table 5 summarizes the findings of the hypotheses tested for the research as a result of the correlation test.

**Table 5. Summary of the Findings Regarding the Research Hypothesis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Type of Analysis</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>Status of Acceptance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1</td>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>p&lt;0.01</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2</td>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>p&lt;0.01</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3</td>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>p&lt;0.01</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4</td>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>p&lt;0.01</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H5</td>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>p&lt;0.01</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DISCUSSION AND SUGGESTIONS**

In this study, the factors that determine the relationship between passengers’ satisfaction levels and behavioral intentions travelling by YHT were investigated. The research data were collected through a questionnaire and only the statements regarding the revisit intention and satisfaction dimensions were included in the questionnaire. When the relationship between the dimensions obtained from the satisfaction scale and behavioral intentions was examined, it was found that the positive perception of satisfaction sub-dimensions affected passengers’ behavioral intentions positively.

When the results of the study are examined, the positive behaviors of the passengers such as re-using the transportation service or recommending these vehicles to their friends are related to their perceived satisfaction. In the light of the analyzes, it has been shown that the value of services delivered in the transportation sector has an impact on the future behavior of the passengers. That passengers save time and that YHT trains are comfortable are the most effective factors in passengers’ revisit to YHT.

These results obtained with this study partially support the findings in the literature (Seçilmiş, Kaşlı, Kılıçlar and Sarı, 2011; Kılıçlar, Sarı and Seçilmiş, 2011). According to the findings obtained from the study, the strongest factors affecting the behavioral intention of the passengers are good departure hours, organization, price, cleanliness and comfort. Especially in recent years, the rising prices on the highways have made the railways even more inviting. Besides, YHTs are much more comfortable than passenger buses. Improving the quality of services, cleaning, increasing the quality of food and beverage services are very important in establishing the intention to revisit and creating customer loyalty. Likewise, the attitude of the personnel is an important factor in the intention of a revisit. Therefore, by giving more importance to the education of the personnel of YHT, personnel could be explained what the meaning of creating customer loyalty for the enterprise is and how they could play a role in creating customer loyalty. While working hard to establish customer loyalty to YHT, it should be remembered that different expectations of customers arising from their characteristics will also affect their satisfaction. If customers with different expectations are offered the same services, some customers will be satisfied and some others will not. For this reason, YHT needs to diversify its services and increase its quality level.

The reflection of passengers’ high level of perceived satisfaction on their behaviours is that they recommend YHT to their friends and define themselves as loyal customers of YHT. In brief, high satisfaction creates loyal customers for companies. The perceived high satisfaction creates loyal customers for the YHT and ensures that the passengers who are satisfied with the means of transportation voluntarily advertise YHT. As a result, in the transportation sector, where there is intense competition, enterprises need to give importance to their passengers’ perceptions to gain an advantage over their competitors.
REFERENCES


Darkot, B. 1972. Türkiye İktisadi Coğrafyası, İ.Ü. Yay. no.1307, İstanbul


Okumuş, A. & Duygun, A. (2008). Eğitim hizmetlerinin pazarlanmasında hizmet kalitesinin ölçümü ve algılanan hizmet kalitesi ile öğrenci memnuniyeti arasındaki ilişki,


Türk, Z. (2009). Denetim Firmalarının Sunduğu Hizmet Kalitesi, Müşteri Tatmini ve Sadakati:

Disabled Tourists’ Access At Kyrenia Sea Front, North Cyprus

Gizem GÜVENBAŞ
Eastern Mediterranean University
gizemguvenbas@hotmail.com

Mukaddes POLAY
Prof.Dr., Eastern Mediterranean University
mukaddes.polay@emu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Urban tourism is becoming significant contributor of city’s economy and urban waterfronts. These destinations perform diverse functions for the visitors, therefore they have to be developed as important tourism precincts. Environmental barriers constraint disabled tourist to join tourism activities at urban waterfronts. Disabled people is a niche consumer market for the urban tourism industry and so governments have to take responsibility to provide suitable arrangements for these consumer segment. Accessible waterfronts allow disabled tourists to gain travel experiences and participate urban tourism activities. Kyrenia city is the tourism capital of North Cyprus and it has designed sea front which becomes main attraction pole for residents and many tourists of Cyprus Island, due to its various architectural, cultural and historic points of interest. Tourism industry has been one of the important sectors of North Cyprus’ economy. Disabled people and their families are potential market for the tourism development. The purpose of this paper is to examine accessibility of Kyrenia Sea Front for physically disabled tourists and explore the significance of accessible tourism at waterfront precincts. For the study, a qualitative research method, systematic observations, were used to make an exploratory review on perceived environmental barriers in urban waterfronts by tourists with a range of mobility capabilities. The research findings showed that Kyrenia Sea Front possesses physical and social barriers, which represent challenges for its visitors, particularly disabled tourists still experience traces of urban space exclusion. Accordingly, recommendations were given for maintaining accessible tourism in Kyrenia Sea Front. The study highlighted the needs for further research that examines nexus between waterfront design and accessible tourism activities.

Keywords: Accessible Tourism, Waterfront, Physically Disabled Tourists, Kyrenia Sea Front, North Cyprus

INTRODUCTION

According to statistical datas; in 2008 more than 600 million (TURSAB, 2008), in 2009 more than 650 million (Darcy and Pegg, 2011) and in 2011 more than 758 million (WHO, 2011; Pehlivanoğlu 2012) people are disabled in the World. The current statistics shows that over one billion people, out of seven billion population, lives with some form of disabilities in the World (Worldbank, 2019). If it is considered that those people need special care and are travelling in the company of others or their families, this number increases.

Disabled travellers market have subsequently a great potential ‘consumer market’ and to grow out of significant ‘niche market’ for countries tourism industry (Son, A., 2010). Although the disabled customer market is significant sector for tourism industry, academic research related to the travel of disabled people has been scarced (Yau, McHercher and Packer, 2004; Öztürk and Yeşiltaş, 2007). In last decade, the issue of accessibility in tourism has been a concentration of a few studies such as; an accessibility in accommodation places (Darcy,2009; Öztürk et al, 2008); accessibility in tourist sites (Israeli 2002; Sen and Mayfield,2004); accessibility of senior tourists (Alén, Dominguez and Losada, 2012); the significance of promoting information for an access (Eichorn et al.,2008); and disabled tourist’s experiences (Daniels, Rogins and Wiggins, 2005; Poria, Rachel and Brandth, 2009; Shaw and Coles, 2004; Yau et al.,2004; Son,2010)

In recent debate, an accessible tourism issue gain greater importance in the inquiry of environmental design and practices. The accessibility is become one of the important concerns in the urban tourism precincts, in such fields providing barrier-free tourism become to be the main responsibilities of governmental authorities, legal arrangements on disability rights in tourism industry come into force by the various
countries. For that reason; disabled people began to gain effortless travel experience and attend tourism activities more (Pehlivanoğlu, 2012).

The broad literature is revealed that handicapped people are among the high potential visitor segments of the tourism sectors, such segments requires accessible attractions in urban tourism precincts (Sen and Mayfield, 2004). Those precincts must be visitor friendly urban waterfronts, there is a need to confirm that well-designed features of the built environment provide barrier-free tourist destinations. The urban tourism precincts such as waterfronts have to be accessible to all visitors, therefore they ought to be arranged with adaptable solutions that enables people having different background in terms of age, gender and capability.

The City of Kyrenia, as the tourism capital of North Cyprus, having designed sea front which attracts almost all visitors of the Cyprus Island (Güvenbaş, 2008). Although; the Kyrenia Sea Front is the most important remarkable destination place of tourists, declining official tourism figures shows necessity of favorable solutions for the tourism industry. Tourists with disabilities are significant potential market for the Kyrenia City's tourism industry, their families can doubtly involved in this figures. The purpose of this study was to examine quality of Kyrenia Sea Front with reference to environmental design considerations on accessible tourism development.

The paper proceeds in the following ways. Initially, it was concentrated on literature review related to the disability, accessible tourism and urban waterfronts and tourism industry in North Cyprus. Then, the methodology of study was given. Following that, the findings of the research is put forward that proved accessibility performance of Kyrenia Sea Front for physically disabled tourists. In the final section, it was aimed to put a contribution for the accessible design solutions and planning polices for designning of accessible urban waterfronts.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature review, concerns concepts of disability, accessible tourism, urban waterfronts and tourism industry in North Cyprus, will be given at following lines.

Disability, Accessible Tourism and Urban Waterfronts

Urban tourism precincts have been classified into different typologies which includes recreational or tourism business district; tourist shopping villages; historic or heritage places; ethnic precincts or quarters; cultural precincts or quarters; entertainment precincts; red-light districts or bohemian quarters; waterfront precincts and festival marketplaces (Griffin, Hayllar and Edwards 2008). In such specific types, waterfronts are among the significant tourism precincts that are extensively issued to redevelopment for tourism and recreational activities, due to attractiveness of their location (Craig and Smith, 1995).

Waterfronts, as a part of urban tourism product, major elements of leisure setting of urban tourism destinations and so they can have a critical role in attracting visitors to a city. Waterfront areas offers diverse function such as housing, industry, commerce, transportation, recreational facilities and numerous leisure (Craig and Smith, 1995). The characteristics of being waterfront setting, makes these places interesting for tourism uses (Adamietz, 2012). Concerning potential of waterfronts on tourism-related facilities, accessibility, parking, open-space activities, water quality, sport areas must prefer high performance for the tourists’ usage. High quality in pedestrian access and open space features offers visitors to engage in various facilities (Adamietz, 2012).

The inaccessibility of destination areas as waterfronts constraints disabled people to enjoy the same destination experiences that other tourists can enjoy and are compel to make accessibility major determinant of destination choice (Darcy, 2002; Market and Communication Research, 2002). Urban space accessibility is concern issues of relative power and powerlessness which necessitate to alter mechanism in the direction of modify environment that allows their freedom (Griffin et al. 2008).

Disabled people are encountered with various constraints and barriers when they are travelling (Ozturk et al., 2008; Yau et al. 2004). Design-related barriers impede disabled tourists to participate contemporary urban life and waterfront facilities. These barriers can be classified under two main headings; physical and social barriers. Physical
barriers involve high kerbs and/or lack of dropped kerbs, steeps without gradients or ramps, uneven paving slabs, rough of cobbled surfaces, slippery surfaces, narrow pavements, poorly placed street furniture, congested pavements, steps without adjacent ramps, dropped kerbs on roads not adjacent to each other, difficult chamber on pavement, deep gutters along roadside, impeding crossings, busy roads, lack of resting places on slopes or ramps, handrails not provided on ramps, insufficient designated road-crossing places, drains near to dropped kerbs, cars parked adjacent to dropped kerbs, raised manholes, poor pathway maintenance (Ungar, 2008; Barış and Uslu, 2009). In addition to these; inaccessible building entrances, public transportation facilities, and inaccessible toilets are among the significant physical barriers that limits function of inviduals in urban environment (Barış and Uslu, 2009).

The urban space is not produced in a naturalistic way and so it is not possible to obligate process of space production that involves extensive socio-political procedure and value systems. Accessibility problem is also emerged by social environmental barriers involving institutional barriers (lack of legislations and regulations on access features, discriminatory policies on design issues, missing knowledge of design practitioners, absence of participatory planning actions), cultural barriers (societal attitudes) and economic barriers (unaffordable prices of urban space facilities), (Goldsmith, 1997).

The terms of tourism and accessibility were initially mentioned by the Manila Declaration and then particularized by the World Tourism Organisation in 1980. The declaration have appreciation for tourism as an essential right and main tool for human development. “it recommended the regulation of tourist services to member states, highlighting the most important aspects of tourist accessibility”. During the late 1980’s other term “tourism for all” was intended to denote to tourism for people with disabilities who can achieve full integration with environment containing activities on tourism (Alén et al. 2012)

Accessible tourism enables people with access requirements, including mobility, vision, hearing, and cognitive dimensions of access, to function independently and with equity and dignity through delivery of universally designed tourism products, services and environment. This definition is inclusive of all people including those travelling with prams, people with disabilities and seniors (World Health Organization, 2007).

According to Rains (2004; ed. in Darcy, 2009) for the tourism industry to adopt universal design principles as a foundation to achieve greater social sustainability (Darcy, 2009). Universal Design, also referred to as inclusive design, design-for-all, or lifespan design, originated as an concept for the built environment in the United States, as produced by wheelchair-using architect Ron Mace (Green, 2011). The concept of universal design asserts to minize the need for specially adapted and segregated facilities while including all into planning for equivalence (Bromley at al., 2006). Nevertheless, each stakeholders interests to built environment design and practices ought to adopted a universal design principles in the provision of built environments toward all-inclusive population.

An integrated access allows all visitors and building users, whether able-bodied or not, to use the same route throughout. Meeting these objectives minimizes the stigma attached to disability, and reduces the segregation, frustration and disappointment disabled people can experience when they cannot get to or find where they need to be” (Foster, 1997). Consequently, the accessible destinations for tourists are accessible for residents as well that supports the commonsurate benefits in social engagement, health outcomes and economic welfare (WHO, 2007a; ed. in Darcy et al, 2009).

In order to achieve accessible tourism development; tourism operator should adopt strategies together with the inclusive design principles include the following:

- Incorporating a barrier-free design into planning process,
- Obtaining knowledge of the proper laws and internationally recognised accessibility standards
- Including people with disabilities as planning members,
- Including accessibility expert on the planning team,
- Exceeding standards if possible,
- Offering accessibility beyond the parking lot,
- Including accessibility into outdoor environments
- Planning for a continuous path of travel
- Considering aesthetic and environmental values when planning, and
- Ensuring all materials used in the building process comply with suitable standards (Moon, Hart and Freidlander, 1995; Darcy et al., 2010).
In spite of that in various countries, the framework for developing accessible tourism or implementing universal design through disability discrimination law, building codes and accessibility standards still absent (ESCAP, 2008; Darcy et al. 2010). Universal design has urgently become a central issue in the development and understanding of accessible tourism (Darcy et al., 2010).

**A Brief Overview on Tourism Industry in North Cyprus**

Cyprus is one of the Mediterranean Island and it has a long history, cultural heritages, hot climate and clean beaches that make the island attractive for tourists. In Cyprus, tourism is an effective and foremost sector which can facilitate to rise and ameliorate the economic situation by adopting sustainable tourism development that is based on the quality (Kiessel et al., 2011; Vehbi B.O., 2014).

![Figure 1. Location of Cyprus](image)

The current population of North Cyprus is around 286,000 (SPO, 2006). According to Tourism Planning Department’s figures that shows tourists’ statistics belong to six months of a year (January to June); in 2018, 846.272 tourists, in 2019, 791.408 tourists visited the North Cyprus. The official figures revealed that tourism industry has been one of the main sectors of North Cyprus economy (Tourism Planning Department, 2019).

North Cyprus is not able to offer distinguished tourism products in contrast with other Mediterranean states, being unrecognized island state in the World obstacles tourism development in the country (Statistical Yearbook of Tourism, 2009). Therefore, rules and regulations on tourism industry must be revised, produce to gain competitive advantage via differentiated tourism product (Erdoğan, Kashif and Ivanov, 2010). Incorporating accessible tourism development can generate competitive strength for the North Cyprus’ tourism industry. Disabled people and their families are potential market for the North Cyprus tourism industry and opening up this market will produce economic returns for the tourism market. Hence; the aim of this study was to determine the accessibility performance of the urban waterfront for disabled tourists. This research is help to determine the current situation of North Cyprus’ tourism industry in terms of accessible tourism issue.

**METHODOLOGY OF STUDY**

Methodology of study will be explained in terms of sample site and data collection and analysis.

**Sample Site**

Kyrenia Sea Front, which is a kind of waterfront, is one of the most significant public open spaces in North Cyprus. It is located in the city of Kyrenia, which is a linear coastal settlement on the north coast of the island. Kyrenia is famous with its Castle and Yacht Harbor that partially define the Sea Front. Besides, Kyrenia Sea Front is defined by historical and contemporary buildings at the center of the town. Kyrenia Sea Front which offers various opportunities to its users; resting, recreation, shopping, eating etc., is a designed
public open space by the Local Municipality. It is an attraction pole for not only all the tourists coming to the island but also the local people and the other people living on the island (Güvenbaş, 2008).

In this research; the main square of the Kyrenia Sea Front, Atatürk Square which is a significant node attached the seafront with the town center, was selected as a representative sample. Atatürk Square is a civic and quay square where people generally used for getting together in terms of realize diverse activities such as meeting, sitting and other socializing events. The square is also significant node that connects the sea front with the town center. Users of Kyrenia Sea Front are mainly completed their visit at this focal point.

Data Collection and Analysis

The qualitative research carried out through structured observations. Observations on-site activities and physical traces, were used to gain a whole sense of participation in waterfront facilities, and contributed to evaluation of accessibility performance of disabled tourists by directly observing real site conditions. The observation forms were designed to document required data. During each observation session, problematic features have been detailly documented on the form. Each determined problems were listed under the main determinants; physical and social barriers. For the physical barriers, the quality of three sub-components including building entranceways, pedestrian routes (sidewalks, curb ramps, pedestrian crossings), and urban furniture and amenities (resting facilities, ATMs, lighting elements, garbage bins, signage, traffic bollards, public toilets, bus stops) were evaluated. For the social barriers, three sub-components such as political values (maintenance and management services), socio-cultural norms (societal attitudes), and socio-economic-issues (affordability of urban waterfront activities) were examined.
The study is only held for people who have a mobility restrictions like wheelchair users, people with cane and walking stickers, elderly and others as parents with prams, pregnant women, children under seven, people with heavy luggage who needs same arrangements in the built environment.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

In the further paragraph the research findings related to physical and social barriers will be explained.

**Physical Barriers**

Physical barriers were examined in order to three components; building entranceway, pedestrian routes, and urban furniture and amenities.

**Building Entranceway**

The quality of entranceways was evaluated in terms of width, gradient, floor covering, and ramp location. Problematic width arrangement, surface material selection, and level differences of entranceways present problems to disabled tourists. The results revealed that single-steeped entranceways without ramps and narrow thresholds create obstacles for wheelchair or scooter users, also negotiate parents with pushchairs and ambulant disabled people to enter buildings with their self-control. Lack of handrails and non-slip floor surfaces are handicapped ambulant disabled person and older adults who faced with problems regard to maintain their balance while using those entrance ways. In addition to these; there was a bank building entrance owning an ideal ramp gradient which unsuitably covered and diemensioned without handrails.

![Figure 4. Unsuitable Arrangement Of Building Entrances Restrict Physically Disabled Tourists' Access At Atatürk Square.](image)

Based on the research results it can be stated that the quality of entranceways is negatively effected disabled tourists' usage at Atatürk Square. Building frontages and entranceways must be redesigned with suitable inclusive design considerations. The proper ramps should be added instead of single-steeped platforms. Floor covering materials and door openings must also changed with suitable form.

**Pedestrian Routes**

Availability of pedestrian routes such as sidewalks, curb ramps, pedestrian crossings was studied. Disabled tourists are not able to move around Atatürk Square, especially wheelchair users must be accompanied by someone else when they are travelling. The square is covered with tiles that are slip-resistant, but the joint between the adjacent tiles are not appropriate in terms of accessible design features. Sidewalks are wide enough, but unsuitable configuration of street furnishing elements obstacled pedestrians and do not allow free passage for them during overcrowded usage periods.
The results indicated that pedestrian routes restrict disabled tourist users' mobility in the Atatürk Square. The overcrowded sidewalks were principal obstacle and sometimes obliged pedestrian to use vehicular routes. Accordingly, sidewalks and pathways are inaccessible and unusable for tourists with limited mobility. The quality of these components have to be improved by complying with contextual pedestrian volumes and the principles of barrier-free access.

**Urban Furniture and Amenities**

Atatürk Square’s street furnishing elements include resting facilities, ATMs, lighting elements, garbage bins, signages and traffic bollards. In general, the urban furnishing elements do not offer convenient or flexible usage. The configuration of street furniture elements as lighting elements and garbage bins along the pathway cause safety problems.

Sitting elements are not suitable for the uses of every people, because some of them are out of standart and inclusive design requirements. Folding chairs offer problematic usage for the tourists with mobility aids or having hand and arm disability. Benches without backrests are not comfortable or safe for elderly people and pregnant women.
ATMs were generally placed on stepped platforms, do not have enough space for frontal approach, and the height of mailboxes slot are troublesome for wheelchair users and very short people.

The legibility of signage was in a good condition because signs that were placed in the square were predominantly designed based on the inclusive use standards. Moreover, lack of illuminated signage is not appropriate for night usage of the public space. Traffic bollards were placed for pedestrian safety, but they are open to probable pedestrian accidents instead of protecting pedestrians from hazards. More useful and accessible street furnishing elements are urgently needed in the Kyrenia Sea Front.

Public toilets are far from the Atatürk Square and they are frequently located below street level. Improper design of such amenities creates problems for disabled tourists. The seamless travel is critical to provide accessible tourism activities over transport chain and in that chain continuity of travel depends on the availability of public toilet provision. Otherwise; travel of disabled tourists results with failure.

In addition to these; any bus stop arrangement were not determined in the Atatürk Square. The unique bus stop was located at the enter of town center and there is a large distance between the Atatürk Square and unique bus stop. Public transportation system must be revised.

Social Barriers
Apart from the physical barriers, social barriers were evaluated in terms of political values (maintenance and management services), socio-cultural norms (societal attitudes), and socio-economic-issues (affordability of urban waterfront activities).
Socio-Polical Values

Periodic and routine maintenance plays an important role for sustaining inclusive urban waterfronts for disabled tourists. Poor maintenance facilities creates problematic usage, particularly uneven and cracked paving slabs are not safe, create risks for pedestrian accidents. Besides; deficient parking control prompt motor vehicle drivers to flout rules by parking prohibited curb side zones in front of the square. Whereas there is double-yellow line along the vehicle lane, drivers still use towaway zone that means weak parking control increases accessibility and usability problems.

Figure 11. Poor Maintenance Facilities Create Danger For Disabled Tourists.

Figure 12. Parked Vehicles At Towaway Zone Restrict Disabled Tourists’ Usage.

In order to achieve accessible tourism, it is essential to provide a range of statutory powers and legislation providing mechanisms for right and proper arrangements in support of issues like urban space management, design control review, public transportation management/control and parking management/control.

Socio-Cultural Norms

Disrespectful behavior of able-bodied society restrict tourists function in Atatürk Square and its close environment. Although tourists with mobility limitations can find well-designed curb ramp, their accessibility are troublesome by the parked vehicles.

Socio-Economic Issues

In terms of socio-economic status of tourists, the research outcomes has shown that tourists with varied income level prefer to use distinct zones of Atatürk Square. While tourists with middle income mainly sit at cafes, tourists with low income prefer to rest on a bench without purchasing. It was also perceived that tourists with high incomes prefer to go restaurants which has expensive prices. Within the boundaries of a sample area, there was not any bus stop, if people become to be more tired they can easily take taxi, because taxi station was located in the square. However; the prices of taxi services are too expensive.

Figure 13. Blocked Curb Ramps By Parked Vehicles Are Among The Significant Traces Of Socio-Cultural Norms.
In the Atatürk Square, affordable facilities are rare, so it is vital to take precautions to control economic barriers to Kyrenia Sea Fronts’ inclusive use. To achieve accessible tourism, strategic transportation plans could be re-envisioned and appropriate public transportation investments would provide positive economic returns.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Tourism is one of the important foremost sector for Kyrenia City, particularly existence of waterfront create high potential to generate economic returns from the tourism sector. Kyrenia Sea Front reflects the characteristics of commercial, recreational and historic waterfront and has attractive shoreline which offers various activities for the visitors of Cyprus.

This research focused on the accessible tourism issues for tourists with physical disabilities at Kyrenia Sea Front. The research findings revealed that the tourism industry is not suitably arranged for the disabled customer market. The case study’s evidence discloses accessibility problems which produced by environmental barriers. Both the physical and social environment have components that are far from the accessible tourism requirements. Based on the research findings; a number of recommendations are given for providing accessible tourism in Kyrenia Sea Front:

- Pedestrian access has to be prioritized under the framework of more comprehensive planning approaches. Pedestrian-oriented details have to be defined in urban design agendas with suitable design considerations regarding seamless travel at all scales of built environment.
- Whole pedestrian networks have to be redesigned with accessible tourism requirements.
- Public transportation system must be revisioned. Accessible bus stops should be placed at regular intervals. The location of bus stops must be graspable. Waiting shelters, sitting elements and schedule boards have to be designed with proper diemensions.
- Public toilets must be completely redesigned with accessible design requirements. They should be placed on the ground floor with comfortable and graspable entrances.
- A number of street furnishing elements; lighting element and garbage bins must be increased and they have to be suitably designed in terms of ergonomic measures. They should be placed outside of pedestrian zone.
- Raising public awareness on accessible tourism issue will foster a sense of belonging for not only tourists, including citizens who perceive their territory in the public realm by the reason of undesirable actions of the broader society.
- Maintenance strategies and plans should be developed. The extent and frequency of maintenance schedules must vary greatly depending on the location, amount of use, and resources available.
- Traffic and parking control have to be regularly provided. The influential regulations have to be enacted and enforced.
- Prices of selling products and eating/drinking have to be taken under control by the authorities.

As a conclusion, the outcome of this research is expected to provide necessary framework to achieved accessible tourism in Kyrenia Sea Front. Tourist visitors with disabilities should be incorporated into tourism market and all of the built environment should be designed inclusively to all people who wants to participate facilities in the urban waterfronts.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

In the second half of the 20th century, the concept of sustainability came up with the claim that social, economic and environmental needs are at risk. Till then, it aims to protect the vital resources and values, and transfer them to the future by eliminating these risks. This approach reveals the importance of protecting and sustaining the urban, architectural, social and cultural values of historical textures in the context of social, economic and environmental development.

The Anatolian geography we live on has many historical textures that need to be preserved with their traditional architecture and cultural structure. Transferring these historical textures to the future with a sustainable conservation approach is one of the important discussion topics of conservation discipline. Although the preferential objective of this discussion is to strengthen the subjective qualities of our cultural heritage and to carry them to the future, the usage of these cultural areas to integrate them with current life and to support the economic development is highly addressed. At this point, the issue cultural tourism as a tool for cultural sustainability and economical development comes into prominence.

In this framework, this study tries to point out the tension between preservation and economic development by examining the impact of cultural tourism activities on heritage places through the historical settlement of Birgi. Birgi, as an important heritage site with its qualified urban pattern, traditional architecture and intangible cultural values, has been transforming into a cultural tourism destination in recent years. Within this transformation process, the determination to maintain the cultural values of the settlement and the interest in tourism activities as a means of economic development forms the dual structure of the discussions related to the future of Birgi. In accordance with the current discussions, the preservation studies and touristic activities had been examined; the social impact of these activities such as the perception of the local people, the tolerance limits related to the touristic activities and the reformation of the traditional life with the visitors was questioned, and the positive/negative impacts of tourism in the context of sustainable preservation was discussed. As a result of all these discussions and findings, it has been significantly noted that, although cultural tourism in heritage places is useful by strengthening the economical and usage values of historical textures, it should only be implemented as if it prioritizes the sustainability of the urban and architectural pattern by means of character, meaning, arts and crafts while sustaining the local socio-cultural structure.

Keywords: Cultural Tourism, Sustainable Preservation, Heritage Places, Birgi

INTRODUCTION

The preservation and rehabilitation of historical environments is an important discussion topic of the conservation discipline. The conservation discipline, which has been developing and expanding since the 19th century, has extended its content from the preservation of historic monuments to a holistic approach that aims to preserve the historical texture and the environment as a whole with all natural and artificial elements (Jokiletho, 2002). This approach foresees the preservation and continuity of cultural areas which are defined as heritage sites with their tangible and intangible values and points out the importance of sustainability in architectural conservation.
The concept of sustainability has emerged with the awareness of social, economic and environmental requirements are at risk. The issue of sustainability, which has become one of the important discussion topics of the scientific and social environments since the half of the 20th century, aims to protect the vital need resources and values that need to be transferred from the present to the future by eliminating the risks (Brundtland Report, 1983). This approach reveals the importance of protecting and sustaining the urban, architectural, social and cultural values of historical textures in the context of social, economic and environmental development.

According to the Italian architect and city planner Cervellati, sustainable and holistic protection can only be actualized by preserving the community that maintains the heritage place further to the restoration of historic buildings (Arısoy, 2014). In a similar vein, sustainable conservation works aim to ensure the continuity of the socio-cultural structure beyond the protection of objects, and foresee that the continuity of the socio-cultural structure should be supported by economic development. At this point, tourism, which is one of the important economic development tools of the 20th century and especially the cultural tourism activities focusing on historical, cultural and local areas come to the fore (Ashworth, 2000).

Tourism activities that focus on the historical textures, enable the economic development and also expand the awareness of these areas (Girard and Nijkamp, 2009). On the other hand, uncontrolled and overstain tourism activities have significant risks for the protection of cultural heritage. Touristic activities that will take place in historical areas, which are important parts of our cultural heritage, should not be an aim but a tool for sustainable protection of the area. For this reason, the preservation of the heritage place and the balance between the preservation and usage should be taken as the priority within forming a sustainable tourism planning in historical places.

In this framework, this study tries to point out the tension between preservation and economic development by examining the impact of cultural tourism activities on heritage places through the historical settlement of Birgi. Birgi, as an important heritage site with its qualified urban pattern, traditional architecture and intangible cultural values, has been transforming into a cultural tourism destination in recent years. Within this transformation process, the determination to maintain the cultural values of the settlement and the interest in tourism activities as a means of economic development forms the dual structure of the discussions related to the future of Birgi. In accordance with the current discussions, the preservation studies and touristic activities had been examined; the social impact of these activities such as the perception of the local people, the tolerance limits related to the touristic activities and the reformation of the traditional life with the visitors was questioned, and the positive/negative impacts of tourism in the context of sustainable preservation was discussed.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

The term sustainability is defined as meeting our own needs without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs (Collin, 2014). By the end of the twentieth centuries, many of these ideas had come together in the call for sustainable development. In 1983, former Norwegian prime minister Gro Harlem Brundtland run the World Commission on Environment and Development (Brundtland Report). After four years, the ‘Brundtland Commission’ released its final report, Our Common Future. It defines sustainable development as: development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. The commission successfully unified environmentalism with social and economic concerns on the world’s development agenda. Within all these concerns, the term sustainability met the preservation discipline and the context of sustainable preservation discussions was began.

According to Burra Charter (2013), the term conservation was defined as all the processes of looking after a place so as to retain its cultural significance. Cultural significance was defined as aesthetic, historic, scientific, social or spiritual value for past, present or future generations. Cultural significance is embodied in the place itself, its fabric, setting, use, associations, meanings, records, related places and related objects. This approach highlights the multi-component issues of preservation that consists of physical (urban, architectural, artificial and technique), socio-cultural and economical concerns.

Within the preservation discipline, sustainable preservation contains variable heritage issues such as; preservation of tangible and intangible values, singular buildings, texture of rural and urban places and cultural landscapes. The aims of sustainable conservation is to maintain all of these heritage issues to the future with their aesthetic, historic, scientific, social or spiritual value. Within this framework and aims, economic development needs
to be in relation with conservation discipline in order to strengthen the sustainability of heritage places. The social dimension of sustainable development emphasizes the need to improve the quality of life for all citizens by raising base levels of material income and by increasing social equity, such that all groups have fair access to education, livelihood and resources. This dimension is most relevant to the need to consider built cultural heritage as part of sustainable development. Of particular relevance to this discussion is the notion of inter-generational equity through which the current generation preserves cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1984) for the benefit of future generations (UNIDO, 2005).

In the context of sustainable preservation, the continuity of the economic value and correspondingly the continuity of socio-cultural values have to be taken among the main objectives. With this point of view, tourism and especially the sustainable tourism came forward as an important issue. Sustainable tourism is defined as a kind of tourism activity that respects the participation of the public, prioritizes the local concerns in policy making and sensitive to cultural and environmental influences (Mccoll and Moisey, 2008).

The concept of sustainable tourism remains the subject of vigorous debate. It is variously interpreted and its validity is questioned in many quarters. These discussions focus on the lack of clarity and meaning while points out the aims and methodology. Definitions abound, to the extent that ‘defining sustainable development in the context of tourism has become something of a cottage industry in the academic literature of late’ (Garrod & Fyall, 1998: 1999). Such definitions fall primarily within two categories; those which are ‘tourism-centric’ (Hunter, 1995), focusing on sustaining tourism as an economic activity, and those which consider tourism as an element of wider sustainable development policies (Cronin, 1990). Sustainable tourism has also been referred to as an ‘adaptive paradigm’, encompassing a set of meta-principles within which ‘several different development pathways may be legitimized according to circumstance’ (Hunter, 1997: 859). The main idea that reveals the need for sustainable tourism is to ensure that environmental and cultural values that constitute the source of tourism are used in a long-term manner without degrading or minimizing the negative effects that may arise. At this point, the relationship between cultural heritage and tourism comes forward. When considered from this point of view, the role of tourism is significant to reach the all aims of sustainability conservation as long as it will be taken a tool not a goal.

Within the framework of these discussions, the aim and scope of the study is to examine the impact of sustainable tourism, which is one of the most important tools of economic development, on historical settlements through the historical settlement of Birgi.

**METHOD**

The discipline of preservation still has doubts about the positive and negative effects of cultural tourism by drawing attention to the commodifying effect of tourism activities. However, the approach that sustainable protection can be achieved by strengthening the place in physical, social and economic terms reveals the positive effect of tourism activities as being an important tool of economic development. At this point, this study constitutes a discussion about how to ease the tension between preservation and tourism. With this aim, the historical and contemporary dynamics of the place are determined and the elements constituting the quality of cultural heritage are defined. After then, the preservation implementations and the touristic activities; the perception of the local community to these activities and their tolerance limits to the visitors and the dynamics of new social life are evaluated.

In this framework, firstly, a comprehensive literature study has been conducted. With this study, the concepts that determine the items of the discussion, and the historical development and cultural quality of the place have been investigated. In order to update the data obtained from the literature studies, field studies were conducted in Birgi in 2019. In this context, the findings on spatial transformation of the place were gathered through observations and interviews, while the opinions and the judgments of the public on conservation and tourism activities. Within the scope of the interviews, fifteen local people, two tradesmen, five operators of the touristic places and the officials of ÇEKÜL Foundation, who had an impact on the conservation activities in Birgi, were met.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS ON BİRĞİ**

Birgi is an historic settlement that located on the two slopes of Mount Tmolos, where Gediz and Küçük Menderes plains are separated from each other. The region with its fertile agricultural areas and the strategic importance by being on the transportation networks, has been inhabited since ancient times.
Birgi has reached to a city scale at the Roman period in the 1st century AD, though it owned the characteristics and colors of a typical medieval city during the Byzantine Period. In Byzantine period, the city has assumed the function of an important cult and religious activity center since it became the Episcopal Center. The place undertook the function of the administrative center of Aydınoglu Principality established in 1308 in Menderes Basins. With the accession of the Sanjak of Aydın to the Ottoman lands in 1426, the settlement which was captured by the Ottomans, became the second largest city of Western Anatolia. In the very beginning of 20th century, the city faced with wars and demographic change. As such in all over Anatolia, the people of Birgi fought for independence during the last period of the Ottoman Empire and kept on living under the rule of the Republic of Turkey.

Despite the historical process of the settlement, the greatest change in the spatial and functional identity of Birgi took place in the 19th century. After the construction of İzmir-Aydın Railway, it remained outside the trade route and lost its identity as a trade and cultural center and undertook the function of a ‘rural charactered settlement’ whose economy was based on agricultural production activities. Another important threshold within the urban history of Birgi was the first quarter of 20th century. The city has lost some of its traditional urban texture within the fire happened in 1922. After then, the demolished neighborhoods were rebuilt in accordance with the architectural understanding of the republican period.

When the socio-economic structure of the settlement is examined, it is possible to say that migration movements are limited and have an inward character in terms of social structure. This situation affected the formation of place identity formation in two directions; the tarditional urban and architectural character and the weakening of the economy. Due to the changes in the transportation networks of 1970’s, Birgi was enclosed and had the chance to stay away from the uncontroled urbanization of 80’s. Thus, the settlement could preserve the ‘traditional urban fabric’ and ‘architectural character’. On the other hand, due to the weakening of the economic volume, the local community and especially the young people migrated to Ödemiş and nearby cities such as İzmir. Though the lack of internal migration and building pressure of urbanization, many traditional structures have been abandoned due to the loss of users and physical degradation (Gülhan 2016).

The preservation activities, which carried out to strengthen the inheritance of the settlement were started by the registering a monumental resident, (Mansion of Çakırağa) as a cultural entity. After then, due to multilayered cultural structure, monumental buildings and 18th century traditional residential architecture, Birgi was registered as an urban-archaeological-natural site in 1977 and conservation development plan was approved in 1996. As for being an important heritage site with its intangible values and natural environment as well as its qualified traditional residential fabric and monumental structures, Birgi has been chosen as one of the self-preserving cities by the ÇEKÜL Foundation and nominated for Unesco World Heritage Temporary List in 2012. The conservation activities happened in Birgi aimed to preserve and maintain historical and cultural values. With this aim, restoration of traditional residential buildings, re-functional interventions related to these entities and rehabilitation studies related to the urban texture has been actualized.

The rehabilitation works, which came to the forefront as an intervention method in urban scale, started primarily in center and its nearby neighborhoods such as: Cami Kebir, Kurtgazi and Saribaba in 2000’s and Taspazar neighborhood in 2019. These rehabilitation studies have made a positive contribution to the maintenance of Birgi’s historical urban character and strengthen the place identity while caused to increase tourism potential in terms of economic development. On the other hand, restoration and re-functioning implementations related to the traditional houses have been carrying on in the site. The most of the traditional houses have been renovated by refunctining such as; cafes, restaurants, pensions. It is possible to say that, the new uses of historic houses was determined by the tourism potential of Birgi that based on its historical and cultural values.

However, these conservation implementations and tourism activities transformed the physical and social structure of the city center and caused a dual life in the heritage place. Today, the city center has been mostly used by the visitors and the local people cannot experience this district in their daily routines. Most of the traditional houses have lost their original usage and transformed into service areas that are temporarily used. Therefore, the city center which is used above potential in the high season becomes sub-potential other times and the locals maintain their lives in the periphery while the visitors experiencing the traditional local life in the center without the
locals. In addition, the rural life is almost dismissed though it is one of the main goals of sustainable preservation and also one of the tools of sustainable tourism. It shall be appropriate to encourage the cultivation of local agricultural products such as figs, olive oil, potatoes, chestnuts and Japanese persimmon by the locals and expected to contribute to the economic development of Birgi in the context of sustainable preservation and rural tourism.

As it has been informed above, the preservation studies happened in Birgi have strengthened the place and made the local community proud of their places, while the tourism activities has increased the awareness, strengthened the economic value of the historic houses and helped in feeling proud of the place. However, the perception of the locals related to the tourists is negative. The interviews have questioned the tolerance limits of locals, the effects of tourism in the local life, and the contribution of new functions to social, spatial and economic aspects. As a result of all these negotiations, it has been determined that as long as these activities contribute to the economic development of the local people, their tolerance to tourism and tourists is high. Seven of the interviewees of local people’s opinions about tourists were positive, since they thought tourists/tourism in Birgi gave a chance to introduce and sell their handmade local goods and Birgi’s local products. However, due to the conservative nature of the locals, this tolerance was low against to the public houses and even they tyrannized over the local and central administration and forced them to terminate the activity. Five of the interviewers of the local people’s opinions were firmly negative about usage of public houses, since they thought public houses affected their local life unfavourably. Another reaction of locals is against the daily trips. Ten of the interviewees from local people thought that daily tours can harm their daily life as well as their local sustainable life balance. Daily tours are one of the main reasons of over potential usage of Birgi and threaten the sustainable preservation model that is taken as the priority.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

In addition to the traditional architectural patterns, historical sites are important parts of life as a holistic product of social, environmental and economical inputs. In historical places that need to be protected, renewed, revitalized and even rehabilitated, it is necessary to adopt these works by the local people and provide solutions to the spatial, cultural and economic needs of the users. Projects that aim a sustainable and holistic preservation should be created with an approach that prioritizes the continuity of the local character and seeks to respond to the needs and expectations of the local community. This approach points out that tourism activities, which are the means of economic development, should be tools rather than goals in the rehabilitation of historical sites. Although this approach is theoretically accepted, it is observed that tourism planning is not prioritized regarding historical textures. It is observed that settlements such as Çeşme, Bodrum and Şirince, which stand out as important tourism destinations in addition to their historical qualities, are planned with an approach that prioritizes the increase of economic value and visitor expectations. With this perspective, the re-functionalization of Birgi’s historical buildings with appropriate usages, the integration of new usages with traditional and rural character of the place and the strengthening of it, and the perception of tourism activities by the local users of the area were evaluated.

As it is observed in Birgi, it is quite important that the new uses of the re-functionalized historical buildings should maintain the architectural character of the structure. On the other hand, in order to achieve a holistic approach, the preservation of intangible cultural heritage values has to be considered among the main objectives. With this perspective, conservation activities in Birgi can be assumed as positive in terms of the adoption of new functions and functional predictions by the local community. The tourism activities have been provided the re-use of obsolete buildings as a hostel, restaurant or café, and it also provided employment opportunities in terms of economics. The placement of these activities that concentrated in the historic center and its nearby where monumental buildings are located can be respond positively as it allows the traditional living routines to continue in the periphery traditional housing areas. However, these activities have negative effect by having similar opportunities and characteristics, and offering the economic benefit to a limited group. This point of view envisages the use of re-functionalized historical structures to be in accordance with the architectural potential and to functionalize these buildings by main tools of cultural tourism such as: accommodation and gastronomic activities, and to ensure the management of these commercial activities with a cooperative management model.

Besides, it is important to emphasize the objective of experience in the foreseen touristic activities and to make this experience with a view that emphasizes the traditional and rural character of the place. For
example, instead of boutique hotels, it is possible to encourage home boarding and to enable the visitors to experience the local life of Birgi together with the locals. On the other hand, limiting the possibilities of accommodation in terms of scale and sharing the income through a cooperative management model will enable the usage of historical buildings in accordance with the architectural potential of the buildings and the appropriation of the activities by the local society.

Another issue that emerged within the studies is the determination of tolerance limits of locals both for the touristic activities and the visitors. The local community of Birgi is heavily conservative. This makes it necessary to carefully determine the location of new uses and options that will be installed on the historical site. For this reason, it is very important to determine the spatial and social dynamics of the place within the tourism planning of the settlement, and to define the activities in terms of service diversity, scale, quality in accordance with the spatial character of the heritage and the social structure of the local community.

Consequently, it can be clarified that the preservation and rehabilitation implementations and the cultural tourism activities carried out in Birgi been positively affected the sustainability of the traditional fabric of Birgi by establishing the balance of protection/use of the historical settlements. By now, tourism activities have been strengthened and put forward the traditional, rural character of Birgi. However, in order to sustain and strengthen the social structure, the socio-cultural issues such as place identity, sense of belonging and memory have to be taken into concern in the further expectations of Birgi.

REFERENCES


Hersek M. C. Alaçatı Kasabası’nda Koruma ve Sağlıklaştırma


Information. (Mcgill University, Canada). Available at: https://www.mcgill.ca/sustainability/files/sustainability/what-is-sustainability.pdf


Oral interviews within the scope of Birgi field work


World Commission on Environment and Development (Brundtland Report), 1983.

Olgica GRCHEVA
Res. Assist., Eastern Mediterranean University
olgica.grcheva@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Reuse of military building typologies is a relatively recent tendency in Skopje, the capital city of the Republic of North Macedonia. As in different regions and countries around the world, especially after the fall of the Berlin Wall and starting of the new political realities in Europe in the late 80s and the beginning of 90ties, former socialist countries such as Macedonia and its military heritage is becoming common part of the civil society used for various cultural purposes rather than emphasizing the military heritage as leading stream. These former facilities that remained in a good physical condition and applied contemporary reuse projects are being part of the new cultural networks and routes, even promoting varieties of values of the “smart city” concept. This former military building (“Public Room”) is located on the “cultural route”, connecting the old (The Old Town and Bazaar) and new parts of the city. The conversion from the rigid and neglected military building typologies that are existing nearby the former Railway Station into new cultural hubs, centers for design and innovations are offering vast multi-layered benefits to the cultural mainstreams. With the case study of the “Public Room” building - Center for Design and Innovation; cultural, social, economic, environmental, aesthetical, technological and functional benefits are achieved not just within the building itself but on the urban levels as well. It creates new paradigms of smart city co-creative platforms such as urban patterns that are promoting the contemporary urban culture and cultural tourism. This paper aims to interpret how the benefits are achieved through the applied adaptive reuse project and decision-making process in the case study of “Public Room”; offering and promoting up-to-date multicultural activities and events to the locals and tourists, without any bias towards political, ethical or religious orientation.

Keywords: Military Heritage, Adaptive Reuse, Benefits, Smart City, Decision-making

INTRODUCTION

Buildings have always been adjusted or modified to a certain extent. Although the adaptation of buildings is not a new procedure, their conversion to contemporary uses on a regular and larger scale is more a recent occurrence. In the past, there was evidence of only occasional building conversions starting up from the Roman era up to the late Medieval period, whereas between the 16th and 19th centuries conversions and other forms of adaptive reuse approaches became more common (Cunnington, 1988).

Nowadays, even though many existing typologies including the industrial/military buildings that are potentially still in good physical/structural quality, unfortunately, they are redundant or neglected due to various influential factors (Gregg and Crosbie, 2001). It would be a loss of valuable built assets to destroy such structures because demolition is itself a non-economic, wasteful, hazardous, polluting, disruptive and costly process (Douglas, 2006). Adaptive reuse of military buildings as part of the industrial building heritage in the cities received a lot of attention in the previous century especially after II. World War and changings of the political systems in Europe and worldwide. The redevelopments and reuse of abandoned industrial sites and buildings, which are often located in the core sections of urban areas, have huge potential to improve quality of life in different manners in the cities (Li, H & Lui, W, 2013).

The industrial heritage (warehouses, factories, gas-stations, mills, railway stations) is becoming more suitable to host various uses that are matching the contemporary way of living, such as art galleries, design & cultural centers, offices, theaters, etc. Moreover, their building characteristics and spatial volumes, the legislation and by-laws are allowing designers to have freedom in the context of importing different use, concepts and functions. Usually, conversions to other uses are more attractive than same-use conversions. The new use may involve minimal spatial, interior and functional requirements that are not differing much from the original. Usually, this building typology requires structural and interior modifications so to accommodate the changes easily (Douglas, 2006).
These reuses and changes of the industrial heritage buildings covers another aspect of urban developments, especially in the domain of the mainstream culture today: the “creative cities” concept. As Harrison and Donnelly are going to emphasize in their significant essay about the theory of smart cities by analyzing recent developments and changes:

“These challenges lead to experiments with new approaches to the planning, design, finance, construction, governance, and operation of urban infrastructure and services that Smart Cities are broadly called”. (Harrison & Donnelly, 2011)

In the case of Skopje, this prism is becoming possible after starting with the steps for creating National Strategies on Creative Industries (Creative Industries Mapping in the Republic of Macedonia, Skopje, 2016) that was initiated and performed basically by the Ministry of Culture. On one side, this explains the level of institutionalized influence in the process but on the other side it is not limiting the creative potential that influences the recent culture and art production, but instead promoting art and culture as basic hubs for collecting creative potential that participates in the concept of the city creativity, cultural networks development, and cultural routes definition. In this context, the same point of “smart cities” appears to influence tourism, cultural tourism, adaptive reuse of heritage buildings and many other forms of creative existence on an urban scale.

Many other examples confirm a tendency of recognition of the cultural, thus promotional and touristic potential of these buildings typologies. As stressed in detail in the PSFK platform – (The Future of cities, 2013) they even elaborate recent trends, which are responsible for the sustainable growth and effective management of the smart cities as they respond to the exceptional challenges by the rapid urbanization. These trends are mostly,

“aided by connected technologies, social platforms, and flexible design thinking, cities at the forefront of these progressive solutions are creating a compelling blueprint for ensuring that their citizens, businesses and public institutions thrive” (PSFK - The Future of cities, 2013).

Some of the emphasized values and topics coming from the above-mentioned report coincide with the main topic of this research and presentation of the case study of “Public Room”, such as pop-up culture, creative clusters, urban canvas, artistic endeavors (PSFK - The Future of cities, 2013)1.

With this approach, it is possible to reach to the point to ask questions such as: Who does the city work for? What the emergent and creative third places are in cities? How do future scenarios of cities seduce policymakers, decision-makers, planners, and designers? How does the complex decision making process is provided? (Tsakarestou, 2013)

Possible answers are again leading the traces back to creativeness, reuse, co-creation, urban patterns and cultures, tourism developments, city branding…

LITERATURE REVIEW: DECISION-MAKING PROCESS IN ADAPTIVE REUSE

Particularly in the adaptive reuse field, development and decision-making process, many professionals from both the public and private sectors are required to ensure that all of the necessary elements are coordinated and the tasks are completed. Because of their specific roles, expertise, and backgrounds, the stakeholders naturally approach the adaptive reuse process differently, with different ideas, strategies, and methods than the experts (Bond, 2011). Adaptive reuse process of industrial/military building typologies reflects with complexity, creativity, design thinking, co-creative, and collaborative planning which includes involvement of various factors, strategies, and approaches such as:- stakeholders(building owners, authorities, planers, institutions, companies, communities, etc.);

---

1 POP-UP CULTURE: “Architects and planners are experimenting with temporary venues designed to be quickly deployed and assembled to host temporary events like performances and films. These flash experiences connect with an ever changing audience, while highlighting locally sourced content and bringing cultural enrichment into people’s lives”.

CREATIVE CLUSTERS: “As a way to breathe life back into forgotten corners of a city, there has been a renewed push to develop an artistic and cultural infrastructure like galleries, studios and workshops within transitional neighborhoods. By highlighting educational programming and creative self-expression, these grassroots efforts seek to build a strong anchor for the surrounding community that is attractive to both residents and visitors. As these areas establish themselves as destinations, they open the door for further social and business ventures, adding to the collective benefit of a place”.

URBAN CANVAS: “Artistic endeavors and considered redevelopments that make the city landscape feel more vibrant and alluring, while engaging citizens around shared experiences and conversations”.

---
strategies (intervention, insertion, and installation);
approaches (contextual, contrast, free design, building within, over, around, alongside);
feasibility studies, regulation, and legislation (degrees of protection);
involvement of local communities (local needs, opinions);
identification (location, building, materials, sense of place, values, etc.);
definition of actors (experts, building owners, organizations, stakeholders);
the decision of the conservation actors (working team);
analysis of the existing fabric;
definition of adaptive reuse potentials (concepts, typology, methods);
definition of financial changes (funds, donations);
final decisions (executive stages);
a management plan for future use and maintenance of the building (international or local organizations, owners, etc.) (Bond, 2011).

Furthermore, by applying these important steps of adaptive reuse decision-making process, the final result and the new uses, functions for existing industrial / military structures could be advantageous from many aspects such as: its function, users, the building itself (aesthetics, maintenance and protection) and on urban levels as well (Mine, 2013). Most common benefits that could eventually come from the properly applied adaptive reuse strategies and decision-making process can be categorized as cultural, social, economic, environmental, technologic, functional, and aesthetic benefits common for both communities and the city (Johnson, 1996).

**Former Military Heritage in Skopje**

After the fall of Yugoslavia in 1991, in R. N. Macedonia as a former socialist country, many military and industrial facilities remained abandoned. In Skopje, especially in the central zone near the former Railway station (existing before the devastating Earthquake in 1963, today functioning as Skopje City Museum) that was from enormous importance for the economic and industrial development for the country and the capital city, many warehouses and storage facilities built between 1919-1936 stayed in good structural condition (Multimedia centre “Mala Stanica” – National Gallery of Macedonia, n.d.). See Fig.1. The structural qualities and capacities of these facilities are not prone to premature physical obsolescence due to the durability of the construction made for industrial and military purposes.

To some of the buildings were given the purposes of the Ministry of Defense to be used for, yet some of them were completely demolished and some remained locked, empty and neglected. In the recent decade, these typologies of buildings became attractive topics for experts to open discussions and debates (since they were not used actively and sufficiently) about their possible future reuse and creation of new cultural routes, connecting the old and new parts of the city so to contribute into the cultural and urban life of Skopje. One of the military warehouses located the nearby left side of the building Public Room (See Fig.1) is one of the initial reuse projects that were applied to this typology of buildings and today successfully is functioning as part of the National Gallery Network of Macedonia, as “Multimedia and Cultural center, Mala Stanica”.

**Research Process**

In that sense, the main objective and research question of this paper is to present and show how multi-layered benefits are achieved through the new contemporary reuse approaches applied on the former military building facility, today so-called “Public Room”. Moreover, this research aims to examine how the reuse strategies and project influences and improves the urban context through the proposed program and gives irreplaceable and up-to-date values to the city. The methodology that will be used in this research will be qualitative and presented through a purposeful selection of a case study (Public Room) through applied adaptive reuse project presented from its earlier conceptual stages up to its final executive stages and decision-making process.

Furthermore, the data collection was provided through personal analysis and observations, archive research, applied the decision-making process of the project, interviews with experts and stakeholders and final results. With this article the focus stays only on the decision-making process of the case of Public Room (Center for Design and Innovation); the achieved benefits and will not elaborate other industrial or military facilities that are part of the urban cultural network of the city.
EARLIER CONDITION

The former military building located nearby the Former Railway Station (today Skopje City Museum) so-called “Vardar”, was initially constructed in 1921, functioning as a military stable during the period between the two World Wars. Later on, according to the needs of the military, it was used as warehouse storage together with an administrative part in the ground floor. The structural system is made from reinforced concrete (columns and beams) and remained in good structural condition (Josole Engineering, 2015). The building has a total capacity of 1440 square meters and has ground floor, first floor, and attic.

Moreover, in recent years the facility owned by Ministry of Defense, unfortunately, remained in derelict condition (interior-floor, walls, stairs and exterior-façade – not renewed and full with graffiti, openings, chimneys, roof, details and ornamentation, accessibility), used only for minor administrative purposes only in the ground floor (See Figure 2-3). The pitched wooden roof structure stayed in critical condition as well; wooden beams (roof construction) are slightly damaged and needs to be replaced/strengthened. The roof construction was to be replaced to be able to hold heavier weights in the future such as solar panels so to enable energy efficiency of the building. Another problem with the attic is that the existing roof structure is not providing any natural ventilation/light. For that purpose, restructuring and consolidation of the roof had to be considered.

Public Room Organization

Public Room is an active non-governmental organization and non-profit civil and urban society organization in R. N. Macedonia, Balkan region and beyond. The activities and the program they are providing to the community is to empower the non-profit sector from the region, influencing the national cultural policies and intensifying the cooperation in the field of culture, arts, design, and architecture in relation with the business sector. Public Room exists as a non-profit organization from 2007 while producing the most tangible results from 2008 in the focus sector – Design (URL 1).
From that year till present the organization is hosting and organizing the most important event in the cultural domain such as "Skopje Design Week”, in the historical building – “Kurshumli Han” in the Old Town of Skopje (See Figure 4-5). Moreover, this organization has organized various international exchanges and presentations, production workshops, training, and management courses in the field of design.

![Figure 4-5. Public Room organizing Skopje Design Week](http://balkandesignnetwork.org/articles/skopje-design-week)

### Requirements and Program

As popular NGO and non-profit organization in Skopje, in 2014, Public Room required new space / building (with previously estimated location and spatial characteristics) that will respond to the needs for creating new a Center for Design and Innovation and organizing Skopje Design Week in a new facility that will actively contribute to the community with its urban and cultural profile as well.

The program of the new Center for Design and Innovation has consisted of: lobby and reception desk, restaurant (bistro) and bar, kitchen and storages, prototyping room with separate entrance for supplying and delivering goods with truck (wood department, metal department, upholstery department, modeling department and storage, separated but still to be visible for visitors from the restaurant and bar area). Moreover, toilet units, multifunctional spaces to host various types of events such as seminars, workshops, presentations, screenings, debates, exhibitions, public and private events; concept store + shopping room, private room with small bar and kitchenette, open room, administrative zone with advertisement agencies, working stations, design studios etc. (Velinovski, 2014). These requirements are given to the stakeholders and expert’s team (architects, engineers) as well as a conceptual design program to be able to fit in the existing military heritage building to be converted into a new center in Skopje for Design and Innovation. Furthermore, in the next chapter, the decision-making process of conversion and adaptation of the building will be explained.

### Decision-making Process (conceptual and executive stages)

The building "Vardar" located on the “50th Division” street is governed by Ministry of Defense (previously used as storage and administration for the military purposes, but not sufficiently used and neglected). Due to the lack of use and poor conditions of the building, after major analysis of the space and estimation from authorities, stakeholders and experts (evaluation of the existing physical condition, documentation, measuring and drawing, preparation of a conceptual project), the Public Room organization find the building suitable to host the appropriate program.

The conceptual project of the facility was presented by Public Room organization to the Ministry of Defense and Ministry of Culture. The project showed the design program and possibilities and benefits from reuse of the facility in the domain of cultural industries of the city. According to the national strategies of the Ministry of Culture for promoting the awareness in the design sector in Macedonia and the region, the Ministry of Defense in collaboration with the Ministry of Culture and Government of Macedonia...
approved its reuse and it transferred the ownership of the facility to the Public Room organization for cultural activities purposes and maintenance for the period of 20 years (Vecer, 2015). The support of the Ministry of Culture will allow future development of the creative industries together with the business sector of the country.

When it comes to the legislation and regulations in the further design process, there is no strict protection that especially applied to the building and it is not categorized as an important industrial heritage of the city. In collaboration with experts and authorities, it was decided that the facility should preserve the original envelope with possible minor additions such as shading elements and definition of the entrance, changes of the openings and color of the façade.

After finalizing the decision process of the conceptual project, it was continued to the execution of the project in two phases. The first phase was about providing: structural reinforcement on the roof and repair work on façade, openings (new), additions (shading elements, entrance definition - stairs), painting, floor replacement, stairs (interior-exterior) changes in the inner division, lightning, HVAC (heating, ventilation and air conditioning), electricity. Due to the lack of finances, the second phase was executed later on including structural reinforcement and replacement on the roof and roof floor, in order the attic space to be used for advertisement agencies, working stations, design studios and administrative purposes of the facility. In the second phase the interior design of the conceptual store, the prototyping room, and the meeting rooms were executed as well.

After a long and complex decision-making process of negotiations and approvals with authorities, stakeholders and experts (interior designers, architects, engineers), conceptual and executive phases of the project were finalized. After the period of one year, the adaptive reuse project was completed on 28 October 2015.

The significant opening of the new Center for Design and Innovation – Public Room, marked a new beginning of the urban and cultural activities that will be supported by the regional Balkan Design Network and European Union. In the next chapter, a new condition of the facility, its offer to the citizens and designers and its benefits will be presented.

**PUBLIC ROOM NEW CONDITION**

After the long and complex decision-making process, today the new center for design and innovation is offering various urban events, happenings in the cultural and design domain such as: free co-working spaces for freelancers, concept store, prototyping room, library, commercial bazaars, fine arts and photo exhibitions, seminars, workshops and creative courses for children and adults, business meetings, presentations and celebrations.

Public Room is a pure hybrid and multifunctional place that offers realization of ideas, open and friendly access to the public, local and international companies, organizations or individuals. Moreover, the new condition of the building is promoting leisure activities like local and international cuisine, mezze bar, live music and DJ performances (New Center for Design and Innovation - Public Room, Skopje, 2015).

The improved new condition of the building is both in the exterior and interior. In the exterior, it is possible to witness from some parts on the façade the previous condition and function by the emphasized structural system with grey color and the details with the hooks (that served for caring the heavy objects). The contrasting contemporary touches on the façade are the wide openings on the ground floor as well as the shading element and stairs for the definition of the main entrance (see Figure 6). The interior design reflects with the same attitude: the structural elements (columns and beams) from the previous condition are visible and clear. The new additions, the furniture, and fixture are reflecting the contemporary and urban living of the 21st century. Furthermore, the interior design enables working spaces for group/team or individual works.

The constant and active use of the facility (interior and exterior), by locals and foreign visitors, is a proof that the new condition and offered program/management are successful in many aspects (see Figure 7). In other words Public Room completely resembles as **pop-up culture** (hosting temporary performances and bringing cultural enrichment into people’s lives), **cultural cluster** (breaths life back into forgotten corner of the city) or **urban canvas** (engaging citizens through shared experiences, platforms, gastronomic events, co-creative spaces and conversations) in the city. In the next chapter, the results and the achieved benefits for the reuse project will be elaborated.
Results and Benefits

As a result, the achieved benefits from the reuse project are evaluated on a micro (unit) scale and macro (urban) scale (See Table 1). The benefits are categorized as: cultural (unit scale: gastronomic events, hosting design week and various exhibitions, promoting local and international events in the cultural domain; urban scale: pop-up culture, cultural cluster, urban canvas, cultural route, cultural tourism), social (unit scale: offering various events for the citizens and visitors (all ages), co-working spaces, raising community awareness, organizing Skopje Design Week; urban scale: attracting local and foreign visitors, presenting the urban culture of the city and the region, preserving the collective memory), economical (unit scale: renting the spaces, buying designer products from concept store, bar and restaurant; urban scale: reduced costs for materials and transportation, no rent to pay to the authorities), environmental (unit scale: saving energy from new systems applied; urban scale: no demolition, reduced pollution), functional (unit scale: multifunctional spaces with sub-functions; urban scale: connected into a cultural route with surrounding facilities in the cultural domain), technological (unit scale: new innovations and designs, new systems implemented; urban scale: improving the context by presenting new technologies in the field of design), aesthetic (unit scale: new façade that still reflects the previous condition, contemporary and urban interior design; urban scale: enriching the context visually and aesthetically).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Achieved benefits from re-use project (Public Room)</th>
<th>Micro (unit) scale</th>
<th>Macro (urban) scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td>gastronomic events</td>
<td>pop-up culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>design week</td>
<td>cultural cluster</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>exhibitions</td>
<td>urban canvas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>promoting local and international events in cultural domain</td>
<td>cultural route</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>cultural tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
<td>offering various events for the citizens and visitors (all ages)</td>
<td>attracts local and foreign visitors,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>design week</td>
<td>presenting the urban culture of the city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>co-working</td>
<td>and the region,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>raising community awareness</td>
<td>preserving the collective memory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economical</td>
<td>possibilities for renting the new spaces for private occasions, organizations and companies,</td>
<td>reduced costs from the reuse project –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>designer products,</td>
<td>materials and transportation,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>concept store,</td>
<td>no rent for the period of 20 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>bar and restaurant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Environmental
- saving energies through sustainable façade,
- new systems (HVAC, solar panels)
- new roof
- garden
- reduced pollution and CO2 emission, transportation, no demolition

### Functional
- multifunctional hybrid spaces,
- sub-functions such as: concept store, prototyping room,
- connected in a cultural route together with other cultural facilities nearby (Mala Stanica, Skopje City Museum)

### Technological
- innovations and new designs (SDW),
- sustainability-new systems implemented in the facility, roof improvement
- improving the context,
- presenting new technologies in the field of design

### Aesthetical
- new façade with preserved envelope,
- interior design, colors, furniture and fixture, urban style, garden
- improving visually the context and the neighborhood

## CONCLUSION

As a summary, it is possible to conclude that the adaptive reuse of industrial/military building heritage no matter their location can bring back life in a forgotten corner of the city and be invaluable and beneficial for the structure itself and many other aspects. Even though the reuse strategies/projects, depends on the complex, long-term decision-making process by involving various influential factors (locals needs, expert's opinions, administrative and authorities approvals, stakeholders, managers) it will not allow premature redundancy or obsolescence of the existing heritage structures. Instead, they will extend their life and continue to contribute to the communities, preserving the collective memory and showing the need for a smart update that will easily accommodate the rapid changes in the urban developments.

Moreover, properly applied adaptive reuse projects will result with multi-layered benefits (cultural, social, economic, environmental, technological, functional and aesthetical) on the unit scale and urban scale as well. The case of Public Room in Skopje is an successful example of a military building typology that was converted into a new Center for Design and Innovation bringing above all cultural benefits, pop-up culture, urban, smart and contemporary content to the city of Skopje offering to the citizens and visitors many new events in the field of design and cultural enrichment.
REFERENCES


URL 1: https://www.facebook.com/publicroomskopje
Last Accessed: 12.05.2018

URL 2: http://balkandesignnetwork.org/articles/skopje-design-week
Last Accessed: 19.05.2018
ABSTRACT

Structural changes that began to be observed in the global economy in the 1970s and neo-liberal economic policies moving towards developing countries from developed countries have led to changes in employment patterns. In Turkey, neoliberal political-economic has been the main determinant with January 24, 1980 Decrees. The reflections of these policies on the tourism industry are shaped by the Tourism Encouragement Law No. 2634 published in 1982. As a result, tourism investments and employment have increased significantly. However, precarization of labour as a result of the influence of neoliberal policies has led to the emergence of a new social class which is called the Precariat in Standing (2012)'s framework. Precariat is an emerging mass class, characterized by inequality and insecurity. These practices grouped under the terms of atypical, nonstandard, marginal and unstable employment such as semi-permanent positions, fixed-term employment contracts, short-term employment (until the end of the work) and working in multiple jobs. Especially, it can be said that this type of work is common in the tourism sector where flexible work is seen. This study aims to describe the development of tourism precariat and its structural features in Turkey. According to the findings, three types of structural employment identified in tourism enterprises. These forms are; (1) permanent, (2) seasonal and (3) one-day employment. It can be seen that in the form of permanent employment, legal rights can be partly exploited and that the precariousness in the forms of seasonal and one-day employment is observed at a high level. It can be said that there is a tourism precariat which does not have trade union memberships in general and which lacks many basic rights and employed precariously. These findings overlap with the structural features of the precariat defined by Standing.

Keywords: Precarization of Labour, Tourism Precariat, Turkey

INTRODUCTION

The conventional distinction between work and home emerged through the process of industrialization. The proletariat worked in places such as factories and mines, which the capitalist defined as the workplace, and then returned to their homes. Recent days, even though the conventional distinction between work and home continues, transformations have begun (Standing, 2011: 199). Within this process, a concept called precarization began to attract attention. x and y were evaluated among the leading indicators of precarization. Flexible labour contracts, temporary jobs, labour as casuals, part-timers, or intermittently for labour brokers or employment agencies were widely evaluated as the prominent determiners of precarization (Standing, 2014b). Standing (2011) than coined the term ‘precariat’ and defines this phenomenon as a ‘new dangerous class’. According to him (2011: 20-21), the precariat is deprived of rights which proletariat has, such as stable, long term and fixed-time work, trade union rights and, collective agreements. They are not even the middle class because they do not have a fixed salary, status or basic rights. These people are in a precarious situation and have no job security.

Four developments have had an impact on the growth of global precariat. The first of these is the spread of women’s labour in the labour market. Thus, the value of male labour decreased and some of them were pushed out of the labour market. The second is the re-entry of the third age into the labour market. Because the elderly who do not have enough money, prefer to join the labour force. Third, a significant number of adults have disability status. These people, of course, those who can be able to work, try to be recruited and most of them are employed in precarious jobs. Finally, it can be considered that for any reason, persons involved in crime are joined to the precarious army by being pushed out of employment (Standing, 2011: 154).
The economic recession following the 2008 global crisis paved the way for decreasing the number of full-time workers and the temporary employment of more people. (Standing, 2011: 65). In Turkey, until 2018, a portion of public employees in the status of contract workers were employed long-term, some of them were employed temporarily. In 2018, with a regulation made in the law, long-term subcontracted workers were transferred to tenure track as 4/D workers in state enterprises. Although it is an important step for the work and life security of public workers in state enterprises, the employment of temporary workers for three months continues in various ways. It is not possible to realize this development for the private sector as a result of market pressure under the following conditions. Because the trend of flexible working in the world is spreading.

Today, businesses are looking for ways to eliminate the problems caused by ‘routine’ by creating more flexible structures (Sennett, 2013). In addition to the increase in informal employment, flexible employment increased the employment rate of women. However, it weakened the organized labour movement (Aykaç, 2009: 42). This is one of the practices that bring the exploitation of labour to a higher level. The tourism sector is one of the branches of business where flexible working practices are seen intensively. Part-time work and seasonal work are examples of these types of practices. Especially for the employee, precarity has negative effects on career and wages.

In this study, it is aimed to show the employment forms and conditions of the tourism workers and the difficulties they are dealing with. For this purpose, some answers have been tried to be formed for these basic problems and sub-problems. The related answers were tried to be described with the findings.

**THE CONCEPT OF PRECARIAT**

The term precariat is coined by Standing (2011) as a social class. The term is obtained by combining the words ‘precarious’ and ‘proletariat’. The precariat consists of people living through insecure jobs interspersed with periods of unemployment or labour-force withdrawal (misnamed as ‘economic inactivity’) and living insecurely, with uncertain access to housing and public resources. They experience a constant sense of transiency (Standing, 2014a: 21).

According to Standing (Standing, 2011: 107), almost ‘everyone’ is a potential precariat. When we lose our assurances in the event of an accident or a crisis, we can become a member of the precariat. It can be said that in the public service are noticeably better but especially for the private sector, precarity is likely to happen. Precarization affects the exposed person deeply; blurs the future and prevents expectations for a rational future (Bourdieu, 2017: 109).

Temporary forms of employment have cost advantages for enterprises. Because low wages reduce risks (Standing, 2011: 61). The flexible workplace consciously exploits the situation of job insecurity, which contributes to its strengthening. The goal of reducing costs is made possible by constantly leaving the employee at risk of losing his job (Bourdieu, 2017: 110). The reason for this is the contracts that provide the ease of layoff a temporarily hired person for any reason. These contracts are legally granted to enterprises. The reduced rights of workers reduce the value of labour, which is already the biggest cost element in the hospitality sector. Thus, the capital makes more profit, but also leads to the exploitation of labour. This makes it easier to control temporary workers through fear. If they do not fulfil the demands of management, their dismissal is only a matter of time (Standing, 2011: 61).

Just as in many European countries today, when the unemployment rate is very high and precarization affects the majority of the population—including workers, industry and trade employees, journalists, teachers, students etc.—work becomes rare and desirable at any cost. This leaves the employees at the mercy of the employer so that the employer not only use this power as witnessed every day but also abuses it (Bourdieu, 2017: 111).

In one aspect, this can be accepted as one of the domination practices that are encountered in working life. The domination form described above consists of two parts. The first of these is the state and the second is the enterprises. First, the state allows temporary employment through the legal rights it provides. Thus, it protects the employer through contracts (made between employer and employee). Hence, the enterprise with a low contract termination cost does not hesitate to layoff it's employees. Besides, high unemployment rates strengthen the employer's hand. The worker who faced with the danger of layoff inadvertently accepts the exploitation. Thus, the competition in the recruitment stage is continuing with the competition in maintaining the job owned. This is a kind of competitive reaction to protect the job at all costs against the layoff blackmail, which is sometimes confronted in the workplace. At this point, it can be interpreted that precarization is a new form of dominance, which aims to establish a continuous situation of insecurity that will compel workers to obey and accept exploitation (Bourdieu, 2017: 113).
Unemployed people endure additional costs in job search and training processes. After working temporarily, they are trapped in precarity. There is low profit and no professional loyalty, and there is no stability in the use of time (Standing, 2011: 89-217). In this study, this condition is accepted as a contemporary problem in labour market employed in the tourism sector. For this reason, the frame of this phenomenon was tried to be drawn in the context of Eskişehir.

**METHOD**

In this research, a qualitative method was used to obtain in-depth inferences. Face-to-face interview technique was used to collect data. The interview is the most commonly used data collection technique in qualitative research (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2011: 147). Also, it is a technique in which questions are asked for the purposes that are important for the researcher (Glesne, 2014: 140-141). In this technique, the researcher can obtain more in-depth findings with the question of ‘how?’ rather than ‘what? or how much?’ (Büyüköztürk et al., 2014: 240).

The data obtained through face-to-face interviews with employees in hotels in Eskişehir. 31 hotels which are operating in Eskişehir were included in the research. This data obtained from the Governorship of Eskişehir in July 2018. The distribution of accommodation enterprises which was certified by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism has presented in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hotel type</th>
<th>Number of enterprises</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5 star hotels</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 star hotels</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 star hotels</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 star hotels</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apart-hotel</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boutique hotels</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Accommodation Enterprises in Eskisehir (2018 Data)

To obtain in-depth findings for the research, 7 semi-structured question was prepared. Semi-structured questions provide both direct answers and in-depth inquiry in the relevant field. At the same time, it has advantages such as providing convenience in analysis and allowing the participant to express her/himself as s/he wishes (Büyüköztürk et al., 2014: 152). Expert opinions were obtained from two researchers to check the content validity of the questions. Necessary corrections were made after expert opinions.

After the interviews, the records were deciphered and turned into text. Subsequently, the data analysis phase was initiated. In this research, interview texts were analysed with the content analysis technique. Content analysis is a qualitative data analysis technique that provides access to concepts and relationships that can explain the collected data. It is aimed to identify the data through content analysis and reveal the facts that may be hidden in it (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2013: 259). At this stage, the codes and themes that make sense for the research were obtained from the data collected.

The credibility of the research is accepted as one of the most important criteria of scientific research (Creswell, 2014). In this context, the following steps were taken to increase the credibility of the research:

- **Long-term interaction:** At the beginning, the warm-up talks have made with participants for at least half an hour and the interview was started as such. The aim here is to create an atmosphere of trust by enabling the participant to get closer to the researcher. Thus, it is thought that the participants will give more sincere answers.

- **Depth-oriented data collection:** The researcher compared the findings with the results in the literature and tested their validity.

- **Purposive sampling:** In qualitative research, purposeful sampling methods are used to ensure transferability. In this context, snowball sampling which is one of the purposeful sampling techniques was selected to reach participants.

The researchers contacted the participants by telephone to explain the content of the study and explained the interview questions before the interview. The interviews were conducted by the researchers between July 26, 2018 and August 7, 2018 with five participants. Participants were informed about audio recording during the interview. All participants responded positively to the audio recording during the interview. Throughout the interview, statements made by the participant that could direct the interview were noted. A total of 296 minutes of interviews were conducted with five participants. Table 1 presents the participant information with the code names.
Table 2. Information of Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Monthly Income (£)</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Working Period</th>
<th>Interview Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gözde</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Master's Degree</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>1800</td>
<td>Receptionist</td>
<td>2 years</td>
<td>69 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uğur</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Bachelor's Degree</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>1800</td>
<td>Receptionist</td>
<td>3 years</td>
<td>52 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatih</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Bachelor's Degree</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>1600</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td>1 year</td>
<td>48 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemal</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Associate's Degree</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>1600</td>
<td>Bellboy</td>
<td>2 year</td>
<td>72 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hakan</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Associate's Degree</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>1600</td>
<td>Bellboy</td>
<td>1 year</td>
<td>55 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FINDINGS

In this study, which is designed to understand the forms of employment in hotel enterprises and to describe the situation of employees, the data analysis is based on the concept of precariat. The forms of employment used by the enterprises are divided into three as daily, seasonal and long-term.

The high unemployment rates in Turkey, creating pressure on employees, hence, enables enterprises to reach labour at low costs. Unemployment pressure is the driving force behind hard work in order not to lose their jobs but also allows them to accept low wages. This is an opportunity for businesses, and they do not hesitate to use this mechanism. In this way, it can be said that also the state has to play a role, albeit indirectly, in the exploitation of workers. Because workers’ rights cannot be protected at a level that can eliminate precarity.

Kemal: ‘Obligatory… Unemployment dragged me here. We did not know this aspect of the tourism sector, hence we entered with peace of mind. But… I never stop, I’m looking for alternative jobs now. I am dragging my feet in workdays. Not only I, 80% of all hotel staff thinks so.’

It is seen that the severance payments which are the legal right of the employees are not given. In order to avoid severance, pay, hotel businesses apply various kinds of pressure on employees and force them to resign. It should be mentioned that the hotel staff are in a total precarious position at this point. The statements of the participants are as follows.

Gözde: ‘I think they say goodbye, sir. Because he voluntarily leaves the job, then they will not give compensation anyway. They’re in this thinking… For example, they saddle the employee with more task to barf him out. Thus, it is hoped that this employee spontaneously quits.’

Kemal: ‘Namely, sir… An employee, who is working in his fourth year for this hotel, has just been forced to resign today and has not received any compensation. So far, they have not fired anyone, always brought to the degree of resignation. They do not give (the compensation).’

It is seen that the workers in the hotels in Eskişehir are working precariously, there is a high employee turnover rate, and the managers also get used to this situation. The hotel staff stated that they did not see a future in the hospitality industry because they did not have any guarantees on job security. The statements of the participants are as follows:

Kemal: ‘After a week, they find someone new, tie it to a routine. They got used to it. They think, they’re gonna train anyone, and he’s gonna work with pleasure for six months in that hotel. After 6 months he will start grumbling, he will work for another 3-4 months, then he will go away. There is no assurance in the profession, because, this profession, actually, is not a profession, at all. I think being a bellboy is a job for the swaggies, frankly. I don’t work in a place like Eskişehir, relying on the tip. I have no job security, and also I see no future.’
Although the hotel employees do not belong to any labour union, they do not know that there are labour unions in tourism, hospitality or travel sectors. When the employees were asked whether the company would create a problem in the issue of labour union membership, it was stated that those who applied to the labour union in the past were faced layoff. The statements of the participants are as follows:

_Hakan:_ There’s never been anyone canalizing us. We didn't think much about it either. Or rather, we didn't think of it, at all.

_Uğur:_ When I look at the current situation, actually it is more advantageous to be a civil servant compared to the private sector. One of them has job security unless you commit a disgraceful crime. But in the private sector, there is no job security. There is no unionization in the hospitality industry, and the public sector seems to be more advantageous because of it. There is no trade union, so it - the private sector - remains precarious. So, he can't apply, if he does, he's gonna go to court. Also, there is a shortage of livelihoods.

Temporary / flexible working methods provide cost advantages to enterprises. Because, while the wages of temporary workers are low, enterprises get a cost advantage in employment when they employ workers according to the workload. This practice, which is very profitable for businesses, means labour exploitation for employees. Temporary workers cannot benefit from social benefits such as severance pay because they are employed on a daily, seasonal basis. They are easy to layoff when they make a mistake or show resistance to exploitation. This puts pressure on temporary workers. Temporary workers, who do not have a chance to pursue a career, have to do jobs that are ordered. Thus, it can be said that they work for peanuts. The state has a significant influence on this. Inadequacy in legal regulation and supervision increases the exploitation in enterprises.

**CONCLUSION**

Precarization shows its presence in the tourism sector as observed in the general public. It is particularly high in the coastal tourism enterprises that provide seasonal services. In this study, precarization in hotel enterprises in Eskişehir is discussed. During the interviews, precarious practices were found, although at a lower level compared to seasonal destinations. The only reason for this is that the hotels in Eskişehir operate 365 days a year and there are no large fluctuations in demand. Hence, the seasonal employment form is not very common in Eskişehir. However, as a result of interviews and observations, it was determined that the turnover rates were high. The fact that the student population in Eskişehir is more than job supply strengthens the hand of enterprises; allows the managers to dismiss the employee who claims his rights or exhibit resistance to improper practices. Because there is a reserve army with their diplomas or their training, who are waiting for jobs (Bourdieu, 2017: 109).

During the busy periods in Eskişehir, it has seen that there are daily forms of employment, which have expressed as ‘extra’. Especially in the service department of the hotels, it has observed that the waiters or pages have employed on a daily basis and that no insurance payment has made. This is the most concrete case of flexible/temporary employment, which is the foremost feature of precarization. Personnel expenses, which are the most important cost element in hotels, have been reduced through flexible employment pools (Sennett, 2013) created under the name of extra.

Employees who are anxious about the layoff and working under precarious circumstances cannot exhibit resistance. One of the main reasons for this is the lack of unionization. Because employees are unaware of the existence of labour unions in tourism, hospitality and travel sectors. Employees can neither claim their rights nor look with hope for the future. Being able to work in a job is shown as almost a privilege for the precariat (Bourdieu, 2017: 109-110). Because several assurances that the employee can lean his back have disappeared (Standing, 2011).
REFERENCES


A Research on Walkability Perception of Tourists Visiting Old Town Mardin

Kadir ÇAKAR  
Assist.Prof.Dr., Mardin Artuklu University  
kadircakar@artuklu.edu.tr

Serhat HARMAN  
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Mardin Artuklu University  
harmanserhat@gmail.com

Şehmus AYKOL  
Res.Assist., Mardin Artuklu University  
sehmusaykol@artuklu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Mardin has become an indispensable route for cultural tours, especially in Southeastern Anatolia in recent years. Considering the tourism potential of Mardin, it can be said that the tourism attractiveness of the city is composed of different kinds of components pertaining to Mardin Old City and the provinces around Mardin as well. In the present study, it is attempted to evaluate the walkability of Mardin Old City from the tourists’ perspectives. The data of the study were collected by applying a face to face questionnaire from tourists who had walked in Mardin Old City. The survey was conducted in March and April 2019, and 480 valid questionnaires were obtained through using survey. Descriptive statistics were used in the analysis of the obtained data. The study concludes with the discussions and suggestions made in the light of the data obtained from the research.

Keywords: Walkability, Walkable cities, Urban tourism, Mardin

INTRODUCTION

Walking is an important factor in increasing social recognition of healthier, environmentally friendly and active communities (Moura vd., 2017). Walkability is a multi-dimensional concept that often determines the degree to which any environment is walkable and at the same time is pedestrian-friendly (Hall & Ram, 2018). Certain discussions of walkability are generally made on several elements or conditions such as traversable, compact, physically attractive areas and safe that provide walking (Forsyth, 2015). The concept of walking is considered as a multi-disciplinary research area which is evaluated from different perspectives (Hall vd., 2018). In this context, previous studies dealing with the concept of walkability have been examined under different disciplines such as architecture, public health, transportation and urban design (Henderson, 2018). The issue of walkability is very important for tourist destinations.

Given that the studies in the current literature regarding the concept of walkability in tourist destinations it is seen that more than one factors determining the walkability of any tourist destination. In their study, Gorrini and Bertini (2018), demonstrated that the walkability level of the Venice destination is shaped by many components. According to this; the lack of basic services, the presence of mass tourism flow and the lack of road signs were found to be significant determinant factors. It can also be said that the concept of walkability represents an important component in terms of creating value and satisfaction levels for tourist destinations (Küpers & Wee, 2018). The aim of the present research is to explore that to what extent Mardin is walkable for visitors along with examining factors affecting the walkability of tourists who visited the old city of Mardin.
LITERATURE REVIEW

In the relevant literature, there are several studies that were conducted to measure the walkability of touristic destinations. Findings derived from these studies revealed that there are several different determinants of the walkability concept. In other words, it was observed that any touristic destination was formed around more than one variable/factor rather than a single criterion in determining the quality of walkability. In this sense, given that the existing relevant literature Walk Score index method is one of the commonly adopted methods in walkability analysis (Ram & Hall, 2018a).

Arslan, Durak, Gebesce, and Balcik (2018) conducted a research in Bursa by using both qualitative and quantiative surveys to pedestrians within the context of walkability assessment. Based on 200 quantitative surveys that were applied to pedestrians the authors found accessibility, comfort and use, environmental aesthetics, safety and security and connectivity as the most important factors affecting walkability.

By analyzing visitors’ reviews on TripAdvisor Hall and Ram (2018) conducted a study examining the most important attractions in the UK in the context of the relationship between walkability and successful tourism indicators shaped by the number of visitors. In the study Walk Score® index has been utilized to measure walkability. In their study, the authors concluded that there is a weak relationship between walkability and visitor numbers for the top 330 tourist attractions in the UK and the number of walkability and TripAdvisor ratings. Besides, although there was a weak relationship between walkability and TripAdvisor ranking, no significant relationship was found between the attractions of the city.

By employing a mixed-method approach, Ujang ve Muslim (2014) carried out a study in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. In the study, the authors found connectivity, comfort, feeling while walking, safety, attractiveness and pleasantness as the most valuable components of the walkability. Similarly, Mansouri ve Ujang (2016) implemented research in Kuala Lumpur through using a questionnaire survey that was distributed to 330 tourists walking in the city. The research revealed that accessibility, connectivity and continuity yürünebilirlik were significant indicators in the formation of expectation and satisfaction in terms of walkability.

By employing principal component analysis, Samarasekara, Fukahori ve Kubota (2011) established six walkability dimensions that have influence on determining walking decisions namely safety from traffic, the comfort of walking area, environmental appearance, activity potential, shade and exploration.

In another study which was conducted in Istanbul by Gören and Santinha (2017), it was examined that the components of accessibility and mobility in terms of walkability from tourists’ perspectives. The result of the study is that there are some important problems in urban planning. Moreover, it has been found that there are connection problems with the places which are connected with the routes and have some important tourist attractions and in some cases, the pedestrian crossings do not allow the continuation of the walking paths.

METHOD

This section contains information about the study area where the research was conducted, the scale used as a data collection tool, and other information about the population and sample of the research.

STUDY AREA

With its several natural and cultural attractiveness, Mardin is known as one of the most important cultural destinations of Turkey for both domestic and foreign visitors (Atsız & Kızılırmak, 2017). It attracts a large number of tourists in the region, as it contains many different kinds of beliefs and worship centers belonging to different beliefs and cultures and possesses the characteristics of cultural heritage (Günal, 2005). As a tourist destination, the city is known for its cultural, religious, cave and camping tourism features (Aydın, 2008). It can be said that as a result of the rich culinary culture of the city, it has come to the forefront as a gastronomic tourism potential with some local foods (Bucak & Aracı, 2013). Particularly, the city is distinguished from other cultural destinations due to its authentic touristic products (Kaygalak, Usta & Günlü, 2013).

According to data released by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, the city was visited by 231.335 domestic and international tourists in 2017 (Mardin İli Kültür ve Turizm Müdürlüğü [Mardin Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism], 2019). The reason why Mardin was selected as a research area is that tourists visiting the city can walk around the ancient city, which is partially closed to traffic, which is one of the best ways of enriching the experience. In other words, walking is seen as an integral part of both the transportation and the yielded tourist experience in everyday life for tourists and local people in the city.
INSTRUMENT DESIGN

The scale used in this study consists of a walkability questionnaire derived from different dimensions by examining the scales used in previous studies. The survey used in the current research was based on a 5 point Likert scale consisting of 31 items ranging from “very unimportant” to “very important” and 32 items (“Bad”, “Moderate” and “Good”) pertaining to second part that has been developed after extensive review of relevant literature. Overall, the questionnaire generally consists of 3 sections. The first part generates the demographic characteristics of the respondents and the second part comprises of travel habits while the third part related to decision items affecting walking in a tourist area. In the second part of the questionnaire the items were developed by adapting the previous studies (e.g., Samarasekara, Fukahori and Kubota, 2011; Ariffin and Zahari, 2013; Hall and Ram, 2018; Minhas and Poddar, 2017; Karupiah and Bada, 2018; Yazicioğlu-Halu, 2010; Audi, Byorkman, Couture and Najem, 2010; Pratiwi, Zhao and Mi, 2015; Ujang and Muslim, 2018; Arslan, Durak, Gebesce and Balcik, 2018; Mansouri and Ujang, 2016; Abdulla, Abdelmonem and Selim, 2017; Kulschrestha and Sharma, 2018; Ng, Lai, Liao, Lao, Lau, Govada and Spruijt, 2016; Tekel and Özalp, 2016; and Alfonzo, 2005).

POPULATION AND SAMPLING

The population of the study consists of tourists visiting the ancient city and tourist attractions in the center of Mardin. The number of domestic tourists visiting the city in the first six months of 2019 is 248,421. The most visited periods of the city are known as Autumn (September-October-November) and Spring (March-April-May). (Mardin İl Kültür ve Turizm Müdürlüğü [Mardin Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism], 2019). To achieve the aims and objectives of the current research, the data were collected by one of the authors who had the experience of collecting data by convenience sampling method in the most visited April and May. After the purpose of the study was explained to the participants, they were included in the research process based on their voluntary participation.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Respondents’ Profile

Table 1 reveals that the present research involved somewhat more female (n = 246, 50.6%) than male (n = 240, 49.4%) pedestrian tourists. The majority of the respondents (n = 130, 26.9%) were between 26 and 35 years old. Concerning their education, the number of bachelor degree (n= 177, 36.6%) were reported less than half but with the largest proportion which is followed by the other groups of respondents holding a degree of secondary school (n=142, 29.3%).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GENDER (N 486)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>50.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>49.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age (N: 484)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17-25</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-35</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>26.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-45</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>20.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46-55</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>15.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56-65</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>13.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66 and above</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education (N 484)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary School</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary School</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>29.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational School</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>36.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master and PhD</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monthly Income (N 458)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-500 TL</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>501-1000 TL</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1001-2000 TL</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-4000 TL</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>43.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4001-7000 TL</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>30.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7001-10000 TL</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>9.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10001 TL and above</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Demographics of Respondents
Information of Respondents Towards Their Traveling

Table 2 shows that the highest frequency of respondents (n = 375, 77.2%) select culture and history (n=343, 70.6%) as the main reasons natural beauties, (39.7%, n = 193), Art (29.2%, n = 142), entertainment (22.6%, n = 110), resting (17.1%, n = 83), “being a part of my trip” and festival (6.2%, n=30), business trip (5.6%, n=27) and the other (4.5%, n = 23) while the number of tourists remain least share (n=11, 2.3%) those who chose event and meeting as for visiting city of Mardin.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons for Visiting Mardin (N 486)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>375</td>
<td>77.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>343</td>
<td>70.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Beauties</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>39.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>22.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resting</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>17.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being a part of My Trip</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Festival</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Trip</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event and Meeting</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 indicates the types of information sources that travelers used to the city before their visit. The highest of respondents (71.5%, n = 236) expressed that they benefited from the internet as the main information sources. In the meantime, TV (47.5%, n = 234) and Films and Documentaries (33.1%, n = 161) respectively, had been selected by tourists as the main sources of information about the city before their visit.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information Sources (N:486)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>62.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TV</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>47.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Films and Documentaries</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>33.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>19.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour Brochures</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>15.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel Agents</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>14.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>10.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Previous Visits</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleagues</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With respect to the visiting frequency, 65.1% (n = 315) of respondents explained that they were first-time visitors to the city while most of them (70.3%, n = 332) stayed overnight in the city. On the other hand, it is also found that most of the respondents preferred to travel to the city with friends (37.0%, n=180) while the highest percentage of respondents (50%, n=238) chose to travel independently (see Table 4).
The highest proportion of tourists select as factors of “Presence of speeding vehicles” and “Presence of street lights” as the answers for the question of factors affecting walkability decisions in the city (see Table 5).

The majority of the respondents prefer to travel in their daily routine life by car (69.8%, n = 339) and bus (38.3%, n = 186) while slightly more respondents preferred to get around by walking (10.9%, n = 53) (see Table 6).

The most answer to the question “the number of the person with whom are you walking?” was with “2-3 People” (34.0%, n = 165) while the least frequency was “11-15 People” (2.7%, n = 13). Given that the travelers’ evaluation of walkability to the old town of Mardin, the most of respondents evaluated as good that “In terms of historical texture” which is followed by “Interesting buildings along the way” (see Table 7).

### Table 4. Travel Characteristics of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Travel Characteristics Category</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visiting Mardin Before (N 484)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>34.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>65.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staying Overnight in Mardin (N:472)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>332</td>
<td>70.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>29.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel Companions (N 486)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alone</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>25.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>33.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>37.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel type (N 476)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>40.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 5. Descriptive Statistics of Factors Affecting Walking Decision

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>ITEMS</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>MEAN</th>
<th>St. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Presence of speeding vehicles</td>
<td>470</td>
<td>4,1000</td>
<td>1,19550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Presence of street lights</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>4,0805</td>
<td>1,18639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Less risk from crime (issues)</td>
<td>474</td>
<td>4,0759</td>
<td>1,13308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>473</td>
<td>4,0698</td>
<td>1,19559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Aesthetic of structures/buildings</td>
<td>477</td>
<td>4,0692</td>
<td>1,13825</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 6. Distribution of Daily Used Modes of Transportation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vehicle (N:486)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Car</td>
<td>339</td>
<td>69.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bus</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>38.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walking</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>10.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxi</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cycle</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Train</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 7. Evaluation of Old Town Mardin Walkability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>ITEMS</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>MEAN</th>
<th>St. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Historical texture</td>
<td>481</td>
<td>2,5364</td>
<td>.65767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Interesting structures</td>
<td>479</td>
<td>2,4322</td>
<td>.69298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Lighting</td>
<td>478</td>
<td>2,3117</td>
<td>.70677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Attitudes of local people</td>
<td>479</td>
<td>2,3027</td>
<td>.71608</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Aesthetics of buildings</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>2,2833</td>
<td>.72743</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONCLUSION

The present study was an attempt to examine to what extent the city of Mardin is walkable for visitors along with investigating factors affecting the walkability of tourists who visited the old city of Mardin. The results derived from the present research show that the walkability has a wide variety of factors those are consistent with prior studies (Hall & Ram, 2018; Samarasekara et al., 2011) creating expectation which has a significant effect on the satisfaction levels of the tourists visiting the city, and also this level of satisfaction determines the quality of the experience received by the tourists (Mansouri & Ujang, 2016).

The present paper has some useful managerial and practical implications. The findings of the current research have also revealed that the majority of travelers preferred to use the internet as a source of information before their visit to the city after which TV comes then the second most important source of information. This result supports the idea that the marketing and promotional campaign of the destination is immensely made and can be improved the internet and TV respectively. In other words, electronic word of mouth through (eWOM) the internet and TV can be considered as the most powerful supporting tools in developing and strengthening the image of the destination. As such, along with the use of the internet, marketing managers of destinations should be aware of the importance of the impacts of movies and documentaries as an effective marketing tool that spread through TV.

It has been also illustrated that walkability is constituted by different dimensions will most likely to have substantial impacts on the evaluation of walkability as well as on the determination of walking decision. Moreover, it can be claimed that the quality of walkability is determined by the cultural and historical landscape in urban areas where travelers are mostly engaged in experiencing mass tourism which is also complies with the previous research studies (Gorrini & Bertini, 2018).

REFERENCES


A Study on the Perceptions of Congress and Fair Organizers on MICE Tourism

M. Murat KIZANLIKLI
Assist.Prof.Dr., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
murat.kizanlikli@hbv.edu.tr

Havva ÇIVGIN
Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
havvacivgin48@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

MICE (Meetings, Incentives, Conferences and Exhibitions) industry is rapidly growing segments within the tourism industry, generating millions in revenues for cities and countries across the globe. The aim of the study is to understand the probable expectations of the congress market in the light of the MICE organizers’ experiences. Because of the economic, social and cultural importance of event and congress tourism and also the lack of studies on this topic in existing literature have caused the need to carry out this research. Due to its rich cultural and historical heritage and being the center of national and international political traffic, Ankara has a significant potential for MICE tourism. Considering this potential, the population of the study consists of the hotels and travel agencies as hosting and organizing establishments, in Ankara. So, purposeful sampling method was used in the selection of the sample and qualitative data collected through 8 semi-structured interviews. Fifteen questions were asked (such as kind of meetings, expectations and priorities of the guests, problematic issues and dissatisfaction cases, expectations of the MICE guests etc.) about the congress tourism. These questions are typically asked of each interviewee in the same way and in a systematic order, but the questions are semi-structured in that the interviewers are allowed freedom to diverge slightly from the script. The research model is “descriptive case study” and this type of case study is used to describe an intervention or phenomenon and the real-life context in which it occurred. Data was analyzed by using descriptive analysis and along with the conventional content analysis, word frequency analysis was performed using NVivo 12 to draw a word cloud of the most mentioned words in the interviews. According to the results, social programs and recreational activities were underlined as the most important factors encouraging guests to stay longer in the congress destination. The meeting hall, food and beverage and the hotel were the most mentioned words in both the requested features and the problems experienced.

Keywords: MICE Tourism, Congress, Event, Hotels, Travel Agencies, Ankara

INTRODUCTION

Business tourism includes various meetings, seminars, conferences, conventions, symposiums, exhibitions, prize trips, events that contribute to connecting people and sharing of knowledge and information (Šušić and Mojić, 2014). MICE (Meetings, Incentives, Conferences and Exhibitions) industry is one of the fastest growing segments within the tourism industry generating millions in revenues for cities and countries across the globe (Banu, 2016). MICE industry has become an emerging area of international business, which has potential for generating economic benefits to the host destinations (Jago, 2013). Meetings are considered as the basis of city tourism. The main feature of congress tourism is that it hosts participants having more power than the average tourists who visit the same place and come with different motivation (Šušić and Mojić, 2014). Continuous growth of event tourism makes it necessary for host destinations to design, plan and manage the local, domestic, and international organizations by a professional manner. It is estimated that around 30% of the total tourism income in the world comes from meeting tourism. Thus, event management has become a business area where tourist expectations have an important effect on the planning process (Getz, 2008).

The participants interact with the local community around the congress center and accommodation facility in the region where they are traveling for congress purposes. The people of the destination region can adopt them by paying attention to the clothing styles, behaviors or various habits of the delegates. In the same way, congressists can change behavior by influencing the behavior of local people (Aksu, 2013: 21).
Congress tourism is one of the fastest developing and most profitable industries in the tourism sector (Šilereva et al. 2013). The increasing number of national and international companies and the need for meetings in the globalizing world and the need to obtain information arising from scientific, technological and professional developments have improved the congress tourism (Gülbahtar, 2006).

The exhibitions, conventions and meetings industry, in terms of event tourism, has become an emerging area of international business, which has potential for generating economic benefits to the host destinations (Jago, 2013). The participants of the congress have various benefits both for the congress organizers and the host destinations (Swarbrooke and Horner, 2001). The first of these benefits is that participants provide economic benefits for the host region/country through accommodation, food and beverage, local transport and various expenditures (Oppermann and Chon, 1997). Secondly, congress participants usually stay longer and spend more time in destinations than other types of tourists. Compared to tourists who visited Turkey in order to coastal tourism, congress tourists spend much more money. The expenditure per capita is 2,000-2,500 dollars in congress tourism while it is 600-700 dollars in coastal tourism. In other words, the per capita expenditure of the congress tourist is about three times more than the coastal tourist expenditure. Therefore, many countries aim to take more shares from gains of this tourism type. Turkey is advancing rapidly especially with Istanbul in congress tourism list (TÜRSAB, 2013).

Tourism is a social event, as with the two-way interaction, the same is valid for congress tourism. Meeting tourism contributes positively to social developments, increasing the culture of the people of the region and changing the world views (Aymankuy, 2006: 20-21). Demand intensity of a six-month period of the tourism season in Turkey, raises problems of inefficient capacity utilization and seasonal unemployment. Evaluation of congress and fair tourism and utilization of the idle capacities during the winter months are important in terms of contribution of the sector to the solution of these problems (TÜSİAD, 2014: 11).

Today, congress tourism is the growing segment of the market. Because of the globalization, new markets emerged in the interests of large international companies, the development of technology and science, people meet other people with the same or similar interests, listen and talk to well-known experts in the field, exchange ideas or offer a new product because people need to travel (Dragićević, 2008). Furthermore, increasing the number of participants is not only the goal of congress organizers, but also the main destination of congresses. However, in order to achieve this common goal, it is necessary to understand the behavior of the congress participants. The best way to do this is to understand how and why individuals make the decision of congress selection and participation (Zhang, Leung and Qu, 2007). So the aim of the study is to analyze the expectations of the congress market in the light of the MICE organizers' experiences and to develop recommendations to the literature and tourism industry. Because of the importance of MICE tourism on economic, social, cultural and also the lack of studies about the congress tourism literature have caused the need to carry out this research. It is hoped that the results of the study will contribute to MICE tourism literature.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

**Congress and MICE Tourism**

The “congress” is a Latin word and it includes the meaning of gathering and meeting. However, conferences, symposia, seminars and conventions are being used in the same sense of concepts in Turkey. Congress can be defined as inviting national and international people from the same or different professional groups to exchange ideas or to obtain information (Aymankuy, 2006: 4). A congress is a meeting that is limited to one or more days and requires expertise within the framework of a pre-agreed program, with the participation of people coming from outside the gathered place, in particular, aimed at a specific exchange in scientific fields or occupational subjects (Çizel, 1999). Congress tourism is the whole of travel, accommodation events and relationships resulting from the gathering of individuals to exchange information on a specific subject in scientific fields or professions that require expertise other than the places where they stay or work (Karasu, 1985:10). As in other types of tourism, congress tourism is the subject of people going out of their place. The purpose of such organizations, which also require travel and accommodation, is to exchange information and experience from members of the same field of expertise. In other words, although the ultimate goal of the congresses is to share information with people in the same fields of activity, the use of tourist products is the result of these activities. Consequently, congresses constitute an important potential for tourism (Özdemir, S. S. 2014: 474).
The planning of the congress includes accommodation facilities, meeting rooms, food and beverage establishments, meeting place, transportation services, stationery procedures and the attendance of the participants. All the work done from the time the participant leaves the house until he returns home is part of the congress planning (Çakıcı, 2013:57).

Ngamsom and Beck (2000) investigated the motivation of the participants in the international conferences and according to the results of the study, the opportunity to travel to overseas destinations, outdoor recreation, business or political activities, space exchange, connection and training opportunities were identified as the most important motives in the international conferences. Rittichainuwat, Beck and Lalopa (2001) identified the factors of congress motivation as visiting interesting places, personal development and business/institution activities. Severt et. al. (2007) also highlighted some factors that motivated participation in the congress, such as activities and opportunities, linkage, suitability of the conference, educational benefits and products. The promising future of congress tourism may create a desire to raise education levels in society (Jubayeva, 2013: 30).

The availability of fast, convenient and easy transportation to a country or congress, city plays an important role in attracting congresses to that region. It is stated that when people decide to travel, they choose the means of transportation by taking into consideration five basic variables: cost, distance, experience, income and time (Şahin, Sönmez and Kahveci, 2014: 1205).

Visitors and exhibitors consider visiting new places, with lower cost and easy to reach destinations (Arslan and Ersun, 2009: 140), having sufficient number and capacity of accommodation facilities, recreation opportunities (Aymankuy, 1997: 32), cultural needs, acquiring new knowledge and experiencing experiences (Özkan, 2005: 32), money, time, competence, health (Um and Crompton, 1990: 438), technological infrastructure facilities and communication infrastructure facilities are flawless, no crime incidents, geography is closed to natural disasters, health services are completed leadership, connection, education and professional information factors (Price, 1993: 15).

Yüncü and Kozak (2010: 118) emphasized that destination-related factors are important for congress tourism. Especially the image of destination, destination climate and previous experiences for destinations can be decisive in terms of congress tourism. Timor (2011: 126-127) pointed out the socio-economic structure as the most important factor in the development of the international congress market in his study. He stated that tourism develops especially with developing travel opportunities, increase in income and in leisure time and this affects international congress tourism.

It is important that the city of congress has not only luxury and 4-5-star hotels, but also mid-range hotels that allow participants from various income and social groups to attend congresses. Today, delegates tend not only to attend the congress, but also to extend the length of stay in the congress area by participating in some trips. Therefore, their expectations are higher. That's why, the congress area should have a good infrastructure in terms of accommodation facilities among other facilities (Özen, 1996:20).
The International Congress and Convention (ICCA) maintains and publishes all congress tourism developments and statistical information in the world. Looking at the 2016 ICCA Statistics Report, the USA ranks first with 934 meetings. Germany ranks second with 689 meetings and the United Kingdom ranks third with 582 meetings (www.iccaworld.com). In addition to its positive impact, congress tourism can have a negative social and environmental impact in the region. Congress participants often act massively in a short time, which can lead to traffic jams, congestion in parking spaces, restaurants, shops and other places. This is especially valid for destinations with lower spatial coverage where the number of participants does not exceed the destination’s carrying capacity.

Istanbul, Antalya, Ankara and Izmir have come to the forefront as suitable towns for congress in Turkey. More specifically, 80% of international congresses are held in Istanbul. The quality of the services provided by five-star hotels and congress centers in these cities is very high (BAKA, 2012).

Ankara, the capital city of Turkey, creates its own congress tourism because of the institutional intensity caused by the parliament, embassies, consulates, military commanders, political parties centers, foundations, chambers, educational and health care institutions (Tayfun and Enes, 2013).

METHODOLOGY

Due to its rich cultural and historical heritage and being the center of national and international political traffic, Ankara has a significant potential for MICE tourism. Considering this potential, the population of the study consists of the hotels and travel agencies as hosting and organizing establishments, in Ankara. So, purposeful sampling method was used in the selection of the sample and voluntary businesses were included. Respondents were purposively selected according to their organizational roles. Eight respondents were accepted to join the interview from the different establishments in tourism industry. It is stated that (Eisenhard, 1989: 537; Yin, 2003) the number of samples is sufficient to collect data from 4-12 participants for a case study in qualitative researches (Konaklõgu, 2011: 95).

Semi-structured interview, which is one of the qualitative research methods, was used for collecting data. In research interview, participants provide information about their behavior, thoughts or feelings in response to questions posed by an interviewer (Crano and Brewer, 2002).

Research questions were formed by researchers based on literature review and related researches. Fifteen questions were asked about the congress tourism such as type of meetings held, expectations and priorities of the guests, benefits of the meetings to the host region, problematic issues and dissatisfaction cases, expectations of the MICE guests etc. in addition to some individual questions (gender, age, position, education level and field). The questions are typically asked of each interviewee in the same way and in a systematic order, but the questions are semi-structured in that the interviewers are allowed freedom to diverge slightly from the script (McIntosh and Morse, 2015).

The questions were also pilot tested on three clerks working in hotels and travel agents. Interviews were conducted between April and June, 2019. All the interviews were conducted in Turkish and on average, each interview lasted about 20 min.

The research model is “descriptive case study” and this type of case study is used to describe an intervention or phenomenon and the real-life context in which it occurred (Yin, 2003). Content analysis was used to analyze the data. Content analysis is a research technique for making replicable and valid inferences from data to their context (Krippendorff, 1980). It’s a kind of observation method. Instead of observing people’s behavior directly, or asking them to respond to scales, the investigator takes the communications that people have produced and asks questions of the communications” (Kerlinger, 1964: 544).

Content analysis assumes that semi-structured and open-ended interviews have been carried out and that those conversations have been fully recorded by interviewers (Burnard, 1991: 461). In content analysis; there are four stages: (1) coding, (2) identifying themes, (3) editing codes, (4) presenting and interpreting findings (Demir, 2014). Data was analyzed by using descriptive analysis and along with the conventional content analysis, word frequency analysis was performed using NVivo 12 to draw a word cloud of the most mentioned words in the interviews.

Findings and Discussion

Table 1 exhibits the individual profile of the informants according to the variables such as gender, education, age, position and organization. According to the Table 1, the majority of the respondents were male (62.5%) and 37.5% were female.
Most of the informants were highly educated and had tourism education, except for two respondents who had finance (Inf.1) and design education (Inf.7). Half of the respondents were from hotels while the remainder from travel agencies (2 informants) and fair organizations (2 informants). And most of them were senior manager.

Firstly, the participants were asked to introduce themselves and their organizations. Then, informants were asked as to what kind of meetings do you organize? According to the answers, mostly medicine (%31,3), education (%18,8) and engineering (%12,5) congress and meetings were organized by their organization.

About the main benefits of MICE tourism for businesses and the host region, informants emphasized mostly economic (employment, revenue and expenditure), socio-cultural and promotional effects of the MICE tourism for the host region. For instance:

“Congresses provide the development of congress tourism in the destination. It provides economic and socio-cultural benefits to both the enterprise and the region” (Inf.4). “Congresses make a great contribution to the host region. Cultural interaction is experienced, tradesmen gain and from food and beverage to souvenir sales are spent.” (Inf.1).

In line with previous research (Dwyer and Forsyth, 1997; Jago, 2013; Kaya, 2016; Lee and Back, 2005; Oppermann and Chon, 1997; Swarbrooke and Horner, 2001; Yoo and Weber, 2005; Weber and Ladkin, 2004), MICE tourism has various effects for generating economic and socio-cultural benefits to the host destinations. Previous studies on the events’ impact analysis suggest that they affect the local economy, society and the sustainable development favorably (Panfiluk, 2015). The economic effects of the events include an increase in employment (Crompton, Lee & Schuster, 2001), and in local taxes (Thrane, 2002). In the social area the events contribute to raising awareness and social activity (Kim & Petrick, 2005) and properly organized, they have a direct impact on creating a positive image of the region (Framke, 2002; Getz, 1997).

Informants were asked as to what can be done to extend the stay of the guests in the congress destination? According to the findings, social programs, activities and enrichment of recreational activities are mainly mentioned. For instance:

“The variety of recreational activities in the city can extend the duration of the visit. So, tourists arrange their meeting schedule accordingly. For instance, Wonderland, is a good example in Ankara” (Inf.2). “Leisure time activities and social programs are important complementary products for the congress market” (Inf.8).
Similar to our findings, Ngamsom and Beck (2000) indicated that opportunities for travel to overseas destinations, outdoor recreation, business or political activities, change of pace, networking, and education were important factors which motivated the respondents in attending international conferences. Severt et. al. (2006) also identified the factors that motivated participation in the congress as activities and opportunities, linkage, suitability of the conference, educational benefits and products.

According to the Fig. 2.; the word “meeting halls” had the highest word frequency followed by the words “hotel”, “capacity” and “food & beverage”. The level of meeting space capacity is important in enhancing hotel operating performance (Madanoglu and Ozdemir, 2016). Analysis and forecasting of demand for a particular event or a region’s events will in part depend on population distribution, competition and intervening opportunities (Getz and Page, 2016). The most interesting places are the city center, coastal centers offering sufficient space, facilities, quality accommodation facilities, high security and efficient traffic. The attraction of the destination is the decisive factor in extending the length of the guests’ stay (Šušić and Mojić, 2014). Investments in the construction of convention centers and meeting halls have increased in almost every country. In addition, congress and visitor center offices are established in many countries and big cities in order to increase the opportunities for congresses and meetings (Arslan, 2009: 26).

Fig. 3 shows the word cloud of the most dissatisfied and problematic matters by the interviewers:

The word “food & beverage” had the highest word frequency followed by the words “room” and “meeting hall”. MICE tourism cannot exist without special-purpose venues and business events (or the MICE sector) require convention and exhibition centres, including numerous, smaller private parties and functions held in restaurants, hotels or resorts (Getz and Page, 2016). In terms of congress organizers, it is easier to market such destinations when it comes to natural beauties, historical and cultural attractions that make the congress destination attractive. Therefore, physical, historical, cultural and recreational resources, which are defined as the primary sources of destination competition in congress tourism, are seen as the most important reason of attraction and motivation to destinations. These factors are a direct cause of travel and attraction for a group of people and affect the length of stay and spending volume of the tourist (Bahar and Kozak, 2005: 207). Accommodation capacity and accommodation facilities are another important factor in the selection of congress destinations. It is a prerequisite that the city or region to be selected as the congress venue has accommodation facilities and congress hotels of sufficient number and capacity.
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

The selection of destinations within the scope of congress tourism is evaluated by considering various factors and these factors are mostly related to the location of the destination, the characteristics of the congress and meeting centers and the opportunities it offers (Özdemir, 2014). Around 30% of the total tourism revenue in the world comes from meeting tourism and is estimated at 250 billion dollars annually. Delegates bring mobility to the commercial life of the region they visit and increase their tax revenues (Kaya, 2016: 24). A better understanding of the motivations, dynamics, problems and facilitators will help meeting planners in designing conference programs to better meet the needs and wants of their customers (Rittichainuwat, Beck and Lalopa, 2001).

According to the findings, social programs and recreational activities were mainly mentioned to extend the stay of the guests in the congress destination by respondents. Traveling to desirable destinations is an important attendance motivation for convention visitors (Rittichainuwat and Mair, 2012). Lim and Zhu (2018) indicated that investment in the MICE sector includes providing tourism/recreation infrastructure and more attractions in the host destination which can benefit visitors and locals alike (Dwyer and Forsyth, 1997).

According to the results; the meeting hall, food and beverage and the hotel were the most mentioned words in both the requested features and the problems experienced. Lower meeting space capacities place hotels at a competitive disadvantage, supporting the tenets of RBV (Resource-Based View) theory. When structuring hotel management agreements, management companies should be cognizant of the negative performance effects of limited meeting space capacities (Madanoglu and Ozdemir, 2016: 79). On the other hand, Crouch et. al. (2019) stated that the quality and range of accommodation, particularly in relation to its proximity to, or association with, the convention facility itself, also represented important considerations.

The tourism industry is a holistic sector which consists of travel agencies and tour operators, transport services, accommodation establishments, recreational facilities and food and beverage businesses in supply dimension (Yazıcıoğlu and Kızanlıklı, 2018). So the congruence and complementary features of these components are very important for MICE tourism.

Historical and cultural attractions are fundamental and powerful charm element for the potential tourist flow. Although it does not affect the congress demand for a destination by itself and at the first degree, it is the reason of choice among destinations which become similar in an increasingly homogenous world. Therefore, if a destination can provide tourists with a culturally and historically diverse service beyond their daily routine, it clearly has a competitive advantage (Özdemir, 2007: 21). In addition to these elements, special infrastructure and superstructure facilities such as convention centers, conference centers and congress offices, simultaneous interpretation facilities must also be available. One or more deficiencies may prevent the system from being implemented properly (Arslan, 2009: 42).

Many personal, social and cultural factors will affect event tourism behavior, and although there is a substantial body of literature on leisure and travel in general, the various factors specifically affecting event tourism have not been well explored (Getz, 2008). So, future research may extend the current study by exploring the influence of personality traits and demographic variables of the visitors. Cross-cultural and motivational studies may also contribute to the literature.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

Virtual reality is a three dimensional simulation model providing mutual communication in a dynamic setting created by computers and which makes participants feel real-like. Development of technology reveals applicable examples of new ideas. Diversified virtual reality applications, each passing day, are important for tourism as they are for engineering, medicine, education and marketing. The aim of this study is to present the profile of articles about tourism and virtual reality in Turkey. Besides, suggestions for using of virtual reality technology are developed by analyzing the usage of this technology. For that purpose, the concept of “virtual reality” is scanned in the data base of ULAKBIM, with “topic” and “key words” sections. A bibliometric analyze was carried out over 73 articles which were published in ULAKBIM during 1996-2009.

Keywords: Bibliometric, Virtual Reality, Tourism

INTRODUCTION

Today, with the rapid development of technology, internet usage has started to increase. The Internet accelerates the flow of information around the world and provides advantages in time and space(Aktamış ve Arıcı, 2013,p.58). However, the trend towards virtual reality programs has also increased. As people make their lives easier, their interest in the virtual environment has started to increase in tourism sector. This situation has brought the concepts such as virtual tour and virtual reality together with new and modern technology. It is possible to benefit from these programs for places that cannot be visited or seen. Virtual reality is a simulation using computer graphics to create a world that seems to be real. Virtual reality is not a stagnant world which has been synthesized. Virtual reality is a dynamic world that reacts to user’s input. Virtual reality programs are a system in which a user can effectively control this simulation environment through various devices in a computer-generated three-dimensional simulation of a real-world situation. This technology can be used in many fields and for various purposes. It is inevitable that the tourism sector will take its share from this technology. Nowadays, with the rapid spread of the concept of virtual tour, in order to increase the passion of curiosity, the introduction of destination areas based on panoramic images to tourists has become an environment where not only attract products and services but also attract more customers(Arat ve Baltacıoğlu, 2015, p.105).
Virtual reality has found a wide range of applications from entertainment to engineering, from medical experiments to scientific experiments. Tourism is an important sector where information and communication technologies are used extensively. This technology, which has an important place especially in sharing and spreading tourism destinations, is rapidly developing today. The use of virtual reality is expected to increase gradually in the promotion activities of the country. It is seen that especially tourism destinations use virtual reality applications to introduce themselves. It is predicted that travel agencies will make a difference and be successful with virtual tours.

In this study, conducted in Turkey and published on ULAKBIM scientific papers related to tourism and virtual reality by examining the method of bibliometric analysis is intended to reveal the profile of tourism-related articles and virtual reality. In addition, the use of virtual reality technology in tourism has been examined and recommendations have been developed for the use of this technology in tourism. In addition, suggestions for the use of virtual reality in the field of tourism were developed and the research results were aimed to guide future scientific studies.

VIRTUAL REALITY

As the computer and internet technologies developed, the internet-human interaction developed and enabled expressions closer to human perception. One of these expressions is virtual reality. Virtual reality is a system in a computer-generated three-dimensional simulation of a real-world situation where the user can emotionally perceive this simulation environment with the special devices she wears on, and can effectively control this artificial world through these devices (Kayabaş, 2005). In virtual reality, everything is a simulation of virtual, digital or reality. Virtual reality opens up the gates of the three-dimensional world, and beyond that, it offers us a realistic experience. According to another definition, virtual reality is a three-dimensional, interactive, computer-generated environment that sees information and human as integrated. They are three-dimensional, interactive, computer-generated environments. These environments are models of real or imaginary worlds (Warwick, Gray, & Roberts, 1993, p. 3). According to Tepe et al, Virtual reality is a system that allows people to mislead their senses and feel them in realistic environments (Tepe, Kaleci, & Tüzün, 2016). It is based on the principle that the virtual reality viewer or the user is etiology within an edited time structure and interacts with it in an advanced image space; It has been defined as an environment consisting of technological tools such as three-dimensional image and audio devices, reproducing devices by simulating sensory effects such as power, motion and touch, consisting of various data input and output technologies (Kuruüzümcü, 2007). According to another definition, virtual reality is structured on the approach of combining an environment created with (virtual) human senses in a computer environment with graphics, colors, animations and sound effects, and making one feel like a part of the environment (Arat & Baltacıoğlu, 2016, p. 17). In the light of the above definitions, virtual reality can be summarized as a three-dimensional simulation environment in which users interact with other objects in order to have real-life experiences in an artificial world made by the computer with the imaging equipment that they wear on their bodies or enter into different devices (Deryakulu, 1999, p. 78).

Karasar (2014) describes the effects of virtual reality on participants from Dagit:

- The environment includes the participant,
- The participant feels that he is there,
- The participant is in interaction with the environment,
- The participant is free to examine the environment and participate in the activity,
- The participant is free to explore and engage in activities within the environment and multiple users can interact simultaneously in the same environment.

Virtual reality, headphones, screen, smart glasses, computers, smart gloves, etc. with the help of smart devices, such as events in the realm of the realization of the virtual environment is a technology that provides a sense of reality. Virtual reality makes people forget about the real world by immersing them in virtual environments and drawing them into virtual environments and enables them to be active and act as if they were real in the artificial world (Demirezen, 2019, p. 6).

Interaction devices used in virtual reality may vary according to their purpose. These; head mounted presentation systems (HMD), data glove, data clothing (body suits) and space ball can be counted as (Tepe, Goalkeeper, & Tüzün, 2016, p. 550-551).

Although virtual reality applications seem to be a costly technology, the experience of virtual reality has become desirable and sought after by everyone. Increasing interest in virtual reality attracted the attention of mobile technology companies in the first place and paved the way for the development of many new mobile hardware and applications including virtual reality components. Virtual reality applications have become accessible and usable.
especially for mobile operating systems by reducing the costs of virtual reality glasses. Many free virtual reality applications that can be downloaded from PlayStore or the App Store have become easily accessible to every user with smart devices thanks to the cost-effective Cardboard glasses developed by Google (Tepe, kaleci, & Tüzün, 2016 p.550-551).

It is seen that the virtual reality used in many sectors is now being used in the tourism sector. There are many examples of the rapid implementation of this technology, which is used especially in virtual tours and virtual museums (Arat and Baltacıoğlu, 2016).

VIRTUAL REALITY IN TOURISM

Virtual Reality technologies, which are expected to reach a market of US $ 40 billion in 2020, have found their place in the tourism industry as in many other fields (Kanak, Erdoğan ve Yılmaz, 2018). Tourism sector is one of the sectors that can benefit greatly from the advantages of virtual reality technology. With this superior technology, it is possible to see the places we want to go to, to travel to Mars, to walk on the Moon, to travel at the speed of light (Kurbanoğlu, 1996, p. 27).

Two of the important virtual reality applications in tourism are virtual tours and virtual museums. It can be said that virtual tours started by being influenced by virtual museology. Virtual Tour is a visual application that gives the impression of three-dimensional image and transfers the latest technology software and visual media applications on the photographs, creating a feeling of navigation for the visitor in the internet environment. Virtual Tour is the process of creating panoramic images with special shooting materials and photographing techniques, and processing these photos and then combining them to obtain a global image (Koçer & Uzunsakal, 2015, p. 1).

The development of virtual reality technology is effective in creating potential tourists in the tourism sector. The increase in the use of virtual reality as a means of publicity has given rise to great opportunities in increasing tourism earnings of enterprises and states, giving people pre-experience and influencing decision-making processes (Durmaz, Bulut, & Tankuş, 2018, p. 39).

Virtual tours can be divided into two-dimensional and three-dimensional. Two-dimensional virtual tours, contextual, educational and brochure virtual tours can be examined in three sections. Three-dimensional virtual tours are virtual tours in which three-dimensional (3D) models, which are designed in the same way as the reality, are created with real-time rendering software called game engine software. The most important feature of such virtual tour applications is that it is user intervention. It is useful in terms of being visual and creating a sense of reality and is aimed at giving people more time (Derman, 2012, p. 46).

3D virtual reality technology with the ancient city in Turkey on a tourist trip in Bergama Zeus, Athena and Asclepius temple offers 3D sightseeing opportunities. The province of Mersin is introduced using the virtual tour method in the Mersin virtual environment with the Tekno Mersin Project developed in cooperation with the Mersin Metropolitan Municipality and the Tourism Area of Mersin and Surrounding Area (METAB) (Ekici & Güven, 2017, p. 406-408).

Making all kinds of marketing and reservations in the virtual environment in tourism is one of the most important advantages of tourism in today's world where internet is widely used. People leaving their homes, visiting the hotels they want to go with the virtual reality application, and choosing their rooms by seeing three-dimensional in advance, will create a more positive image for the hotel in the eyes of people than other hotels. Virtual reality application for hotel staff can also be motivating. In addition to working personnel, having a device that shows the guests in all areas of the hotel in 3D will facilitate the work of the personnel (Arat & Baltacıoğlu, 2016, p. 110).

Advances in technology, in many forms, often have a direct and lasting impact on tourism. Recently, developments in information and communication technologies have changed tourism in many ways with its effects in various fields from consumer demands to management. For example, many tourists have adopted the Internet as a means of acquiring travel information. An important area of ICT is virtual reality, which is widely used in a variety of fields, including entertainment, design and simulation training. In fact, virtual reality has various uses in the tourism industry. For example, a London-based travel agency marketing an Amazon eco-tourism river cruise may want to promote the trip using a fully immersive a head-mounted presentation system that allows potential customers to enjoy a virtual simulation of the tour (Demirezen, 2019, p. 7-8).

With the introduction of virtual reality and the significant increase in its advantages, businesses have turned to using technology in this field. It is able to provide a pre-experience that is not possible to be lived in the tourism sector before and enables the companies using this technology to differentiate
from other enterprises and create a brand image. Providing the preliminary experience enables potential customers to be created, people to turn to technology-based businesses and consequently increase demand. As one of the returns of the increasing demand, the customer potential that will increase with the formation of feedback will positively affect the enterprises in the booking and marketing point with the introduction of this technology. Companies that keep pace with technology and are constantly in follow-up will prevent non-technology enterprises and lead the tourism industry by creating sector competition (Durmaz, Bulut, & Tankuş, 2018, p. 38).

Due to the nature of virtual reality applications, it is valuable to promote tourism. Because tourism is based on discovering new places and getting new experiences. Hotels, casinos, theme parks, special events or virtual sea cruises can be revived to provide a better feeling and impression of what the customer has purchased. Virtual reality systems can exert tremendous persuasive power and provide a lucrative opportunity to successfully market a property that is currently in use in the tourism sector (Demirezen, 2019, pp. 7-8).

METHOD

The aim of this study is to determine the profile of the article on virtual reality in Turkey. In addition, the use of virtual reality technology in tourism has been examined and recommendations have been developed for the use of this technology in tourism. In the literature, there is no Turkish publication attempting to reveal the bibliographic profile of the concept of virtual reality. The results of this study will be useful for the creation of future scientific studies on virtual reality. For this purpose, the following problems are sought.

- What are the data collection techniques used in the research of articles in the database?
- What are the analysis methods used in the research of articles in the database?
- How many authors does articles have?
- What are the research topics of the articles?

In this study, the concept of virtual reality, virtual reality and tourism and virtual reality in tourism, title, keyword and summary sections were searched and a total of 242 articles were searched in ULAKBİM database. As a result of the review of 242 articles, 159 articles were excluded from the study due to the lack of data on virtual reality, virtual reality and tourism and virtual reality in tourism. In addition, it was found out that 10 articles were uploaded to English and Turkish separately. In the line with this, 10 articles were excluded from the study and bibliometric analysis was performed on 73 articles published in ULAKBİM between 1996-2019. Microsoft Excel program was used for the analysis of the articles. Within the scope of the analysis of the articles, 10 columns were created in the Microsoft Excel table. These columns include the database containing the articles, the name of the article, the journal in which the article was published, the number of authors, the discipline, subject, research method, data collection technique, and data analysis technique of the article. The articles were examined one by one and processed into the Microsoft Excel table, and the results of the bibliometric analysis were evaluated by creating graphics and tables.

FINDINGS

In this section, findings related to the problems of the study and their comments are given.

Distribution of Articles According to Databases

The articles related to virtual reality in ULAKBİM are distributed according to the databases as shown in Figure 1.
23 (31.5%) articles in the life sciences database, 22 (30.1%) articles in the social sciences database, 16 (21.9%) articles in the health sciences database, and 12 (16.4%) articles in the engineering and basic sciences database. It is seen that virtual reality studies are extensively included in the life sciences and social sciences database.

**Distribution of Articles by Research Disciplines**

The distribution of articles related to virtual reality in ULAKBİM according to research disciplines is shown in Figure 2.

The most published research discipline is educational research discipline with 16 articles. Medical research discipline ranks second with 8 articles and communication research discipline ranks third with 7 articles. The number of articles published in other research disciplines is close to each other. It was determined that the studies were mostly in the discipline of education. In addition, it was determined that only one study took place in the discipline of tourism.
Distribution of Publication Years of Articles

The distribution of the articles related to virtual reality in ULAKBİM according to their publication years is given in Figure 3.

![Distribution of Articles by Years](image)

2017 was the most published year with 16 articles. The number of articles published after 2012 increased in general.

Distribution of Articles According to Research Methods

The articles related to virtual reality in ULAKBİM are distributed according to research methods as shown in Figure 4.

![Distribution of Articles by Research Methods](image)

Qualitative research method is used in 54 of the articles, while it is seen that the quantitative research method is used in 17 of the articles. Mixed research method was used in 2 of the articles. It is seen that 20 articles and the most frequently used qualitative research methods are in the life sciences database. It was found that the database containing the most widely used articles in quantitative research method is the database of engineering and basic sciences with 6 articles.
Data Collection Techniques Used in Research of Articles

The data collection techniques of the articles related to virtual reality in ULAKBİM are distributed as shown in Figure 5.

When the analysis techniques used in the researches of the articles in the ULAKBİM database are examined, it is seen that the most commonly used data collection technique is the source scanning technique used in 25 articles. Another commonly used data collection technique is the questionnaire technique used in 14 articles. The least used data collection techniques are the data collection techniques that use surveys and interviews as well as resource scanning and observation. Other data collection techniques are close to each other.

Analysis Methods Used in Research of Articles

The distributions of articles related to virtual reality in ULAKBİM database according to the analysis methods used in their research are given in Figure 6.

Descriptive analysis, which is one of the qualitative research analysis methods used in 26 articles, is the most widely used analysis method.
Count the Author of Articles

When the number of authors is examined in articles on ULAKBİM virtual reality, the distribution shown in Figure 7 is reached.

![Distribution of Articles by Number of Authors](image)

30 (41.1%) of the articles were single authors. 26 (35.6%) of them had two authors. 58 articles are co-authors. Therefore, it was found that the articles were usually written by co-authors. However, the number of articles with a single author constitutes a very large proportion.

Research Topics of Articles

The research topics of the articles on ULAKBİM on virtual reality are shown in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Articles Topics</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Articles Topics</th>
<th>n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality in education</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Virtual reality and cinema</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality in medicine</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Violence problem and virtual reality</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality and technology</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Virtual reality in librarianship</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality in engineering</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Virtual reality and literature</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality and rehabilitation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Virtual reality and philosophy</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality applications in communication</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Virtual reality and tourism</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality and learning environments</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Virtual reality and sports events</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality and media</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Scale adaptation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual reality in art</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Virtual reality and astronomy</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing and virtual reality</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Virtual reality and cultural heritage</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>73</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

20 different subjects related to virtual reality have been studied. Among these topics, the most studied subject is virtual reality in education. The issue of virtual reality in medicine is noteworthy among articles.
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Virtual reality technology is an effective concept that allows to change the laws of time, scale and physics. Thanks to this technology, which increases the interaction between human and computer, it has moved the designer from the two-dimensional world of mouse, keyboard and monitor to three-dimensional worlds where naturalness and intuition are at the forefront of design (Zafer, 2007, p. 17).

The concept of virtual reality, which has been used frequently in medicine, architecture, engineering, education and many other fields, is progressing towards being a concept that can be used by businesses in the market in the competitive sector in which human relations are experienced intensively. As a result of the literature review, the contributions of virtual reality technology to the field of tourism were determined. In this context, rapid adaptation of this technology to the tourism sector is expected to be beneficial.

In this study, conducted in Turkey and scientific articles on virtual reality, which was published in ULAKBİM it was examined by bibliometric analysis. In addition, the use of virtual reality technology in tourism has been investigated. As a result of the study, the profile of the articles related to virtual reality was revealed. According to the data examined within the scope of the research; The distribution of articles related to virtual reality in ULAKBİM according to the databases is mostly determined in the life sciences and social sciences databases. When the distribution according to the research disciplines is examined, it is found that 23 different disciplines are studied. When the publication years of articles related to virtual reality in ULAKBİM were examined, it was concluded that virtual reality has been studied in research disciplines since 1996. In recent years, it has been determined that virtual reality is an important field of study for research disciplines and the studies are mainly carried out with qualitative research methods.

Among articles related to virtual reality published in ULAKBİM, one article was realized in the discipline of Tourism. When the benefits of virtual reality technology to tourism discipline are taken into consideration, all destinations, every business in tourism area, museums etc. should adopt this technology. Accordingly, publications in the field are considered to be insufficient. Therefore, it may be suggested that tourism researchers in universities work in this field. Moreover, it is thought that the use of this technology in tourism education will contribute to the training of experienced individuals for the tourism sector.

The results of the research show that quantitative research methods are less used in scientific researches. It is clear that focusing on experimental studies in scientific researches in the field of social sciences will contribute to the benefits of using virtual reality technology. This research covers only the articles in ULAKBİM. In the following researches, other databases can be examined to determine whether these results are similar. In addition, international publications can be examined and comparisons can be made.
REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

With the industrial revolution, the increase in the use of fossil fuels, increasing population, urbanization, wrong land use, unconscious release of waste, deforestation, human activities disrupted the flow of the natural system and caused many environmental problems including global warming. Global warming and climate change, which is one of the most important problems in the world, affects every aspect of our lives and creates negative effects on many factors such as natural ecosystems, the existence and health of living things, and water resources. These long-term effects (such as melting of glaciers, rising sea levels, displacement of climatic zones, intensification and effects of severe weather events and related natural disasters, drought, erosion, desertification and consequent shortage of clean water, epidemic diseases, increase of agricultural pests) are expected to become more pronounced in the future. Tourism that uses natural and historical environment as a resource is inevitable to be affected by this process. Turkey have rich opportunities in terms of tourism potential with its natural beauties, historical charm, socio-cultural characteristics. In tourism where natural, cultural and historical values are the source, negativities especially on the environment directly affect the tourism sector.

It is inevitable that tourism will be affected by global climate change, which is also dependent on climate elements such as temperature, precipitation, wind and humidity and the changes experienced in them. Antalya, the most important tourism city of Turkey, is one of the cities that will be most affected by global warming. This will naturally, culturally, socially and economically cause national and regional damages. Individuals as well as managers play important roles in the fight against global warming and climate change. It is aimed to determine view of the public of Antalya on global warming and climate change by using an interview applied to 386 people in the center districts (Konyaalti, Kepez, Aksu, Dosemealti, Muratpasa). In the first section of the study, consists of three main sections, the concepts and definitions, causes and effects of global warming and climate change are presented from the literature. The second section of the survey consists of determining the sampling size, selecting the questioning method, preparing the interview, pre-testing the interview and correcting the errors, applying the interview and evaluating the results statistically. With the interview, the causes of the most important environmental problems, global warming and climate change were asked and the situation of Antalya (affected or not) by global warming and climate change were evaluated. According to the results of the interview, the respondents stated that Antalya was also affected by global warming and climate change and this was understood by the precipitation and uneven season. Among the things that should be done to prevent these problems, it is stated that the protection of natural areas, support of recycling and afforestation activities should be increased. In the third and final section of the study, some suggestions were given in terms of professional discipline of landscape architecture in the fight against global warming and climate change.

Keywords: Global Warming, Climate Change, Environmental Problems, Antalya.
INTRODUCTION

More than 50% of the global population lives in urban areas, in recent years. Worldwide, the urban area is expected to increase approximately threefold from 2000 to 2030 (SCBD 2013, Anguluri and Narayanan 2017). The fact that urban areas continue to increase in the coming years and the rapid growth of cities in terms of size and density will create significant pressure on the natural structure of the city (Nor et al. 2017). This situation necessitates the examination of the urban environment.

Urbanization affects the natural resources negatively as it changes the land use, transportation, industrial and agricultural production, consumption and social activities of individuals. Unplanned cities concentrating around fertile agricultural areas, forests, seashores and river resources lead to irreversible losses in these areas. It is inevitable that landscape planning, which is also important in terms of conservation and proper use of our natural resources, will have a place in the planning process of our country, especially in urban planning (Mansuroglu and Dag 2019).

With the industrial revolution, the increase in the use of fossil fuels, increasing population, urbanization, unconscious release of waste, deforestation, human activities disrupted the flow of the natural system and caused many environmental problems including global warming. Global warming and climate change, which is one of the most important problems in the world, affects every aspect of our lives and creates negative effects on many factors such as natural ecosystems, the existence and health of living things, and water resources. These long-term effects are (such as melting of glaciers, rising sea levels, displacement of climatic zones, intense weather events and related natural disasters and strengthening their effects, drought, erosion, desertification and consequent shortage of clean water, epidemic diseases, increase of agricultural pests) (IPCC 2007, Solomon et al. 2007, IPCC 2013) expected to become even more pronounced in the coming years.

Climate change can be defined by taking into account human activities that increase greenhouse gas accumulations. The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (1992) describes "A change in climate as a result of human activities that directly or indirectly disrupt the composition of the global atmosphere, in addition to the natural climate change observed in a comparable time period".

Global warming, which is used as a concept similar to climate change, "Since the industrial revolution, especially due to the rapid increase in the accumulation of greenhouse gases released into the atmosphere by various human activities such as burning of fossil fuels, deforestation, agricultural activities and industrial processes, the natural greenhouse effect has been strengthened by the effect of urbanization; (lower and middle troposphere) is defined as the increase in temperature (Turkes 2007).

Changes in climate events are expected to pose significant risks to communities and ecosystems (IPCC 2013). In addition to global disasters of global warming and climate change, unique climate risks may arise in urban areas (for example, the city’s warm island, impermeable surfaces that increase flooding, coastal development threatens by sea level rise, etc.) (Carter et al. 2015, Gartland 2008, Gill et al. 2007, Smith et al. 2009, Wilbanks et al. 2007). Therefore, it is foreseen that all countries, even cities, will be affected by climate change in different dimensions and will face various adaptation problems. Therefore, Füngfeld (2010) states that the international community is working to take measures to mitigate the impact of climate change. Doherty et al. (2016) state that despite the adaptation of people throughout their environment, climate change poses new and unique challenges that threaten their lives and livelihoods.

Climate change will undoubtedly affect human life in various ways. Some sectors that are in close relationship with the climate may also be affected by these negativities. One of the most important of these sectors is tourism. Considering that the external environment and natural factors have a direct impact on tourism movements and tourist decisions, it is inevitable that climate changes will affect tourism. Because Didascalou et al. (2007) state that the competitiveness of a destination depends on the ideal climatic conditions appropriate for the type of tourism sustained. Therefore, climate disadvantaged areas are less preferred by tourism planners and tourists (IPCC 2007).

Turkey has rich opportunities in terms of tourism potential with its natural beauties, historical charm, socio-cultural characteristics. In tourism, where natural, cultural and historical values are used as a resource, negativities especially on the environment directly affect the tourism sector. Karadeniz et al. (2018), tourism contributes to globalization in three dimensions, social, spatial and economic aspects, and is one of the sectors most affected by global warming (Viner and Agnew 1999). Turkey is surrounded by seas on three sides of the climate can vary in size due to the rugged topography and local orographic features. The different regions and regions of our country, which is one of the countries that will be most affected by climate change with its diverse climate structure, will be affected by climate change in different sizes and forms (Ozturk 2002).
In this study, the causes and consequences of the most important environmental problems of the world, global warming and climate change, and the situation of Antalya affected by the global warming and climate change and suggestions for preventing this problem were questioned. As a result, some suggestions have been made in terms of the professional discipline of landscape architecture in the fight against global warming and climate change.

**MATERIAL AND METHOD**

This study was carried out in Antalya city. The study area is an important tourism city of Turkey and located in Mediterranean costal region. The study was carried out between March and June 2019 to determine opinions of resident on global warming and climate change in Antalya.

The main objectives of this section were indicating size of the sample population, selecting interview method, design of the interview, pre-testing and revision of interviews, data collecting and analysis and interpretation of data.

**Indicating Size of the Sample Population**

According to the sampling size for the population over 100 000 justified by Balci (2015) with 5% error efficiency is 384. In sampling this number was represented with randomly selected 386 people in total among of citizens in Antalya city center.

**Selecting Interview Method**

Due to faster and reliable results, face to face structured interviews were preferred in the study instead of standard data forms.

**Design of the Interview Form**

- Determination of the effects of climate change and global warming
- Socio-economic character.

For the determination of “the effects of climate change and global warming” 6 main questions (five three-point Likert type questions) were asked to samples. On the “Socio-economic Characteristic”, relation between the factors of gender, age, profession, education level that effecting socio-economic characteristics was studied.

**Pre-Testing and Revision of Interviews**

Interview forms were develop in cooperation with experts working on environmental issues and interviews and evaluated under the major processes of content, construction, interpretation and evaluation. Pre-testing was carried out by the first face to face interviews with randomly selected 30 inhabitants living in Antalya city center.

**Data collecting:** According to population percentage of inhabitants within Antalya city center, number of individuals was selected randomly for the interviews.

**Building up scaling system:** Indicating a scaling system was indicative in the selection of question types.

**Analysis and interpretation of data:** The interview form covers two main chapters; identify the effects of climate change and global warming and socioeconomic character. IBM SPSS 20.0 software used to assess the relation between scores and levels of identify the effects of climate change and global warming and socio-economic characteristics (gender, marital status, age, education level). Following the evaluation of frequencies and percentages cross tabs and chi-square test were used to test statistical significance that accepted as alpha level of 0.05.

**RESULTS**

**Socio-Economic Characteristics**

There is close relation between socio-economic characteristics and identify the effects of climate change and global warming. Gender, marital status, age, income and education level on the environment were investigated in this section (Table 1). Of the respondents 47,4% were male and 52,6% female while 21,5% of them were married, 74,6% single and 3,9% divorced. Table 1 indicates the information on marital status, age, income and education level of the respondents. Education is a key milestone in the creation of environmentally responsible behavior. Great majority of the respondents in 52,3% are between the ages of 18-24, and the majority of high school (50%) according to their education level.
Table 1. Socio-economic Characteristics of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital status (%)</th>
<th>Income (TL) (%)</th>
<th>Age groups (%)</th>
<th>Education (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>21,5 Less 2,000</td>
<td>7,0 18-24</td>
<td>52,3 Illiterate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>74,6 2001-3000</td>
<td>23,8 25-34</td>
<td>27,2 Primary school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>3,9 3001-4000</td>
<td>13,0 35-44</td>
<td>11,7 Secondary school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4001-5000</td>
<td>16,8 45-54</td>
<td>4,9 High school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5001-6000</td>
<td>15,0 55-64</td>
<td>2,8 High school (University)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+6001</td>
<td>24,4 +65</td>
<td>1,0 University</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is seen that all participants respond to the statement that the effects of climate changes will increase as a result of scenarios that may arise as a result of global warming (Table 2). Women (98%) responded with a higher rate of agreement than men (97.3%) and the responses were statistically significant (p <0.001). The 25-34 age group (99%), singles (98.6%), high school graduates (97.9%) and those with 2001-3000 TL income (98.9%) responded with the highest rate of agreement and the responses were statistically significant.

Table 2. Effects Of Climate Change Will Increase

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender (n=386)</th>
<th>Agree (%)</th>
<th>Neutral (%)</th>
<th>Disagree (%)</th>
<th>Chi-square</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female (n=203)</td>
<td>98,0</td>
<td>2,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>187,315</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male (n=183)</td>
<td>97,3</td>
<td>2,7</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>163,546</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-24 (n=202)</td>
<td>98,5</td>
<td>1,5</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>190,178</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34 (n=105)</td>
<td>99,0</td>
<td>1,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>101,038</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44 (n=45)</td>
<td>95,6</td>
<td>4,4</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>37,356</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-54 (n=19)</td>
<td>89,5</td>
<td>10,5</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>11,842</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-64 (n=11)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+ (n=4)</td>
<td>75,0</td>
<td>25,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>0,317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married (n=83)</td>
<td>94,0</td>
<td>6,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>64,205</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single (n=288)</td>
<td>98,6</td>
<td>1,4</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>272,222</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced (n=15)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate (n=1)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary school (n=2)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary school (n=5)</td>
<td>80,0</td>
<td>20,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>1,800</td>
<td>0,180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school (n=193)</td>
<td>97,9</td>
<td>2,1</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>177,332</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school (University) (n=23)</td>
<td>10,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University (n=143)</td>
<td>97,2</td>
<td>2,8</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>127,448</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-graduate (n=19)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less 2000 TL (n=27)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-3000 TL (n=92)</td>
<td>98,9</td>
<td>1,1</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>88,043</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3001-4000 TL (n=50)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4001-5000 TL (n=65)</td>
<td>96,9</td>
<td>3,1</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>57,246</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5001-6000 TL (n=58)</td>
<td>94,8</td>
<td>5,2</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>46,621</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6001+ TL (n=94)</td>
<td>96,8</td>
<td>3,2</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>82,383</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to these scenarios, there is a statistically significant difference between the responses of the men that 87.4% agree, 10.4% neutral and 2.2% disagree with the statement that quality drinking water will decrease and be very expensive (p <0.001). The highest rate of unstable was 15.6% in the 35-44 age group ($\chi^2 = 21.356, p <0.001$) and the highest percentage of those who disagreed was 10.6% in the 45-54 age group and the results were statistically significant ($\chi^2 = 17.789, p <0.001$) is remarkable (Table 3).
As the result of the melting of the glaciers, coastal settlements will be submerged, while women agree with a higher rate, while men respond with 21.3% undecided (χ²=150,426, p<0.001). 55-64 age group stated that I agree with the highest rate (χ²=7,364, p=0,007). As it is seen in the table, it is possible to say that the age increases, concerns about the subject increase (Table 4). It is also remarkable that married individuals (79.5%) responded with a higher rate of agreement than singles (76.7%).
University graduates responded that 95.1% agree that precipitation will become more variable. While 13% of college graduates stated that they were undecided, 90.7% of males and 89.7% of females agreed. Some of the participants reported that rainfall has changed even in recent years and that the effect may be felt more in the following years if no measures are taken. There are some who think that irregular rainfall can lead to flood formation and consequently product loss (Table 5).

### Table 5. Rainfall Will Become More Variable

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender (n=386)</th>
<th>Agree (%)</th>
<th>Neutral (%)</th>
<th>Disagree (%)</th>
<th>Chi-square</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female (n=203)</td>
<td>89,7</td>
<td>8,9</td>
<td>1,5</td>
<td>291,438</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male (n=183)</td>
<td>90,7</td>
<td>8,2</td>
<td>1,1</td>
<td>272,492</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-24 (n=202)</td>
<td>88,6</td>
<td>10,4</td>
<td>1,0</td>
<td>280,465</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34 (n=105)</td>
<td>91,4</td>
<td>5,7</td>
<td>2,9</td>
<td>159,600</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44 (n=45)</td>
<td>88,9</td>
<td>11,1</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>27,222</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-54 (n=19)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-64 (n=11)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+ (n=4)</td>
<td>75,0</td>
<td>25,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>0,317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married (n=83)</td>
<td>92,8</td>
<td>7,2</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>60,735</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single (n=288)</td>
<td>89,2</td>
<td>9,0</td>
<td>1,7</td>
<td>407,313</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced (n=15)</td>
<td>93,3</td>
<td>6,7</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>11,267</td>
<td>0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate (n=1)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary school (n=2)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary school (n=5)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school (n=193)</td>
<td>86,5</td>
<td>11,9</td>
<td>1,6</td>
<td>248,870</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school (University) (n=23)</td>
<td>87,0</td>
<td>13,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>12,565</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University (n=143)</td>
<td>95,1</td>
<td>3,5</td>
<td>1,4</td>
<td>245,636</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-graduate (n=19)</td>
<td>89,5</td>
<td>10,5</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>11,842</td>
<td>0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less 2000 TL (n=27)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-3000 TL (n=92)</td>
<td>90,2</td>
<td>7,6</td>
<td>2,2</td>
<td>134,370</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3001-4000 TL (n=50)</td>
<td>90,0</td>
<td>10,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>32,000</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4001-5000 TL (n=65)</td>
<td>81,5</td>
<td>16,9</td>
<td>1,5</td>
<td>70,277</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5001-6000 TL (n=58)</td>
<td>91,4</td>
<td>8,6</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>39,724</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6001+ TL (n=94)</td>
<td>92,6</td>
<td>5,3</td>
<td>2,1</td>
<td>148,489</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Among the participants who stated that the increase in temperatures could affect ocean and sea water temperatures, 81.3% of the respondents and 76.0% of the respondents stated that the temperature level could increase. It is among the most undecided graduate graduates (26.3%) about the increase in ocean and sea water temperature values. However, the percentage of respondents who agree with this statement (68.4%) was high and the responses were statistically significant (Table 6).

Table 6. Seas and Oceans Will Be Warm

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender (n=386)</th>
<th>Agree (%)</th>
<th>Neutral (%)</th>
<th>Disagree (%)</th>
<th>Chi-square</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female (n=203)</td>
<td>81,3</td>
<td>16,3</td>
<td>2,5</td>
<td>215,803</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male (n=183)</td>
<td>76,0</td>
<td>22,4</td>
<td>1,6</td>
<td>161,443</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-24 (n=202)</td>
<td>79,2</td>
<td>19,3</td>
<td>1,5</td>
<td>200,921</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34 (n=105)</td>
<td>72,4</td>
<td>23,8</td>
<td>3,8</td>
<td>78,343</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44 (n=45)</td>
<td>86,7</td>
<td>11,1</td>
<td>2,2</td>
<td>58,133</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-54 (n=19)</td>
<td>78,9</td>
<td>21,1</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>6,368</td>
<td>0,012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-64 (n=11)</td>
<td>90,9</td>
<td>9,1</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>7,364</td>
<td>0,007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+ (n=4)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married (n=83)</td>
<td>84,3</td>
<td>14,5</td>
<td>1,2</td>
<td>99,349</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single (n=288)</td>
<td>76,0</td>
<td>21,5</td>
<td>2,4</td>
<td>252,146</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced (n=15)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate (n=1)</td>
<td>100,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary school (n=2)</td>
<td>50,0</td>
<td>50,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,000</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary school (n=5)</td>
<td>60,0</td>
<td>20,0</td>
<td>20,0</td>
<td>1,600</td>
<td>0,449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school (n=193)</td>
<td>79,3</td>
<td>19,2</td>
<td>1,6</td>
<td>192,290</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school (University) (n=23)</td>
<td>78,3</td>
<td>21,7</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>7,348</td>
<td>0,007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University (n=143)</td>
<td>80,4</td>
<td>17,5</td>
<td>2,1</td>
<td>147,748</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-graduate (n=19)</td>
<td>68,4</td>
<td>26,3</td>
<td>5,3</td>
<td>11,789</td>
<td>0,003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income (n=386)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less 2000 TL (n=27)</td>
<td>81,5</td>
<td>11,1</td>
<td>7,4</td>
<td>28,222</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-3000 TL (n=92)</td>
<td>76,1</td>
<td>23,9</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>25,043</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3001-4000 TL (n=50)</td>
<td>84,0</td>
<td>16,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>23,120</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4001-5000 TL (n=65)</td>
<td>80,0</td>
<td>18,5</td>
<td>1,5</td>
<td>66,492</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5001-6000 TL (n=58)</td>
<td>86,2</td>
<td>13,8</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>30,414</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6001+ TL (n=94)</td>
<td>72,3</td>
<td>22,3</td>
<td>5,3</td>
<td>68,447</td>
<td>&lt;0,001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

93.5% of the participants think that Antalya is affected by global warming and climate change. When the participants were asked to list how the city was affected, first degree (34.1%) and II. degree of precipitation (25.5%), III. degree (24.5%) were the factors that indicate the state of the irregularity of the season (Table 7).

Table 7. The Impact of Global Warming on the City of Antalya in Order of Importance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasons</th>
<th>1. Degree (%)</th>
<th>2. Degree (%)</th>
<th>3. Degree (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Flood increase</td>
<td>4,2</td>
<td>6,1</td>
<td>10,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Precipitation disordering</td>
<td>34,1</td>
<td>25,5</td>
<td>14,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temperature increase</td>
<td>20,5</td>
<td>18,3</td>
<td>13,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sea water temperature increase</td>
<td>3,6</td>
<td>3,3</td>
<td>5,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drought increase</td>
<td>7,8</td>
<td>9,7</td>
<td>7,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonal disordering</td>
<td>22,7</td>
<td>23,3</td>
<td>24,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural crops decrease</td>
<td>5,3</td>
<td>10,8</td>
<td>15,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural vegetation extinction</td>
<td>1,9</td>
<td>3,0</td>
<td>8,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Where it is determined that the people in tourism cities do not manage global warming and climate change, they have stated that Antalya’s global city’s nature and climate change have been affected, while the seasons have been disorganized. In addition, the participants stated that the rainfall became irregular and the temperature and drought increased in the city.

Changes in climate events in tourism cities, the change of tourism periods of the city’s tourism potential will be able to produce many different results. Therefore, it is important to take the necessary precautions by considering that the effects of climate change and global warming are felt in the tourism sector rather than being considered as a future event. The effects of global warming and climate change in the tourism sector can be listed as follows;

- Decreasing the tourism potential with the prolongation of dry season periods and the loss of characteristics of natural areas,
- Winter tourism is adversely affected by the unevenness of snowfall time and / or varying amount of snowfall,
- As a result of the shortening and / or absence of transition periods between seasons, tourism areas with seasonal natural features lose their characteristics,
- Increase the number of visitors in some tourism regions during the hot summer months,
- Decreasing rainfall and decrease in ground water resources in some destination areas,
- Negative impact of the attraction of touristic areas due to large forest fires,
- Increasing sea water temperature and adversely affecting sea-sand-sun tourism,
- Indirectly affected tourism by the decrease of agricultural production or damage of agricultural products,
- Decrease of plant and animal species and / or change of vegetation / monitoring periods adversely affect some tourism species (botany tourism, wildlife-birdwatching),

Among the things that should be done to prevent these problems, priority should be given to conservation of natural areas, to support recycling and to increase afforestation activities. What can be done in terms of global warming and combating climate change is presented below:

- Reforestation activities should be increased
- Protect natural areas
- Green areas in cities should be increased
- Recycling should be supported
- Encourage the use of bicycles
- Public transport should be improved
- All consumption should be reduced (water, electricity, etc.).
- Training activities should be increased

As a result, it is considered that on a global scale/ national measures should be taken in the struggle against climate change due to global warming, which is a global environmental problem, and it is necessary to carry out studies on diversification of tourism and performing appropriate tourism activities in different regions of our country in order to be least affected by tourism, which is one of the important sectors of our country.

Acknowledgments: This study was supported by the Administration Unit of Scientific Research Projects of Pamukkale University (Project No: 2019KKP105).
REFERENCES


SCBD, (2013). Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity. Cities and Biodiversity Outlook (ISBN 92-9225-432-2) is an open access publication, subject to the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/).


The Idea of Divine Mercy and Its Religious Cult in Krakow as Impulse on Urban Tourism

Pawel PLICHTA
Jagiellonian University
pabloplichta@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Despite the secularization and changes in the forms of religiosity of modern man [e.g. Woodhead 2001; Heelas 2002; Tacey 2004; Lynch 2007] religion plays a significant role in modern tourism [Norman 2011; Dallen & Boyd 2006]. Over the last years, Krakow has become one of the most visited cities in Central and Eastern Europe. The former capital of Poland with its multicultural history is now a thriving academic and cultural center [Airey 1998; Hughes, Allen & Wasik 2003; Plichta 2014] but also religious [Jackowski 2008; Kapera 2011]. The city’s promotional strategies emphasize, among others, such aspects and spaces as: Kazimierz - Jewish quarter [Ashworth 2002]; Krakow as the city of Saint John Paul II [Niedzwiedz 2009] and Saint Faustyna Kowalska [Niedzwiedz 2017; Soljan & Liro 2015] and a center of numerous Roman Catholic sanctuaries, synagogues and places related to Jewish religiosity [Sandri 2013]; a city through which there are several cultural and religious routes including the Camino de Santiago [Mroz 2014].

The aim of the paper is to present ways of functioning of Krakow as a tourist city through the prism of its religious heritage and the idea of Divine Mercy and its cult in Krakow. Interesting is the tension between its cultural heritage and contemporary ideas implemented both with the use of existing religious sites and the creation of new ones. New media are particularly important in this respect.

The presented paper is a result of in-house and field studies conducted since 2010. A descriptive-analytic method, a dynamic-comparative method, as well as statistical methods were used to present the study results.
REFERENCE


Turkey’s Metropolitans in Terms of City Tourism: A Review of Tourism Brochures

Burçin KIRLAR CAN
Dr., Pamukkale University
burcink@pau.edu.tr

Mehmet ERTAŞ
Dr., Pamukkale University
mehmetertas@pau.edu.tr

Sonay KAYGALAK ÇELEBİ
Assist. Prof. Dr, Batman University,
sonay.kaygalak@batman.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The importance of city tourism has been highlighted over the last decade. All national, regional, or city-based organizations have an important role in the development of city tourism in destinations and each of these stakeholders spends considerable amounts of money to promote the cities. Tourism brochures are among the most used tools in tourism promotion (Wicks and Schuett, 1991). In spite of the advances in information technologies, brochures are still one of the main references for tourists and widely used before and during the vacation (Andereck, 2005).

Tourism brochures are the key elements to build and represent cities as tourism destinations (Pritchard and Morgan, 2001). These brochures also exhibit various attractions of a city and arouse the desire of tourists to visit that city. Besides while traveling the city, tourists widely use city brochures as a reliable information source. The purpose of the study is to investigate the tourism brochures to evaluate the city tourism potential of Turkey’s metropolitans. Turkey has 30 metropolitans and Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism (PDCT) of each city usually leads the responsibility of the city’s promotion. Therefore, a content analysis of the tourism brochures on the PDCTs web page constitutes the basis of the research.

After checking the official web pages of PDCTs, cities that do not have tourism brochures on the web pages were excluded. In total, 20 cities were analyzed based on the criteria determined by Cibinskiene and Snieskiene (2015), Güçer, Hassan and Pelit (2013), and Zhou and DeSantis (2005). These criteria include information about geographic location, climate, history, activity list (what to do, what to eat, what to buy), transportation to the city, urban transportation, city-map, natural, cultural and other attractions, travel routes, culture and art, yellow pages, tourism enterprises, and tourism types.

As a conclusion, most of the cities give detailed information about their natural and cultural attractions in their tourism brochures. By emphasizing their own attractions more, cities allocate more space for these attractions in the brochures. For instance, while city tourism stands out for Istanbul, Antalya highlights sea-sand-sun, Adana and Gaziantep underline gastronomy, Şanlıurfa impresses on faith, and Denizli focuses on culture. On the other hand, cities mostly underestimate information about transportation, activity list, and city map which are essential for the tourists in a vacation. Most importantly, cities disregard foreign language option both on the web pages and the brochures.

At last, considering the criteria of city tourism, most of the metropolitans of Turkey have potential in terms of city tourism. While some of the cities highlight this potential, the majority of the cities pay no attention. More important is that one-third of the metropolitans do not have a tourism brochure even if they have a city tourism potential. However, they still give tourism information on the PDCT web pages. Cultural values in the city centers are the most emphasized attractiveness in the brochures.

The study finally notes the implications for local authorities. As tourism brochures are widely used and influence tourists, all stakeholders should collaborate to promote the city and make efforts to reach out to more tourist. Tourism brochures should definitely be accessible to tourists and provide information that are essential for tourists such as inner and intercity transportation, foreign language option and accessibility to tourist attractions.

Keywords: Tourism Brochure, Tourism Promotion, City Tourism, Turkey’s Metropolitans.
REFERENCES
**The Need For A Tour Guide While The Cities Get Smarter**

**Grant Altay TAŞKIN**  
*Res. Assist., Aksaray University*  
grantaltaytaskin@hotmail.com

**ABSTRACT**

Nowadays one can easily understand that day by day we are becoming a part of the age of technology. Humans have accepted and allowed technology to do its own job. The way things are changing sometimes scares people but on the other hand it makes life easier. In certain countries artificial intelligence and robots started to appear in daily life and before anyone realises, they will become a part of our daily routine.

Some day we will only need to click a button and everything will happen for us. But clicking a button without seeing a face or hearing a voice is something totally different for us. The question is, do we like to get things done as quickly as possible or do we still look for communication.

The new trend in the tourism sector is the “Smart Tourism and Smart Destinations” which starts with giving you an idea of how and where to plan your holiday and travel. It also helps you with all other aspects throughout your vacation. These might be smart device applications like audio guidance, translation services, direction guidance, making reservations or augmented realities like pointing your phone towards the scene of the theatre and watch a gladiator fight.

Tour guides, who we call the ambassadors of tourism, may experience problems with the rate of technological development. Although, taking advantage of technology such as, navigator, smart phones, kindles, head sets, cameras, altimeters and many more makes the job easier for guides. So if the evolution of technology continues will there be any need for a tour guide?

The aim of this study is to determine if the job of the tour guide can survive the technological improvements or even get better and still be preferred by the tourists who are travelling to new places and new cultures. The methodology of the study is qualitative. A structured interview has been carried out. The sample of the group only includes tour guides over the age of 50. This is because they are near to retirement and don’t expect earning their living by guiding people anymore. So their opinions will be more appropriate compared to young guides who are at the beginning of their tour guiding lives and need this job for many years to come and would not like to lose the battle against technological improvements. Also the study will add some suggestions based on the results obtained from the analysis.

**Keywords:** Tour Guidance, Tour Guide, Smart Tourism, Smart Destination, Technology, Smart City.
Tracing Industrial Heritage: The Case Of Berlin Bicycle Route

Evinç DOĞAN
Assist. Prof. Dr., Akdeniz University
evinc.dogan@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The aim of this paper to investigate how the industrial heritage is represented on a cultural bicycle trail and used as a tool for constructing the tourist gaze. A qualitative case study methodology is used, where the analysis is twofold. A phenomenological approach is adopted at the first step. The bicycle route is explored to get first-hand experience and familiarize with the data in the physical urban context. The second step is the document analysis. Texts are collected and analysed for interpreting the meaning by digging deeper into socio-cultural context. The cycling route is a form of experience bridging the spatio-temporal gap between tangible heritage (monuments, landmarks) and intangible dimensions (symbols and meanings). The findings reveal shifts in meaning drawing on relations between the physical space and represented space. The cultural routes are of interest as innovative tourism products. They provide opportunities for creating a strong destination image. Therefore, this research provides an initial examination of the ways in which cultural routes can shape tourism experience. This exploratory research provides a framework to tackle with heritage and representation, while offering further avenues for investigating urban tourism where tourists can be co-creators for adding layers of meaning based on their personal experience. This helps increasing awareness about urban heritage and offers an alternative tourist gaze and perception.

Keywords: Berlin, Industrial Heritage Routes, Tourist Gaze, City Image, Urban Experience.
Analysis of Tourist Attraction of Brand Cities: The Cases of Antalya and St. Petersburg

Güneş SÜTÇÜ
Lect., Anadolu University
gunessutcu@anadolu.edu.tr

Oktay EMİR
Prof. Dr., Anadolu University
oktayemir@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Determining the contribution of branded cities to the tourism sector which provides an added value to the national economy is important in terms of socio-economic development. In this study, which is prepared with this perspective, Turkey and Russia cases are discussed comparatively. The framework of the study is determined as Antalya and St. Petersburg, which are defined as culture and art cities. It is aimed to obtain information about the current status of tourism in the tourism market by examining the contribution of the mentioned cities to tourism. The information about the cities is obtained by analyzing the data from Antalya Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism, Turkish Republic of Culture and Ministry of Tourism, Russian Federation Ministry of Culture, Tourism Data Bank June 2019 statistics. In the light of this information, the distinctive features of these cities which are prominent in tourist attraction have been identified.

Most of the tourists from Russia, Germany and Ukraine came to Antalya for the sea/coast; most of the tourists from Italy, France and Germany came to St. Petersburg for cultural tourism. As a result of this study, the importance of city branding had been tried to be highlighted through the two major tourist cities of Turkey and Russia.

Keywords: Brand City, Tourist Attraction, City Tourism, Antalya, Petersburg
Does The Destination Decision Of Inbound Tourists From Different Counters Affect Each Other? The Case Of Turkey

Selim YILDIRIM
Assoc. Prof. Dr., Anadolu University
selimy@anadolu.edu.tr

Burak EROĞLU
Assist. Prof. Dr., İstanbul Bilgi University
burak.eroglu@bilgi.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The study investigates whether the destination preferences of foreign tourists from different countries, which has chosen to come to Turkey, affect each other's decision. Cointegration analysis is employed for this purpose on time series of inbound tourist from various countries to Turkey during the period between 1996m10 - 2017m12. The findings shall be useful in promotion and advertising policies. If the preference of inbound tourists from two different countries to come to Turkey affect each other, the advertisement in these countries will have greater effect since the affect each other. Hence advertising in such country pairings will be more effective in the long run.
Not Every Small Hotel is a Boutique Hotel

Eda AVCI
Lect. Dr., Dokuz Eylul University
eda.avci@deu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Many industries have been affected by consumer demands and expectations that have been changed with postmodernism which become popular in the 1990s. Tourism, which is one of the important dynamics of the service industry, has also been affected by this change and businesses have adapted their products and services to the postmodern consumer. New investments in the tourism industry have also been made according to this change. Postmodern tourists traveling with the desire of self-actualization started to demand the unusual holiday preferences instead of the classic ones. The concept of “boutique hotel” which was first used by Steve Rubell in 1984, became popular with the effect of postmodernism in the 1990s. Today, the demand of boutique hotel which is an important part of the city tourism is increased by tourists who want to get rid of the limitations of daily life, seek flexibility, make changes in their lifestyle and desire freedom. The boutique hotels, which know their guests very well and provide services according to their personal preferences, offer memorable experiences to their guests with about 20 different concepts. When the related literature is examined, it is pointed out that there are many different approaches to the definition of boutique hotels. In Turkey, the obligations for obtaining a boutique hotel certificate are specified by the “Regulation on Certification and Qualifications of Tourism Facilities” and the boutique hotel certificate is given to hotels that have these qualifications. This situation causes concept confusion. The main purpose of this conceptual study is to clarify the concept of boutique hotel, to determine the difference between boutique hotel and small hotel, to draw attention to the problems of boutique hotel industry and to develop suggestions for the solution of the problems. In accordance with this purpose, the concept of boutique hotel, its history and development process, its value and importance for the hospitality industry, requirements for boutique hotel certificate and the problems caused by the sector have been examined within the scope of literature. Significant result obtained from the examination of the related regulations and the decisions of the Tourism Council in 2017 is most of the hotels presented as boutique have no certificate. This situation is caused by difficulties and even impossibilities of some of the conditions in the relevant regulation for boutique hotels. On the other hand, in order to benefit from the popularity of the concept, every small hotel whether suitable or not uses the title of boutique. This problem was also discussed in 2017 Tourism Council and emphasized that the re-arrangement of the requirement for the boutique hotel certificate within the scope of the related regulation can solve the problem. It is thought that the evaluations about the present situation and the future of boutique hotels that provide significant contributions to city tourism, will draw attention to the subject and contribute to the related literature with this study which aimed to draw attention to the problems of boutique hotel industry and to develop suggestions for the solution of the problems.

Keywords: Small hotels, Boutique hotels, Boutique hotel certificate, City tourism, Memorable experience.
ABSTRACT

Current research within the marketing literature has established that consumers do not buy goods based on the functionalities but increasingly are making choices based on experiences with the offers (Zarantonello, Schmitt, & Berndt, 2010). Hence, their satisfaction is largely dependent on experience with the brands in focus. Among the first to introduce experience concept to marketing literature were Holbrook and Hirschman, (1982) which has since gained popularity in various fields of study including consumer behavior (Holbrook & Addis, 2001), economics (Gilmore & Pine, 1998) and evidently marketing (Schmitt, 1999; Brakus et al., 2009).

Previous studies have established that the experiences consumers have with a brand do have effects on how loyal they get to the brand and their satisfaction levels (Brakus et al., 2009; Pine & Gilmore, 1999). Furthermore, with reference to previous researches (see Larsen & Ketelaar, 1991; Mooradian, 1996) the relationship between individual affective states and personality has been proven, thus it gives good ground to propose personality as a salient predictor of experiential consumption (Holbrook & Hirschman, 1982). In addition, the assumption that experiential consumption can be predicted by personality dimensions is strongly supported by research that has shown a strong relationship between sensation seeking behavior and personality dimensions (Aluja, García, & García, 2003). In addition, Gountas & Gountas, (2006) also established that personality orientations have a direct influence on the consumer’s evaluation of service satisfaction.

There have been little or no research done on whether the influence of consumer personality traits on the level of satisfaction is mediated by their experience with the brand. Based on the previous findings, this study aims to examine the relationship between consumer personality traits and brand experience whilst also using brand experience as a mediating factor between consumer personality traits and consumer satisfaction.

Data were collected via questionnaires administered online and offline to consumers who have patronized various brands in the hospitality service sector e.g. hotels, restaurants, airlines. The model was further tested utilizing structural equation modelling. Findings in the research indicated that brand experience partially mediated the effects of personality traits on consumer satisfaction whilst also establishing strong correlations between personality traits and brand experience. Overall, the research findings suggested that brand experience plays an important role in influencing consumer satisfaction and has strong correlations with personality traits.

This research contributes to extant literature on the influence of personality traits on consumers’ level of satisfaction and the role brand experience plays in mediating this effect.

Keywords: Personality Traits, Brand Experience, Satisfaction.
REFERENCES


Prediction of Number of Foreigners Visiting Turkey with LSTM and Feed-Forward Neural Networks

Baki ÜNAL
Assist.Prof.Dr., İskenderun Technical University
baki.unal@iste.edu.tr

Çağdaş Hakan ALADAĞ
Assoc. Prof.Dr., Hacettepe University
aladag@hacettepe.edu.tr

ABSTRACT
Tourism sector which has become one of the fastest developing sectors in the world economy is seen as a means of economic development for developing countries such as Turkey. In addition to its contribution to the national income, the tourism sector plays an important role in terms of the economy of the country with its foreign exchange income and its ability to eliminate foreign deficits and improve the balance of payments. With its feature of creating new employment opportunities, tourism is an important sector for countries with high unemployment. In Turkey, especially in terms of number of active foreign tourists, tourism showed a significant improvement since the 1980s. Prediction of number of foreigners visiting Turkey is important for policy makers, investors and businesses in tourism sector. Artificial neural networks are machine-learning models successfully used in many tasks including time series predictions. Feed-forward neural networks (FFNNs) are simplest types of artificial neural networks in which connections between the nodes do not form a cycle. Long short-term memory (LSTM) networks are recurrent neural network architectures in which connections between the nodes have feedback connections and cycles. This feature of LSTM networks makes LSTM architecture suitable for sequence learning. LSTM networks are successfully used in time series forecasting, speech recognition, handwriting recognition, human action recognition, grammar learning, robot control and music composition. In the study number of foreigners visiting Turkey was predicted with LSTM networks, FFNNs and Box-Jenkins model. Out-of-sample prediction performances of these models were compared with mean absolute percentage errors. Most accurate prediction performance was obtained with LSTM model.

Keywords: Neural Networks, Time Series Prediction, FFNN, LSTM.
Modelling Inbound Tourism Demand for Istanbul

Deniz GÖKTAŞ
Lect., Istanbul Gedik University
deniz.goktas@gedik.edu.tr

Dilara ORUÇ
Istanbul University
oruclidilara34@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Istanbul is among the ten most visited tourist destinations in the world. This study aims at estimating the tourism demand in Istanbul. Sample of the research consists of the top four countries that send the highest number of tourists to Istanbul. These countries are France, Germany, Russian Federation and the United Kingdom.

Based on the quarterly tourist arrival data for the period 2002:1-2017:4 it is possible to gauge information about the income and price elasticities of tourism demand by analysing the other variables used in this study. In tourism demand, the choice of a tourism destination is related to the relative price of tourism products in that destination compared to alternative destinations and income in tourism generating countries. ADLM Bound Test approach is applied as the empirical method in the study. ADLM procedure provides long term regression coefficients as well as long-term coefficients in time series models. In this respect, preliminary tests have been held for time series data. Income and price elasticities of demand for origin countries are analysed in the short-term and long-term, respectively. In line with the economic theory, it is expected that income and price elasticities of tourism demand is greater than one. Tourism is a luxury good and tourists are price sensitive consumers. When there are substitutes, price elasticity is high. However, as a city Istanbul has not a good substitute destination. Potential substitutes can be considered as imperfect substitutes. In order to capture substitution elasticities, price level of Greece is taken, since Athens can be substitute destination. Price index is created by exchange rate adjusted relative price level of countries. Qualitative effects are modelled as dummy variables. First qualitative variable is the effect of Global Economic Recession for all origin countries second qualitative variable is assigned for Russian Federation for the year 2015 which aircraft crises happened between Turkey and Russian Federation. Third qualitative variable controls the effect of 2016 coup plot and terror incidences. Regression results show that four lagged value of tourist arrivals is significant. This finding supports the “Word of Mouth” hypothesis. Long-term elasticity results reveal that German citizens do not consider Istanbul as a luxury tourism destination. For France, while the income effect is significant, the price elasticity of demand is insignificant. Both income and price elasticities are significant for the UK. For Russian Federation, demand is significant and consistent in the overall framework. Findings suggest that political instabilities have stronger effect on tourism than economic instabilities do.

Keywords: Tourism Demand Modelling, ARDL Bounds Testing, Tourism in Istanbul, Urban Tourism
Readiness the Small Town of Pangandaran – West Java, Indonesia, As a World-Class Tourist Destination

Heru Purboyo Hidayat PUTRO
Dr., Institut Teknologi Bandung
purboyohp@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The active development of national tourism can open opportunities for expansion and equitable employment, encourage the utilization of resources owned based on local wisdom that is characteristic of each region in Indonesia, including in terms of environmental preservation. Pangandaran Regency is one of the Indonesian National Tourism Strategic Areas (KSPN) based on the National Tourism Development Master Plan for 2010–2025 with tourist attractions based on the potential diversity and natural uniqueness of the coastal landscape. Based on the West Java Province Tourism Destination Development Plan prepared by West Java Government (2017), Pangandaran Small City Beach Recreational Tourism Area is a priority to be developed as tourist destination that have world-class service standards. To achieve those standards, the use of natural resources must be supported by good human resources in order to create sustainable tourism. The consequences of tourism development on the natural environment itself can occur in the physical environment, ecological environment, the resources used by humans and the values of quality of life.

The number of tourists visiting Pangandaran is increasing from 2,024,026 in 2017 to 2,827,426 in 2018. The tourists come to visit the areas directly adjacent to the sea and has the most visited tourist attraction to date, namely Pangandaran Beach. Area of Pangandaran is 7 square kilometre with its population 11 thousand people. In this area, there are 191 lodging facilities which have 2,979 room units of various types. The growing number of tourists is also followed by the increasing number of hotels, the greater the utilization of water resources and the generation of garbage or waste resulting from human activities. For this reason, it should be the responsibility of the government, private sector such as lodging business owners and all parties that produce waste must manage their waste with the best possible system so that it does not cause environmental pollution. As a world-class tourist destination based on the vision of Pangandaran Regency and West Java Government, several standards are needed to be met by the Pangandaran Beach Recreational Tourism Area. Sustainable environment is one component of the aspect of the wealth of natural and cultural resources in determining the competitiveness of world-class tourist destinations. In this paper Pangandaran's readiness as a world-class tourist destination be approached based on the study of the amenities and waste generated in Pangandaran Small City. The results of field observations and preliminary analyzes are the amenity increases rapidly and it was not followed by good waste management. Garbage and puddles of liquid waste are still on the road and open space. This deficiency is one that must be solved to make Pangandaran small city become a world-class tourist location.

Keywords: Small Town, World-Class Tourist Destination, Planning, Sustainability, Indonesia
Urban Tourism Development Through Creative Economy and Green Tourism: The Case of Jakarta

Rusdi ABBAS  
Dr., Universitas Pertamina  
rusdiabbas@marun.edu.tr

Dzikri Abdul AZIS  
Universitas Pertamina  
abdulazis.dzikri@gmail.com

Heri KURNIAWAN  
Universitas Pertamina  
herikurniawan1484@gmail.com

Rahmadha Akbar SYAH  
Universitas Pertamina  
rahmadhaakbar@gmail.com

Arinda SHABRINA  
Universitas Pertamina  
arindasabrinamay@gmail.com

Dianissa SCHEHERAZADE  
Universitas Pertamina  
sheraaazd@gmail.com

Zaki Khudzaifi MAHMUD  
Universitas Pertamina  
work.khudzaifi@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Cities are the most important tourism destination in the world. As a world tourism phenomenon, cities are seen as a complex process related to culture, lifestyle, and a different set of requests for holidays and travel. Tourism objects and tourist attractions are the basis for tourism, without the presence of tourist attractions certainly in the development will experience obstacles. Urban tourism has other distinctive characteristics, different from tourism in general, whose tourist attraction is intended only for those who travel. Urban tourists use urban facilities that are also used by city dwellers as a tourist attraction.

The economic impact of tourism activities or various economic activities can be grouped into three categories, namely direct, indirect and continued benefits. The priority concept that can be optimized in the city of Jakarta today is urban ecotourism. That's because Jakarta requires a unique appeal and requires a better green environment. This research study focuses on the condition of the city of Jakarta and the impact of urban tourism on the local economy. The method used is the descriptive method. By sampling methods Quota sampling techniques using Sampling Insidental election. In assessing the perception of using Rating Scale and analyzing the economic impact. The results of this research are the development strategy of urban ecotourism area which the order of priorities is the quality of human resource development, urban planning, regulations, integrated transportation, and services. Results are expected to be used as input to government policymakers, private sector and investors in developing tourism.

Keywords: Urban Tourism, Development, Economic Impact
Revisiting the Old Issue: Workplace Incivility and Employee Emotional Exhaustion

Uju Violet ALOLA  
Dr., Istanbul Gelisim University  
ualo@gelisim.edu.tr

Andrew Adewale ALOLA  
Dr., Istanbul Gelisim University  
aadewale@gelisim.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The effect of incivility on employee’s psychological wellbeing has attracted attention, bringing scholars from different fields. Customer and supervisor incivility remains a serious issue where cases of uncivil behaviour are becoming burdensome to organizations. Such behaviour continues to accumulate costs in the hospitality industry and remains the influencing factors for employees’ emotional exhaustion. For instance, the effects of uncivil act is evident in frontline employees, in the manufacturing industry (Wu et al., 2012), in restaurants (Han, Bonn, & Cho, 2016), property-management companies (Miner et al., 2012), universities (Sliter, Sliter, & Jex, 2012), hotels (Alola et al., 2019; Alola, Avci, & Ozturen, 2018), health sector (Trudel & Reio, 2011), and the financial sector (Abubakar et al., 2018). Incivility is a rude, insensitive deviant behaviour, either verbal or non-verbal, targeted toward another person to cause deliberate harm. The Nigerian hotel industry is not an exemption to cases of uncivil behaviour, as constantly is becoming the order of the day in the hospitality industry. This study draws from the Conservation of Resource Theory (COR) (Hobfoll, 2002) to investigate the objectives. The study aims to verify the effects of customer incivility (CUST) and supervisor incivility (SUPE) on hotel frontline employee’s turnover intention (TOIN) and job satisfaction (JSAT) through the mediating effect of emotional exhaustion (EXXT). The study applied a total of 328 questionnaires from frontline employees of four- and five-star hotels in Nigeria, specifically in the commercial city of Lagos and the national capital Abuja. The sample size was determined according to the researcher’s judgment since there was no available data to determine the survey population (Darvishmotevali, Arasli, & Kilic, 2017). The judgmental sampling method is the method appropriate for the study. Twelve hypotheses were developed for the study. The study will apply SPSS and AMOS 20.0 statistical software in conducting the analyses. Ten hypotheses were accepted, two hypotheses were rejected. Surprisingly, there was no mediating effect of emotional exhaustion on customer and supervisor incivility and JSAT. The researchers suggest effective managerial framework like employee and customer training to combat incivility in the hotel industry. The study applies a cross-sectional data collection style, therefore, generalizing the findings of this study should be done with caution.

Keywords: Customer and Supervisor Incivility, Emotional Exhaustion, Turnover Intention, Job Satisfaction, Nigeria
ABSTRACT

This study aims to contribute to the urban food tourism literature by advancing an understanding of how street food vending reveals processes of ‘place-making’ that shape the social, political, economic and cultural landscape of London as a developed urban city as well as a thriving marketplace empowered by its rich multicultural food culture and one of the world’s leading tourism destinations.

Street vending is a widespread practice in densely populated areas in both developing and developed countries (Bhowmik, 2010; Bromley, 2000). Street food vending forms a source of income and employment for vendors (who often operate within the informal economy), as a result of the lack of barriers to employment (Burnett and Newman, 2014). It is generally assumed that the demand for street food is fuelled by a fundamental need to provide necessary sustenance in an economical manner (Sharit and Bhowmik, 2005). This study focuses on the unprecedented consumption of street food predicated on experiential and hedonistic fulfilment (Holbrook and Hirschman, 1982). In line with this approach, London street food markers are chosen as a context. The scene of street food markets in London different than traditional street markets of developing countries. In London, food vendors also attract travellers, tourists, shoppers, students, worshippers – all of whom harbour different culinary preference and perceptions of street-food. Long (1998) observes how culinary tourists seek to experience the cultural ‘other’ through food as a hedonic pursuit involving the thrill of the unknown.

I will adopt Lefebvre’s (1991), Social Production of Space to examine street food vending as a theoretical framework. While I apply this triplite to this study, I position social-spatial practice to see how street vending produces and reproduces daily social relations and experiences between vendors and various stakeholders; representations of space to understand the ways in which council and urban planners represent London; representational space to examine how the symbolic meaning and images are lived and subverted by vendors and its various stakeholders.

Ethnography is used for this study, and I aim to understand movement concerning mind, body and the environment with the help of interviews, mobile methods and sensory participant observation.

To sum up, in this study, I explore how the social relations between different stakeholders are spatially played out. I aim to find out the multilayer of meaning and use of space by various stakeholders and how these meanings and uses contests with each other by using ethnographic methods.

REFERENCES


Horizontal Individualism, Authenticity and International Tourist Behaviors

Hakan SEZEREL
Assist.Prof.Dr., Anadolu University
hakansezerel@anadolu.edu.tr

Deniz KARAGÖZ
Assist.Prof.Dr., Anadolu University
dkaragoz@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

despite, the four decades passed till the first attempts to adopt authenticity to tourism discipline, (Maccanell, 1973), the authenticity is still a current issue which Urry (1990) states its pivotal role in tourism literature. Authenticity is defined with notions, namely, being real, reliable, original, direct, and genuine. (Ram et. al, 2016:111). In other words, it is an experience which individual is seeking to interact with their Being via themselves, objects, and their experiences surrounding them (Knudsen et al, 2016). In tourism literature, seeking for new experiences and authenticity theoretically is related to high degrees of individualism (Kim ve Lee, 2000:157; Yeoman et al., 2007: 1131-1132, Peterson, 2005). Additionally, the tendency to be an authentic tourist is also related to individualism (Yeoman et al., 2007:1131). Tourists demand on the products and services which provide a sense of identity and self-realization. This tendency becomes stronger gradually in generations (Peterson, 2005:1094).

Besides the universal values, the cultural context that the tourists are embedded makes an impact on tourism involvement. In other respects, the empirical research on the cultural context of authenticity in the tourism literature was missing. This paper attempts to fill this specific literature gap by examining the effects of individualist values on authenticity perceptions of tourists. Relying on Triandis’s (2001) individualism dimensions, a theoretical model was designed. The model depends on how individuals perceive their positions in their embodied values. A significant attribute which distinguishes several types of individualism is the positions towards power. The horizontal cultures focus on equality when the vertical cultures emphasize on hierarchies. Therefore, in horizontal individualism, “all people are equal” and “every individual is unique”. However, in vertical individualism, the differentiation and “being the best” are the main values (Triandis, 2001: 36). To that end, a structural equation model was designed and analyzed via the data obtained from 674 international tourists who visited Cappadocia Region. When the demographic and descriptive analysis was done by SPSS 16.0, SmartPLS 3.1 was employed to analyze the theoretical construction. We found that individualistic values have an impact on both the object-based and existentialist authenticity perceptions of tourists. Additionally, the paper reports the effects of authenticity on tourist satisfaction and the satisfaction predicted the behavioral intentions of tourists.

This study contributes the literature by suggesting the cross-cultural context of authenticity which is not undertaken via empirical research previously. Findings indicate the horizontal individualism predicts authenticity perceptions. Accordingly, interacting with oneself and tourism products with a sense of autonomy makes an impact on one’s perception of authenticity. The results suggest that planning and managing cultural sites highly depend on cross-cultural behavior. The authorities might retain the importance of individualism vs. collectivism when providing touristic goods and services.

Keywords: Individualism, Authenticity, Cross-Cultural Behaviors
The Core Principles for an Effective City Tour Design

Orhan YABANCI
Res.Assist.Dr., Eskisehir Osmangazi University
oyabanci@ogu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Travel is a service-intensive business that contributes to both global and local economies. As to the World Tourism Organization, the international tourist arrivals reached over a billion. These arrivals are fulfilled by various travel and tour companies that make billions of dollars in annual revenue. The conspicuous economy is generated through the close collaboration of the stakeholders, particularly tour companies, hotels, governments, scholars, and local vendors.

One cannot deny the contribution of city tours to the striking success of the travel industry. A city tour is one of the main types of tours that refers to the travel organization designed to make people experience the good vibes of a city. This concept is worth studying as being a contributor to economic growth.

A successful city tour thrives on strong design. A well-cultivated design is essential for good moments of truth during touring activity. Henceforth, one should ponder the principles for a quality city tour design from both theoretical and practical perspectives. In conclusion, there are some concise inferences to consider when designing an effective tour described as follows;

— *Putting security first*; pin security on the forefront of the agenda as it is one of the main concerns of life. Avoid congested areas as much as possible for the sanity of both tourists and the residents. Areas of crowds, public protests or upheavals might engage the tourist group in turmoil or even a terror attack.

— *Learning from the past*; infer from the past. Learn from previous experience, whether a failure or a success, to improve and maintain future tour organizations.

— *Employing talents*; people are the most critical source for organizational activity. Hence, hire competent people and build agile teams to carry out challenging tour operations.

— *Following the dynamics*; plan the tour by considering the specific dynamics of the city such as traffic, crowded areas, urban entertainment districts, local social life, and regulations.

— *Discovering the spirit*; design the tour to consist with the vibration of the city, so that it creates unique moments of truth in due course. For example, it should make a tourist remark — “Now, I testify that this city is something special.”

— *Being peculiar*; every city has its distinctive features that no other city can imitate. Therefore find the most authentic assets of the city and have them as aces in the hole of the program.

— *Being tourist-centric*; never ignore the expectations of the tourist group. Tailor the tour to the common inclinations of the group so that it conforms well to their expectations.

— *Playing fair*; be responsible for the service you provide. Care for your customers. Further, represent the destination as much as it deserves.

— *Marketing matters*; marketing is at the core of many businesses and no exception for travel. Hence, find the potential strengths of the city and promote them for commercial use.

**Keywords**: City Tour, City Tour Design, Core Principles
Which European Union Countries Turkey is similar in Hosting Foreign Tourists

Selim YILDIRIM
Assoc. Prof. Dr., Anadolu University
selimy@anadolu.edu.tr

Burak EROĞLU
Assist. Prof. Dr. İstanbul Bilgi University
burak.eroグル@bilgi.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

This study investigates quantitatively which European Union (EU) countries as well as Turkey have similar structure in the tourism sector. The study employs time series clustering methods on the data set, which has monthly frequency, composed of foreigners’ arrivals at tourist accommodation establishments in EU countries. Although the topic is interesting by itself, the findings have a practical use. It will provide information about who is the fiercest competition of whom in attracting foreign tourists for EU countries. In that regard the study will also provide quantitative information on the closest competitor of Turkey for the foreign tourists. Hence policy makers in Turkey may find it easier to develop tourism polices to increase Turkey’s international competitiveness in this sector.
Winter and Urban Tourism Duality Under Climate Change: Case of Erzurum, Turkey

Neslihan KULÖZÜ UZUNBOY  
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Atatürk University  
nkulozu@ataturk.edu.tr

Osman Cenk DEMİROĞLU  
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Umeå University  
cenk.demiroglu@umu.se

ABSTRACT

This study aims to assess the future climates of Palandöken Ski Resort, one of Turkey’s largest and oldest, and the City of Erzurum, a historical town dating back to 4000 BC on the ancient Silk Road. Ski tourism is under major threat due to spatiotemporal shrinkage of snow cover. Such effect negatively influences natural snow reliability, hence the financial/economic viability, of ski destinations. To cope with this, many ski area operators worldwide have started to install snowmaking systems. However such measure comes with high financial costs and increased environmental footprints as well as technical limitations due to snow production impracticability at high wet bulb temperatures. Therefore, other adaptation strategies need to be considered and diversification of the tourism product is a good alternative for vulnerable destinations. In this sense, as an alternative/supplement to winter tourism, usually urban tourism does not offer a good offer as ski resorts are usually located at remote areas at very high altitudes. However, some resorts are most fortunate due to their immediate proximity to city centers with a strong urban tourism potential as in the case of Palandöken, Erzurum. In order to utilize urban tourism as an alternative/supplement, the climatic comfort for urban sightseeing should be assessed in addition to snow reliability assessments for winter tourism. For this purpose, the Mountain Tourism Meteorological and Snow Indicators (MTMSI) and the Holiday Climate Index (HCI:Urban) projections of the recently launched Copernicus Climate Change Service (C3S) European Tourism are utilized. The MTMSI application provides the user with historical and future skiable snow durations per 100 m elevation at the NUTS 3 level while the HCI:Urban application displays the climatic suitability of European towns for urban tourism for each of the four seasons. In this study, the seasonal HCI:Urban climatologies of the City of Erzurum are coupled with the snow reliability projections of Palandöken Ski Resort. The results indicate whether the climatic comfort for urban sightseeing outplays ski tourism as an alternative for the winter season and/or complements the main ski product for year-round tourism throughout the 21st century and according to different Representative Concentration Pathways (RCPs).

Key words: Winter Tourism, Urban Tourism, Ski Resort, Climate Services, Climate Change Adaptation, Erzurum

This study is part of the project “Determination of Climate Change Adaptation Strategies for Winter Tourism in Erzurum with a Participatory Approach” (Grant no. 118K191) funded by the Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey (TÜBİTAK). The authors would like to thank TÜBİTAK for their support.
Destination Perceptions and the Relation Between Satisfaction and Repurchase Behaviour

İbrahim ÇETİN
Assoc. Prof., Akdeniz Üniversitesi
ibrahimcetin01@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

This paper reviews the literature and identifies city characteristics as a new developing destination. Also it is a primary research. The purpose of this research is based on the evolution of city characteristics of Van which became a popular destination especially for Iranian tourists visiting in recent five years. Hence, the study analyses the destination characteristics and investigates the perceptions of Iranian tourists with relation among characteristics, satisfaction and repurchase behaviour. Research was conducted in 2017 in Van and data collected by the questionnaire form which contains the statements in Likert scale (5) derived from the literature. 400 questionnaire were distributed to the tourists originally from Iran and face to face contacted. Only 370 form returned and 292 of those questionnaire forms were considered for statistical analysis since some statements were not fill in. The form and statement were translated by an expert into Persian from Turkish. Reliability and factor analysis has been found reliable and satisfactory. Some statements which has weak factor loads were eliminated from the scale and then statistical analysis were implemented. Natural, historical, social cultural values and distance from origin place were found the most significant elements of city tourism. At the end of the statistical analysis it has been found that the results showed the significantly correlated among some dimensions. Also it has been found that a significant regression among satisfaction and other dimensions in addition to the significant regression impacts of satisfaction and attractions on repurchase behaviour of tourists.

Keywords: Destination Marketing, Customer Behaviours, Customer Satisfaction
The Contribution of Opet Respect to History Project, An Unique Social Responsibility Project, to Historical, Social and Cultural Change in Gallipoli Peninsula and Its Effect on Domestic Tourism

Burhan SAYILIR
Assoc. Prof., Anadolu University
burhansayilir@gmail.com

Ferdi BOZKURT
Assist.Prof.Dr., Anadolu University
ferdib@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT
Respect to History Project was launched in 2006 to meet the basic needs of the visitors and to modernise the territory by protecting the nature of Gallipoli Peninsula.

The Project includes modernising, development and arrangement of the villages where the Gallipoli Campaign took place. This territory is among the unique national parks where there are residential areas and 24-hour daily rural life continues. Alçitepe, Seddülbahir, Bigalı, Kilitbahir, Kocadere, Behramlı, KüçükAnafarta and BüyükAnafarta villages and Eceabat county have obtained new cultural, social, and economical opportunities within the scope of the project.

It can be claimed that the project was based on these following basic corner stones. As for cultural purposes, the maintenance and restoration of historical artefacts, betterment of martyrs’ cemetery, preparing printed and visual materials for promotion; as for social purposes, organizing training sessions for local habitants to improve their opinions about tourism, improving the physical environments of the tradesmen, efforts to integrate women into social life; as for economical purposes, enabling local people obtain a new income opportunity thanks to the visitors of culturally enhanced territory. Moreover, the project has also helped to improve the income level of the local habitants by providing opportunities for selling handicrafts and agricultural products, by promoting boarding houses and especially women entrepreneurship. There were also things done to meet the basic needs of the people such as resting, health and cleaning within the scope of the project. Sustainability is among the basics of the project. Therefore, the territory is continuously controlled and the shortcomings are overcome. The process has enabled the local habitants to improve their service standards thanks to the income they obtained from the tourism. Thus the local habitants provide higher quality service to the visitors.

Respect to History Project, has increased the quality of social life in the territory, has raised historical consciousness, has enriched the cultural life, and has brought athermal and hygienic characteristics to the social buildings in the territory. The project has also improved the shopkeeping culture, raised the economical level, contributed to multi-directional improvement of educational institutions and improved the aesthetic-architectural culture.

Keywords: Gallipoli campaign, Gallipoli, Respect to history project, Opet.
The Relationship Between Economic Policies and Tourism Policies in Turkey

İnci Oya COŞKUN
Asst. Prof., Anadolu University
ioyazicilar@anadolu.edu.tr

Fırat ÇİFTÇİ
firatciftci36@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The interaction between economic and political decisions taken by countries for various purposes, and the regulations made within the scope of fiscal and monetary policies have an impact on the tourism industry as well as in all economic areas. Therefore, the aim of this study is determined to evaluate the relationship between economic and tourism policies. The republican era was discussed in five periods. In Atatürk period (1923-1938), the basic economic policy is the foundation of the republic and economic independency. In this era, tourism policy was based on the governmental and managerial organization and promotion of the industry. After the II. World War (1940-1960), Turkey applied conservative economic policies and at the same time attempted to implement liberalization. The government has worked to improve travel opportunities and increase investments in tourism. In 1963, Turkey started to prepare central development plans and implement policies through these plans. In the first period of central planning (1960-1980), main concern was planned development on the economy side, and boosting number of tourists to increase tourism revenues on the tourism side. In the period of 1980-2000, liberalization was in the center of economic policies. Along this era, the government implemented policies to increase investments, number of tourists and tourism revenues in tourism. After 2000, the central planning approached changed from strict planning to a more flexible, necessity based strategic approach. Turkey started the EU harmonization process and prepared a special plan for the 100. anniversary of the republic to improve tourism activities. To investigate the relationship between economic and tourism policies, tourism investments, as the most concrete reflection of economic policies on tourism policies were analyzed based on these eras. Bai-Perron (BP) and Carrion-i Silvestre (CiS) multiple structural breaks tests were employed to analyze the number of accommodation establishments and the number of beds for both tourism investment and tourism operation licensed investments by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, in addition to the total number of establishments and beds using yearly data for the period 1970-2018. All the series show multiple structural breaks, some at the times of policy shifts, and some after widespread economic crises. Structural break dates obtained from the BP test were interpreted within the framework of the policies for the relevant period and recommendations were discussed.

Keywords: Economic policy, Tourism policy, Structural breaks, Bai-Perron, Carrion-i Silvestre.

1 This study was produced from Fırat Çiftçi’s master’s thesis and supported by Anadolu University Scientific Research Projects Commission under the grant no: 1709E496.
A Trip to Bursa: A Multi-Sensory Experience

Ebru GÖKDAĞ
Assoc. Prof., Anadolu University
egokdag@anadolu.edu.tr

Özge BOZDOĞAN
Res. Assist., Anadolu University
ozgebozdogan@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Planning a strategy to attract visitors to a destination, whether resort, city, region, or country by applying the appropriate marketing concepts is called the marketing of tourism. When marketing a product, the focus is placed on the “four P’s” of product, place, price and promotion. Yet these four P’s cannot be used as a standard strategy for marketing a city. Because only by travelling, a city can be experienced or consumed as a product since the product is also the place. Yet travelling takes considerable time and money. Thus, if the positive image of the city is not communicated effectively, people won’t take the risk of visiting. That’s why it is suggested that when developing a marketing plan to attract tourists, the emphasis must be equally on developing the city as a product/place worth visiting and also promoting what the city has to offer. There are many ideas in the literature on how to package and brand a city as a tourist product by using a city’s already existing tourist attractions, distinctive cultural features, natural beauty, and/or heritage. These unique features, plus the available tourist services/event creates the image of the city. This image has to include beauty, excitement, the lifestyles, ethnic culture, values of its inhabitants. In short this entire experience must be promoted when marketing a city.

This study which is a practice-based research inquires how this can be achieved? Can we create a product/event that will provide people with a multiple sensory experiencing of a city, before the people actually visit the city? How is it possible to compose multiple sensory encounters creating an experience of living the colors, sounds, tastes, smells of a city and initiating a positive memory about a city before people decide to visit the city? “A Trip to Bursa: A Multi-Sensory Experience” is the result of our inquiry.

Keywords: Marketing of tourism, Marketing a city, City as a product, Multi-sensory experience, Bursa.
Agri-Tourism Potential of Gazipaşa as an Alternative to Urban Tourism

Gözdegül BAŞER
Assist.Prof.Dr., Antalya Bilim University
gozdegu.baser@antalya.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Tourists travel for many reasons as they are attracted by many historical, natural, socio-cultural attributes of tourism destinations. Tourism is a global industry with an average growth rate of 3.9% on the global arena (World Travel and Tourism Council, 2019). Majority of tourism activities take place in big cities which are mostly investigated under urban tourism research. Urban tourism has taken attention since the past 20 years as a field of academic studies (Ashworth and Page, 2011). This progress can prevail theoretical debates as well as practical research incrementally. The high urbanization rates may be one of the reasons for the rapid increase in urban tourism research globally. As an example, in 2018, 55.3% of the world’s population lived in cities, whereas for Turkey, this figure is reported as 75% (World Bank, 2019). However, tourism activities need to provide alternative and sustainable varities. Agri-tourism (or namely agro-tourism) is one of the sustainable tourism alternatives. Agricultural tourism has many environmental benefits such as the protection of rural areas and natural resources, the promotion of environmentally friendly agricultural practices and the improvement of agricultural production (Barbieri 2013; Brown and Reeder 2007; Che et al. 2005). Phillip et al. (2010) states that agricultural activities for tourists can be examined in various levels. The levels may be passive as an observer of agri-cultural activities or direct or indirect involvement. Agri-cultural tourism involves a wide variety of activities and can be combined with other forms of tourism as a package. In addition, agricultural tourism can be considered as one of the important alternatives of sustainable tourism.

Gazipaşa district of Antalya, Turkey has mainly an agricultural economy. Although being in proximity to tourism destinations and governing natural, historical, cultural attractions, Gazipaşa preserved its originality in its traditions and agriculture and has not progressed in terms of tourism. Gazipaşa is only 44 km. away from Alanya which is a very popular tourism district located in Antalya province. The district was declared as a tourism zone in 1989 and Gazipaşa airport was put into operation (Aşık, 2016). This research aims to find out the agri-cultural potential of Gazipaşa. The research is designed as a qualitative methodology. Two focus group studies are made with a total of 17 farmers. Semi-structured interviews are made with government officers as well as civil society organization authorities. The results point out an important potential to be developed with many factors to be considered. The farmers are mostly willing to be involved in agri-cultural activities, however they need information as well as better infrastructure. There may be u-pick activities and participation in village life. More festivals can be organized in addition to the current pomegranate festival. Some of the farmers are not in favor of offering home accomodation whereas some of them are willing to host tourists. Governmental officers mention the need for accomodation availabilities and think that agri-tourism can only be developed in presence of other hotels. The paper presents detailed information related to the agri-cultural potential of Gazipaşa. The findings may help for the future strategies to be followed.

Keywords: Agri-tourism, Sustainability, Rural Development, Gazipaşa, Tourism Policy.

REFERENCES

ABSTRACT

In this study, a qualitative evaluation was made based on some examples. There are numerous travel writings, travel narratives, travel programs and geography and cultural documentaries in the media. The media is very interested in tourism and has positive or negative contributions to the media. This study discusses the productions of the so-called media on tourism and tourism issues and draws attention to the positive and negative messages of the media that affect tourism. In the modern era fed by popular culture, the most common and effective instruments of communication and entertainment are the media. Media is usually composed of newspapers, magazines, radio, television and the internet. People follow the developments in their immediate surroundings, countries, the world and the universe through the media, as well as sharing via the internet and satisfying their egos. The media includes everything from politics to economy, from private lives to global problems. Tourism is one of the most profitable sectors of the modern era. Millions of people around the world are constantly traveling and exploring tourist areas. The main sources of information for people interested in tourism are brochures, promotional films, especially the internet and other tools. The media are the main reference and information sources of the modern era. People often turn to the media to have information and ideas on different topics. Media are the most common instruments of popular culture and all popular topics. Media has the opportunity to collect and convey a wide range of information and impressions through its wide networks. The media is often interested in tourism and tourist attractions because of it is a popularity. Television, which is the most watched media, frequently introduces touristic regions, features interesting cultures and traditions, and shows delicious food and localities. Some travel publications in the media, memories from different regions, history and culture publications, curiosity and interest in people. People who are interested in different cultures, geographies, different traditions and especially local tastes participate in tourism activities. Different geographies, different cultures, interesting traditions, tastes that have never been tasted attract almost everyone’s interest and create the desire to experience these experiences. National and local governments, which constantly promote publicity to stimulate tourism movements for national and regional gain, often use the media. Tourism is one of the sectors that earn a lot without spending much money. In this context, the influence of the media is undoubtedly strong and every organization tries to benefit from the media. The most easily accessible media, the internet and television, are the instruments that attract the most geography, culture and food that attract people. On the Internet, people share their travel experiences, especially attractive photos also contribute to tourism movements. Although the negative comments shared on the internet also adversely affect the tourism movements, they make the tourism shares realistic and cause the business owners to correct the mistakes. The horrific events in the news broadcasts, clashes, wars, rights violations, improper images and dirty spaces are the messages that adversely affect the tourism movements. The news and publications about negative events in a country, instability, strained diplomatic relations, violent behaviors towards foreigners, religious and racial bigotry, cultural problems directly affect tourism. Tourism is the sector where security and peace are the primary condition, where tourists seek safe places and peace, and want to relax and have fun. Every publication that violates security and peace in the media has a negative impact on tourism.

Key Words: Tourism, Media, Broadcast, Internet, Attraction.
An Oasis in a Complex World: Slow Cities

Fulden Nuray KÜÇÜK ERGEN
Res.Assist., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
fuldengural@gazi.edu.tr

Cemal Ersin SILIK
Res.Assist.Dr., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
cemalersin.silik@gazi.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

As a center of economy and management, cities have a historical and cultural past as old as the transition to the settled life of mankind. Throughout history, cities have been the center of societies' change and social and economic life. The constant change of social and economic life leads to the corruption of the social and cultural fabric of the cities, and also leads to the globalization of other cities. Globalization forces people to work harder, to produce more and consume more. This rapidity not only shapes the economic life but also ensures that the social, cultural and environmental dynamics of cities are aligned according to the rapidity phenomenon.

Rapidity is a concept against which the concept of calm is opposed and it is thought that this understanding has emerged from the idea that it constitutes an atmosphere of turmoil in the world. However, in many settlements where globalization and rapidity cannot be achieved, calmness is seen as a routine of life. The reason for this is that in these regions, rapid living, emerging as a natural pressure of globalization, the dependence on technology, the examples that constitute the majority of life are at the lowest level, and having a comfortable and calm environment which is a part of traditional life can be prioritized.

This study aims to examine the importance of the slow city concept considering the fact that the world is under pressure for a fast development, globalization and standardization. This study has a potential to show that slow city can be a tool to solve economic, social and environmental problems stemming from globalization. In other words, focusing on the tenets of slow city, this study will reveal an alternative model to fast growing and globalization in the context of cities.

This study is based on an extensive literature review. According to literature review, it can be briefly stated that Slow City (Cittaslow) is an alternative sustainable urban model developed for cities that are based on the quality of life and do not reach a certain size in order to prevent globalization, the texture of cities, the standardization of lifestyle and local characteristics, and to realize the environmentally sensitive and tourism-based local development. Slow city movement represents resistance to globalization. Slow living; slowly rushing, with the way the Latin people used it, Speed is moving away from the self and slowness gets closer to itself, and thanks to the possibilities of today and the future, means to benefit from the heritage and accumulation of the past.
Pastry (Borek) Culture in Uzbek Tatars: Böğrüdelik Village Sample

Nisa Nur KAYA
ozbudaknisanur@gmail.com

Osman GÜLDEMİR
Lect. Dr., Anadolu University
osmanguldemir@gmail.com

Nermin IŞIK
Assist. Prof. Dr., Selcuk University
nermin@selcuk.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Tatars who came to Turkey years ago, and settled in many different regions have a rich culinary culture. The inhabitants lived in the Omsk region of Siberia, were forced to emigrate during the tsarist Russia. They settled in Konya in 1910. They are called Uzbek in Turkistan, Sibirek or Buharins of Siberia, also called Tatars in Turkey. The majority of the food consumed by Tatars as they migrate from cold countries consists of pastry foods.

The aim of this study is to investigate the pastries which are indispensable tastes of Uzbek Tatars living in Böğrüdelik neighborhood of Cihanbeyli district of Konya. The study was conducted with qualitative research method. Face-to-face interviews were conducted with five source people who lived in Böğrüdelik neighborhood or who had lived for a long time before. Previously prepared questions about some of the local pastries were asked to the source persons. Interviews were analyzed and reported. In the scope of this study; “beliç”, “beremiç”, “kaysıbörek” and “bavursak” pastry are investigated. It is understood from these pastries that “beliç” is made on special occasions and invitations. “Bavursak” is held every holiday (bairam). Tatars living in the neighborhood of Böğrüdelik do not only make pastries on special occasions but also any time. In addition, it was found that there were families who consumed pies once a week or ten days. As a matter of fact, it can be said that pastries are important for Tatar folks. So much so that they did not marry the girl who used to able to cook 50 kinds of pastry in Siberia. The country (Siberia) was very cold. That’s why they always put meat in the pies. When they had fried meat and pastry, they never got cold. Furthermore, the preparation of pastries requires many people. It strengthens communication between women cooking or baking and provides social solidarity. This makes it easier for single male mothers to see the skills of young girls. This division of labor is still continuing at the weddings of Böğrüdelik village. Especially for the production of “beliç” women come together in the village to help the wedding owner and prepare the “beliç”. “Beremiç (peremeç)” is cooked in two ways as fermented and unfermented. According to sources, it is seen that there is a “peremeç” prepared with potatoes. In this way, the potatoes are peeled, washed and boiled. Mashed potatoes are cooked. Add the onions that fried in oil. It is fried in oil as in meat “peremeç”; “Beliç” pastry is cooked in the ovens designed by the villagers. “Beliç” is an Uzbek pastry is cooked from unfermented dough consisting of beef and rice. It is served as a main course at Tatar weddings in Böğrüdelik village. It is defined as a pie that is baked in the oven by opening the dough with one or more kinds of material and covering it with the dough again.

In the following studies, it is recommended to make standardization in touristic facilities and to carry out educational activities.

Keywords: Tatar cuisine, Uzbek foods, Pastry, Borek, Gastronomy.
The Impact of Architectural Heritage on the Tourism: The Case of Walled City of Famagusta, Cyprus

Nazife ÖZAY
Assist.Prof.Dr., Eastern Mediterranean University
nazife.ozay@emu.edu.tr

Maryam GHASEMI
Res.Assist., Eastern Mediterranean University
maryam.ghasemi@cc.emu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Today, people are travelling to different countries and their variable cities for the touristic purposes. Each person is enjoying from different types of tourism such as environmental, cultural, health, adventure, recreational and religious. According to the peoples' expectations, particular destinations can be selected. When they are visiting new places, tourists are supposed to learn about the different cultures and their historic and cultural heritages. Thus, heritage tourism is one of the most preferred types of the tourism. It contains natural, historic and cultural resources of countries. Cultural heritage is one of the most significant values of a country, which is the reflection of its history, culture and architecture. During the history, under the influence of the changing political, socio-cultural, economic factors, the cultural heritage has been composed layer by layer. Governments and people of countries have been making efforts to preserve cultural heritage. This attempt is very important for carrying the cultural heritage to the future. Architectural buildings and monuments are most important resources of countries, which creates the significant part of the tangible cultural heritage and reflect about their background. Historical buildings and monuments, which are the mirrors of a country, also constitute its identity. Thus, the conservation of them has a great importance for the promotion of the countries and marketing of their cities. Nowadays, different countries in the world are in deep studies to create some policies for renovation, restoration or re-functioning of the historic buildings to re-use in the contemporary period. These efforts can change the quality of the cities and increase the tourist attraction in the old and historic parts.

Famagusta is a city close to the Mediterranean Sea, which is located on the east coast of Cyprus. The history of the city goes back to 274 BC. Famagusta harbor was one of the most important ports of the ancient period. It was used as a gateway for trade to Europe. Its rich cultural and historic background has been reflected to the architecture. Today, it is possible to observe great number of historic buildings from different architectural periods of Cyprus in the old town of Famagusta. Lusignan (1192-1489), Venetian (1489-1571), Ottoman (1571-1878) and British (1878-1960) are the most significant ones. In this study, it is aimed to discuss the impact of architectural heritage on the tourist attraction and city marketing. It is also intended to discuss and present the significant historic buildings from the different time periods, which are visited and used for the touristic purposes in Famagusta. These buildings will be categorized according to the uses and the way of conservation. On the base of this, mainly literature review and physical analysis methods are used for this research. At the end of the study, it is expected to provide a general review about Famagusta’s historic buildings and touristic activities, which are supporting the tourist attraction and city marketing.

Keywords: Tourism, Architectural Heritage, Conservation, City Marketing, Walled City of Famagusta.

INTRODUCTION

The meaning of the “tour” is that the travelers returned to their countries when they come to the point to answer their expectations of this travel. They get seriously motivated by the fund investment and also cultural purpose from the intention country that is far away from their home countries (MacCannell, 2013). In the modern period and modern type of tourism, a social group of people was selected for the practicing of cultural tourism in terms of economic position and education (Richards, 2001). The function of tourism changes from ancient times to the present. It is transferred from entertainment to national income (Diamond,1977). Nowadays developing tourism is one of the main goals of the countries with specifically archeological sites (Brohman, 1996). Tourism is categorized in different types in the present world such as ecotourism, leisure, business tourism, family visiting and others (Goeldner, 2007).
Architectural heritage is consisting of various elements and buildings belong to the different periods. They are sorted as traditional and historic monuments and buildings, handicrafts and museums, old streets and urban spaces (Timothy, 2003). In the contemporary period, one of the main tourism fields is related to the recognition of the cultural heritage of the cities and also the appreciation of the cultural heritage (Richards, 2007). The collaboration between tourism and heritage has some advantages and disadvantages to the cities. Some of the advantages are creating more jobs in the cities, economic growth achievement for the citizens and government, improvement of the urban infrastructure, improvement of the facilities in cities specifically old part of the town, make the heritage areas be livable, increase the public spaces, connect the old part of the city to the new part of the city, restoration and conservation of the old buildings and spaces and reinforcement between the local identity and tourists. However, on the other hand, the threats are related to the poor quality of renovation and restoration, not using suitable materials, and destruction an alteration in heritage monuments, spaces, and buildings. All of the mentioned disadvantages are harmful to sustainability in the city (Dümcke, 2013).

The fact of conservation is that it shouldn't touch the identity of the objects, spaces or buildings. These elements should keep in their actual shape, size, material, colour, and texture. They can be repaired or re function to be liveable and reusable as a piece of art belongs to history (Jokilehto, 2017).

The conservation and restoration which is applied to the architectural heritage can change the historic part of the city. This issue has a positive effect on the absorption of the heritage tourists to specifically this part of the town (Larkham, 2002). The other main factor that the travelers in the contemporary period are looking for is good quality transportation and accommodation system. A combination of good quality and professional restoration, conservation, accommodation, transportation, livable events, and services affect the improvement of city marketing (Kotler, 2002). Marketing specifically in tourism has a major role. Architectural heritage can be a powerful element to improve the marketing of the cities. A combination of the artifact elements next to architectural heritages and social events improve the tourism heritage of a city. The powerful policy of tourism can effect on the improvement of city marketing. People can share and present their culture, nature, and history with the tourist from all parts of the world to show and keep their culture (Timothy, 2011).

Famagusta as a port city that belongs to different historical periods such as Lusignan (1192-1489), Venetian (1489-1571), Ottoman (1571-1878) and British (1878-1960) is a good tourism destination. In the old town of Famagusta, different architectural heritage buildings and monuments are located which have different functions such as cafes, restaurants, bars, castle, bazar, churches, museums, shops, and others. Some of these historic buildings renovated and conserved in their original use. However, some of them were conserved by new uses. Generally, they transfer to the cafés, bars, restaurants and shops. The old town of Famagusta is a kind of outdoor museum. Different activities such as theater plays, music concerts and festivals are taken place in different times. In this research architectural heritage in the Walled City of Famagusta is analyzed in terms of touristic uses. It mentions about their history and period of conservation. Besides, in this study, the architectural buildings that change their functions during the contemporary period are discussed.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The Role of Architectural Heritage on Tourism and Marketing of a City

The world tourism is originated by the word “Grand tour” that belongs to the eighteen century. In that period the artists and the people who are loved in literature, art and history from different countries traveled to Europe as a continent which is specified as high cultural and architectural cities in the world. Specifically, the mentioned people choose the Italian peninsula and Rome city as a curio and classical antiquity of the Europe continent. The ancient world and history go to Roman civilization. The culture of Roman people goes to Renaissance and Rome city is a well rich sample for the ones that love historical heritage culture, classic arts and become an inspiration for them for artistic production of that time (Choay, 1992).

Heritages and specifically architectural heritage are the history and culture of the past that the government and the citizens try to preserve for the present. They should be also kept and inherited for the future. Heritage shaped in different social, cultural and political periods that connect the present period to the past (Ashworth, 2013).

UNESCO’s did a convention in 1972 about the world’s natural and cultural heritage and the protection of this issue. UNESCO classifies the cultural heritage as Sustainable development and cultural heritage tourism is the World Trade
Organization (WTO) strategy from the beginning of the 1970s. “Tourism: the conservation of world heritage for the new millennium” is the motto of the 1999 year for the World Tourism Day. It was also issued a joint memorandum on the “Tourism and the conservation of cultural heritage” in 1999 between the Organization of World Heritage Cities, the council of Europe and UNESCO which is done in Khiva-Uzbekistan (McKercher, 2002).

Based on the variable studies on “cultural tourism” culture is one of the main factors in these days related to tourism in a different part of the world. Also, it is one of the largest and most developed categories in a different type of tourism on the world scale (Richards, 2001). This development brings different opportunities and demands to increase the number of conserving monuments and traditional buildings which is not usable, less valued in the contemporary period. Also, it can bring back life to historic and traditional environments. This development causes more appreciation for the historical environment and understanding more about the local culture and cross-cultural relation.

Architectural buildings cover the important part of the heritage in the historic and traditional environments. Different countries in the world are obeying the conservation policies to protect the cultural identity of the past and offer it in the professional condition as a reference to the future generation. The policy of conservation is to be outstanding and to be unique. In addition to these, the artefacts and architectural buildings that are conserved shouldn't lose their identity.

In recent periods, the importance of the cultural heritage and protection of the heritages gain more credit from the countries. An increase in the number of heritage tourists in the world causes the concern of the countries to create policies to protect the heritages. They try to protect conserved architectural buildings and artefacts much more than before.

The International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) adopted an International Charter on Cultural Tourism in 1976. The extraordinary growth of tourism over the last decades of the twentieth century led ICOMOS to review the Charter; a new text was adopted in 1999, more suitable to the demands of the moment. This introduces concepts and recommendations related to the proper interpretation and transmission of heritage values and meanings, with the need to consider the tourism use of heritage as a tool for the integral development of host communities through the idea of participatory planning involving all stakeholders (Roders, 2011).

Heritage tourism is consisting of two chapters. One of them is cultural tourism and the other one is eco-tourism. The quality of cultural and natural environment affects tourism. Heritage tourism is including visiting museums, architectural heritage buildings, national parks, and art galleries (Ritchie, 2003).

There are two main policies related to the preservation of architectural heritage and urban. The first one is based on developing the aesthetic and efficiency of the inherited architecturally planning unit. The second aim is related to the urban fabric and the processing of the building gets conserved. They are not allowing harming architectural heritage. The challenge is in between of these two factors is to find sustainable tourism development (Orbasli, 2002). Sustainable tourism development happened due to a balance between three factors. These factors categorized as protection of nature, economic benefit, and identity of the culture of the specific city. Cultural heritage has a positive potential effect for the city related to two main factors. One of them is based on social impact and the other one is related to the economic. Cultural heritage specified on the identity and support of culture. It is bringing harmonies between the people and also helps to renew tourism (McKercher, 2002).

The international conservation guideline and charters try to create some principles due to keeping the nature of the architectural heritage and keeping the original form. These principles are based on an ethical code. These ethical codes should be based on moral principles. They can help the conservators to do their job in the best way to appreciate and understand cultural heritage. These basic ethical codes are standards for conservation in the international charter. They are categorized as; 1. Deeply study, analyzing and recording before the intervention. 2. The minimum change in the fabric of historic places. 3. Bring the risk to the minimum level due to damage, the uncertainty of performance and loss through intervention. 4. Make the interventions that possible to reversible. 5. Retention of the original structure. 6. Using distinguishable or distinctive material for the new additional part. 7. Sympathy in use and interpretation. 8. Respect for the place and its quality. 9. Use the original materials and standard in workmanship and 10. Durability in the result of conservation and finishing (Mansfield, 2003). These are guiding the governments, policy makers, designers and the local people to improve the quality of a city.
The Walled City of Famagusta

Famagusta is one of the cities which are located in the southeast part of Cyprus. It is one of the significant cities with its wealthy history. Famagusta city contains different historic periods and their cultures. Some of the periods are categorized as Byzantine (330-1191), Lusignan (1192-1489), Venetian (1489-1571), Ottoman (1571-1878) and British (1878-1960). The culture and architectural buildings belong to these historic periods are brightening in different cities of Cyprus and in the Walled City of Famagusta. The town was extending from this part to the contemporary part of the city center. The walls around the walled city are 3.7 km. There are significant historic buildings belong to different periods in the Walled City of Famagusta such as Saint Nicholas Cathedral, Church of Saint George of the Greeks, Latin Church of Apostles Peter and Paul, Church of Saint George of the Latins, Church of Saint George Exorinos, Church and Monastery of St. Francis, Templar and Knights’ churches, Church of Saint Nicholas, Church of Agia Zone, Church of Saint Anna, Church of Saint Mary (Armenian Church), Carmelite Church, Royal Palace, Fortifications, Othello Tower, Ravelin Bastion, Martinengo Bastion and Porta Del Mare(Walsh, 2012) (Fig. 1). Also, the streets and squares are reflecting its historic identity. The main square, which is named as Namik Kemal Square is surrounded by the most significant architectural heritages from the different historic periods (Fig. 2).

In 2008 and 2010, the Walled City of Famagusta specifically the historic part was placed as a monumental maritime, social and economic historic part of the world. It drew the attention due to the spanning centuries of architectural monuments of the Mediterranean historic city (URL 2).

Conservation works on the architectural buildings and monuments allow the tourists and the residence to enjoy more about this fascinating place. The progress of conservation in the architectural heritage part of the Walled City of Famagusta is in progress in recent years. These cause the improvement in the number of tourist in this part of the city. Increase in the number of tourist cause city marketing. Also, city marketing affects the income condition of locals.

There is a dual mayoral office in Famagusta that the established of this office goes back to a century. This office has encouragement support for the conservation and improvement of the historic part of the walled city. In this area when each conservation project finished, it makes the citizens and government inspired to have more protective historic sites in the Walled City of Famagusta and bring back the power to this part of the city. In parallel, this issue causes the area to get more touristic and valuable for the visitors (URL 2). Conservation policy helps the marketing of the city.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Analysis of the Architectural Heritage of the Walled City of Famagusta

In the Walled City of Famagusta, there are existing different architectural heritages belong to the different historical periods. Some natural disasters such as floods and earthquakes and also the effects of time have caused damage to buildings. These architectural heritages get conserved in different periods in the history. Although some of the architectural heritage buildings and monuments have a rich history behind, still they are ruins. They need a deep study on them and try to conserved for keeping them as a cultural heritage of the city for the next generations. Some of this architectural
heritage which is renovated lost their real function. They transfer to stores, cafes, bars, and restaurants. This issue makes the history part of the city livable. This research is analyzing some of the walled city architectural heritage buildings which keep their real function and the ones that change their function.

St. Nicholas Cathedral
St. Nicholas Cathedral is located in the main square that is named as Namık Kemal Square (Fig.3). This is one of the most significant Gothic style cathedral which is belong to the 14th century that the Frankish the king of Cyprus and also Jerusalem were crowned in there (URL 3). In 1571, parallel to the Ottoman Period, this Cathedral changed its function to the mosque in the name of Lala Mustafa Pasha (URL 4). Some modifications were done on it such as a minaret added and all the interior walls were painted in white colour.

Venetian Palace
In front of this Mosque, there is a Venetian Palace that belongs to the Lusignan Period which was built in the 13th century (Fig.4).

The Bandabuliya
The covered market which is known as Bandabuliya is also located on the Namik Kemal Square close to the St. Nicholas Cathedral and Venetian Palace (Fig.5). It dates goes back to Venetian Period. It was used as a bazaar/closed market during the Ottoman and British Periods. In 1980s, the building began to need repairs. Thus, with the support of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the Bandabuliya has been restored and re-opened. It now consist of cafes, restaurants, a bar and souvenir shops. It is also a popular live music venue (URL 5).
Othello Castle, Sea Wall revamp and Martinengo Bastion are the other architectural heritages that their renovation starts since 2006. The Ravelin / Land Gate restoration is also one of the architectural heritage areas in the Famagusta. The renovation of this area started in 2017 and finished in 2018. Bicomunal Technical Committee on cultural heritage is responsible for all these renovations (URL 6).

**Othello Tower**

It is one of the most important citadels or tower in the history of Mediterranean area specifically in Famagusta city of Cyprus (Fig.6). Walking through the gateway of the citadel with the lion of Venice after a hundred years still has a sense of mystery inside. The citadel is consisting of the different parts as wall fortifications, connecting walls and also four towers. Othello tower constructed in the eight towers but in the years and through the history lost four of them. This citadel is compromising of the two-part inner and outer part. The outer part is Venetian fortifications that the history of the background of it goes to 1492 parallel to the Lusignan period. This tower has a defensive key role of the Famagusta city walls between the port and the sea area. The renovation of this project is finished in 2015 and now is open to the tourist to visit the history and also the story of this tower. Othello Castle is known as a symbol of the famous story behind in the name of Desdemona by Shakespeare. Each year once in time there is an art theater hold in the citadel area that absorbs tourists to enjoy this play in this architectural heritage area (URL 7). Also, different cultural activities are taken place.

**Martinengo Bastion**

Martinengo Bastion is a sample of military architecture that the history of this architectural heritage goes back to the Renaissance (Fig.7). Martinengo heritage area located far away from the city centre of Famagusta. Thus, it is not known enough by the tourists. Martinengo Bastion was constructed in the Venetian Period. In that period, Venetians come to the point that the defence situation of the northwest corner part of the Famagusta city is weak. They built this part to strengthen the city for defence situations. The conservation of this architectural heritage site is finished in 2017 (URL 8).

**Ravelin/ Land Gate of Famagusta**

This area is one of the most essential parts of the Famagusta walled city (Fig.8). It is an entrance from the other part of the city. Also, this architectural heritage site is a massive construction area in the middle of the rocks that belongs to the different periods in history. The construction period goes back to Lusignans that the tower was constructed. It is formed in different periods such as Lusignan, Venetian, Ottoman, and British. This land gate consists of bridges, passageways and fosses. It is connected to the outside of the city through drawbridge and bridge. This land gate is a valuable architectural heritage. The renovation of this site is finished in 2018 (URL 9). There are many tourists that visit this Land Gate in the year.
Walls between Arsenal and Sea Gate

Wall of Famagusta was famous through North Africa, the Middle East, and Europe (Fig.9). This architectural heritage element was constructed over many years in history. It is developed through centuries by changing the kings to extend the city parallel to protect the city from the wars. The wall is constructed by rubble masonry core and also sandstone ashlars that both of them are connected with plenty of mortars together (URL 11).

They are the important military architectural elements in the history that became architectural heritage belong to the different rulers in different periods. It is important to protect and conserve them.

The Church of Armenians (St. Mary) and also the Church of Carmelite (Carmel) also get renovated by the UNDP in 2018 (Fig.10 & Fig.11) (URL 12).

Next, to this valuable architectural heritage, several cafes and bars stabilized in the architectural heritage buildings which are getting renovated. These cafes and restaurants and bars are located in the city centre next to the main square. These architectural heritage buildings get invested by the locals to preserve the old city of Famagusta. These converted buildings are named Monk’s Inn café and Bar as one of the most popular bars in this area, which is located in the side street in the south part of St. Nicholas Cathedral (Lala Mustafa Pasha Mosque) (Fig.12).
Ginkgo Restaurant is located in the medrese of the St. Nicholas Cathedral (Lala Mustafa Pasha Mosque) which is located in the east part of the Namik Kemal Square. Also, variable activities such as concerts, festivals, ceremonies and etc. are taking place in this main square that was surrounded by the architectural heritages from the different historic periods (Fig.13).

Hammam Inn Bar is an old bath building (hamam) which belongs to the Ottoman Period (Fig.14). This restaurant is next to the Church of St. Francis and located in the northwest of Namik Kemal Square on the corner.

There are also twin churches that were converted to the Demolay Bar. In the heritage site of the Walled City of Famagusta also there is a Venedik House that is now transferred to the traditional restaurant. Also, a row of British Period warehouses creates a line on a street. They located in between Namik Kemal Square and the Sea Gate. They were converted to restaurants, cafes and shops (Fig.15 & Fig.16).
CONCLUSION

In the contemporary world, tourism is one of the significant factors for the marketing of cities. It helps to conserve the cultural heritage, carry it for the future generations and also increase the economic conditions of the locals. By improving the policies for city marketing, tourists play an important role. City marketing can be beneficial for keeping the culture of the locals in a city from ancient till now. Through conservation and renovation, they can protect their heritage. Improving the number of tourists in a city causes more communication with the world. The Walled City of Famagusta as a world’s valuable cultural heritage site has the potential to absorb too many tourists. From the past to present there are different periods in the history that they try to conserve these heritage in the Walled City of Famagusta. Mainly, during the last ten years Bicommunal Technical Committee with European Union tries to renovate and conserve the architectural heritage in the Walled City of Famagusta. By reading too many numbers of comments on the Trip advisor site about the Walled City of Famagusta, it is visible that there are too many tourists that enjoy from the architectural heritage of Walled city of Famagusta. After these conservations and renovations, the number of tourists increased to visit this valuable heritage. There are several shop, cafés, bars and restaurants that opened in the renovated buildings in the Walled City of Famagusta. Mostly, the function of these renovated buildings was different than the previous centuries. This issue causes an increase of income for local people and increases the quality of the city condition, when the buildings are actively using.

REFERENCES


http://ontheworldmap.com/cyprus/city/famagusta/famagusta-tourist-map.html

https://www.wmf.org/project/historic-walled-city-famagusta

http://www.whatson-northcyprus.com/interest/famagusta/famagusta/lala_mustafa_pasha.htm


http://www.whatson-northcyprus.com/interest/famagusta/famagusta/bandabuliya.htm


https://medium.com/@UNDP_PFF/celebrating-famagusta-on-world-heritage-day-4dcadb29139


https://allansartworlds.sites.ucsc.edu/2015/12/27/revisiting-north-cyprus-carmelite-church/
The Effect of Website Features on the Visiting Levels of the Destination Website at Destination Selection

Sami ÖZCAN
Ress.Assist., Ardahan University
samiozcan@ardahan.edu.tr

ABSTRACT
The purpose of the study, to research the impact of website features on the levels of visiting a destination website before deciding where to go for the persons who living in Turkey. For this purpose, a survey consisting of 12 questions and 3 factors (ease of use, design, accessibility) have been administered to 411 people via e-mail and face to face. In the study, convenience sampling and snowball sampling have been used together. Because of the fact that the website visiting levels variables are categorical and hierarchical, it has been preferred ordinal logistic regression in the study. At the end of the study, statistical differences were obtained regarding easy viewability of the information on the website, easy access to the website and the use of the website at any time of the day.

Keywords: Destination, Destination Preference, Destination Website, Website Visiting Level, Ordinal Logistics Regression

INTRODUCTION
Internet services starting with a limited use in the 1980s by attempts of some universities in Turkey is particularly opened to personal use as of the mid-1990s. The use of the internet has been steadily increasing from the mid-1990s to the present. Internet that had quite a few numbers of users in Turkey at early on has gained an increasing momentum since 2004. The graph below shows this increase very clearly.

![Figure 1. The number of internet subscribers in Turkey by year](image)

Reference: Turkish Statistical Institute (TSI)

In view of Turkey’s population being more than 83 million, having more than 73 million internet subscribers in Turkey shows that the internet is very widely used. Internet usage is continued to increase with the changes in information technologies. Therefore, as everywhere in the whole world, everything is done using the internet from the most complicated tasks to daily transactions also in Turkey.

In Turkey where using internet is very high, internet usage is important also to the tourism sector and web technologies indispensable. It is an inevitable fact that that domestic tourists living in Turkey benefit from the internet while they deciding to visit a destination. For this reason, the intention of domestic tourists to visit destinations can be increased thanks to the strength of destination websites. However, even if all the features required in a website are fully provided, the level of destination website visiting may vary.
Domestic or foreign tourists often obtain the information about the destination which they want to visit from platforms such as travel agencies’ websites, travel blogs, social media accounts. However, it can be said that the usage of the websites belonging to destinations is quite low in Turkey. Despite of this status, it can be expected that, domestic tourists living in Turkey find the website which contained directly information more reliable. Therefore, it can be stated that it is very important developing destination websites, determining the common features and applying them jointly. Nevertheless, it can be expected that the level of destination websites visit will increase and the intention of visiting the destination will be positively affected.

In this study, it is purposed that examine the effect of website features on the visiting levels of destination websites. As such, after first mentioning similar studies, information about population and sample of the study, data collection method and analysis method are presented. Then, the findings obtained from the analyzes were stated and the results were evaluated with similar results in the literature. In the last section, suggestions were made in the light of the evaluations.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

In the literature, it is possible to come across studies on the evaluation of the websites of the destinations, the effect of these websites on the visitors and the evaluation of the websites of the destinations. As a result, they have stated that the use of the website increased the reputation of the destination and that tourists’ choice of destination was positively related to the attractiveness of the website and certain characteristics of the website.

Çiçek, Pala and Özcan (2013) have examined in the selection of destination whether or not destination web sites are more effective than other elements (published ads, close-environment views, frequently visited destinations, positive/negative thoughts about destinations, promotional activities apart from the internet). As a result, they have stated that in the choice of destination, examining the website is more effective than other elements for decision-making for destination.

Chung et al. (2015) have investigated the correlation between destination website qualities and intention to use it continuous and the effect of destination website qualities on the intention to visit the destination. As a result of their analysis with the method of partial least squares, they have stated that there was a mutual relationship between destination web site quality and intention of continuous use and that the quality of the web site had a positive effect on the intention to visit the destination.

Romanazzi, Petruzzellis and Iannuzzi (2011) have examined the use of the website of tourists through primary and secondary data for Italy’s Puglia region. They have concluded that the use of the website increased the reputation of the destination and that tourists’ choice of destination was positively related to the attractiveness of the website.

Eryilmaz and Zegen (2013) have mentioned the role of internet in destination marketing and proposed a website model for the Eastern Marmara Region. In their proposed model, they have stated that there should be a web address in which the expression Marmara destination is mentioned, should be banner ads in website, should be listed in search engines, website advertisements should be made through social media, and should be included information of public institutions.

Chung et al. (2015) have investigated the correlation between destination website qualities and intention to use it continuous and the effect of destination website qualities on the intention to visit the destination. As a result of their analysis with the method of partial least squares, they have stated that there was a mutual relationship between destination web site quality and intention of continuous use and that the quality of the web site had a positive effect on the intention to visit the destination.

Rodriguez-Molina, Frias-Jamilena ve Castaneda-Garcia (2015) have analyzed that whether the effect of the design of a tourist destination website, and the effect of the tourist’s processing of information, on the destination image that the tourist creates. They have found that when emotional messages are used on the website and the individual is not experience overloaded, destination image is more positive.

Resino, Rodriguez and Jimenez (2016) have aimed to determine whether the websites at different Spanish regions improved the image of consumers towards destinations, identifying their main dimensions and analyzing its effect on satisfaction and intentions of the future behavior of potential visitors. As a result, they have stated that the differences in the composition of the perceived image could be determined according to the destination and that the perceived different image dimensions have a significant effect on satisfaction.
In their study, Foroudi et al. (2018) have aimed to measure the impact of the destination website on the destination image of customers/visitors/tourists. In this study, they have addressed to determine the main factors on destination websites and place identity, to determine the main impacts on destination image and to determine the main effects on favorable destination image. They have concluded that the positive approach of the visitors to the website affected the destination image to the same extent and that the intention to revisit or suggest it increased at the same rate as the destination image.

Polat and Yazıt (2018) have aimed to determine whether the destination web sites at the Marmara Region have the basic features that should be available on the destination web sites and whether these features are used effectively. They have found that many district destinations in the Marmara Region do not have a web site, and the destinations with a web site have some points that need improvement on their web sites.

When the literature is examined, it is possible to come across studies that the destination websites have positive effects on the destination image. However, it was not encountered the study about the website visiting level on domestic tourists who examined the website of destination that before making a destination decision.

METHOD

In the study, it was examined that before domestic tourists who living in Turkey deciding where to go, effects of the destination websites features on the websites visiting levels. In the literature, there are many studies indicating that web site features are effective in the destination decision of domestic / foreign tourists (Romanazzi, Petruzziellis & Iannuzzi (2011); Çiçek, Pala & Özcan (2013); Chung et al. (2015)). However, any study may have been not found on how often domestic / foreign tourists examine the websites of destinations when making a destination decision. It was emphasized that according to the level of examination of the web sites of destinations how are evaluated the features of these websites and how assessments vary between websites visiting levels. Therefore, in this study, it was tackled that while domestic tourists making a destination decision, whether the effects of website features on the website visiting levels.

For the purpose of the study, it was utilized that the questionnaire used by Bayram & Şahbaz (2015), Bayram & Şahbaz (2016), Bayram & Şahbaz (2017) and Faiz (2018). In this study, it was based on that since it is emphasized the features of all destinations rather than the evaluation of the any destination website, it is used the questionnaire which developed by Bayram & Şahbaz (2015). This questionnaire consists of two dimensions which “before purchasing services” (ease of use, design, accessibility) and “after purchasing services”. Since there is no accommodation, booking, transportation etc. in destinations websites, it is taken the dimension of “after purchasing services” in this questionnaire. The questions in the questionnaire were prepared with a 5-point Likert Scale and scored from “strongly disagree (1)” to “strongly agree (5)”.

Since domestic tourists are consider in the study, population is comprised of people who living in Turkey and who visiting the website while making destination decision. Sampling methods were used since it is not possible to reach the whole population. Convenience sampling was used to the participants who answered ‘Yes’ to the question which “Have you ever visited at least one time the website of destination that you have intent to go, when making the destination decision?”. In accordance with information received from the participants who answered 'Yes' to the question asked, snowball sampling method was used also via e-mail.

After determination of the sampling method, the sample size which is could best represent the population was calculated. Depend on whether the population parameters are known or not, there are different calculation methods for calculating the sample size. The following general formula, which is used in cases where the parameters of the population are not known, was used.

\[
  n = \left( \frac{0.5 \cdot Z_{1-\alpha/2}}{d} \right)^2 = \left( \frac{0.5 \times 1.96}{0.05} \right)^2 = 384.16
\]

A value of 0.5 in the formula indicates the probability of making the right choice for the sample. The expression \( Z_{1-\alpha/2} \) represents the confidence interval and 0.05 is the margin of error. It was accepted that the confidence interval is 95% and margin of error is 5%, within the scope of the study. As a result of the calculation, it was concluded that there should be at least 385 participants. For this reason, a total of 450 participants were surveyed and 411 of them returned ready for analysis.

Since the purpose of the study was to determine the effects of the destinations websites features on the visiting level of the websites, it was decided to apply the regression analysis. Since the destination websites which is dependent variable has a categorical structure, logistic regression was applied for analysis. Especially, ordinal logistic regression which is a type of logistic regression was performed, because of the hierarchy between the dependent variable categories.
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In this study, a method was applied a mixed data collection including e-mail and face to face methods. In the data obtained through the questionnaire, it was tried to reach the participants who different demographic characteristics as much as possible. The demographic characteristics of the participants was summarized in the table below.

According to Table 1, participants were composed of 220 (53.5%) female and 191 (46.5%) male. When the distribution of participants by age is examined, it is seen that 68 (16.5%) are in the 20-29 age range, 151 (36.7%) are in the 30-39 age range, 123 (29.9%) are in the 40-49 age range, 43 (10.5%) are in the 50-59 age range and 26 (6.3%) are in the age of 60 and over. While 349 (84.9%) of the participants are married, 62 (15.1%) are single. It has been of the participants, 28 (6.8%) are primary education, 70 (17%) are high school, 108 (26.3%) are associate degree, 118 (28.7%) are undergraduate and 87 (21.2%) are graduate education. Finally, according to their monthly income, 35 (8.5%) of the participants have 2500 TL and less, 72 (17.5%) have between 2501-3500 TL, 162 (39.4%) have between 3501-4500 TL and 142 (34.5%) have 4501 and more monthly income.

The validity test of the questionnaire was conducted with explanatory factor analysis. Varimax rotation was used in exploratory factor analysis. The results of factor analysis are summarized in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Profile category</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>411</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>53.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>191</td>
<td>46.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>411</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-29</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>16.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>29.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>≥60</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital Status</td>
<td>411</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>349</td>
<td>84.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>15.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>411</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>17.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Degree</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>26.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>28.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>21.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Income Status (TL)</td>
<td>411</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>≤2500</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2501-3500</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>17.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3501-4500</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>39.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>≥4501</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>34.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Results of exploratory factor analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Statement Code</th>
<th>Factor Loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ease of use</td>
<td>The information on the website should be easy to viewability.</td>
<td>KK1</td>
<td>.762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Website navigation should be easy</td>
<td>KK2</td>
<td>.758</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Access to submenus should be quickly</td>
<td>KK3</td>
<td>.748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I need to do easy what I want to do</td>
<td>KK4</td>
<td>.513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The website should be user friendly</td>
<td>KK5</td>
<td>.621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design</td>
<td>The website should be well organized.</td>
<td>T1</td>
<td>.632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The color, graphics and text used in the website should be compatible</td>
<td>T2</td>
<td>.675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The design should be suitable to the purpose of the website.</td>
<td>T3</td>
<td>.750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The website should give the feeling of being crafted by experts.</td>
<td>T4</td>
<td>.663</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>The website should be easily accessible on popular search engines.</td>
<td>U1</td>
<td>.669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The website should be available to use at any time (any day, any hour).</td>
<td>U2</td>
<td>.592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It should be accessible to the website from whole internet-enabled devices.</td>
<td>U3</td>
<td>.558</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

KMO and Bartlett’s test results show that whether the statements in the questionnaire are suitable for factor analysis. In above table, the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin Measure of Sampling Adequacy value greater than 0.5 (.775) and Sig value less than 0.05 (.000) are indicate that the data are suitable for factor analysis. In Table 2, “Factor” shows the factors in the original questionnaire, “Statement” shows the questions in the questionnaire, the “Statement Code” shows coding that will make it easier to use in analysis and the “Factor Loadings” shows the loadings of each statement. Accordingly, it can be interpreted that factor loads of all statements are greater than 0.5, so all statements can be included in the related factors. The validity of the questionnaire was obtained via explanatory factor analysis.

Ordinal logistic regression was applied for the purpose of the study. There are three points to be considered in Ordinal Logistic Regression: (1) There should be hierarchy between the categories of the dependent variable. (2) There shouldn’t be multicollinearity in ordinal logistic regression analysis as in multiple regression. (3) The parameters of the dependent variable in the Ordinal logistic regression should be parallel to each other (assumption of parallel lines). Due to the fact that there is a hierarchy (never, sometimes, always) between the categories of the dependent variable (website visiting level) in the study, the first assumption was fulfilled. For the test of whether there is multicollinearity, the variance inflation factor (VIF) and eigenvalues were calculated. These calculations were performed with the help of syntax in Figure 2 in SPSS 22. The results were obtained are summarized in Table 3.
Due to the results in Table 3, since the VIFs of all variables are less than 10, it can be indicated that there is no multicollinearity. On the other hand, obtained the value of 18,273 (0.201 / 0.011 = 18,273) that the maximum value of the eigenvalues (0.201) divide by the smallest eigenvalue (0.011) is less than 1000, it is interpreted as no multicollinearity. Accordingly, it can be said that the second assumption was provided. Finally, the assumption of parallel lines was tested and results were obtained as follows.

The hypothesis of assumption of parallel lines is "H₀: Parameter estimates go through the same breakpoint". As a result of the analysis, H₀ cannot be rejected, because the significance level value (Sig.) is greater than 0.05 (0.998>0.05). Thus, it can be said that all categories of the website visiting levels (as dependent variable) are parallel to each other. In case, parameter estimations go through the same breakpoint, it can say that all calculated parameters are equal in all categories of dependent variable.

After three assumptions of ordinal logistic regression were realized, ordinal logistic regression was applied. First, it was performed goodness of fit test. The aim of the goodness of fit test is to determine whether the data obtained is compatible with the analysis. For this reason, the hypothesis proposed for the test is "H₀: The model is compatible with the data". The results of the tests performed for the goodness of fit are given in Table 5.

Chi-square and deviation tests are the most commonly used tests in logistic regression for goodness of fit tests. Accordingly, the significance levels of both tests are greater than 0.05 so it can say that the model is compatible with the data. In other words, tested the H₀ hypothesis cannot be rejected due to the fact that significance levels are greater than 0.05 (0.108 and 0.527).
Assumptions were tested and realized for ordinal logistic regression. Then, the goodness of fit test was conducted and it was concluded that the model was compatible with the data. Finally, the results of the parameter estimations were obtained and the calculated values are presented in Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>Wald</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Threshold</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WİD=1</td>
<td>-1.167</td>
<td>2.585</td>
<td>0.3113</td>
<td>.108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WİD=2</td>
<td>0.216</td>
<td>0.089</td>
<td>1.2411</td>
<td>.765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KK1=1</td>
<td>2.453</td>
<td>5.190</td>
<td>11.6232</td>
<td>.023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U1=1</td>
<td>-2.619</td>
<td>15.423</td>
<td>0.0729</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U1=2</td>
<td>-1.372</td>
<td>9.600</td>
<td>0.2536</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U2=1</td>
<td>-0.985</td>
<td>5.268</td>
<td>0.3734</td>
<td>.022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U2=2</td>
<td>-0.904</td>
<td>6.588</td>
<td>0.4049</td>
<td>.010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note 1: The dependent variable is ‘web visiting level (WİD)’. The value 1 in parenthesis means ‘never’ and the value 2 indicates ‘sometimes’.

Note 2: The explanations of the values at right hand of equality in the independent variables are the same as the explanations on the 5-point Likert scale.

Note 3: Variables that Sig value less than 0.05 are shown in parameter estimations. In other words, variables that significant differences in the categories are included in table.

It is possible to say that the variables whose significance level is less than 0.05 are contained significant differences in the findings regarding the parameter estimates. Accordingly, it can say that there are significant differences in statements which was coded as KK1, U1 and U2. Participants who strongly agree to the statement of “The information on the website should be easy viewability (KK1)” while make their destination decision are visited the destination website 11.6232 times more than those who strongly disagree to this statement. Along with the easy viewing of the information on the website, during the domestic tourists make a decision for destination, they increase that the visiting level of destination website. In the study conducted by Lu, Lu and Zhang (2002), it was emphasized that the main purpose of the web users to apply to the website in the selection of the destination was getting information, hence the information on the website should have the ability to be easily displayed and to provide up-to-date information. Just like Lu, Lu and Zhang (2002), Chung et al (2015) also have stated that the information on the destination website increased the intention of tourists to use the website. In terms of potential domestic tourists who living in Turkey, Polat & Yazıt (2018) have also reached the conclusion that there should be up-to-date information on destination website. It can be said that this result obtained within the scope of the study coincides with the results obtained from similar studies in the literature.

Participants who strongly agree to the statement of “The website should be easily accessible on popular search engines (U1)” while make their destination decision are visited the destination website 0.0729 times more than those who strongly disagree to this statement and 0.2356 times more than those who disagree to this statement. Accordingly, if the website of any destination is ranked first in the popular search engines, it can be provided that the web site of that destination can be examined more frequently. As stated by Romanazzi, Petruzzellis, and Iannuzzi (2011), web users not spend much time browsing destination websites. Therefore, accessibility must be fully provided for destination websites. Yaylı and Bayram (2009) stated that the websites should be easily accessible by looking at provincial directorates of culture and tourism, while Eryılmaz and Zengin (2013) stated that listing the destination websites in the search engines is one of the most important features for the destination websites. With the results obtained from these studies, it is possible to say that if the destination websites are ranked higher in the popular search engines, destination website can be examined more frequently.

Participants who strongly agree to the statement of “The website should be available to use at any time (any day, any hour) (U2)” while make their destination decision are visited the destination website 0.3734 times more than those who strongly disagree to this statement and 0.4049 times more than those who disagree to this statement. This result can be handled together with the result that should be listed in the search engines. Given that web users spend few time for visiting destination websites, it can be expected that both listing the destination websites in search engines and being available around the every time can increase the level of visiting that website.
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Tourism is an important source of income for Turkey. In particular, the active participation of domestic tourists in tourism activities provide the mobilization of domestic markets. For this reason, it is very important to implement applications that will increase the destination visits of domestic tourists. With the increasing use of the internet day by day, the importance of websites is also increasing. When the websites prepared for the destinations are designed to meet the information demands, domestic tourists will examine these websites more frequently when making a destination decision.

The situation that most influences the destination websites visiting level of domestic tourists is related to the easy access to the information on the destination web sites. When deciding on a destination visit, the most important point is that the destination information should be accurate, understandable and easy. Therefore, it is very important that destination websites are prepared by experts. Simple menus, fluent and simple expressions are available for users who want to get information about destinations. Preparing the website design in such a way that all information can be accessed in a few steps can positively affect the level of visiting websites. Considering that domestic tourists spend very little time on searching websites for destination decision, it can be said that these websites ranking on the tops in popular search engines will increase their level of visiting. In this regard, it can be achieved advantages that ranking on the tops in popular search engines by coming together with representatives of search engines in Turkey. It is also important to keep the website up-to-date. During these updates, it may be effective to provide active viewing of the website.

There are some limitations in the study. This study done in terms of domestic tourists; it can carry out on foreign tourists' destination websites visiting level in Turkey. In addition to this, it can be addressed the levels of visiting destination websites for other countries. Changes in the level of visiting the relevant website after the arrangements to be made can be examined. On the other hand, the scope of the study can be expanded by considering the social media accounts of the destinations as well as the websites.

REFERENCES


How Sustainable is Tourist-Guiding Education in Turkey? : Perspectives from the “Urban Side”

Yalçın ARSLANTÜRK
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
yalcin.arslanturk@hbv.edu.tr

Özlem ALTUNÖZ
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
ozlem.altunoz@hbv.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The concept urban tourism has been a focal point of some tourism papers especially within the last 10 years and its popularity is ever-increasing. In scope, despite the fact that the boundaries are not precise, it is still a theme that is under researched probably due to its intertwined nature. However, it is not an elusive theme in that the concept itself hints details regarding the link between tourism. As such, thanks to its tangled relation to tourism, some cities came to be called through a use of adjective like “love, smart, slow, gastronomy, etc… (cities)”. In other words, each city under consideration adopted a strategy in translating the urban qualities into tourism business. Along with this, not surprisingly, came the question of sustainability into the agenda, which was also the case for mass tourism. On account of the advanced transport means, cities have been on the rise more than ever in the last 10 years with respect to tourism attractiveness and daily tours have become a prominent part of weekend activities. On the other hand, in the context of Turkey, according to the law numbered 6326, it is stipulated that all tours have to be accompanied by a licenced guide. Guiding in Turkey is a topic of unending debate among the scholars of tourism in Turkey with reference to the ways through which you can be a guide with a must licence. All the above mentioned points at hand, the main objective of this paper is to evaluate the present situation of urban tourism from the sustainability perspective and perform a conceptual analysis on extent to which the subject of sustainability is covered by the programs, with suggestions for future directions.

Keywords: Urban Tourism, Sustainability, Tourist Guides, Tourist Guide Education, Turkey

INTRODUCTION

It is an undeniable fact that cities account for a great share in tourism activities and hence in the economic impact on the economies of the countries involved (WTTC, 2017). European Commission defines urban tourism as “the set of tourist resources or activities located in towns and cities and offered to visitors from elsewhere” (2000, p. 21), with an emphasis on the dynamics of the cities that could appeal to tourists. Apart from the attractiveness cities have to offer as destinations, there is another aspect rather than the pull factors of the cities, which is competition. Along with the fierce competition on global scale to get more share from the “tourism pie” cities compete with other potential competitors and put great effort to set themselves apart in terms of the activities, services and image (Zukin, 2009).

As held by Adamo et al. (2018), recent decades have witness competition founded on the touristic attractiveness of each individual city; however, as of 1980s, the competition changed direction from the regular and natural offerings like location and natural beauties to symbols and the developed images. In this way, rather than the tangible aspect of the cities, intangible and experiential aspects began to play a big part in terms of rendering the image of the city and position in the competitive environment (Papadimitriou et al.,2015). For the sake of creating the desired image in the eye of the tourists, cities have come to the forefront through creativity as a means of setting different image and to have competitive edge.

In Turkish context, it will not be mistaken to assert that the number of cities taking their righteous role in urban tourism is on the rise, especially within the last 5 years. What's more, something specific to Turkey, tour guiding business and tourism has to go hand in hand in terms of expanding the touristic services and making the tourism business more profitable and sustainable. Within the set framework by tour guiding
professional law number 6326, released in 2012, it is a must that organized tours offered by travel agencies have to be performed by a licenced guide given by an appropriate authority, which is TUREB (Union of Tourist Guides’ Chamber) in Turkey. In other words, illegal guiding or guiding without a licence is a crime in Turkey. Presently, according to data given by TUREB, there are about ten thousand licenced tourist guides in Turkey. Given the increasing popularity of urban tourism and the very formal structure and indispensable role of tourist guides in packed tours in Turkey, the main objective of this paper is to evaluate the present situation of urban tourism from the sustainability perspective and perform a conceptual analysis on extent to which the subject of sustainability is covered by tourist guiding programs, with suggestions for future directions.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

**Sustainability**

As its name suggests, the term sustainability is the collective combination of efforts to make tourism activities more sustainable, reaching to future generations and so on. There will be no mention of sustainability of tourism in this part but the concept itself and what it implies. The terms and the notion of sustainability became a topic of interest on the global scale towards the late 1980s, as a reaction against the rising mass-tourism all over the world (Jamal, et al. 2013). As a formal definition, sustainable tourism is defined as “the current and future needs of tourists as well as the host community, and at the same time takes into account the social, economic, and environmental aspects” (UNEP, p. 11-12). With the aim of preserving the social, economic and environmental characteristics, an uninterrupted course of controlling and observing the tourism flow in a given destination or place of interest and in the event that anything against the sustainable frame, which are economic, social and environmental, occurs, not only preventive but corrective precautions and actions are taken so as to convert the situation into a sustainable framework. This in mind, the actions taken by the authorities may not be sufficient on their own and for this reason a helping hand by tourists or the demand-side could be of immense use for the sake of sustainability.

With respect to the demand side, Lerario et al. (2017) suggest that involving tourists in the process of sustainability will lead to awareness and in this way the outcome of good practices by tourists will influence the position and the development of a given destination in a positive manner thanks to the collaboration of tourists, leading to more sustainably conscious tourist in the first place. Besides, sustainability is not a core concept revolving around such terms as environment, society and economy. These three core terms do not necessarily possess the same outcome for all levels of tourism activity although tourism is regarded as the major motivating force of many local economies across the globe. According to Saarinen (2014), sustainability has lost its essence by focusing on particular destinations, missing the essence for the global scale through its focus on solely the local markets and its economic impact. Furthermore, it is also alleged that the roles of residents are overlooked (Moscardo, 2011). However, the roles of residents in taking and enhancing a sustainable stance towards tourism is as important as the tourism assets themselves, for residents are the ones who have to go through and deal with the impacts of tourism occurring in many dimensions of the society residents live in. For this reason, residents should be incorporated in tourism planning in all the efforts of sustainability (Moscardo and Murphy, 2014).

There have emerged some other concepts along with sustainability, also considered as the sub-category of sustainability, such as “ecotourism” and “responsible tourism”, both of which focus on environmental awareness. In the words of Blangy and Wood (1993), ecotourism is “responsible travel to natural areas that conserves the environment and sustains the well-being of local people” (p. 36). On the other hand, responsible tourism decreases the negative impacts and increases the positive impacts in terms of social, economic and environmental perspectives through a balance between consumption and production by all the parties involved (Saarinen, 2014).

**Urban Tourism**

While sustainability is a term with fruitful outcome when implemented as it should be, real life practices do not often live up to what is expected mainly because tourism has its roots in the course of business life and it is, like many sectors, profit-oriented, hence usually not paying attention to the sustainable aspects. It is no surprise that the dynamic interactive nature of cities eventually uses up all the resources allocated at their disposal. The
progress of urbanization is very much related to the formation of megacities and it is projected that by 2030 more than half of the world population will move to urban areas (UNDESA, 2011).

Lerario and Turi (2018) find urban tourism difficult to define and consider the concept far more complicated than “tourism performed in the cities”. Urban tourism is defined and examined within the perspective of multifunctional character, microdestination, coexistence of built forms and cultures, and peculiarities such as shortness of stays, repetition of visits, and cities’ ability to recreate themselves to satisfy the ever-changing wishes of visitors (Asworth and Page, 2011; Barrera-Fernandez et al. 2016).

Tourist Guiding

A tourist guide, as its name suggests, is the one who guides. While in ancient times they were regarded as “pathfinder”, nowadays the complexity of the roles of guides range from pathfinding, acting like a compass, to culture brokers and educators. A formal definition has been provided by The European Committee for Standardisation (CEN, 2007), according to which a tourist guide is “a person who guides visitors in the language of their choice and interprets the cultural and natural heritage of an area, which person normally possesses an area-specific qualification usually issued and/or recognised by the appropriate authority” (p. 4). This being the case, the roles attributed to tourist guides much more than being simply complex. They are informal ambassadors, educators, interpreters that bond social, cultural historical pillars for the visitors in a manner that will not only educate but also lead the groups. Thanks to interpretation, the tasks to be performed by tourist guides go beyond mere reciting names and facts. Otherwise, a smart phone with the Internet access would make good guides. Tourist guides are the tools to increase awareness about the issues particular to the destination or to global scale. Pertinent to sustainability, according to Pereira and Mykletun (2017), "tourist guides can interpret an attraction or phenomenon in an informal manner and present salient issues in sustainability, potentially provoking thought while making meaning of places and situations. The voice of tourist guides is an innovative tool for transferring sustainable principles to inspire tourists and potentially influence changes in behaviours and attitudes” (p. 359). In other words, the role of tourist guides is not only guiding about a place itself but also “soft” issues related to the place under consideration.

The units of United Nations have so far highlighted that in order to reach sustainability aims, education is an efficient tool (UNESCO, 1997; UN, 2017). All the roads to become a tourist guide in Turkey cannot be viable without a solid educational background and practice training, which is offered by either TUREB (Union of Tourist Guides’ Chamber) or Tertiary Education institutions.

Assessment of the Programs with Specific Reference to Sustainability and Discussion

The use of the term of sustainability in the sense we know sates back to the 1987 “Brundtland Report”, also referred to as “Our Common Future”. According to the definition given in the report sustainability is “development that meets the needs of present generations without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs” (WCED, 1987, p. 43). Taken from the point of tourist guiding, sustainability holds an important place in tourism to sustain it for posterior. This being the case, spread of the notions and principles of sustainability across the society is of paramount importance to be implemented by professionals and university graduates with this notion are what a study needs (Kagawa, 2007).

As mentioned earlier, the three conventional pillars of sustainability are economic, social and environmental ones. These three elements make up the main criteria in the analysis. The fundamental reference to the courses given in tourist guiding programs are set by TUREB According to the latest regulations, presently in the certificate programs, there are 16 courses, some of which are Sociology, History of Anatolia Civilizations, General Tourism, Turkish Folklore and Traditional Handicrafts, History of Arts, Communications Skills and so on. Interestingly, among the 16 courses mentioned, no course related to sustainability has been found out. Imagine there were courses related to sustainability, could you transfer the notion of sustainability through courses?

What’s more, presently, in Turkey there are 23 tourist guiding programs offering Associate’s degree and 30 programs offering Bachelor’s degree and 9 programs offering Master’s degree (with non-thesis
options). Excluding the Master’s degree programs, the total number of the two-year and four-year programs is 53. Out of 53 programs, 10 from four-year programs and 10 from two-year programs were randomly chosen and their curricula have been examined to see if the subject of sustainability has been covered. Of the programs examined, there is a mention of sustainability, usually dealt with in General Tourism or Introduction to Tourism courses. Plus, it is no surprise that “urban tourism” has been covered with specific emphasis, despite the fact that this was not the point of interest of this paper.

Being a must part of all organized tours in Turkey, the guides’ influence to support and spread the notion of sustainability is an undeniable fact. While performing their role of educators, the responsibility they have on their shoulders is a lot more than mere information-giver. Using their educator-function, the contribution of tourist guides to sustainable could be of immense opportunity and benefit. Considered as the rising star of tourism types, urban tourism is on the way to engulf the interest of scholar and from the supplier side, it is a resource of income for the locals and for those offering service and amenities. The result of the examination of the curricula suggest that under the present condition of tourist guiding education, prospective tourist guides are not ready to deal with the sustainability related issues, let alone sustainability in urban tourism.

As for future studies, it is suggested that studies covering all the curricula should be conducted and a comparative study between Turkey and some European countries would serve much better for the sake of sustainability and urban tourism. Besides, as much as the course-related subjects, the real life practices could be another alternative rather than sticking only to curricula or the list of courses. At a further level, an interesting topic could revolve around whether the notion of sustainability taught.

REFERENCES


Moscardo, G.; Murphy, L. (2014). There is no such thing as sustainable tourism: Re-conceptualizing tourism as a tool for sustainability. Sustainability, 6, pp 2538–2561.


WTTC (2017). *Travel and tourism: Global economic impact and issues*.

Urban Tourism in Scope and Its Repercussions on Turkish Tourism Academia

Özlem ALTUNÖZ
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
ozlem.altunoz@hbv.edu.tr

Yağış ARSLANTÜRK
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University
yalcin.arslanturk@hbv.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

It will not be unjustified to assert that global developments in conjunction with local developments in tourism field have at last led to a number of new perspectives in shaping the business flow of tourism. Urban tourism, also known as city tourism, is undeniably one of the novel outcomes of the new perspectives that emerged. The research into urban tourism had not had its righteous place in tourism literature until the first half of the 1990s. Nonetheless, this emerging domain of this new type of tourism has still been in its infancy compared to other tourism-related domains. Defined as “… set of tourist resources or activities located in towns and cities offered to visitors elsewhere” (European Commission, 2000, p. 21), Urban tourism is very much related to the dynamics embedded in cities and the social, economic and cultural feature a city has to offer to visitors. From the demand side; that is, from the point of tourists, the quality and the quantity of the tourism services offered, expanded and differentiated tourism services and the extent to attract visitors can be said to make up the fundamental of urban tourism dynamics. This being the case, the first objective of this paper is to analyze and outline the concept of urban tourism in scope. The second objective is to examine the concept of urban tourism in terms of its reflection on Turkish Tourism Academia through a bibliometrics analysis. In this context 16 research article obtained and analyzed. Results illustrated that researchers more tendency to use city case study and qualitative research method in Turkey.

Keywords: Urban Tourism, Tourism Studies, Bibliometrics, Turkey

INTRODUCTION

For Turkey, tourism represents an opportunity of growth, economic and social development. With the changes in social life, interest in alternative tourism types is increasing instead of tourist movements in sea-sand-sun understanding. These changes have enabled the development of urban tourism, including short-term visits to cities for many social, cultural and artistic purposes (Kaynak & Karabulut, 2016). In fact, while urban tourism is one of the oldest tourism movements, with the development of the right to paid leave, there has been a great shift from urban tourism to coastal, rural or mountain regions since the early 1980s. Therefore, it would be a more correct approach to treat it as a reemerging and rising form of tourism, not as a new type of tourism (European Commission, 2000: 21).

In parallel with growing tourism industry over the past two decades in Turkey, the amount of academic knowledge generation has also been increasing (Evren & Kozak, 2014). Because urban life and urban attractiveness has become important again within tourism context in recent years, it has been quite necessary to examine the development of urban tourism by the conceptual sense. Hall (2011) has emphasized that bibliometric analysis is important for tourism literature as a result of external evaluation of research quality, interest in impact and prestige factors, and study of the field’s development. Bibliometrics is a field that uses mathematical and statistical techniques, from counting to calculus, to study publishing and communication patterns in the distribution of information (Diodato, 2012).

In this context, the first objective of this paper is to analyze and outline the concept of urban tourism and the second objective is to examine the concept of urban tourism in terms of its reflection on Turkish Tourism Academia through a bibliometric analysis. Although bibliometric studies have been conducted by some researchers (Palmer et al., 2005; Hall, 2011; Evren & Kozak, 2014; Ruhanen et al., 2015; Köseoğlu et al., 2016; Güzeller & Çeliker, 2018 etc.) in various aspects of tourism, bibliometric study focused on urban
tourism has been seen insufficient when the relevant literature is examined. The present study is regarded as significant owing to draw an overall picture of the research conducted in the field of urban tourism in Turkey, it expected fill an important gap in the literature.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Urban tourism is basically a complex and difficult form of tourism to determine as a conceptual framework. Despite the fact that urban tourism is a growing research area as researchers and policy makers seek to understand the phenomenon of tourism within the urban environment (Edwards et al., 2008), the phenomenon cannot be said to receive the attention it deserves. There have been some attempts to define urban tourism in the literature. According to Wang and Pei (2014) urban tourism is a general term of various urban tourism activities of outsiders and its related influences on society, economy and environment. Lapko (2014) states that urban tourism consists of all the conditions and manifestations of tourist activity occurring in this area, taking into account both the tourist attractiveness of urban space, which is one of the main conditions for travelling, forms of tourism and tourist infrastructure (Lapko, 2014).

Urban tourism is a type of tourism generally carried out in metropolitan cities. When it comes to urban tourism, all elements such as originality, modernity, security, technical equipment and infrastructure services, facility quality and price policies, recreation services, urban outdoor area quality, which make the city life attractive, should considered (Emekli, 2011). Urban tourism can be defined briefly as tourism activities offered to visitors in towns and cities” (European Commission, 2000: 21).

The European Commission (2000) remarks that urban tourism depends on many factors such as the size, history and heritage, morphology and environment, location and appearance of the city, but basically includes activities such as (European Commission, 2000: 21-22):

- Leisure tourism link to particular features of urban areas;
- Business tourism linked to the economic, social and cultural vitality of towns and cities;
- Conference tourism linked to the facilities available in and images of towns and cities.

In urban tourism context, tourists generally join in travels offering flexibility and diversity, range of sports, cultural and social activities, recreation facilities, shopping opportunity and a few days of accommodation. On the other hand, tourists traveling to cities for cultural purposes visit the exhibitions, museums, monuments and historical sites in the cities (Şarkaya İçelloğlu, 2014: 42). Fairs and trade shows, which are one of the main elements of urban tourism, play a supporting role in the economic and touristic development of cities (Koçak & Karakaş Tandoğan, 2008). Arts festivals, likewise, culture-led urban regeneration strategies and become a mainstay of urban tourism and urban policy-making (Quinn, 2013).

![Figure 1. Sub-themes within the domain of urban tourism research (Ashworth and Page, 2011)](image-url)
Ashworth and Page (2011) have divided the studies on urban tourism into 12 sub-themes: marketing/place imagery, cultural agendas, impacts, sustainability, visitor perception and satisfaction, urban regeneration, models, typologies of tourist cities, city case studies, social theory/theoretical, transport and infrastructure (Fig.1).

The first research about urban tourism date back to 1980s (Uca Özzer, 2010). These researches mainly focused on urban tourism and its development on a national scale (Jansen-Verbeke, 1986; Buckley&Witt, 1989). When the studies conducted in the 1990s (Roche, 1992; Murphy, 1992; Hinch, 1996; Bramwell, 1998; Snaith & Haley, 1999) are examined, it is observed that the issues such as planning and marketing of urban tourism resources and sustainability of urban tourism, satisfaction levels of urban tourists have begun to be examined. From the 2000s onwards, researchers have focused on more specific issues in a similar line.

Suh and Gartner (2004) examined how tourist perceptions towards South Korea differ according to their nationality and purpose of visit. They found that Japanese tourists coming for business gave more importance to the security-centered and functional characteristics of tourism products than North American and European tourists. Rogerson (2004) in his research has addressed the role of small enterprise development in urban tourism. Richards (2011), Rogerson (2017) and Adamo et al. (2019) have stressed that creativity is necessary for success of urban tourism destination. Miller et al. (2015) have shifted the debate on sustainable tourism destinations from an emphasis on ecotourism and eco-resorts towards sustainable urban tourism destinations, While Lerario and Turi (2018) have handled sustainably urban tourism concept within the scope of building-related indicators.

METHODOLOGY

The aim of this study was to explore trends and patterns in urban tourism and to show the current state of scientific researches regarding urban tourism in Turkey via bibliometric analysis. The articles that constitute dataset was collected by searching for key words ‘urban tourism’ and ‘city tourism” from online article databases (e.g. Ulakbim, Sobiad, Asos Index) and academic search engines (e.g. Google Scholar) between June and August 2019. The titles of the articles were used in defining them as urban tourism related. However, because the urban tourism concept is a new phenomenon and the framework of the studies on the subject is not clearly, some articles could not be defined based on their titles. To define these articles as urban tourism related, their abstracts and the key words were assessed.

Consequently 16 articles were specified that focused on urban tourism. Within the scope, regardless of publication date, all the urban tourism related articles published in national refereed journals analyzed in terms of several parameters such as their distribution research method, subject, publication date, keywords, etc.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In this section, the data set has been analyzed and result are illustrated via tables. The findings concerning with evaluated article themes and results are presented in Table 1 according to publication date.
Table 1. Distribution of Research by Subject and Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors/Year</th>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tutal Cheviron</td>
<td>The transformation of Istanbul due to the developments in tourism, culture and congress sectors</td>
<td>Istanbul reflects the eastern culture as well as the western culture with its shopping malls, entertainment centers and cultural activities. Therefore, it is moving towards becoming a global eastern city.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koçak &amp; Karakaş</td>
<td>The current situation of İzmir within the scope of urban tourism and the role of fairs and exhibitions in the development of urban tourism</td>
<td>Although the lack of capacity of the fairgrounds, the shortage of specialized trade fairs and the lack of convention centers adversely affect İzmir urban tourism, urban tourism has become prominent during the EXPO candidacy process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tandoğan (2008)</td>
<td>Importance of marketing of cities in terms of tourism</td>
<td>The touristic charm of each city should be integrated with the image of that city. Festivals and events play an important role in this matter. Thus, the branding of the city becomes easier. This contributes to the marketing activities of urban tourism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giritlioğlu &amp; Avcıkurt (2010)</td>
<td>To introduce the approach of learning tourism cities theoretically, to draw attention to its importance and applications</td>
<td>With the approach of learning tourism cities, defining the city well, collecting information about the urban and tourism in one hand and providing information flow are the first steps that play an important role in the development of urban tourism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emekli (2011)</td>
<td>Determination of tourism development problems in Eskisehir</td>
<td>Differences in perceptions regarding the problems in the development of tourism and the problems experienced in educating labor force and service quality in Eskisehir are some of the identified problems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seçilmiş (2011)</td>
<td>Efficiency and efficiency of Kırdağ festival, consumers participating in festival and evaluation of festival costs</td>
<td>Kırdağ Festival organized 14th times is a proof of the public's acceptance of this festival. As a matter of fact, this process is the most difficult in terms of festivals. The organization of various competitions and the support of local authorities will contribute to the development of festivals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olcay &amp; Giritlioğlu</td>
<td>Satisfaction levels of university graduates staying in hotels in Gaziantep</td>
<td>Customers were found to be satisfied with the product and service, and it was concluded that satisfaction levels were affected by gender in terms of equipment, equipment and service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Şarkaya İçelioğlu (2014)</td>
<td>SWOT analysis in terms of Istanbul's urban tourism</td>
<td>It has been determined that the top side of Istanbul is the geographical location and the weakest side is infrastructure, management and planning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Başarangil (2014)</td>
<td>Examination of the phenomenon of urban tourism and the necessities of structuring sustainable urban tourism</td>
<td>Cities with tourist attraction elements do not attract enough attention. It has been suggested that common goals and cooperation among destination management organizations have not developed sufficiently.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uca Özer et al. (2014)</td>
<td>Estimation of the number of potential foreign visitors to visit Edirne and tourism development of the province</td>
<td>It has been determined that it can increase compared to previous years and this increase may continue each year. In this context, Edirne's concrete and intangible cultural and natural heritage should be well planned and included in tourism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaynak &amp; Karabulut (2016)</td>
<td>Evaluation of beliefs and cultural values in Konya in terms of Christianity and Islam</td>
<td>Konya, which has an important place in terms of faith tourism and urban tourism due to its historical and cultural texture, cannot be evaluated sufficiently in terms of its potential.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negiz (2017)</td>
<td>Urban-Tourism and Development Relations</td>
<td>In terms of urban tourism, the title of cultural tourism is cared for and the archeology that makes culture ready is not cared enough. Therefore, this study will provide an idea for the local administrators to shape cultural policies.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Songur (2017) Evaluating the cultural heritage and lost cultural values in the context of urban tourism, examining three travelogues written about Bursa in this context. Bursa travel books can be used as a source for new urban tourism projects. Thus, cultural values lost over time can be revealed again. This situation may affect the urban tourism positively.

Aylan & Şalvarcı (2018) The effect of themed parks in Konya on urban tourism. Konya meets the changing demands of the visitors and it is determined that the theme parks that provide diversity have a positive effect on the urban tourism.

Keleş Eriçok (2019) Revealing the urban tourism opportunities of Van. Daily or several day trip routes can be established by establishing relationships between the points that allow experiencing the Urartian culture in Van. As a matter of fact, cultural elements support urban tourism positively.

Uğurlu & Çekiç (2019) Determination of the opinions of NGOs, public institutions and private sector on the concept of city right for urban transformation. In terms of the relationship between sustainable urban tourism and the concept of city right, the participants stated that these concepts would be effective in preserving the city if they interacted with each other.

Table 2 presents frequency and percentage distributions of findings concerning with the total pages, number of author, keywords of researches, presence of urban tourism concept between the key words, research method, researches subjects and journal information.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>n=16</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>n=16</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pages</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Single author</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>50,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Less than 11 Pages</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18,75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11-15 Pages</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25,00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16-20 Pages</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More than 20 pages</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>43,75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Method</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Double authors</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>37,50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single author</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>50,00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Double authors</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>37,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Triple authors</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research subjects</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Research subjects</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>68,75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourism Marketing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theoretical Perspective</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recreational dimension</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultural elements</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>City Case Studies</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>37,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Visitor perception/ satisfaction</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Management and planning</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Method</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Publication Year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research subjects</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Urban Tourism” in Keywords</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25,00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus of Journals Published</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ranking of “Urban Tourism” in Keywords</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of tourism</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18,75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of social sciences</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>50,00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of management</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of marketing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of economics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of geography</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of communication</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First rank</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>31,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Second rank</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12,50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Third rank</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fourth and more</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6,25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not sorted</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>43,75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As it seen in the Table 2, most of the studies analyzed (43, 75%) have got more than 20 pages and half of these researches has prepared by single author (50, 00%). When the research methods of the articles are examined, it is seen that qualitative research methods have been used to a large extent (68, 75%) in the studies, while only 5 articles (31, 25%) has been prepared by using quantitative methods.

As is also understood from the Table 2, urban tourism researches have more focused to city case study in Turkey (37, 50%). The other articles discuss the subject with its marketing (6, 25%), theoretical (6, 25%), recreational (12, 50%), cultural (12, 50%), visitor (12, 50%) and management (12, 50%) dimension.

When the distribution of articles by years is examined, it is seen that the most articles (25, 00%) were published in 2014. It is noteworthy that the first publications based on urban tourism were published in 2008.

While 56.25% of the articles included the concept of urban tourism in the keywords, 31.25% of the papers put the concept in the first rank. 43.75% of the articles did not include the concept of urban tourism in their keywords.

On the other hand, a great majority of articles (50, 00%) has seen published in the social sciences journal. 18, 75% of articles have published in tourism related journals.

**CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

The present bibliometric study aimed to provide an overview of how urban tourism research has evolved in the Turkish scientific community. As a result of searches made without any date limitations, 16 articles focused on urban tourism in Turkish literature were identified.

While the first international studies on city tourism date back to the 1980s (Uca Özer, 2010), the oldest urban tourism based article achieved in Turkish literature belongs to 2008. This finding can be interpreted as the fact that the Turkish academy lags behind the world in recognizing the importance of urban tourism. On the other hand, urban tourism as a research topic can be considered as not got the attention that it deserves still in Turkey. When the current studies were examined, it was found that the majority of the articles was single-authored and had more than 20 pages.

In their research Evren & Kozak (2014) aimed to reveal the general development of tourism literature in Turkey, has found that most of the articles used empirical methods, and the others were conceptual assessments of tourism-related issues. Our findings related research methods of the articles draw the attention that qualitative method usage tendency is more between Turkish researchers when urban tourism is concerned.

Findings reveal that a substantial part of research has been published in journals of social science. Until the last five years lack of tourism centric journal in Turkey, may conceivable as the main cause of it. Tourism centric journal number in Turkey has been increasing during the recent years.

Distribution of research subjects is another interesting point of the study. Ashworth and Page (2011) in their research that has examined recent progress and current paradoxes in urban tourism, have divided urban tourism related research to 12 sub-themes. Accordingly, international urban tourism researches consists of sub-themes; marketing/place imagery, cultural agendas, impacts, sustainability, visitor perception and satisfaction, urban regeneration, models, typologies of tourist cities, city case studies, social theory/theoretical, transport and infrastructure. In the present study result shows that in Turkey great majority of urban tourism articles have focused on city case studies. There is little research that examines the marketing, theoretical perspective to urban tourism, recreational dimension, cultural agendas, visitor perception, and management. Within this scope results are parallel with Ashworth and Page (2011). Urban tourism related other sub-themes (planning, economics, urban regeneration, typologies of tourist cities, infrastructure etc.) is still pending investigation in Turkey.
REFERENCES


Quinn, B. (2013). Arts festivals, urban tourism and cultural policy. In Culture and the City (pp. 77-92). Routledge.


Environmental Problems and Sustainable Tourism at the Golden Horn, Istanbul

Özgür ZEYDAN
Assist.Prof.Dr., Zonguldak Bülent Ecevit University
ozgurzeydan@beun.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Istanbul is the top leading city in Turkish tourism in terms of foreign tourist arrivals as reported by Ministry of Culture and Tourism statistics. The Golden Horn (Haliç) plays an important role on Istanbul’s tourism due to its historical, cultural and recreational sites. The Golden Horn Region was the first settlement of Istanbul throughout history. Some historical and religious locations have made this region especially important in terms of religion tourism. It’s a well-known fact that clean, unpolluted environments attract tourists. Also, sustainable tourism needs clean environments. Deteriorations in environmental conditions may result in loss of importance of tourism destinations. In short, it can be said that tourism cannot exist without environment. The Golden Horn Estuary has been classified as “Sensitive Water Zone” according to the Turkish Environmental Regulations. Therefore, increasing water pollution may cause the Golden Horn to lose its tourism attractiveness. Because of extreme and unplanned growth of Istanbul in the last century, the Golden Horn has served as receiving body for wastewater discharges. In the beginning of 1980’s, water quality was so deteriorated that strange odor makes impossible to stand near the Golden Horn. It was extremely polluted till late 1980s because of wrong city planning, domestic and industrial wastewater discharges and solid wastes. Pollution of this region was in the focus of both scientists and local authorities. In 1984, “The Golden Horn Environmental Protection Project” has been carried out with great efforts to bring Golden Horn to its magnificent days again. Industrial plants moved, waste water collection system and treatment plants have been build. Moreover, bottom sediment of estuary has been removed in order to improve water quality. Following the restoration period, the Golden Horn has become the center of cultural tourism after the establishments of some places like Feshane, Rahmi Koç Museum, Miniatürk and Haliç Congress Center. Also, shorelines of estuary has been arranged as green corridors for recreational purposes. Finally, the Golden Horn and its surroundings were become a cultural, art, tourism and recreation valley.

The aim of this study is to explain the dependency of clean water environment for sustainable tourism. This paper summaries the literature about The Golden Horn in terms of water quality and sustainable tourism. The reasons of water pollution of the Golden Horn over years are summarized. After that, environmental protection efforts and recovery of water quality and biodiversity have been discussed. Then, the importance of the Golden Horn region in terms of tourism is emphasized. The importance of environment for sustainable tourism is explained by the example of the Golden Horn’s water quality.

Keywords: The Golden Horn, Water Quality, Environmental Pollution, Sustainable Tourism.

INTRODUCTION

Sustainable tourism activities depend on clean and unpolluted environments. It is a well-known fact that clean environmental conditions attract tourist. Deteriorations in environmental conditions like water, soil and air pollution may result in the loss of attractiveness for tourism destinations. In short, unpolluted environmental conditions are necessary to sustain tourism activities. Sustainable tourism has been defined by World Tourism Organization as “tourism that takes full account of its current and future economic, social and environmental impacts, addressing the needs of visitors, the industry, and the environment and host communities” (Pulido-Fernández, Cárdenas-García, & Espinosa-Pulido, 2019). Environmental sustainability is especially important for the continuation of tourism activities since polluted environments (air, water and soil pollution) results in discomfort of tourist. Although it is still problematic in application (Pulido-Fernández et al., 2019), environmental sustainability programs have been developing and applying by tourism industry, tourists, local and regional governments to reduce the ecological footprint, consumption levels and greenhouse gas emissions.

According to the tourism statistics published by the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul is one of the most important tourism cities in Turkey. In 2018, 39488401 foreign tourist have been visited Turkey.
34.02% (13432990) of these tourists have entered Turkey through Istanbul. Antalya, Edirne, Muğla and Artvin are following Istanbul in terms of tourist arrivals. Therefore, it can be concluded Istanbul is an important tourism city in Turkey. The one of most attractive tourism destinations in Istanbul is the Golden Horn (Haliç) estuary and its surrounding area. In ecological science, estuaries are semi-enclosed and sensitive transition zones between salty and fresh water (Kocak, Yetilmezsoy, Gonullu, & Petek, 2010; Yüksek, Okuş, Yilmaz, Aslan-Yilmaz, & Taş, 2006). According to the Turkish Environmental Regulation (Sensitive and less sensitive water areas communique concerning urban waste water treatment regulation, Official Gazette date: 27.06.2009, number: 27271), the Golden Horn Estuary has been classified as “Sensitive Water Zone”, that can go into eutrophication. Eutrophication is the term used to describe water quality which is polluted by organic pollutants, algal blooms exist on water body, dissolved oxygen concentration is quite low to support aquatic life and water body would turn into swamp ultimately. Therefore, increasing water pollution may cause the Golden Horn to lose its tourism attractiveness. Consequently, tourism revenue losses may occur.

The purpose of this interdisciplinary study is to explain the dependency of clean water environment for sustainable tourism. In this study, literature related with water pollution and remediation of the Golden Horn has been reviewed. The improvements of tourism activities after the rehabilitation project has been analyzed. The dependency of clean environment for tourism and recreation facilities have been discussed by the Golden Horn example.

WATER QUALITY OF THE GOLDEN HORN

History of Water Pollution

Waters of the Golden Horn was quite clean in primeval ages. During the Byzantine Empire, alluvions carried by Kağthane and Alibeyköy Streams had caused anaerobic degradation and Golden Horn had been called as “Sapralthalassa”, which means decayed sea (Türkhan, 2008). The first environmental protection project in the Golden Horn Estuary had been applied by Sultan Mehmet “the Conqueror” (Yüksel et al., 2006). In 18th and 19th centuries, there were three main sources for water pollution in the Golden Horn: alluvions carried by streams, solid wastes disposed into the Golden Horn and wastewater discharges coming from industrial facilities. At the beginning of 20th century, due to the extreme and unplanned immigration and urbanization of Istanbul, the Golden Horn has served as receiving body for domestic wastewater (van Leeuwen & Sjerps, 2016).

In 1936, the Golden Horn had been declared as an industrial zone as a result of wrong city planning prepared by the French urbanist Henry Prost (Coleman, Kanat, & Aydinol Turkdogan, 2009; Ozdemir & Gokmen, 2017). Factories, without wastewater treatment plants, continuously and heavily polluted water for decades (Taş, Okuş, & Aslan-Yilmaz, 2006; Tuncer, Tuncel, & Balkas, 2001). In 1985, there existed approximately 700 industrial facilities and more than 2000 commercial facilities near the Golden Horn region (Altinbilek, 2006). It was extremely polluted till 1990s because of domestic and industrial wastewater discharges and solid wastes (Kocak et al., 2010). Strange hydrogen sulfide odor from anoxic sediment was so excessive that no one could stand near it (Coleman et al., 2009).

Observing water quality parameters in the Golden Horn can show how water has been polluted for years. For example, biochemical oxygen demand (BOD) - a water quality parameter related with wastewater discharges - measurements have shown an increasing trend till restoration period. BOD concentration was measured as less than 20 mg/L before 1970, whereas, it was in the range of 20 – 70 mg/L which means water showed the diluted
wastewater characteristics (Coleman et al., 2009). In 1980’s, water quality was classified as the worst class according to Water Protection Control Regulation, which means that the Golden Horn’s water cannot be used neither for drinking, recreational nor industrial purposes. Trends were similar to BOD in other water quality parameters. Dissolved oxygen concentration, vital water quality parameter for aquatic life, was less than required levels (<3.5 mg/L), therefore, all aquatic life were nearly distinct (Coleman et al., 2009). Studies in literature have stated that thousands tons of heavy metals (Cr, Cu, Ni, Zn) have been discharged into the Golden Horn since 1950 (Tuncer et al., 2001).

**The Golden Horn Environmental Protection Project**

Many projects have been developed to protect water quality of the estuary but none of them have been applied till 1984. At last, “Golden Horn Environmental Protection Project” has been approved by Istanbul Greater Municipality and Istanbul Water and Sewerage Administration (ISKI) to bring the Golden Horn to its magnificent days again. With a total cost of US$ 653 million, this project was one of the largest estuary cleaning projects of the world (van Leeuwen & Sjerps, 2016). Firstly, industrial facilities were moved outside the region. Northern and Southern Sewerage systems were furnished in northern and southern parts of the Golden Horn to collect and transport wastewater to wastewater treatment plants so that the wastewater discharge to the estuary were blocked. Then, the bottom sediment of Golden Horn was dragged. 5×10⁶ m³ anoxic bottom sludge were removed form estuary. Old Galata Bridge was removed from the Golden Horn since floating bridges were blocking water circulation (Altinbilek, 2006; Coleman et al., 2009; Tas, 2015). Water quality and biodiversity of Golden Horn Estuary was improved consequently (Gönülülü et al., 2005). Following the sludge dredging and bridge removal, Secchi Disc Depth value (indicator of turbidity) increased, in other words, water becomes less turbid (Coleman et al., 2009). After rehabilitation project, water becomes clear and nutrient concentrations were decreased. Dissolved oxygen concentrations increased. Finally, water quality was classified as swimmable (Coleman et al., 2009; Yüksek et al., 2006). In 2002, Golden Horn Environmental Protection Project has been awarded by Metropolis Award as Winner (Altinbilek, 2006).

**TOURISM AROUND THE GOLDEN HORN REGION**

The last step of the rehabilitation project was the Golden Horn Cultural Valley Project (Coleman et al., 2009; Gunay & Dokmeci, 2012). Following the remediation project, the Golden Horn and its surroundings were established as cultural, art, tourism and recreation valley. The northern and southern sides of estuary were arranged as “green corridors”. Parks are constructed for the urban beautification (Gunay & Dokmeci, 2012). Miniturk, where 1/25 scale of national and international historical and architectural structures exist, has been welcomed visitors since 2003. Some of the industrial plants at the Golden Horn were transformed to universities, museums or cultural centers (Ozdemir & Gokmen, 2017; Uysal & Özden, 2012). For instance, old electricity generation plant (Silahтарağa) was turned into Santralistanbul, an international culture, art and education platform (Düzgün & Aladağ, 2013). 43 different cultural events have been exhibited since the establishment of Santralistanbul. Main gallery building has been awarded by “International Architecture Awards” in 2010 (https://www.santralistanbul.org/). Another example is Kadir Has University which was establish in the place of Cibali Tobacco Factory. Also, Ottoman Navy anchor foundry and Shipyard have been reorganized as Rahmi Koç Museum (Düzgün & Aladağ, 2013). Similarly, old Textile Factory was converted to Feshane Exibition Center. Furthermore, Sütlüce Slaughterhouse was demolished for the construction of Halic Congress Center (Gunay & Dokmeci, 2012). This building hosted 5th World Water Forum between March 16 and 20, 2009 with more than 25000 participants from 182 different countries (http://www.worldwatercouncil.org/en/istanbul-2009).

The Golden Horn has become the center of cultural tourism after the establishments of some places like Feshane, Rahmi Koç Museum, Miniturk and Haliç Congress Center. Moreover, some important national and international sport organizations have been performed in estuary or surrounding region after the improvement of water quality in the Golden Horn. Red Bull Air Race World Series (29 July 2006 and 2 June 2007), Golden Horn Half Marathon (20 April 2014), Isiklar World Offshore 225 Championship (5 May 2012) Dragon Festival and Golden Horn Sailing Races are the examples of these sport organizations held at the Golden Horn. Also, recreational boat ride activities became possible after the launch of Sultan Boats.
Most of above listed cultural places and sport activities were conducted after the rehabilitation period of estuary. On the other hand, tourism activities are not limited by these list. The Golden Horn and its surrounding region was the first settlement area. Because of some historical and religious events, faith tourism is very important for the Golden Horn and its surroundings. This region is a meeting point of the three celestial religions. Mosques are located in Eyüp, churches are located in Fener and synagogues are located in Balat. Pierre Loti Hill, Eyüp Sultan Mosque, Bulgarian St Stephen Church and The Greek Orthodox Patriarchy in Fener are some of the must see touristic destinations of the Golden Horn. Figure 1 shows the important locations around the Golden Horn.

CONCLUSION

Historical and natural beauties of Istanbul makes her the most attractive tourism destination in Turkey. The Golden Horn estuary and waterfront region has lots of places to visit. Pierre Loti Hill, Eyüp Sultan Mosque, Bulgarian St Stephen Church and The Greek Orthodox Patriarchy in Fener are the examples of best destinations in Halic region. Although estuary was severely polluted till 1990’s, the rehabilitation project was applied with great efforts. The final step of restoration of the Golden Horn was the creation of social and cultural transformation of waterfront area. After the transformation projects, estuary has gained a new identity as cultural valley. Old factories and industrial plants were re-organized as cultural centers, museums and universities. Most of these places were located on shoreline. Therefore, water quality strongly affects the tourism activities because no one wants to visit a polluted places. By the rehabilitation project, environmental sustainability has been achieved. Furthermore, by the creation of cultural valley, social sustainability has been developed. With the increasing tourist attraction, economic development has also been achieved. Therefore, all of the three pillars of sustainability are formed. In conclusion, it can be said that the restoration and reorganization of the Golden Horn is a perfect example for sustainable tourism.

Figure 1. Important locations around the Golden Horn
REFERENCES


The Impact of Instagram Influencers on Tourists Hotel Perceptions: A Study on A Five Star Hotel In İstanbul

Zehra YARDI  
Lect., İstinye University  
zyardi@istinye.edu.tr

E. Ozan AKSOZ  
Assoc. Prof. Dr., Anadolu University  
ozana@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Instagram, which is one of the social media tools used today, is pioneering very popular methods. Marketing with influencers who are well-known people in the Instagram, one of the increasingly effective methods. When the studies are examined, it is seen that marketing activities made via social media platforms, especially Influencer works, are highly effective and affect the consumer significantly. It has become evident that the prominent way to reach out to tourists is via Instagram accounts. It is also apparent that traditional marketing fails to apply to city hotels, whereas influencer marketing becomes an asset for tourism. The proposed model connects fame, image and activities with the Instagram influencer and the way the decision making of the tourists are influenced when choosing to stay at a hotel. This paper examines the ways hotels can become attractive to tourists using Instagram influencers. The aim of the study is to understand and assess how the hotels work with the influencers. The Influencers worked on Instagram between the dates of 04.01.2018- 27.04.2019 in the five-star hotel examined in the research. This five-star hotel consists of 385 rooms and 68 suites and placed in Taksim, İstanbul. An interview consisting 15 questions were made with the hotel's public relations manager. The research results include; working with the Influencer are noted to be efficient, working with the influencers have increased the number of followers in the hotel's Instagram account, the likes of shares, the questions about accommodation and outlets on social media. Influencers promote for hotel, in response to this, receive service from the hotel and there is no regular working period with influencers.

Keywords: Influencer, Marketing, Instagram, Tourism

INTRODUCTION

Who want to continue using the assets you need every business today must use the opportunities of marketing methods? Marketing from past to present; conditions have changed due to the development of technology and many different variables. New concepts have been added to the marketing in today's world where the demands and needs of the consumer are not taken into consideration, and people-oriented, demand and advertising and sales gain importance only from the period when production is based. One of these is the Electronic Word of Mouth (EWOM). E-WOM; Potential, positive or negative statements made by real or former customers about a product or company that is presented to many individuals and institutions via the Internet (Hennig-Thurau ve ark., 2004, sf. 39).

The information on the Internet is usually provided through the websites of companies prepared by marketers. The basis of this system is that people in social media share their opinions with others by creating media content as photographs, videos or text. Blogs, discussion forums, shopping sites and social media websites are different types of e-WOM platforms.

Instagram, one of the most used and highly interactive social media platforms in recent years, is one of the e-WOM tools. Users have the ability to announce their likes, comments and shares to large audiences by labeling the brands, people and institutions they want in this platform where they share their photos. The opportunities to reach these broad masses have become remarkable in the field of marketing. Influencer is called people, individuals and groups who have the power to influence and direct certain communities by sharing their experiences and comments on the products and services they receive through the social media channel they own. Most Brands do not engage in large advertising campaigns with famous people. They
prefer influencers. Influencers, who will display their natural environment by adapting their brands to their daily lives, are more effective in influencing the target audiences.

The aim of this study is to understand the reasons, working methods of hotel businesses operating in the field of tourism with Influencers and how effective these works are in promoting hotels.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

When we look at the concept of social media marketing, it means a process that will contribute to the products, services and web pages of businesses online to a wide audience that cannot be reached with the traditional advertisements of the media (Erçiş ve Yıldız, 2017). Companies use social networking platforms to become recognized online and to hold on to their products (Yücel ve Kızkapan, 2016). All these activities and objectives encourage companies to use different marketing ways.

Influencer Marketing is a kind of electronic word of mouth marketing (E-wom) and one of the new generation marketing methods used extensively in social networks. This marketing method can influence an audience by introducing and marketing methods on social media.

The basis of the electronic marketing activities is the monitoring of the experience of the influencers through social media by those intending to purchase. People want to know what kind of emotion, satisfaction and effect the product and service will buy. In today’s world which the services and products offered are similar, the quality and the diversity of the experience gained by the person gain importance. The concept of experiential marketing has been put forward by Pine and Gilmore (1998) within the scope of experience economics studies and they have stated that they buy activities belonging to this product along with the service they receive. At this stage, influencers staging their experiences through social media are important mediators of experiential marketing.

Figure 1 shows the figures reached by social media as of 2019. 7,676 billion, of which 4.388 billion while the world’s population of Internet users utilize social media as their 3,484 billion in assets. All of these figures show a striking number in order to predict the audience that can be reached through marketing activities on social media.

All these people who use social media extensively can use various digital platforms such as Facebook, Instagram, YouTube, Twitter and LinkedIn. All these social platforms support brands in various ways in advertising, promotion and image works. Instagram, which is one of the active platforms in Influencer Marketing area, has close to 895 million users and the total number of users using this platform is 290 million, with age ranges between 25-34 (Figure 2).
Expenditures of social media users (Figure 3) show the highest figure in fashion and cosmetics with 525 billion dollars. When we look at the ranking in which expenditures are concentrated, we see areas such as electronics, food and furniture. Accommodation spending is on this list with $750 million. Considering the expenses made by users over the internet, it becomes necessary to reach the relevant audience via social media.

Influencer marketing is one of the most popular marketing methods in terms of brand recognition and access to brands. Brands that are unable to follow the trend in social networks cannot address the new generation but cannot make progress in recognition and image. Therefore, one of the main objectives of businesses should be to exist in social media. Brands that fail to meet this requirement will fail to achieve their desired goals.

In their study, Nathaniel J. (2017) examined the effect of Instagram’s explanation language (“SP”, “Sponsored” and “Paid Ads”) based on advertising, brand attitude, intention to purchase and advertising for sharing. According to the results of the previous researches, “Paid Advertising” announcements affect the participants’ memory and the language of the disclosure affects the attitude and sharing of the brand and has effective advertising features.

Ewers (2017) conducted research that provided information on marketing, an impressive element on Instagram. In this research he reached the following conclusions; that marketers can help sponsor sponsored Instagram posts to select an appropriate market, while the idea is that the shares on Instagram are very effective, as well as the search for additional features that determine how effective they are to persuade in marketing.
Chatzigeorgiou (2017) stated that the easiest way to reach the younger generation in 2000s is through social media accounts. In this study, it is emphasized that rural enterprises should use the personal relationships they have developed with their customers and expand these relations in social media. It is clear that traditional marketing cannot be implemented in small rural enterprises, whereas Influencer marketing is a valuable method for tourism.

When the studies are examined, it is seen that marketing activities made via social media platforms, especially Influencer works, are highly effective and affect the consumer significantly. Although the use of social media has become widespread in recent years, published studies are insufficient to explain this area. The studies have tried to explain social media, Influencers and their effect to buying behaviors in general.

**METHOD**

In terms of the structure of the sector, the usage areas of social media in the tourism sector are spreading to a very wide ground. It has become evident that the prominent way to reach out to tourists is via Instagram accounts. It is also apparent that traditional marketing fails to apply to city hotels, whereas influencer marketing becomes an asset for tourism. The proposed model connects fame, image and activities with the Instagram influencer and the way the decision making of the tourists are influenced when choosing to stay at a hotel. CVK Park Bosphorus Hotel, a 5-star hotel operating in Istanbul, has been identified as the working universe based on this study. The hotel is actively using the Influencer marketing method. The aim of the study is to understand and assess how the hotels work with the influencers. The Influencers worked on Instagram between the dates of 04.01.2018- 27.04.2019 in the five-star hotel examined in the research. Merve Alişan, the Public Relations Manager of the hotel, runs this process. 15 questions about this process were asked to the hotel public relations manager. She was interviewed beforehand and informed about the purpose of the study, why it was done, questions were sent by e-mail and feedback was received by the same method. The data obtained from the interviews were analyzed with descriptive analysis technique.

Questions and answers of the interview are as follows;

1. Which customer market is your hotel addressing?
   Our hotel appeals to the A ++ target audience from various continents from Middle East to Europe.

2. How did the hotel start working with influencers?
   The aim of our work is to reach the targeted masses more quickly and to provide rapid interaction between the brand and the target audience, we are in an industry that can be introduced with experience.

3. What criteria do you take into account when choosing Influencer?
   We attach importance to the audience, the quality of sharing, the number of followers, the brands he worked with and the quality of the brand and the influencer.

4. How do you get feedback on the influencers you are working with?
   Thanks to the influencers we work with, we increase the number of our followers and increase the likes of our shares. There is also an increase in booking requests regarding hotel accommodation and outlets via social media.

5. How do you analyze your feedback after working with influencers?
   The measurements are followed by our social media agency. After starting to work, we can measure with increasing interactions depending on the number of followers and tastes changing.

6. What services do you think influencers increase the interest in your hotel?
   We offer Influencers the opportunity to experience all the services in our hotel. In line with the services we provide, interest in social media (restaurants, rooms and SPA) is increasing.

7. Do you think that you are getting efficiency from your work with Influencer?
   We certainly think.

8. Which of the influencers you have worked with has been more effective in promoting your hotel? Why is that?
   Since we wanted to open up to the Iranian market, we worked with Influencer Sadaf Taherian from Iran for a period. The highest interaction occurred during the period we worked with her.

9. Are the agreements made with influencers for service or payment?
   Generally, we can work in two ways, but we prefer working for service.
10. What is your Influencer Marketing budget?
Depending on the economic conjuncture throughout the country and the projects developed on a yearly basis, it varies.

11. Is there a specific order of working periods with influencers?
No period is specified. Depending on the projects developed, we do this to support the project.

12. What are your principles of working with influencers?
We offer our guests the same way as Influencers staying in our hotel. Unreal service or product is not shared within the hotel. The target audience of the hotel and the audience of Influencer should be an overlapping audience. It is among our basic principles that we prefer not to work with different hotels while working with us.

13. How does your process of working with influencers work? (Story sharing? Photo sharing?)
The Influencer shares his experience as a post and story with content to interact with during his stay.

14. How do you contact Influencer? How do you get a return from them?
They mostly communicate via their social media accounts.

15. What are the advantages and disadvantages of working with influencers?
As an advantage, we can say that they do not create operational problems because they share their accommodation experiences and they enable us to reach the desired audience easily through their social media accounts. The disadvantage is that they cannot be made in accordance with an agreement since they are experiencing and that they spontaneously share their experiences during their stay from their accounts.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**
Influencers worked on Instagram between the dates of 04.01.2018 - 27.04.2019 in the 5-star hotel examined in the research are shown in Table 1 according to their dates, areas they work and the number of followers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>INFLUENCER</th>
<th>WORKING AREA</th>
<th>NUMBER OF FOLLOWERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27.04.2019</td>
<td>Aliya Bermukhambetova</td>
<td>Blog Writer</td>
<td>69.5B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.04.2019</td>
<td>Sadaf Taherian</td>
<td>Prominent Person</td>
<td>2.3MN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.03.2019</td>
<td>Leiti Hsu</td>
<td>Prominent Person</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.02.2019</td>
<td>Pink Frame Wedding</td>
<td>Photographer</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.12.2018</td>
<td>Cameliardrg</td>
<td>Tour company</td>
<td>25B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.11.2018</td>
<td>Melinasmom</td>
<td>Prominent Person</td>
<td>293B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.10.2018</td>
<td>Blerna Bensha Ujkanı</td>
<td>Personal blog</td>
<td>45.2B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.10.2018</td>
<td>Styleboom</td>
<td>Prominent Person</td>
<td>83.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.08.2018</td>
<td>Esra Bilgiç Töre</td>
<td>Actress</td>
<td>1MN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.07.2018</td>
<td>Cem Talu</td>
<td>Art</td>
<td>180B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.04.2018</td>
<td>Yogi Cameron</td>
<td>Yoga</td>
<td>10.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.04.2018</td>
<td>Zach King</td>
<td>Digital Creator</td>
<td>20.4M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.01.2018</td>
<td>Ahu Demirli</td>
<td>Blog Writer</td>
<td>26.5B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.01.2018</td>
<td>Lider Şahin</td>
<td>Musician</td>
<td>29.6B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 1.** Influencers where CVK Park Bosphorus Hotel works in Instagram.

Kaynak: https://www.instagram.com/parkbosphorus/

When the profiles of influencers are examined, it is observed that all of them have gained recognition with the use of social media, and they have cooperated with brands by interacting with the shares they have made in their profiles. It is seen that the lowest number of followers of the hotel’s influencers is 10,700 and the highest number of followers is 20 million 400 thousand.

Influencers are sharing photos and stories to promote the hotel according to their agreement with the hotel. These shares are planned to increase their interaction by reposting in the hotel profile (Picture 1).
When the studies conducted between certain periods are examined, it is observed that the most work period of the hotel is January 2019 (Table 2). It was observed that the studies did not contain a certain order and did not proceed systematically.

Table 3 shows the monthly occupancy rates of the hotel from January 2018 to April 2019. The highest occupancy rate of the hotel was in April 2019 and the lowest occupancy rate was in June 2018. Looking at the months worked most with influencers, it is observed that in January and February 2019, intensive work was carried out.

ADR (Average Daily Rate) is one of the data that the hotel considers trying to determine room rates. The highest ADR was reached in August 2018, while the lowest time was February 2018. Accordingly, the highest monthly income for this period was August 2018 and the lowest monthly income was June 2018. The food and beverage income was the highest in April 2019 and the lowest in June 2018.
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Working with influencers brings some advantages and disadvantages to businesses in the long and short term. When the advantages are considered, it has effects such as increasing the return on investment and expanding the audience.

In the studies and assessments, it is known that impressive individuals and accounts affect the purchasing decisions, expand the audience, choose and reach the desired audience, and can be applied to a wide range of increasing visibility on social media platforms.

It is concluded that working with influencers is effective. The most important point to be successful in this regard is the right decisions to be made in influencer selection. Choosing the right influencer is the decision to deliver the brand to the targeted audience, to increase awareness and to succeed in influencing the intent of buying.

About Cvk Park Bosphorus Hotel's work with Influencers, some results were reached as a result of the answers to the questions asked about the methods applied by the hotel. Results can be seen below;

- In general, working with the Influencer are noted to be efficient.
- The hotel appeals to the audience in the luxury segment in the Middle East from Europe.
- When selecting the Influencer, it is noted that Influencer’s follower audience, the share quality, the number of followers and the brands previously worked.
- Working with the influencers have increased the number of followers in the hotel's Instagram account, the likes on shares, the questions about accommodation and outlets on social media (Spa, restaurant, pastry shop, etc.).
- Influencers promote for hotel, in response to this, receive service from the hotel.
- There is no regular working period with influencers.
- Influencers are generally stated to contact the hotel to work with them.
- When working with the influencers, they should not share the fact that does not reflect and work with other hotels recently.
- Influencers publish their experiences as photo sharing in their profiles and stories.

There are not many publications and researches in the field of influencer marketing so this provides a wide working area for researchers. In addition, although the studies are generally oriented towards marketing, there is almost no work done in the field of tourism. Many studies can be done on the effects of Influencer marketing, working methods and factors affecting tourism.

REFERENCES


Bibliometric Analysis of Tourism Economics Field Studies

Sezi AYDIN  
Res.Assist., Anadolu University  
seziaydin@anadolu.edu.tr

Cem IŞIK  
Assoc.Prof.Dr., Anadolu University  
cemisik@anadolu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to review studies published in SSCI journal, Tourism Economics which subjected Turkey in the context of sampling. In that sense, the condition of studies which subjected Turkey is considered highly important for further researches. For this purpose, bibliometric analysis approach carried out by reviewing a total of 55 publications under the eight parameters as publication year, number of authors, pages, and citations, destination (i.e. national, international), publication type, and research approach. Results revealed that international studies were prominent, studies are increased in years, in articles are more prominent and finally, all researches are carried out empirically.

Key Words: Tourism Economics, Turkey, Bibliometric Analysis

INTRODUCTION

Turkey plays a critical role in terms of tourism industry in addition to its varied and wealthy potential in supply and demand. Increase was driven by a strong demand in Turkey’s tourism in last two decades, demonstrated by Turkish Statistical Institute that the number of tourist arrivals reached around from 9 to 39 million. Cultural and social attractiveness of Country is assessed as an economic asset through tourism. One of the most crucial aspects of tourism for countries is the income in which generated by tourist expenses. Crucial amount of resources are transferred from developed economies to less developed one through tourism.

In 1960s beside the beginning the rise of tourism in Turkey, scientific studies related to tourism also began to increase. Scientific studies in both national and international literature that situated Turkey as a destination are important in terms of tourism industry in Turkey. In this context, quantitatively analytical approach to the studies toward to tourism Turkey considered highly crucial to shed light on Turkey’s current stand in tourism industry.

Scientific studies published in Tourism Economics which is an international refereed journal predominantly focuses on components of tourism services and micro and macro level economic organization of tourism. Tourism Economics is also a journal that categorized in SSCI in which qualified studies published in the field of tourism. A total of 55 published studies reached subjected to Turkey as a destination in this very journal since its beginning to publish from 1994 to current.

By reviewing studies have published in Tourism Economics Journal subjected Turkey in tourism field, the purpose of this study is to analyze those studies in bibliometric context and constitute a source for researchers who are willing to conduct a research in this field. For this purpose, first of all, the literature reviewed then the data related to bibliometric analysis are presented, finally the results of the study evaluated and in conclusion, various suggestions proposed.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Uniqueness is crucial for scientific research and in order to produce unique research it is important to review and evaluate the studies previously performed in that related subject. Bibliometric researches are analysis the feature of studies in; research subject, journal, publication year, citations, number of pages, etc. both quantitative and qualitatively (Al ve Tonta, 2004). In addition, such research approaches are by shed lights on a relevant subject, discipline, journal, etc leads to researchers in the context of their direction to a
subject. Cole and Eales (1917) have performed the first bibliometric study by reviewing studies published in anatomy literature in statistically.

Particularly in the 1980s, bibliometric studies technique was frequently used in various disciplines and research field (Lawani, 1981; Ağaoğlu, 1985; Potter, 1988; Hoffman ve Holbrook, 1993; Kozak, 2000). Continuously increase in the number of tourism studies the qualification of literature and articles, impact factor and development processes of the literature evolved bibliometrics as an important research approach (Hall, 2011).

A study examined the academic literature of tourism in Turkey concluded the improvement in primary and secondary sources demonstrated the influential role of institutions, individuals and organizations in the formation of literature. As a result, the study determined that in the field of tourism in Turkey a wide range of quantitative research have performed, besides, these improvements in both quantitative and qualitative research approaches are better far beyond than much of the countries around the world (Kozak, 2000).

Leung and Law (2007) reviewed 4140 researches based on information technology in tourism published in six different journals between 1986-2005. As a result, the authors determined that researches increased prominently between 1986 and 2005 on the other hand, they have found that these studies conducted by different researchers from different countries, in addition to these researches conducted by more than one author, authors found significant differences between those authors title and authors as well.

Huang and Hsu (2008) performed a bibliometric study towards to studies published in Tourism and Tribune Journal between 2000-2005 for the purpose of determining the research subject conducted on tourism and accommodation field. Results show that tourism resources development and management, tourism planning, the problems of the tourism industry are predominantly used subject is studies. In these studies, it was concluded that the qualitative research approaches were predominantly used while in quantitative approaches statistical analyses were loose.

Ma and Law (2009) have reviewed 1034 studies published in Annals of Tourism Research Journal with an interdisciplinary approach in terms of competency of tourism research in various parameters. Authors determined that most of researches published in this journal in tourism subjected were classified under 20 category as social and cultural issues, tourism and economics, psychology and tourist behavior issues, destination planning and development, heritage and environment issues.

In a scientific research examining the bibliometric profile of studies in tourism marketing field, Ozel and Kozak (2012) focused on analysis of tourism marketing overall features. A total of 286 national studies published in tourism marketing field were examined in terms of following parameters; years, number of researchers, subfield of studies, distribution to resources type, most cited journals, authors, and institutions. Results showed that most researches were published predominantly in 2010, while they were conducted by two authors, on the other hand, in terms of type of resources most of the researches were published as books, finally, the most cited journal were Tourism Management.

In this present study, a concise historical background of bibliometric studies were mentioned and researches that related to bibliometric studies were summarised. However, during the literature review, it was figured out that studies subjected to Turkey remain lacking. Therefore, the purpose of this very study is to apply bibliometric analyze the international studies subjected to Turkey.

METHOD

Bibliometric studies which have published in a scientific field are important in terms of both highlighting some features and giving some cues for scientific communication as; subject, year, institution that contributed, keywords, number of authors, citations, joint citations (Ulu ve Akdağ, 2015). These researches provide knowledge to researchers in a related subject besides presents information about development of scientific researches or its current status. Bibliometric data are used frequently in providing information about countries, universities, research institutes, journals, specific discipline, and subject (Huang, Ho ve Chuang, 2006: 75-76).

The purpose of this study is to examine bibliometric features of studies published in Tourism Economics Journal which subjected Turkey and present information to researchers who are interested in related topic. In addition, this study also aims to demonstrate academic literature improvement of Turkey's tourism. In that sense, the sample of this study is Tourism Economics Journal publishing academic researches since 1995. In this context, bibliometric analysis approach carried out by reviewing a total of 55 publications
under the eight parameters as publication year, number of authors, pages, and citations, destination (i.e., national, international), publication type, and research approach.

This current study is considered crucial in both demonstrating the status of the studies subjected to Turkey and the qualification of the studies published in Tourism Economics Journal. The scientific studies published in Tourism Economics Journal evaluated in abstract, title and keyword context that contains the concept “Turkey” together acquired entire years published in the journal. In that sense, relevant journal has reviewed between August 01-05, 2019 in the context of aforementioned parameters and a total of 55 researches have reached, these researches constitutes of the sample of this study.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In this study in order to examine studies subjected Turkey a total of 55 researches have reached that published in Tourism Economic Journal. By using some determined parameters, bibliometric analysis applied to scientific researches that subjected to Turkey. In that sense, it was aimed to enlighten the status of the studies that subjected to Turkey and present information to the researchers. In order to perform bibliometric analysis approach eight parameters were determined for these 55 publications; publication year, number of authors, pages, and citations, destination (i.e., national, international), publication type, and research approach. In the first stage of the analysis, the acquired studies were examined in accordance with one of each parameter and tabulated. Findings were presented below in accordance to the parameters.

Publication Year

The publication year of studies examined in Tourism Economic Journal contains 1999-2019. Tablo 1. shows that there are no studies published for the year of 2001, 2004 and 2008 while there are studies that contain Turkey as a sample from 2009 to current. On the other hand in 2000, 2003, 2006, 2007, 2009, 2018 with only one study carried out it was determined that these years are the least years in which studies conducted, while most studies conducted respectively in the years of; 2013 (nine studies), 2012 (seven studies) finally 2019 (six studies).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publication Year</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Number of Author

As shown in Figure 1, single authored researches were 23.6% while 36.4% of them were two authors. It was also determined the number of authors in proportionately respectively 20% of researches with three, 4.5% of four, finally 5.5% of the researches were conducted with five authors. This result demonstrates that researchers prefer to conduct their studies in this field by either by themself or with a colleague. Even though researchers, in general, prefer to study individually, tourism studies as a matter of fact its interdisciplinary aspect facilitates and frequently conducted researches with either two and more authors.

![Figure 1. Number of Author](image)

Number of Pages

As shown in Figure 2, the number of pages of study consists of with at least five pages while most were 37 pages. The number of 10 studies page that published in the journal consists of 5 to 10 on the other hand 32 of them were 11-16 pages. Since most of the researches were empirical, the tables and figures were thought to increased the number of pages in studies. On the other hand, this parameter may also be the result of the publication principles of the journal as well.

![Figure 2. Number of Pages](image)
Number of References

Figure 3 demonstrates the number of references searchers have benefited in their studies. As shown in Figure 3 while the least number of references that researchers have benefited were 5, the most were 117. The majority of 55 studies (27.3%) were benefited from 16 to 26 references while 60 and more references occurred rather common (23.6%). The number of references is highly related issue to limitation of the sources, accessibility and rigorous of the researchers. It was concluded that in studies conducted towards Turkey, the studies benefited references mostly between 16 to 26.

![Figure 3. Number of References](image)

Number of Citations

The number of citation of a study provides information about both its feature and place in the field. Based on the analysis the number of citations of studies have differed from 0 to 370. The majority of citations in the studies (47%) were between 0 and 15 times. As shown in Figure 4. the number of citation of the 26 studies of which constitute almost 50% of the studies examined were between 0 and 15. Given the citation values of the overall 55 studies, it was determined that six studies received no citation while the rest of the six were published currently in 2019. The number of citation is highly related to the accessibility and degree of interest that the relevant topic receives in the field of that study.

![Figure 4. Number of Citations](image)
Destinations (National, International)

The majority of these 55 evaluated studies (78%) sampled Turkey in an international context while the remaining of the studies (22%) dealt national only. It is plausible to select Turkey as a sample of international tourism studies due to Turkey is a tourism country. Therefore, Turkey placed in these international studies as field of research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sampling</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>78,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>21,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Publication Type

Given the type of publication of 55 studies, it was determined that 49 of studies were articles (89%) while six of them were research report (see Table 2). To publish article were stand out more than reports because of both drawn interested of other authors and qualification of publishing. Given the studies published in journal of Tourism Economics have high standards, it is rather plausible that most of the works were articles.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publication Type</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Article</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>89,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Note</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Research Approach

Research approaches provide pre-knowledge toward of qualification of studies. In general, research approaches divided in two categories; empirical and theoretical. All total of 55 studies which are examined in the scope of this study were empirical. Given the overall profile of tourism studies as Turkey have selected as a field of research, empirical approach was frequently preferred (see Table 3). Considering the theoretical framework of these studies were in predominantly such as business and economics sciences, it is not surprising that empirical approach was applied in studies. However, in addition to positivist, theoretical research approach and reviewing case studies and analytical comparisons among countries based on these studies may contribute to widening the literature in this field.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Approach</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Empirical</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Bibliometric studies are considered important in the context of better understanding of publications, leading the authors in the field of related topics and demonstrating the gap in a specific field of research. This study aims to analyze quantitative status of studies published in the Journal of Tourism Economics that Turkey’s have selected by authors as a sample of study. In this context, for the study, bibliometric analyse was applied to a total of 55 scientific publications under the eight parameters as destination (i.e national, international), publication type, and research approach.

It was concluded that studies were mostly international which Turkey was chosen as case and studies were increased in recent years. On the other hand in the research approach context, studies which are published were more of articles while all of the researches were empirically based on the analyses. The studies were conducted with mostly two authors and the number of page of these studies were predominantly between 11-16 while authors benefitted from 16-26 sources and finally it was determined that most of the studies received 0-15 citations.

As a conclusion of this study, one may conclude that the number of studies related to Turkey is limited. It is a known fact that European countries allocate a significant amount of resources for scientific researches. In Turkey also, particularly as a matter of fact by using university funds the authors can be encouraged to produce publications. There are gaps in literature need to be filled in both theoretical and case studies context that Turkey was chosen as field of research. Given considered in publication types context, articles were considered the most favored and evaluated as accessible and have more potential to receive citations. For tourism researchers, one may conclude that in addition to empirical studies, analytical theoretical reviews thought to be convenient fields of research for international literature. Because of the time limitation, this study includes studies published only in journal of Tourism Economics. Tourism Economics journal is an SSCI journal, therefore, it is thought to be more convenient in this study to examine the studies published in which contain the same standards. By including some other journals, conducting further researches in this field, perhaps will enable more comprehensive results.
REFERENCES


A Study on Exploring the Tourism Potential of Altınköy as a Rural Tourism and Recreational Activity Area

Aysê ATAR
Assist.Prof.Dr., 19 Mayıs Üniversitesi
aysee.atar@gmail.com

Seda ÖZDEMİR AKGÜL
Res.Assist.Dr., Selçuk Üniversitesi
sedaozdemir8@gmail.com

Muharrem TUNA
Prof. Dr., Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi
muharrem@gazi.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The aim of the current study is to explore the tourism potential of Altındağ in the light of the tourism values embraced by Altınköy which is one of both rural and recreational tourism areas, and to reveal the perspectives of local community and visitors on the rural tourism area in the region. From this point of view, the views of local people and visitors about the tourism potential of Altınköy, which is a rural tourism area, were intended to be measured. The study was conducted in Altınköy located in Altındağ, Ankara, which is considered to be one of the potential rural tourism areas in Turkey, between August 2018 and October 2018 via face-to-face interview, a qualitative interview technique, with 103 individuals in total 53 visitors and 50 working staff- who were selected through random sampling method. The findings obtained as a result of the analyses point out significant results regarding the contribution to the development of rural tourism in the region, promotion of the region and its becoming a brand.

Key Words: Altınköy, Open-Air Village Museum, Rural Tourism, Leisure Time, Recreation.

INTRODUCTION

Rural tourism as a tourism type is dependent on natural resources, besides having positive connotations with rural settlements. Rural tourism embraces natural attraction elements and rural areas such as villages, farms, adventure and sport venues (Situmorang et al., 2019: 20). Since it shines out the attractiveness of adventure and sport venues which are part of recreational areas, rural tourism is considered as a component of recreation, as well. Ecotourism, rural tourism, soft tourism, alternative tourism and many other similar tourism terms describe recreational tourism activities organized in environmental-rural areas (Komppula, 2014: 361; Cucari Wankowicz and De Falco, 2019; 105). Thanks to the advantages it brings along, rural tourism rises in its importance day by day among other alternative tourism types in Turkey. While contributing to the development of the tourism economy in the country, it promotes, in the context of destinations, the existing tourism mobility by introducing such elements as promotion, attractiveness and development of the region.

One of the regions tending towards development in rural tourism is Altınköy, which has put into practice a different touristic activity plan by offering visitors with the village life of 100 years ago, and thus, be flooded by visitors every year. Located in Altındağ district of Ankara, Turkey, Altınköy reflects the village life in the 1930s, 1940s and 1950s and thus, not only provides visitors with memorable experiences but also paves the way for them to enjoy their free time. Due to various resources of high value such as the way of preserving customs and traditions and historical and cultural characteristics it embodies, the preferability of Altınköy among different tourism destinations increases day by day. Accordingly, the purpose of the current study is to explore the tourism potential of Altınköy, Ankara, to protect and improve the existing
value sources of Altınköy, to ensure the transfer of natural and cultural heritage to next generations and to contribute to further development of rural tourism in Altınköy.

In the context of the current study, the research question determined by the researchers are as follows: From the visitors’ and working staff’s point of view, does Altınköy, which is one of the recreational and rural tourism areas hosting various recreational activities, have sufficient volume of tourism potential?

The study is thought to be important as it will reveal the tourism potential of Ankara-Altınköy, which is one of both recreational and rural tourism areas and has a limited number of studies, and in theory, it will be crucial for the future rural-recreation areas to provide researchers with ideas for local governments.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Along with the change in consumers’ understanding of travel nowadays, the 3S (sea, sun, sand)-based holiday options, which are considered under the umbrella of mass tourism, has undergone a downward transformation in recent years (Hacıoğlu and Avıcıkurt, 2008: 255). Following the announcement by the World Tourism Organization in 1995 with regard to the damages of mass tourism on nature and environment, the interest of the consumer groups who have environmental consciousness and have become more aware of the issue have started to rotate towards alternative tourism products and services that would minimize the harm to the environment and nature (Dursun et al., 2017: 9). One of the alternative types of tourism that consumers have leaned towards is rural tourism that allows activities in rural areas, minimizes the harm to the environment and nature, and provides sustainability (Fons et al., 2011; Su et al., 2019; Amir et al., 2015).

The growing interest in rural areas over time has led to an increase in the number of definitions of rural tourism in the literature. However, there is no commonly-accepted definition of rural tourism and it seems quite difficult to come up with a definition of generic nature (Tchetchik et al., 2008: 554).

Rural tourism brings together people, place, consumption, mixed cultures, values, expectations and experiences and offers tourists with a broad recreational area to discover (Edwards et al., 2008: 1034). In the scope of this alternative type of tourism, tourists are provided with the opportunity to spend time in rural areas such as recreational spots, bazaars, forests and highlands. Thus, not only the underdeveloped touristic regions are promoted for rural tourism but also new strategies are adopted in order to contribute to the further development of the region as a rural tourism destination, to provide the local community with employment opportunities and to generate additional income in the region (Dursun et al., 2017:8).

The fact that it is a type of tourism immune to seasonality generates employment and income sources for local people, promotes sustainable tourism approach (Tang et al., 2013; Daugstad, 2008; Xue et al., 2017; Démurger et al., 2010), serves as an important advertisement tool in the promotion of the country, embodies various and authentic recreational activities, facilitates communication through socialization, and allows active recreational activities as well as passive activities in the region can be listed as the main characteristics of the concept of rural tourism (Hacıoğlu and Avıcıkurt, 2008: 70; Dursun et al., 2017:9; Kiper, 2006: 35; Ahipaşaoğlu and Çeltek 2006: 87).

Many countries in Europe (France, Italy, Spain, Germany, England, Ireland, the Netherlands, Belgium, Portugal etc.) have made notable progress in rural tourism development (Randelli et al., 2014: 276). Some of the examples from Turkey that come to mind in the context of rural tourism destinations where recreational activities frequently take place are İzmir/Şirince, Bursa/Cumalıkızık Village, Trabzon/ Uzungöl, Bursa/Safranbolu, Ankara/Beypazarı, Fethiye/Kayaköy.

As the studies before 1980s discussing the concept of rural tourism were reviewed individually, it was observed that the concept was never examined as a concept of tourism on its own (Edwards et al., 2008: 1034).

Sub-themes of the studies carried out on the concept of rural tourism are presented on Figure 1 below (Christou et al., 2018; Amir et al., 2015; Bravi and Gasca, 2014; Su et al., 2019; Cucari et al., 2019; 105; Fons et al., 2011; Zhou, 2014; Eusébio et al., 2017; Falak et al., 2014; Adeyinka-Ojo et al., 2014; Situmorang et al., 2019; Wang and Yotsumoto, 2019; Bălan and Burghlea, 2015; Rid et al., 2014; Snieška et al., 2014; Gao and Wu, 2017; Jesus and Franco, 2016; Gao and Wu, 2017; Barkauskas et al., 2015; Paresishvili et al., 2017; Kellher et al., 2018; Li et al., 2016; Zhang et al., 2018; Cosma et al., 2014; Zheng et al., 2019; Prabhakaran, Nair and Ramachandran, 2014; Hernández et al., 2016; Campón-Cerro et al., 2017; Christou, and Sharpley, 2019).
In the light of Figure 1, researchers discussed under which sub-theme the research would be carried out, and consequently, in the scope of the theme of “tourism potential”.

One of the rural tourism destinations hosting recreational activities is Open-air Village Museum in Altınköy, Ankara, which is subject to the current study. Open-air museum along with its attractions such as forests, parks, lakes, chapel and tower offers an experience of unique and old village life and draws the attention of many visitors with different tourist typologies. Altınköy Open-air Village Museum stands out as the first open-air village museum in Turkey. The presence of traditional ‘çanti’ houses within the boundaries of this open-air museum which are among cultural heritage properties in Turkey and the fact that each house in the museum area is attributed with a specific theme have enhanced the recreational and cultural diversity in the region (Figure 2).
METHOD

The Study Site
Field study was conducted between August and November, 2018 in Altınköy/Turkey and nearby recreational areas with the purpose of revealing the tourism potential of the region, and relevant stakeholders (local community, visitors, personnel working in the area), who were selected via convenience sampling method which is one of the sub-groups of non-probabilistic sampling, were interviewed. Considering the fact that the individuals interviewed within the scope of the current study may not have sufficient knowledge about the concepts of recreational area and rural tourism, qualitative interview technique was preferred. Before being interviewed via face-to-face interview technique, the research subjects were provided with basic information about the terms that they are not familiar with, and then the researchers proceeded with the interview process.

Data Analyses
Semi-structured interview as a frequently used technique in the scope of qualitative research methods was adopted in the current study (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2013: 46). In this context, data were collected from written sources through literature analysis and observation. In the study, convenience sampling method, one of the sub-groups of non-probabilistic sampling, was used. Within the scope of this technique (non-probabilistic sampling) that has emerged under the umbrella of the qualitative research tradition, a panorama of the existing matters is acquired. The matters subject to qualitative research are revealed in all details and by all possible distinguishing features (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2008; Nastasi, 1998; Robinson, 2014; Marshall, 1996).

The research sample consists of 103 (53 visitors and 50 working staff) individuals in total including the staff working in the field of recreational rural tourism and the visitors visiting the region, who have been selected via non-probabilistic sampling method. The sample covers male and female respondents of the X, Y and Z generations within the age range of 18-50. Interviews were held in August-October 2018.

The questions were prepared according to the research objectives determined by the common point of view after investigating the studies related to the recreational and rural areas and the opinions of Altınköy staff and visitors involved in the research on the destination. Both Altınköy was observed by the researchers and the opinions of the visitors and staff were continuously received at different times. The site was visited at 2-day intervals for 1 month. Before the research questions were formed, the first step was to talk with the people who knew about the destination and then the field was visited by the researchers. Within the scope of the development process of the semi-structured interview form, the form was presented to expert's opinion and the experts were asked to express their opinions and recommendations with specific remarks as “Appropriate”, “Not appropriate” and “Your recommendations for revise”. Clear and comprehensible instructions and items were acquired in accordance with the opinions and recommendations by the experts. Throughout this process, reliability of the questions was tested via Miles and Huberman (1994)’s formula \[\text{Reliability} = \frac{\text{Consensus}}{\text{Consensus} + \text{Disagreement}}\], and the items with a coefficient of fit fixed at 0.70 and above were included into interview form. The value of the coefficient of fit indicates that interview questions can be used at high reliability.

QSR NVivo 10, the computer-based qualitative analysis program, was used to facilitate encoding of the data. This program represents an inductive coding process that focuses on identifying key concepts, ideas, or justifications that are clearly expressed in the data, rather than categorizing them using pre-existing codes or questions (Vaismoradi, Jones, Turunen and Snelgrove, 2016). The first phase of coding begins by identifying the wide range of temporary themes of all three authors on research questions. In this process, the researchers were asked to include the metaphors and motives of interviewees in one of the draft themes/categories that they have already listed, or to create a new theme. The simultaneous coding efforts of all three authors provided the consistency in the coding process (often referred to as inter-code reliability). No inconsistencies were spotted along the coding process, and the process was finalized by the creation of a codebook that includes common definitions for each code (Lombard, Snyder-Duch and Bracken, 2002). After the finalization of the coding process by the researchers, research findings were concluded based on the analysis and interpretation of the research data. The research findings were analyzed and interpreted separately in the context of the working staff and the visitors in Altınköy.
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In this chapter, findings and interpretations related to the data obtained as a result of the interviews with the working staff in Altınköy and the visitors for the purpose of exploring the tourism potential of Altınköy are presented separately.

Findings and Interpretations on Visitors in Research Sample

According to the findings covering 53 visitors in total, 29% of the visitors were male and 71% were female. Examining the educational status of the visitors, it is observed that 81% of respondents have university degree, 9% are high school graduates, 6% are primary school graduates and 2% have master’s and doctorate degree. According to the findings on 50 personnel who were involved in the research, 20% of working staff is male and 80% is female. When the educational status of the personnel involved in the study is examined, it is seen that 50% graduated from primary school, 22% from high school and university and 6% from associate degree programs.

It is observed that 74% of the respondents visited Altınköy for the first time, 6% for two times, 7% for three times, 2% for four times, and 11% for five times or more.

| Table 1. Findings on Sufficiency of Tourism and Food and Beverage Facilities in Altınköy (Visitors and Working Staff Views) |
|---|---|---|
| **Visitor** |  |  |
| (n) |  |  |
| Enough | 38 | 15 |
| Not enough and the number should be increased | 9 | 33 |
| Insufficient on weekend | 3 | 43 |
| Variety of menus rather than numbers can be increased | 5 | 9 |
| Total | 50 | 100 |
| **Working Staff** |  |  |
| (n) |  |  |
| Enough | 38 | 76 |
| Not enough and the number should be increased | 9 | 18 |
| Insufficient on weekend | 3 | 6 |
| Total | 50 | 100 |

As a response to the question “Do you think that the number of tourism enterprises and food and beverage facilities in Altınköy is sufficient?”, 15% of the visitors expressed that the number is sufficient, 33% indicated that the number is insufficient and should be increased, 43% mentioned that the facilities fall short of providing services in the weekends, and 9% recommended enhancing the variety of menu selection rather than increasing the number of facilities. For the same question 76% of the working staff expressed that the number is sufficient, 18% indicated that the number is insufficient and should be increased, and 6% mentioned that the facilities fall short of providing services in the weekends. In the light of the research results, it is seen that visitors and working staff have counter arguments regarding the sufficiency of tourism/food and beverage facilities in Altınköy.
As shown on Figure 4, as a response to the question “Which factor has influenced you to revisit Altınköy? Majority of the visitors interviewed has listed the factors as “natural environment”, “nostalgic structure”, “the presence of green areas”.

Figure 3. Findings on the Factors Effective on Revisiting Intention

Figure 4. Findings on the Factors Driving Respondents to Prefer Altınköy (Visitors Views)

Figure 5. Findings on the Reasons Why People Visit Altınköy (Working Staff View)
In Figure 4, with regard to the question “What motivates you to prefer Altinköy?”, the visitors selected the following expressions evenly (17 respondents per item): “It has a different concept”, “It has a relaxing effect”, and “It is intertwined with nature”. In Figure 5, with regard to the question “What do you think that motivates people to visit Altinköy?”, the majority of working staff responded “it has a nostalgic structure”. “It has a different concept”, “its nature”, and “clean-air” are among the most frequently mentioned responses by the working staff who were involved in the interview process in the scope of the current study.

In Figure 6, vast majority of visitors responded “Transportation” to the question “What do you think are the current problems in Altinköy?” In addition, visitors expressed that the high-rise buildings located outside Altinköy is another negativity in the region? In Figure 7, it was concluded that the biggest problem in Altinköy is related to transportation services. It is observed that publicity, infrastructure, lack of security are the other problems in Altinköy.
In Figure 8, with regard to the question “What are the benefits of Rural Tourism to Altındağ?”, the majority of working staff responded that Altınköy provides benefits to the region it is located in. Other responses to the question are respectively as follows: “Providing employment to the people in the region”, “Recognition of the region”, “Supporting the village life”, and “Image change in positive direction”.

Figure 8. Findings on Benefits of Rural Tourism to Altındağ (Working Staff Views)

Figure 9. Findings on Activities for the Publicity of Altınköy (Working Staff Views)

Figure 10. Findings on Activities for the Publicity of Altınköy (Visitor Views)
In figure 9, the majority of the responses by the working staff in Altınköy to the question “What can/should be done for the publicity of Altınköy?” includes the following recommendations: “Social media use for the publicity of Altınköy”, “Region-specific posters/banners”, and “Active use of media and broadcast channels”. In Figure 10, majority of visitors responded “social media”, and this recommendation was followed respectively by “Television”, “Media”, “Poster/Banner, Advertisements”.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Taking into consideration in the light of the purpose of the current research (From the visitors’ and working staff’s point of view, does Altınköy, which is one of the recreational and rural tourism areas hosting various recreational activities, have sufficient volume of tourism potential?), it was concluded that Altınköy has a suitable infrastructure for rural tourism and recreational activities; however, it requires further development in the sense of the sufficiency of tourism potential.

76% of working staff in Altınköy responded “Sufficient” to the question “Do you think that the number of tourism enterprises and food and beverage facilities in Altınköy is sufficient?” whereas 33% of visitors put forward a counter-view and responded that the number is insufficient and should be increased, and 43% indicated that the number is insufficient on the weekends. From visitor’s point of view, the reason underlying the insufficiency could be that the enterprises fall short of meeting the expectations (fast service, diversity of menu content, expected quality, insufficient personnel). From working staff’s point of view, on the other hand, the fact that the presence of new enterprises in the region would bring along competition and have an impact on financial profits would have stimulated the working staff to express a positive view on the number of facilities.

- In order to eliminate the dissatisfaction of visitors, enterprises may come up with solutions to improve the current situation through fast service-delivery, diverse menu content, adequate physical conditions (seating area, number of personnel, restrooms).

In the light of the conclusions based on the findings, the most frequently expressed statements by the working staff and visitors in Altınköy with regard to the reasons motivating individuals to prefer and visit Altınköy are as follows: “having a different concept”, “having a nostalgic structure”, “having a relaxing impact”, “nature” and “clean air”.

- The research results have revealed not only the fact the factors motivating individuals to prefer/visit Altınköy are “nature-based” but also that Altınköy has an image of natural environment. Based on this point of view, green areas can be expanded and new natural recreational areas can be set up in order to sustain the natural environment image and maintain and further increase the preferability of Altınköy, which is defined as both a recreational and rural tourism area.

Based on the research findings, it is seen that Altınköy as a recreational and rural tourism area has an attractive structure due to its nature, greenery and different concept. Despite its attractive nature, the fact that inaccessibility of Altınköy is perceived as a negative point by visitors, and as the reason underlying the region’s not being visited by the working staff reveals that this issue is considered as a serious problem by both sides. Consistent with the other findings in the study, another conclusion drawn from the interviews with the working staff in Altınköy put forward that the transportation problem is the biggest obstacle in Altınköy. Visitors’ responses to the questions on the accessibility of Altınköy point out that transportation infrastructure and accessibility of Altınköy should be improved. In addition, visitors mentioned that high-rise buildings located outside Altınköy is another negativity in the region.

- In order to eliminate the negative environmental appearance highlighted by the visitors, afforestation practices can be adopted in a way to render invisible the high-rise buildings outside the boundaries of Altınköy. Thus, visitors’ perception of “natural environment” associated with Altınköy will be reinforced.

- Considering the problem of lack of transportation infrastructure, which is considered as a problem both by the visitors and the working staff, it can be proposed that the transportation infrastructure and the routes to Altınköy should be improved and maintained. In order to increase the preferability of Altınköy, practices and efforts to ease the transportation can be adopted. For busy visit-days, a free shuttle service can also be provided at specific locations. It is considered that this practice will have a positive impact on the number of visitors and contribute to perception and familiarity of Altınköy as a recreational activity area.
According to the findings, the visitors have mentioned that the most appropriate communication tool to increase publicity of Altınköy is social media. This suggestion is followed by "television", "mass media" and "posters/banners".

- Considering the fact that social media is the most effective communication tool for the publicity of Altınköy, visitors can be motivated to be online on social media during their visit. It can be benefited from the power of social media through encouraging visitors (via awards, discounts etc.) to share location, pictures and videos in Altınköy.

According to the findings, the responses of working staff in Altınköy point out that rural tourism in Altınköy supports employment in Altındağ, promotes the region, sustains village life and provides cultural heritage.

With regard to the recommendations on publicity of Altınköy, the working staff proposed the following options, respectively: “Use of social media to promote Altınköy”, “Region-specific posters/banners”, and “Active use of media”. The working staff’s recommendations on increasing the number of tourists in Altınköy are as follows: “Region-specific posters and banners should be used”, “Altınköy-based advertisements should be organized and increased in numbers”, “Altınköy should be supported by travel guides and agencies”, and “Altınköy should be included in the travel routes of tourists visiting Ankara”.

- In the light of the recommendations from visitors and working staff in Altınköy, a powerful social media effect in relation to the publicity of Altınköy can be provided through close cooperation between visitors and working staff.
- Region-specific posters and banners can be disseminated to the entire city to reinforce the effectiveness of publicity.
- Bilateral meetings between the municipality and the travel guides/agencies can be held to find a common ground on including Altınköy into travel routes of tourists.

In the context of the practical implications in the current study, as general recommendations for small regions in Turkey and abroad which operate or are to operate in the future in a similar form to Altınköy, the disadvantages/negativities which are highlighted in the research findings and may emerge in the regions with similar characteristics with Altınköy may be taken into notice and these disadvantageous factors may be eliminated at the construction stage of new areas. The current study paves the way for other studies to be conducted on similar small regions.

There exists limited number of studies conducted on tourism potential of rural tourism. Researchers can contribute to the theoretical background by way of investigating other recreational areas within the scope of their studies focusing on small regions as in this study, and of revealing the degree of familiarity of the region in question. In this regard, giving weight to the studies bearing similar characteristics with the current one and bringing new perspectives on the subject matter through the comparison of the studies are considered to be of great importance in terms of contributing to the existing literature.

REFERENCES


Analysis of the Concepts of Tourism and Tourist by Metaphors

Günay EROL
Assist. Prof. Dr., Nevşehir Hacı Bektaş Veli University
gunayerol@nevsehir.edu.tr

Ebru DÜŞMEZKALENDER
Assist. Prof. Dr., Eskişehir Osmangazi University
earslaner@ogu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT
This study examines the concept of “metaphor”, reviews various definitions of “metaphor” and discusses figurative or metaphorical explanations of the concepts. Metaphors are alternative approaches that are used when defining concepts, phenomena or objects. They represent the imaginative and fictitious thoughts of individuals through different expressions. This way, a defined concept can be explained via different words and from different directions while still bearing the same meaning. Metaphors are considered important especially in the way that they reveal the perceptions towards a certain concept. The aim of this study is to determine the metaphorical perceptions of the local people of Ürgüp, which is a notable touristic destination, towards the concepts of “tourism” and “tourist”. With this in mind, the study seeks to determine the metaphorical perceptions of the local people towards the concepts of tourism and tourist utilizing data gathered with a semi-structured interview form. Using the data gathered from 50 individuals living in Ürgüp, the metaphors regarding the concepts of “tourism” and “tourist” were categorized and analyzed. According to the results, it was determined that the metaphors towards the concept of tourism were mostly perceived in a classic manner and metaphors towards the concept of tourist were perceived most commonly in an economic manner. Additionally, it was found that the great majority of the metaphors developed towards both concepts were positive perceptions, aside from the very few negative perceptions.

INTRODUCTION
There are many different definitions of tourism suggested by various researchers. Tourism was generally defined in a spatial way initially, and the individuals who travel a certain distance to another place were defined as tourists. More clearly; tourism is the sum of activities including individuals’ traveling outside their places of residency and work for short and temporary periods, and the goods and services necessary to meet their needs during their visit (Akış Roney, 2011: 3-4). The opinions on tourism of each member of the tourism system can be different. Because of this, tourism and tourist can be expressed in a different way for each individual.

Concepts are mostly considered with their common properties with other concepts. Sometimes, a newly learned aspect of a concept is identified with the properties of another concept which is very well-known. In formal or informal learning processes, metaphors can also shed light on certain concepts that are hard to comprehend (Geçit and Gencer, 2011: 2). The term metaphor is defined as a word that is used outside its true meaning to establish likeness (Yazçıçek, 2012: 139). Explaining a concept with metaphors also put forth the fictitious phenomenon which said concept evokes. With these images, the feelings and notions which are related to the concept are also comprehended to a certain extent (Ayyıldız, 2016: 15). What increases the significance of metaphors is that they allow the projection of a mental schema on another mental schema by establishing a certain relationship between two different phenomena (Saban, 2009: 282).

Metaphors are commonly used nowadays. Studies on metaphor analysis are utilized especially in the field of educational sciences (Babacan, 2014; Kodan Çetinkaya, 2014, Hacıfazlıoğlu vd., 2011). However, it can be stated that studies using metaphor analysis in the field of tourism are not sufficient yet. This study, which aims to determine the metaphoric perceptions of the local people in Ürgüp on the concepts of “tourism” and “tourist”, is thus thought to contribute significantly to the literature on tourism.
LITERATURE REVIEW

The word “metaphor” comes from the base of “metapherein” in Greek and means “to relay/transfer”. Its primary meaning is defined as shifting the usage of a word into a new one (Al-Hasnawi, 2007). The broadest definition of “metaphor” in Turkish, which is translated as “mecaz” by the Turkish Language Association (TDK, 2019), is the expression of a concept or phenomenon through the use of analogies (Aydın, 2010: 1296). In other words, it can be defined as expressing a phrase or idiom by likening it to another phrase which is similar in meaning (Yazçiçek, 2012: 139).

Metaphors are clear expressions of individuals’ thoughts on the world, objects, events and actions (Özdemir et al., 2016: 116). They can also form as explicitly or implicitly stating that an X phenomenon is similar to a Y phenomenon (Saban, 2009: 282). The expressions in the metaphors may not be directly connected to each other, but the meanings must be parallel and should echo with each other. The important thing in metaphors is moving from the source to the target to, but doing this by describing the source (Yazçiçek, 2012: 139).

Forceville (2002) emphasizes that in order for a something to be called a metaphor, it must answer the questions below:

- What are the two terms of the metaphor?
- What are the target and the source of the metaphor?
- Which properties can be linked between the source and the target?

Moving on from all this information; it can be stated that metaphors take shape when a concept, subject or object is implicitly or explicitly expressed in another manner. In Bayraktaroğlu et al.’s (2011) study where the researchers examined the Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences students’ perceptions on Human Resources management using plant and animal metaphors, it was seen that the foremost metaphor is “bamboo”. The most commonly used metaphors for the concept of Human Resources were “fruitless” “prune-free” and “hard to cultivate”. The most common animal metaphor was stated to be “dog”.

Demirtaş and Çoban (2014) have examined the student opinions on faculty members through metaphor analysis. The research results showed that students create mostly negative metaphors and the most common of these were related to the aspect of authority; while positive metaphors mostly referred to leadership, guidance and mentorship. In another study, the metaphors regarding the perceptions of tour guiding students about Turkish Cuisine were examined. The mostly referred metaphors were related to nature; such as the rainbow, ocean, earth and sun (Köroğlu et al., 2018).

METHOD

Data

The aim of this study is to determine the metaphoric perceptions of the local people of Ürgüp regarding the concepts of “tourism” and “tourist”. In order to do this, a semi structured form was constructed. This form contains the questions of “Tourism is like …, because …” and “Tourist is like …, because …”. The participants were informed about how to fill the forms. They were told to fill in the blanks in the forms in 20 minutes and were allowed to write more than one metaphor provided that they explain why. This way, the participants were given the incentive to explain the metaphors they have written. During the data gathering process, it was observed that most participants took the time to find the appropriate metaphors when filling the form; nevertheless, most participants took less than 20 minutes to fill the form. The average time for the participants to fill the form is roughly 15 minutes.

Sample

The findings in the study consist of the data gathered from 50 individuals living in Ürgüp. During the research phase, 65 individuals were given the form but 15 forms unsuitable for gathering data were excluded from the survey. Because of this, 50 forms which were suitable for gathering data were taken into consideration. Average age of the participants was calculated as 31 (youngest was 18, oldest was 54). 52% of the participants were male, 48% were female. 38% of the participants had high school degrees and 46% were university graduates. The participants included members of different professions such as tradespeople, workers, civil servants and teachers, as well as non-working individuals such as housewives and students.

Data Analysis

Before getting to cataloguing the metaphors created by participants of the study, the forms were thoroughly examined to find the ones suitable for gathering data. The study has excluded forms containing metaphors which were incompatible with the explanations or had no explanation at all; as well as ones that had insufficient explanations or those evoking no metaphorical perceptions (such as “tourism is travel”). Later, the data found in the 50 suitable forms were analyzed using content analysis.
A list of the metaphors gathered from the forms suitable to evaluate metaphoric perceptions and certain demographic information of the individuals who created said metaphors was created in computer environment, and later, the metaphors which were thought to be related to each other were specified and assembled together. It was found that the participants have developed 48 different metaphors for the concept of “Tourism” and 46 different ones for the concept of “Tourist”. The metaphors towards “Tourism” were gathered under 4 categories and the ones regarding “Tourist” were gathered under 5 categories. In order to test the categories regarding both concepts, two experts were consulted; one being a sociologist and the other a tourism academician. It is very important for the reliability of qualitative studies to consult with experts, and to maintain a high compatibility between the opinions of said experts and the researchers (Creswell, 2015/2013; Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2013). the experts were given a list containing the names of the categories and were asked to match the metaphors with the appropriate categories. No ambiguity was found regarding the names of the category names of the metaphors. The two experts had one different opinion each among both the “tourism” and “tourist” metaphors. The study utilized the formula calculating the agreements and disagreements over the total number of items created by Miles and Huberman (1994:64) to determine the reliability of the scale. Accordingly, the following formula was used to calculate the reliability: \[ \text{reliability} = \frac{\text{number of agreements}}{\text{total number of agreements} + \text{disagreements}} \]

Thus, the level of reliability of the metaphors about the concept of tourism was found as \( \frac{48}{48+1}= 0.98 \) and, where the value regarding the reliability of the concept of tourist was found calculated as \( \frac{46}{46+1}= 0.98 \).

**Findings and Discussion**

The metaphors of the participants regarding the concepts of “tourism” and “tourist” are shown in Table 1 and Table 2. Some participants were observed to have developed more than one metaphor towards these concepts, albeit partially. Additionally, the distribution below shows that certain metaphors have been repeated by several participants.

Table 1. Distribution of Metaphors Concerning the Concept of Tourism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metaphor Name</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Metaphor Name</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Fun</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.47</td>
<td>25. Nothing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Investment</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.08</td>
<td>26. Need</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Money</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.08</td>
<td>27. Quality Life</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Tree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.39</td>
<td>28. Tool for Development</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Smokeless Industry</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.39</td>
<td>29. To Discover</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Commingling</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.39</td>
<td>30. Book</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. River</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>31. Gambling</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Light and Darkness</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>32. Theme Park</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Cloud</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>33. Legacy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Rest</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>34. Essential</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Having Fun</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>35. Organization</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. To See</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>36. History</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Economy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>37. Market</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Economic remedy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>38. Window</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Economic Fun</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>39. Color</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Livelihood</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>40. Pinwheel</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Source of Income</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>41. Showroom</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Development</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>42. Acquaintance</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Beauty</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>43. Vacation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Sky</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>44. A Clean Home</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Sun</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>45. Passion</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Life</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>46. Rain</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Meaning of Life</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>47. Sun in Winter</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Natural Flow of Life</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>48. Food</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to Table 1 which includes the distribution of the metaphors on the concept of tourism, the participants have written 48 different metaphors regarding the concept of tourism. The metaphors of fun (6), investment (3), money (3), tree (2), smokeless industry (2) and commingling (2) were written by more than one participant. Accordingly, though the most frequent metaphor was fun, metaphors like investment and money were repeated more frequently in total. The rest were all written by singular participants. A general evaluation of Table 1 tells us that the participants have developed different metaphors regarding tourism. These metaphors were then gathered under categories, shown on Table 2:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metaphor category</th>
<th>Metaphors</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tourism as a Conventional Perception</td>
<td>fun (5), commingling (2), rest (1), having fun (1), to see (1), to discover (1), theme park (1), legacy (1), organization (1), history (1), acquaintance (1), vacation (1)</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism as a Life related perception</td>
<td>life (1), meaning of life (1), natural flow of life (1), nothing (1), need (1), quality life (1), book (1), gambling (1), essential (1), window (1), color (1), pinwheel (1), showroom (1), a clean house (1), passion (1), food (1)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism as an Economic perception</td>
<td>investment (3), money (3), smokeless industry (2), economy (1), economic remedy (1), economic fun (1), livelihood (1), source of income (1), development (1), tool for development (1), market (1)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism as a natural perception</td>
<td>tree (2), river (1), light and darkness (1), cloud (1), beauty (1), sky (1), sun (1), rain (1), sun in winter (1)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The metaphors regarding tourism are categorized under 4 groups; conventional (general concepts regarding tourism, such as analogies and definitions), life related (general concepts regarding life), economic (monetary sources and other economic inputs) and natural (definitions regarding nature) perceptions. The distribution between these categories are shown on Table 2. According to this, the participants have most frequently developed metaphors under the conventional tourism perception. Following this, it was seen that the participants tried to define tourism with the metaphors regarding life and economy. According to Table 2, only a small portion of the participants perceive tourism as a phenomenon regarding nature. Because of this, it can be stated that the fewest participants have tried to explain the concept of tourism with metaphors regarding nature. Generally speaking, the metaphors regarding tourism were developed mostly with its conventional, life related and economic aspects, while natural metaphors are less used to explain tourism with.

The Participants' explanations regarding their metaphors on the concept of tourism

a. Tourism as a Conventional Perception: The general definitions regarding tourism were put under this category. This group includes metaphors such as fun (5), commingling (2), resting (1) and having fun (1). Some definitions of the participants regarding these metaphors are as follows:
   - “It is a fun world where people travel to, see and meet new cultures and people. It is a very pleasurable way of fun.”
   - “It enables us to show our culture to other people, draw a positive image, deepen our relationships with others and fix the negative images. This way, we can mingle with one another by touching each other's culture, even a little.”
   - “Tourism can make you rest while touring or traveling through history. You travel, sightsee, rest and enjoy yourself at the same time.

b. Tourism as a Life Related Perception: This category includes metaphors on general definitions regarding life, such as life (1), meaning of life (1), natural flow of life (1), nothing (1), need (1) and quality life (1). Some explanations on these metaphors are given below:
   - “It is part of my life because both my life and work are closely related to tourism. I can describe it this way because my life consists of tourism in a manner of speaking.”
   - “I think life without tourism would be very bland and meaningless. It is the meaning of life itself for me”
• “I live in a place where tourism is actively practiced, and I work in an institution which gives education on tourism. It is like a daily routine in my life.”

c. Tourism as an Economic Perception: The metaphors of participants regarding the economic effects of tourism are grouped under this category, such as: investment (3), money (3), smokeless industry (2), economy (1), economic remedy (1), economic fun (1) and livelihood (1). The explanations of these metaphors are as follows.
• “It has the potential to produce intense added value for the economy of the country.”
• “I think there will be good income as long as there is tourism and people to come and see the historical and touristic places in our country. Plus, I see tourism as an important source of income for the future.”
• “People can find jobs because of the employment opportunities. It can also contribute to the country’s economy without too much investment, just by increasing the service quality.”

d. Tourism as a Natural Perception: This category includes definitions regarding nature; such as tree (2) river (1), light and darkness (1), cloud (1) and beauty (1). Several definitions regarding these metaphors are below:
• “When the trees are green and high, the high season comes. When the leaves wither, it is the low season.”
• “Water gives life everywhere it goes; it brings wealth and abundance. Similarly, tourism is one of the most important sources of income in our country; it brings wealth and cultural richness. In other words, it brings life.”
• “It can nurture the place it goes, but it can also harm beauty, change it or destroy it. Of course, this isn’t a direct result of tourism but people’s greed, but tourism is the base factor.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3. Distribution of Metaphors Regarding the Concept of Tourist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metaphor Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Guest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Bread</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Cultural Richness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Human</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Benefactor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Meal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Walking Wallet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Burden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Gift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Kid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Insatiable Person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Reveler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Economic Richness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Ambassador</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Life for the tradesman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Publicity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Air</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Oxygen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Joy of Life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Everyman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The distribution of the metaphors described by the participants are shown on Table 3. According to this, the participants have developed 46 different metaphors regarding the concept of tourist. Among these; guest (9), bread (3), water (2), cultural richness (2), income (2), human (2) and benefactor (2) metaphors have been developed by multiple participants. Other metaphors have been developed by singular participants. Thus, it can be stated that the participants have developed many different metaphors regarding the concept of tourist. The most frequent metaphor regarding the concept of tourist was observed to be the guest. This is followed in order by metaphors such as bread, water, cultural richness, income, human and benefactor. It is possible to say that the participants generally see tourists as a guest and a phenomenon with various benefits. Additionally, metaphors regarding culture and personal features can be shown as other expressions towards the concept of tourist.

Table 4. Distribution of Categories Which the Metaphors about Tourist

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metaphor category</th>
<th>Metaphors</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tourist as an economic perception</td>
<td>bread (3), income (2), benefactor (2), walking wallet (1), economic richness (1), life for the tradesman (1), publicity (1), job source (1), money (1), capital (1), problem money (1), easy pickings (1)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourist as a relational perception</td>
<td>Guest (9), child (1), everyman (1), an important guest (1), distant relative (1), stranger (1), a new friend (1)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourist as a life related perception</td>
<td>Cultural richness (2), meal (1), burden (1), gift (1), joy of life (1), heart (1), book (1), culture (1), respect (1), toleration (1), a new hope (1), new thoughts (1), culture incompatibility (1)</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourist as a characteristic perception</td>
<td>Human (2), kid (1), insatiable person (1), revealer (1), ambassador (1), person of pleasure (1), adventurer (1), a curious child (1), culture ambassador (1), a snob (1)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourist as a natural perception</td>
<td>Water (2), air (1), oxygen (1), seed (1)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>61</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Categories of the participant metaphors on the concept of tourist are seen in Table 4. These metaphors were analyzed in 5 different categories. These are categorized as; tourist as an economic (monetary and other material resources), relational (closeness or the level of relationship), life related (phenomena concerning life), characteristic (personal, bodily or other features) and natural (definitions regarding nature) perception. As seen on Table 4; the metaphors are most frequently considered as economic, relational and life related perceptions, in that order. Following these, the concept of tourist was most commonly described with metaphors regarding personal characteristics. Natural metaphors were the least used category in describing the concept of tourist. As a result, the concept of tourist was most commonly described by the participants as a monetary phenomenon. On the other hand, it can be said that the participants also consider the concept of tourist using phenomena regarding daily life and relationships. Additionally, even though the participants mostly develop positive metaphors regarding the concept of tourist, there are certain negative metaphors as well.

The Participants’ explanations regarding their metaphors on the concept of tourist

a. **Tourist as an economic perception:** This category of metaphors regarding economy and economic outputs include items such as: bread (3), income (2), benefactor (2), walking wallet (1) ve economic richness (1). The explanations about these metaphors are below.
   - “When tourists come, I eat, as well as my country. In other words, they bring money.”
   - “They are the best investment on my homeland, they are income and export. They are the best means of publicity, they are economy.”
   - “Tourist is the person who enables us to earn money, because of this he is valuable.”

b. **Tourist as a relational perception:** Metaphors regarding the closeness and level of relationship fall into this category. Below are some explanations regarding the metaphors in this category such as; guest (9), child (1), everyman (1), an important guest (1) and distant relative (1):
   - “When they come to our country, we accommodate them as guests, and we demonstrate the historical places of our country.”
- “Sometimes you just endure because you have to. You have to endure every hardship coming from the tourists, and you can’t send them back.”
- “The concept of tourist is very broad. Anyone can be defined as a tourist any moment.”

c. **Tourist as a life related perception:** This category includes life related metaphors such as; cultural richness (2), meal (1), burden (1), gift (1), joy of life (1), heart (1), book (1) and culture (1). Several participant descriptions are given below:

- “Each tourist brings his/her country’s cultural richness to our country. Despite the impracticalities like language, cultural interaction can be established.”
- “Because I live in a touristic region, the tourist’s coming to our country means meal, water, bread for me.”
- “Tourist groups can become a grind from time to time and be very hard to handle; while other times it can become a gift. But individual tourist is mostly like a gift.”

d. **Tourist as a characteristic perception:** In this category where metaphors such as Human, (2), child (1), insatiable person (1), reveler (1), ambassador (1) and person of pleasure (1) fall in, personal features stand out. Some descriptions regarding these metaphors are as follows:

- “Each tourist is a human being first. He/she has own feelings, sensations and judgements. They need to be treated as human beings and with respect, despite their positive and negative opinions. I see them as guests visiting us.”
- “They learn new things like a child from the start in the region they go, they are open to learning new things. They form a certain opinion on that region. They also have economic, social and cultural benefit for the country and the region.”
- “The tourist wants more and better as he/she learns new things about his/her place of visit. A tourist participating in tourism and travel is never satisfied with the fun and adventure he/she experiences, he/she wants more fun and more adventure.”

e. **Tourist as a natural perception:** This category includes the metaphors of water (2), air (1), oxygen (1) and seed (1). The descriptions about these metaphors are below:

- “Tourist is as essential for our country as water is for humans.”
- “Without the tourist, tourism can’t breathe. Tourism is the nose and tourist is the breath, they are necessary for each other.”
- “A well-nurtured harvest will become more fertile each year compared to the previous one. Because of this, I see the tourist as the seed sown in the field of tourism. For touristic regions, tourist is like a natural resource, it is valuable.”

**CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION**

This study was conducted with the aim of determining the perceptions of the local people of Ürgüp on the concepts of “tourism” and “tourist” through metaphors, as it is an important tourism destination. Within the scope of the study, 48 metaphors on the concept of tourism and 46 on the concept of tourist developed by the participants were specified. It was found that the most common metaphors regarding tourism were fun, investment and money, for the concept of tourist the metaphors were most frequently guest, bread and water. A few metaphors have been repeated by the participants regarding both concepts. This fewness of repeated metaphors has enabled more diverse metaphors to be developed and many different metaphors were obtained. Despite that, it can be said that a small number of participants have developed multiple metaphors on the concepts.

The metaphors regarding the concept of tourism were divided into 4 perception categories: conventional, life related, economic and natural. Among these, the most common metaphors were under the category of tourism as a conventional perception (fun, discovery, vacation, etc.). Following this are the categories of life related and economic metaphors. The least developed metaphors were the ones regarding nature. Accordingly, it can be said that the participants describe the concept of tourism with its intrinsic features, such as sightseeing, having fun, resting and exploring. Tourism’s economic meanings come later. In this regard, it is possible to state that tourism metaphors are mostly based on its conventional and life related perceptions. Özder, Kaya and Ünlü (2012) have also mentioned in their study that the most metaphors regarding tourism are based on the conventional perceptions. In the said study, economic perception comes after conventional, historical and cultural values. However, this research has also found that some life related metaphors include economic definitions, even though in an indirect manner. In addition,
this study’s life related metaphors constitute the most diverse category regarding tourism. The least used category to describe tourism was natural metaphors.

Analysis of the concept of tourist shows that it is mostly regarded as an economic perception. Despite this, the most frequent metaphor was the guest metaphor. From this point, it can be said that the accommodating the tourist is also valued in aside from the economic perceptions of the concept. It was found that the closeness of that participants’ relationships with the tourist is almost at the same level with their economic perceptions, which is the most common category. The concept of tourist was also defined with many metaphors associated to culture. Dilek, Dilek and Gümüş (2016) have determined in their study that social and cultural perceptions on tourism are equally important as the economic perceptions. Characteristics, which include personal features were also used when defining the concept of tourist within the scope of this study. Again, the metaphors regarding nature were the ones least used here.

Generally, conventional tourism perception comes into the fore in the concept of tourism while for the concept of tourist, the economic category is more prominent. This can be explained with the participants’ living in a touristic destination, because tourism’s conventional and economic effects were very well defined in both concepts. It can be stated that the people living in a relatively small touristic region are strongly affected by tourism in social and economic terms. Moreover, metaphors developed in both concepts were mostly positive. However, a small number of participants have also developed negative metaphors regarding cultural conflicts and incompatibilities, the negative effects of tourism and the bad tourist behavior. This shows that the participants regard the concepts of tourism and tourist in a positive way.

REFERENCES


Natural Disaster Threat on World Heritage Sites in Turkey and the Effect on Cultural Tourism

Doğa Dinemis Aman
Assist.Prof.Dr., Özyeğin University
dinemis.aman@ozyegin.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

The majority of world’s population living in cities under natural disaster risk requires the security of the people and property. Many cultural heritages locate in vulnerable areas to natural disaster because of humanity settling in such places. As a result of the sudden and devastating effects of natural disasters, culture tourism is severely affected in such countries. Turkey lived several devastating earthquakes in the past century, and due to global climate change, the country also suffers from water related disasters in recent years. Disaster threats bring social and economic demolitions and long-term problems that will be reflected in the whole country. This problem makes it crucial for every occupational group to increase the urban resilience and coping capacity of the country in order to protect cultural heritage and maintain cultural tourism activities. The existing seismic threat, increasing water related incidents and irregular urbanization turn natural events into disasters. There are 18 places in UNESCO World Heritage List from Turkey, and most of them are somehow under disaster threat, which damages the tourism sector to a large extent. The continuation of tourism by protecting the archaeological, historical and cultural assets from disasters is necessary for the social and economic sustainability of the city. Therefore, the aim of this study is to develop spatial planning strategies for Turkey in order to maintain tourism activities after a natural disaster. In this context, this study aims to create integrated risk maps of the world heritage sites. First, natural disasters risks are examined by extensive literature review. Second, thematic maps are created showing natural hazards on heritage sites. Finally, spatial planning suggestions are made in order to protect heritage sites against possible natural threats. Tourism is such an important aspect of Turkey and maintaining the activity will increase sustainability for the economy and society.

Key Words: Natural Disaster, World Heritage Sites, Cultural Tourism, Turkey

INTRODUCTION

UNISDR reported that disasters around the world increases every year (2009) due to the urban growth in cyclone coastal areas and earthquake-prone cities along with poor governance and disturbed ecosystems (UNESCO, 2010). The destruction of cultural heritage sites because of natural disasters such as earthquakes and floods result a dramatic loss as these sites have great value. It is accepted that five of the seven wonders of the ancient time were destroyed by the earthquake: Hanging Gardens of Babylon (1st century), Statue of Zeus at Olympia (5-6th century), Mausoleum of Mausollos (350), Colossus of Rhodes (226) and Lighthouse of Alexandria (1480) (Mark, 2009). The fact that cities are vulnerable to natural disasters causes many historical monuments to be damaged, and this situation directly effects tourism. In 2006, the greatest damage after the earthquake was in the Italian medieval city of L’Aquila. The historic city center was the tourist attraction and central business district (Diez, 2012), providing income and employment (Contreras et al, 2014). 2009 Italy Earthquake damaged Abruzzo’s tourist income; it is reported that Central Italy lost half of its €9 billion annual income from tourism and a 40% drop in tourism in the region (Fogarty, 2017). After the Central Italy Earthquake in 2016, it is reported that 30% decrease in tourist arrivals occurred in the regions and even areas not affected by the earthquake directly (Tanner, 2017). In 2017, Kos earthquake killed 2 people, and in summer 2019, severe summer storm killed six tourists in Halkidiki, Greece, risking many heritage sites. Far from Europe, cultural heritage is damaged as natural disasters strike South America and Asia. The Basilica Cathedral of Arequipa is damaged after the 2001 earthquake, and in 2015 Kathmandu Earthquake in Nepal show the vulnerability of cultural heritage. The Government of Nepal Department of Archaeology indicates that one-third of the country’s important cultural heritage sites are destroyed by the earthquake (Sonda et al, 2018). Examples in Japan continue with Kumamoto Earthquake in 2016 and Typhoon Jebi in 2018, exposing cultural heritages to natural disasters.
Turkey is vulnerable to natural hazards, most prominently earthquakes, landslides, and floods (GFD-RR, 2019). Earthquakes are one of the most destructive types of disasters because of causing many deaths in Turkey; since the beginning of the twentieth century about 110 devastating earthquake occurred in and the biggest losses are given in the 1939 Erzincan earthquake and the 1999 Marmara earthquake (Kulci et al, 2015). More than 200 devastating earthquakes have occurred since 1900 in Turkey (TMMOB, 2012), and more than half of the country’s population live under first and second-degree disaster hazard. 4 major fault lines in Turkey are North Anatolian Fault, the Aegean Graben System, the East Anatolian Fault and Southeast Anatolia Fault, and most of the seismicity of the country depends on the North Anatolian Fault Line, one of Europe's and the world's most active fault (Demarchi, 2014) (Figure 1). The North Anatolian Fault is a relatively young active fault zone and has the potential to produce large earthquakes (Le Pichon et al, 2001), thus risking the heritage sites.

![Figure 1. North Anatolian Fault (Ketin, 1976)](image)

Along with earthquakes, Turkey suffers from extreme climate events in recent years. The size and frequency of floods, which are closely related to climate change, varies from region to region. During the transition period from summer to autumn, heavy rainfall causes floods and landslides in many parts of the country, especially in crowded cities. Inadequate vegetation and steep slopes in dry areas increase the speed of sudden floods and landslides. Erosion and unplanned urbanization are among the most important factors. In the urban planning stage, incorrect land use decisions and inadequate rainwater drainage systems have led to a continuous increase in the risk of sudden floods in big cities such as Istanbul and Ankara in recent years.

Most of the cities in Turkey are also the victim of irregular urbanization as a result of excessive migration from rural to urban, especially after 1950. The plains, which are most suitable for agriculture, have been occupied as industrial areas and settlements; therefore, resulting natural events turning into disasters. This situation also triggers the destruction of cultural heritage sites, by population pressure along with natural threats.

The linkage of Europe and Asia, Istanbul, hosts many historical and cultural events for thousands of years, and is one of the world’s leading natural and cultural heritage centers. Historic Areas of Istanbul is registered as World Heritage Site in 1985 and is protected by UNESCO. Since Istanbul lies on the Anatolian Fault, historic site is under seismic threat for centuries, and the issue has long been an important part of the country and metropolitan agenda, all-round technical studies at the lower and upper levels of the metropolis are examined. Disaster response experts are strengthened in both quality and quantity dimensions; architectural structures are strengthened for a possible Marmara Earthquake expected in near future (ISMEP, 2014). However, there are 17 other heritage sites in Turkey and unfortunately there is not as many scientific research and interest as Istanbul for these sites.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

UNESCO (2010) identified the information needed to assess the disaster risk to a site, how to analyze the factors and evaluate the hazard to prevent or mitigate disaster risks. Jigyasu and Arora examined risk assessment for cultural heritage and identified approaches for risk prevention/mitigation for reducing disaster risks from various hazards (2013). Identification of risks includes establishing the values and significance of the heritage site; the geographical, hydrological, meteorological and seismic data; historical data on previous disasters; detailed information of management, planning and infrastructure of the site; and
other records of surveys and documentation (Jigyasu and Arora, 2013). ISMEP aims within the subject of risk mitigation to protect cultural heritage property of Istanbul to create Risk Mitigation Planning. The study includes determining the methods, categorizing the vulnerability of historical artifacts against disasters and creating risk mitigation plans and actions (ISMEP, 2014). Matiz Lopez proposed Integrated Risk Assessment for Cultural Heritage Sites using AHP method (2016); Agapiou et al aims to indicate the risk of natural and anthropogenic hazards for cultural heritage area of Paphos District by interconnecting multi-temporal GIS and earth observation analysis (2016). AHP methodology is followed to group cultural heritage sites with similar characteristics and threats and to estimate hazards (Agapiou et al, 2016). Bonazza et al. conducted a study to contribute to the development of good practices to integrate cultural heritage into national disaster and risk reduction strategies (2018). It is said that the results show protecting cultural heritage from natural and manmade disasters still suffers from the fact that cultural heritage is not fully considered as a risk management priority in emergency situations.

Turkey has 18 places in UNESCO World Heritage List, and most of them are somehow under disaster threat. The existing seismic threat, increasing water related incidents along with population and urbanization pressure lie behind the demolition risk of heritage and damage the tourism sector to a large extent. This problem makes it crucial for every occupational group to increase the urban resilience and coping capacity of the country in order to protect cultural heritage and maintain cultural tourism activities. The continuation of tourism by protecting the archaeological, historical and cultural assets from disasters is necessary for the social and economic sustainability of the city. This study aims to develop spatial planning strategies for Turkey in order to maintain tourism activities after a natural disaster by creating integrated risk maps of the world heritage sites.

METHOD AND CASE STUDY AREA

The study concerns World Heritage Sites in Turkey. The country has 18 properties inscribed on the UNESCO World Heritage List and 78 sites in Tentative List. 16 of the World Heritage Sites are cultural and 2 of them are mixed, and their registration dates vary from 1985 to 2017 (Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>World Heritage Site</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aphrodisias</td>
<td>Aydın</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>(ii)(iii)(iv)(vi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archaeological Site of Ani</td>
<td>Kars</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>(ii)(iii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archaeological Site of Troy</td>
<td>Çanakkale</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>(ii)(iii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bursa and Cumalikizik: the Birth of the Ottoman Empire</td>
<td>Bursa</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>(i)(ii)(iv)(vi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Safranbolu</td>
<td>Karabük</td>
<td>1994</td>
<td>(ii)(iv)(v)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diyarbakı̈r Fortress and Hevsel Gardens Cultural Landscape</td>
<td>Diyarbakı̈r</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ephesus</td>
<td>İzmir</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>(ii)(iv)(vi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Göbekli Tepe</td>
<td>Şanlıurfa</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>(i)(ii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Mosque and Hospital of Divriği</td>
<td>Sivas</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>(i)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hattusha: the Hittite Capital</td>
<td>Çorum</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>(i)(ii)(iii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historic Areas of Istanbul</td>
<td>İstanbul</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>(i)(ii)(iii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nemrut Mountain</td>
<td>Adıyaman</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>(i)(ii)(iii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neolithic Site of Çatalhöyük</td>
<td>Konya</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>(ii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selimiye Mosque and its Social Complex</td>
<td>Edirne</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>(i)(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xanthos-Leetoon</td>
<td>Muğla</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>(ii)(iii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hierapolis-Pamukkale</td>
<td>Denizli</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>(iii)(iv)(vii)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This study has mapped natural hazards including earthquake, flood and landslide. Earthquake hazard map of cultural heritage sites is produced using new Turkey Earthquake Hazard Map (AFAD, 2019), placing the sites conjecturally into the map (Figure 2). Flood hazard map is produced from Turkey Disaster Suffered Settlements Map between 1950-2008 by Ministry of Public Works And Settlement Directorate General of Disaster Affairs (2008) (Figure 3), and landslide hazard map is edited using Turkey Landslide Density Map by Ministry of Public Works And Settlement Directorate General of Disaster Affairs (2008) (Figure 4). Anthropogenic hazard as urbanization is processed from aerial photo with the parameter of the site locating in urban, rural or rural-urban fringe (Figure 5). As a result, an integrated risk table is created, relative to natural (earthquake, flood and landslide) and anthropogenic (urban sprawl) hazards affecting cultural heritage sites (Table 2).
Figure 4. Landslide Hazard Map of Cultural Heritage Sites (Edited From Ministry of Public Works and Settlement Directorate General of Disaster Affairs, 2008)

Figure 5. Aerial Photo of Heritage Sites Indicating Anthropogenic Hazard
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Since most of the Marmara and Aegean Region of Turkey is earthquake zone, 8 heritage sites are under earthquake hazard, excluding Selimiye Mosque in Edirne. Safranbolu is close to North Anatolian Fault, leaving the site under hazard. Nemrut Mountain is located on Southeast Anatolia Fault; therefore it has seismic threat that may result in volcanic activities.

Historic Peninsula of Istanbul (Akça, 2017) and Ephesus (Reimann et al, 2018) are under risk of sea level rise; while Selimiye Mosque, Historic Peninsula of Istanbul, Safranbolu, Göreme and Diyarbakır Fortress have flood hazard and faced with water related disasters in history according to Figure 3.

Landslide hazard map shows that landslide is not a primary threat to many cultural heritage sites. Only City of Safranbolu has a history of damaging landslide. However, Ephesus is under the risk of erosion due to climate change (Reimann et al, 2018), while Gobeklitepe and Çatalhöyük are exposed to wind erosion. In Nemrut Moutain, snow slide occur during winter. In addition, sites under earthquake and flood risk also have the possibility to face landslide incident, therefore precautions must be taken.

Diyarbakır Fortress, Great Mosque of Divriği, Istanbul Historical Peninsula and Selimiye Mosque are located in dense urban texture, thus have a risk of anthropogenic damage, while Göreme National Park is mixed into rural settlement texture. Some heritage sites such as Ephesus, Pergamon and Hierapolis locate in urban/rural fringes and they are under the threat of urban sprawl; while Xantos-Letoon is surrounded by greenhouses intensively.

Integrated risk table of cultural heritage sites relative to natural (earthquake, flood and landslide) and anthropogenic (urban sprawl) hazards are shown in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural Heritage Site</th>
<th>Natural Hazards</th>
<th>Anthropogenic</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Earthquake</td>
<td>Flood</td>
<td>Landslide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aphrodisias</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archaeological Site of Ani</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archaeological Site of Troy</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bursa and Cumalikızık: the Birth of the Ottoman Empire</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Safranbolu</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diyarbakır Fortress and Hevsel Gardens Cultural Landscape</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ephesus</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Göbekli Tepe</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Mosque and Hospital of Divriği</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hattusha: the Hittite Capital</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historic Areas of Istanbul</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nemrut Mountain</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neolithic Site of Çatalhöyük</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pergamon and its Multi-Layered Cultural Landscape</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selimiye Mosque and its Social Complex</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xanthos-Letoon</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Göreme National Park and the Rock Sites of Cappadocia</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hierapolis-Pamukkale</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

+ indicates the presence of risk  - indicates no risk
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Some of the sites are threatened by multiple hazards; some of them are relatively safe. Even though they are not menaced by natural hazards, they may face anthropogenic pressure near future. For this reason, protection and maintenance of those sites should be a priority and national concern. Below, spatial planning strategies for UNESCO cultural heritage sites in Turkey under the risk of disaster hazards are suggested in 4 headings.

Earthquake. Since earthquakes are generated because of geological formation; they cannot be prevented with today’s technology but the effect can be mitigated. Micro-zoning maps should be generated to better understand the earthquake hazards in heritage sites. Historical artifacts should be examined and strengthened if necessary against seismic hazard. For protection of the tourists, pedestrian circulation, both inside and outside the sites, should be planned towards debris fall. Authorities must create emergency evacuation plans.

Flood. On the other hand, unlike seismic hazards, floods can be prevented with accurate environmental planning decisions. Floods occur in urbanized areas because of heavy rains and impervious pavements, which causes urban storm water run-off and stream overflow. The main struggle today is to eliminate the effects of global warming and to take water under control on site by increasing infiltration as a natural drainage. Buffer zones to store excessive water should be created around the streams in order to prevent the streams from overflowing. In case of sea-level rise hazard, sites must be protected with catchment (excavation) or dyke (filling) integrated with landscape design.

Landslide. Landslides mainly occur as a result of seismic activities or water related disasters. Initially, these hazards, if any, should be eliminated. Therefore, in case of a landslide threat, necessary precautions should be taken; surrounding hills should be stabilized and afforested with appropriate structural solutions to protect the heritage site. Thematic maps indicating landslide hazard should be generated in detail.

Urban sprawl. With growing population in the world, it is clear that uncontrolled urban growth will continue and risk the heritage sites especially the ones locating already in urban areas and the fringes. As heritage sites are absorbed into urban matrix, they are under threat of, directly or indirectly, vibration and contamination generated by construction nearby and use of cars and heavy vehicles. Planning policy should be developed against urban sprawl, protecting agricultural land in general and heritage site in specific. Public education is a key role to minimize vandalism, destruction and stealing of historic building materials.

As a result, a Disaster Based Integrated Risk Management Model should be constituted for every site in UNESCO World Heritage List and Tentative List. With respect to many scientific research and projection studies around the world, this study aims to contribute to the creation of a holistic risk management model that will be carried out with a holistic approach to ensure that the cultural heritage of Turkey will be protected to be passed on to future generations.

REFERENCES


Mark, J. (2009). The Seven Wonders <https://www.ancient.eu/The_Seven_Wonders/>


